Television in Botswana: Development and Policy Perspectives

Seamogano Mosanako

Master of Arts, Journalism (International), University of Westminster (London), 2004
Bachelor of Social Work, University of Botswana, 1996

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at

The University of Queensland in 2014

School of Journalism and Communication
Abstract

Although numerous scholars across the world have sought to explore the relevance of television for development purposes in various national settings, there is a dearth of literature on the use of television for development in the Botswana context. A national television service, Botswana Television (Btv) was introduced in 2000 by the Botswana Government. However, Btv’s role in national development has received limited research attention. This study examines the role of television in national development in Botswana. In addition, the study explores the factors that influence the performance of television in a developing country context, with a view to suggest issues for consideration in media policy in Botswana to improve the performance of the Btv.

This analysis of Btv was conducted through a qualitative research methodology that comprised document analysis, schedule analysis, in-depth interviews, and focus group discussions. This combination of methods provides data that contributes to a more holistic knowledge of media and development in Botswana. Various documents about Btv and media in Botswana were reviewed to establish the media policy issues relating to television broadcasting in Botswana. The schedule analysis, which was a unique method applied in this study, involved reviewing samples of Btv schedules from 2010 and 2011 to examine Btv’s program output, specifically, the content related to Botswana’s national development priorities. In-depth interviews with 37 participants provided significant insights into the origins, role, and structure of Btv, as well as the socio-economic and political factors that influence the service. Focus group discussions were employed to explore audience perceptions of Btv programs.

The study illustrates that the role of television in national development in Botswana is mostly consistent with the role of the media advocated by the modernisation theory of development communication. The roles of Btv in this regard are education, information, entertainment and dissemination of government information. Most research participants in this study shared a common understanding that Btv should be a medium for diffusing development ideas initiated by the Botswana Government, for possible adoption by the public. Other roles of Btv relate to countering the dominance of neighbouring South Africa media content in Botswana, as well as contributing to Botswana’s economic diversification through advertising. The positive factors that validate the applicability of modernisation theory in the analysis of Btv include planning for the introduction of the service, improved transmission signal access, diverse programs that have been aimed at addressing
developmental issues such as health, education and agriculture, and the use of the national language. Nonetheless, Btv audiences complained about limited cultural content on the channel. A political economy analysis of the factors influencing the performance of Btv revealed that the absence of a formal media policy framework has exacerbated the political and economic pressures facing Btv, such as state control and limited funding. This study therefore proposes that there is a need for the Botswana Government to introduce appropriate media policy with more emphasis on issues relating to its broadcasting model, objectives, funding, and programming with a view to strengthening and positioning Btv to realise its full potential in contributing to national development in Botswana.
Declaration by the author

This thesis *is composed of my original work, and contains* no material previously published or written by another person except where due reference has been made in the text. I have clearly stated the contribution by others to jointly-authored works that I have included in my thesis.

I have clearly stated the contribution of others to my thesis as a whole, including statistical assistance, survey design, data analysis, significant technical procedures, professional editorial advice, and any other original research work used or reported in my thesis. The content of my thesis is the result of work I have carried out since the commencement of my research higher degree candidature and does not include a substantial part of work that has been submitted *to qualify for the award of any* other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution. I have clearly stated which parts of my thesis, if any, have been submitted to qualify for another award.

I acknowledge that an electronic copy of my thesis must be lodged with the University Library and, subject to the General Award Rules of The University of Queensland, immediately made available for research and study in accordance with the *Copyright Act 1968*.

I acknowledge that copyright of all material contained in my thesis resides with the copyright holder(s) of that material. Where appropriate I have obtained copyright permission from the copyright holder to reproduce material in this thesis.
Publications during candidature

“No publications”.

Publications included in this thesis

“No publications included”.
Contributions by others to the thesis

“No contributions by others.”

Statement of parts of the thesis submitted to qualify for the award of another degree

“None”
Acknowledgements

Many people and institutions contributed to the successful completion of this study. I thank God the Almighty for his grace. My profound gratitude goes to my Principal Supervisor Dr. Levi Obijiofor for seeing this project from beginning to end by offering critical and constructive feedback during his review of my work in the production of this thesis. I thank my associate supervisor Ass. Prof Eric Louw for his suggestions and endless “why” questions that have helped me look at Botswana critically. I thank Ass. Prof. Pradip Thomas for his valuable feedback as a reader throughout the study.

I am grateful to all the participants in this study, for their valuable insights. I am thankful to the Department of Broadcasting Services for allowing me to conduct this study, and for their utmost cooperation and assistance during the data collection for this study.

A special gratitude to the Botswana Institute of Development Policy Analysis (BIDPA) for their financial support that allowed me to pursue my dream of acquiring knowledge. I special appreciation to the University of Botswana for financial support and study leave to allow me to further my studies.

I am also thankful to my many cherished friends, and most profoundly Dineo, Maitseo, William, Thuto, Keba and Baphiwe and other African RHD colleagues who were my community and made my stay in Australia bearable. Ke a leboga. Special thanks to colleagues in the School of Journalism and Communication, mostly those in Room 318, Hoa, Elena, Nhuan, Marie, Gerald, Stephen, Sadia and Tamara for engaging conversations about various issues. A special thank you to Dr Chris Lawe-Davies, for his countless support and encouragement throughout my PhD life in Australia.

A special thank you to my dearest husband, Selefo who amazingly looked after our three girls; Boipelo, Boitshepo and Anele, while I was way from home studying. Thanks for your encouragement; you have been a pillar of my strength. Thanks to the girls for always praying for mummy to finish and come back home. You were all very patient with me. Ke a leboga. Thanks to my mum, family, pastors and friends in Botswana for all your well wishes and prayers.
Keywords

Africa, Botswana, broadcasting, Btv, development communication, media policy, modernisation, national development, television

Australian and New Zealand Standard Research Classifications (ANZSRC)

ANZSRC code: 200104 Media Studies 50%
ANZSRC code: 200103 International and Development Communication 40%
ANZSRC code: 169999 Studies in Human Society not elsewhere classified 10%

Fields of Research (FoR) Classification

FoR code: 2001 Communication and Media Studies 80%
FoR code: 1699 Other studies in human society 20%
Table of Contents

Chapter 1  Introduction........................................................................................................14
  1.1 Aims and objectives of this study.................................................................14
  1.2 Research questions .........................................................................................14
  1.3 Statement of the problem ................................................................................14
  1.4 Significance of the study ................................................................................16
  1.5 Contextualising Botswana’s national development ......................................17
     1.5.1 Demographic profile of Botswana ............................................................18
     1.5.2 Economic performance of Botswana .......................................................19
     1.5.3 Political performance ..............................................................................21
     1.5.4 Development strategy ............................................................................24
  1.6 Media in national development in Botswana ..............................................26
     1.6.1 Television broadcasting in Botswana .......................................................27
     1.6.2 Botswana Television (Btv) overview .......................................................28
     1.6.3 Media policy in Botswana .......................................................................29
  1.7 Summary and outline of chapters .................................................................30

Chapter 2  Literature Review........................................................................................31
  2.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................31
  2.2 Definitions of development and development communication ..................31
     2.2.1 Development communication defined....................................................37
     2.2.2 Approaches to development communication ..........................................44
  2.3 Television Broadcasting and development communication .....................46
     2.3.1 Television broadcasting in Africa .............................................................47
     2.3.2 Contemporary trends in broadcasting in Southern Africa ......................50
  2.4 The role of television in development communication ................................53
     2.4.1 The role of television in national development .......................................54
     2.4.2 State and development communication ................................................58
  2.5 Media policy ......................................................................................................60
  2.6 Summary ...........................................................................................................62

Chapter 3  Theoretical Framework..............................................................................64
  3.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................64
  3.2 Modernisation ..................................................................................................64
     3.2.1 Underdevelopment and modernisation in developing countries ..............67
     3.2.2 The use of modernisation by other scholars ............................................68
     3.2.3 Critiques of modernisation theory ...........................................................69
  3.3 Political economy of communication .............................................................74
  3.4 Summary ...........................................................................................................79

Chapter 4 Research methods ....................................................................................81
  4.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................81
  4.2 Research approach .........................................................................................81
     4.2.1 Purpose of research .................................................................................82
     4.2.2 Philosophical assumption .......................................................................82
Chapter 6 Discussion and Conclusion

6.1 Introduction ..............................................................................211
6.2 The origins of a national television service in Botswana .............211
6.3 The Roles of Btv in national development in Botswana ..............213
6.3.1 The use of Btv to inform and educate .................................213
6.3.2 The use of Btv for entertainment ........................................216
6.3.3 The Role of Btv as a Mirror for Cultural Reflection ..............217
6.3.4 Other roles of Btv in Botswana ...........................................218
6.4 The political and economic factors influencing the performance of Btv..................221
6.4.1 Political factors that constrain the operation of Btv ..............221
6.4.2 The economic factors that constrain the operation of Btv .......225
6.5 Policy considerations in improving the performance of Btv .........227
6.5.1 Broadcasting model .........................................................228
6.5.2 Mandate and objectives ...................................................230
6.5.3 Programming .................................................................231
6.5.4 Funding .........................................................................232
6.6 Contribution of the thesis to knowledge ...................................234
6.7 Limitations of the study and suggestions for future research ........236
6.8 Conclusion ..............................................................................237

References ......................................................................................240

Appendices .....................................................................................271
Appendix 1 Documents Reviewed in the Study ................................271
Appendix 2 Composite Week Schedule, 2010 ................................274
Appendix 3 Composite Week Schedule, 2011 ................................278
Appendix 4 An example of a Btv program brief ..............................282
Appendix 5 Generic schedule Btv (2011–2012) ..............................283
Appendix 6 Information Sheet (Interview) ......................................287
Appendix 7 Participant’s Consent Form ........................................289
Appendix 8 Interview Guide by Category of Interviewees ...............290
Appendix 9 Focus Group Discussion Guide .................................292

List of Tables
Table 4-1 Composite Weeks .......................................................88
Table 4-2: Composition of Interviewees .......................................93
Table 4-3: Focus Group Participants’ Demographics ..................103
Table 5-1: Role of Botswana State Media in the Reviewed Documents 128
Table 5-2: Types of Programs on Btv ..........................................133
Table 5-3: Durations of Various Program Types on Btv ...............141
Table 5-4: Sources of Local Programs .........................................143
Table 5-5: Languages Used on Btv’s Local Programs .................144
Table 5-6: Target Audiences for Local Programs ..........................146
Table 5-7: Most Frequently Mentioned Roles of Btv ..................162
Table 5-8: Focus Group Participants’ Preferred Channels ..............185
Table 5-9: Participants Preferred Programs on Btv ......................189
Table 5-10: Overview of the Key Findings of this Study .........................................................206

List of Figures
Figure 4-1. Sample thematic network from the interview data..............................................98
Figure 4-2: Sample coding for focus group discussions data .................................................107
Figure 5-1 Percentage of local and foreign programs on Btv ..............................................140
### Abbreviations and glossary:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AIDS</td>
<td>Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AU</td>
<td>African Union (AU)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Batswana</strong></td>
<td>Botswana nationals (plural)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BBC</td>
<td>British Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BDP</td>
<td>Botswana Democratic Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEST</td>
<td>Black Entertainment Satellite Television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Botswana</strong></td>
<td>Country name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOCRA</td>
<td>Botswana Communications Regulatory Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BTA</td>
<td>Botswana Telecommunications Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COSBOTS</td>
<td>Copyright Society of Botswana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DBS</td>
<td>Department of Broadcasting Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GBC</td>
<td>Gaborone Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HDTV</td>
<td>High Definition Television</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV</td>
<td>Human Immunodeficiency Virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kgosi</td>
<td>Means chief. It is the most senior tribe’s man.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kgotla</td>
<td>A place where public gathering are conducted, presided over by the kgosi and attended by morafe (community), community consultation and briefing forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morafe</td>
<td>Refers to community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MABC</td>
<td>Munhumutape African Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCST</td>
<td>Ministry of Communications Science and Technology MDGs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MFDP</td>
<td>Ministry of Finance and Development Planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MISA</td>
<td>Media Institute of South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MST</td>
<td>Ministry of Science and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MYSC</td>
<td>Ministry of Youth, Sport and Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAM</td>
<td>Non-Aligned Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NBB</td>
<td>National Broadcasting Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>National Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIEO</td>
<td>New International Economic Order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWICO</td>
<td>New World Information and Communication Order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Motswana</strong></td>
<td>Botswana national (singular)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OP</td>
<td>Office of the President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMS</td>
<td>Performance Management System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SABA</td>
<td>Southern Africa, the Southern African Broadcasting Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SABC</td>
<td>South Africa Broadcasting Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern Africa Development Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Setswana</strong></td>
<td>Botswana’s national language, can also refer to traditional lifestyle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TNDP</td>
<td>Transitional National Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tswana</strong></td>
<td>A member of Tswana speaking tribe(s)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VDC</td>
<td>Village Development Committee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 Aims and objectives of this study
The overarching aim of this study is to examine the role of Botswana Television (Btv) in Botswana’s national development. The study focuses on the socio-economic and political factors influencing the performance of Btv as a national service. Furthermore, the study explores broadcasting policy in Botswana with a view to suggesting key policy issues for consideration by media policy makers and media professionals at Btv in their efforts to improve the performance of the service for national development. The objectives of the study are as follows:

1. To examine the role of Btv in national development in Botswana to determine its relevance as a modernisation project.
2. To identify the socio-economic and political factors which influence the performance of Btv with a view to exploring how these factors impact on its role in the national development of Botswana.
3. To propose policy directions to improve the performance of national television within a communication for development framework.

1.2 Research questions
To achieve the aims and objectives, the study seeks to address the following research questions:

RQ1. What is the role of Btv in national development in Botswana?
RQ2. What are the socio-economic and political factors that have shaped the overall performance of Btv?
RQ3. What policy considerations could drive a national television broadcasting system in Botswana?

1.3 Statement of the problem
The need to conduct this study is premised on three key issues. First, although national television in Botswana has been researched, there are no similar studies investigating Btv that focus on its performance in national development. Prior to the launch of Btv in 2000, studies about national television in Botswana were already receiving some mention in the literature (Fako & Nyamnjoh, 2000; Kijeski, 1995; Zaffiro, 2000). The implied notion in the works of
these scholars was that Botswana needed a national television system to augment the existing broadcast radio and press services. Other studies undertaken after Btv was introduced have focused on the level of access and use of the service (Thapisa & Megwa, 2002), the role of Btv as a cultural medium (Mosime, 2007), and the degree to which Btv promotes national identity (Mosanako, 2004). In addition, there are studies about the use of Btv for propaganda and political gains, with suggestions regarding how to address these concerns through the corporatisation of the national television network (Balule, 2013b; Fombad, 2002). None of these studies have attempted to explore the role of Btv as a modernisation project. Against this backdrop, this study considers how media professionals strike a balance between social policy objectives, specifically national development and other competing roles of a national television system in Botswana. The study also focuses on the factors that influence content production and media messages at Btv, as well as the perceptions of audiences about the relevance of the service within their social and economic lives.

Second, although many studies globally have sought to explore the relevance of national television services for development communication in various national settings, there is a dearth of studies focusing specifically on a television system in the Botswana context. Globally, the future of public television is a hotly debated issue, especially in the developed media markets of Europe (D’Arma, 2009; McQuail, 2005), Australia and New Zealand (Flew & Harrington, 2010; Pearce, 2000), and Canada (Padovani & Tracey, 2003; Peke, 1998). Predominantly, arguments about the relevance or irrelevance of public broadcasters are based on issues of spectrum scarcity and market failures (Harrison & Wessels, 2005; McQuail, 2005). With regard to global commercial media, scholars point to its failure in meeting social policy objectives at the expense of focusing on profits (Cocker, 2005; Collins, 1994; Hoskins & McFadyen, 1992). Specific to developing regions in Africa, the concerns with public media relate to issues of reform from state-owned broadcasters into public service media (Moyo & Chuma, 2010; Kaswoswe, 2005), and ensuring their independence from state control (Heuva, 2010; Mano, 1997). However, despite these global and regional trends, national television in various contexts has retained a national character (Bignell & Orlebar, 2005). Thus media systems vary according to specific national contexts. Therefore, there is a need to conduct more studies that focus on public television at distinct national levels. Considering that television is a global medium, such studies could go a long way in reshaping our understanding of this medium in various countries with peculiar socio-economic and political contexts. In particular, Botswana has a distinct socio-economic context characterized
by sound democratic principles, moderate economic growth and social inequality. As such, an analysis of the status of the national television system in Botswana is imperative to unpack the origins, mandate and performance of national television from a developing country context.

The third issue, which relates to both the first and the second, concerns the relevance of a national television system to perform the significant role of enhancing socio-economic development in developing countries. According to various scholars, conventional literature ascribes a role for the media in the national development of developing countries, and in most cases a national television network is viewed as a key medium for the cohesion of citizens within modernisation projects (Katz & Wedell, 1977; Menon, 2004). Nevertheless, recent studies have demonstrated limited success by national television services in development communication in many developing countries (Amienyi, 2004; Eko, 2003, Johnson, 2001 Pashupati, Sun, & McDowell, 2003). There is also evidence in the literature suggesting gaps between the promises and performances of the media in development in Africa (Amienyi, 2004; Katz & Wedell, 1977; Mytton, 2000; Okigbo & Eribo, 2004). According to Amienyi (2004, p. 108), several factors such as “excess government control, urban focus, structural inadequacies, illiteracy, and self-censorship” impede the performance of broadcasting in Africa. Despite criticisms that national television services in various countries, have had limited success, the Botswana Government continued in 2000, to introduce a national television service as part of its modernisation. Over a decade since the introduction of Btv, its relevance for national development, and its overall performance in this regard, are yet to be examined. Therefore, this study provides a foundation for exploring the role of national television in Botswana, a society that has already attained some progress concerning economic and democratic developments. In addition, given the continuing profound challenges to national development in Botswana, as well as the critique of modernisation as an approach to development communication, this thesis also examines the political and economic factors and media policy issues that impact on the use of Btv as an aspect of modernisation in Botswana.

1.4 Significance of the study
This study is significant in two ways. Theoretically, it contributes to the broader area of media and society, specifically communication for development. With its focus on national television in Botswana, the study offers an additional perspective about the role of television
for development in a society that has already attained some progress concerning economic and democratic developments prior to the introduction of its only national television service. By employing a development communication approach, this study places national television in the social context of development in Botswana to reflect on the issues that media in similar developing countries have to contend with.

Practically, the findings of this study will be of long-term use to policy makers in Botswana. Currently there are concerns that state owned media in Botswana, including Btv, should be reformed to a public service broadcaster (Balule, 2013b; Kelebonye, 2010; Makgato-Malesu, 2011). Therefore, as a policy oriented study, data from this research is useful in informing policy debates about the performance of national television, in this case Btv, and its role in national development. In addition, data from this study offers insights about audience perceptions regarding programming in Btv that are is essential in establishing the extent to which the service meets the programming needs of audiences.

1.5 Contextualising Botswana’s national development

Since independence from British colonial rule in 1966, the focus of the Botswana Government has been national development, which was to be achieved through, among other strategies, social and economic planning (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2009a; Republic of Botswana, 1966). Specifically, the Botswana Government embraced development planning as a foundation to accelerate economic growth, which would generate revenue to facilitate social services and infrastructure provision. Indeed, like other developing countries, national development in Botswana appears to have been influenced by the need to ‘catch up’ with the West (Acquah, 2005). Western nations have been engaged in the process of modernisation, which has involved changing from traditional to modern societies (Lerner, 1958; Rostow, 1960). The notion by various scholars has been that modernisation is characterised by urbanisation, industrialisation, economic growth, increased literacy, and democracy, to mention but a few (Alberto, 2005; Lerner, 1958; Mahadevan et al., 2002). Accordingly, countries such as Botswana have approached development from a perspective of attaining these ideals of modernisation as espoused by the West. Therefore, in an effort to examine the role of television in national development in Botswana, first, an overview of Botswana is done to explain the national context within which Btv operates. The next section focuses on Botswana’s demographic composition, economic and political performance and
its approach to national development. The final part of the section presents background information about the media in Botswana, and then provides an overview of Btv.

1.5.1 Demographic profile of Botswana

As a national television broadcaster, Btv operates within a society that comprises a relatively small population of about 2,024,904; sparsely distributed in a landmass of around 582,000 square kilometres (Central Statistics Office, 2009, 2011b). The structure of the population of Botswana reflects domination of females, as they constitute 51% of the population. The population is mostly youthful, as 32.7% is below the age of 15-39 years. The population cohort above 65 years, or elderly population constitutes 5.1% (Central Statistics Office, 2011b). Around 62% of this population lives in urban centres (World Bank, 2013). Specifically, the population of Botswana comprises of the following ethnic groups: Tswana 79%; Kalanga 11%; and Kgalagadi, Bayei, Humbukushu, Basarwa, Khoi, and foreigners all make up the remaining 10% (Central Statistics Office, 2009). Although Botswana has avoided ethnic tensions as various minority ethnic groups have assimilated within the main Tswana groups, and there has been limited competition for national resources, recent scholars have been concerned about emerging trends of disenfranchisement among minority ethnic groups and the need to address issues of their empowerment (Good, 1999b; Mompati & Prinsen, 2000; Mulinge, 2008). The national language in Botswana is Setswana, and the official language is English, whereas the languages of the minority groups are excluded at national and official level. Although initially perceived as an effort towards nation building, this exclusion of minority languages has been viewed as one of the limitations of Botswana’s liberal democracy (Good, 1993, 1999b, 2008; Solway, 2002). At independence, the literacy rate in Botswana was very low, but had risen to 85% in 2013 (World Bank, 2013). With regard to life expectancy, the latest figures have shown that it stood at 55.5 years in 1971 and then increased to 65.3 years by 1991. However, a worrisome decline to 54.4 was realised by 2006 (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2009a) and conceivably, this decline has been due to HIV/AIDS, which has recently affected Botswana society (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2009a). Given this outlook of the demographic composition of Botswana, it is perhaps apparent that a national television service, which is supposed to serve the citizens, has to contend with broadcasting programs that are reflective of diverse languages, cultures and geographic locations, as well as address social challenges, such as HIV/AIDS. In this study, these issues are considered as part of the contextual
information that guides the examination of the performance of Btv’s role in national development.

1.5.2 Economic performance of Botswana

In addition to its demographic profile, the economic context of Botswana is also reviewed in this section. This is to provide information about the economic achievements and challenges of Botswana, and their implications on its national television service. Various scholars have concurred that a country’s economic composition has implications on media policy decisions, such as media ownership, financing and consumption (Barnett, 1999; Murdock, & Graham, 1999; Sonwalkar, 2008). At independence in 1966, Botswana was one of the poorest countries in the world (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2009a) with a per capita income of under US$90 (Mogae, 2005, p. 32). Its main economic challenges at independence related to the following diverse factors: being an agricultural based economy located in arid pastures and a drought prone environment; having no industrial base; and being dependent on technical and financial assistance from the British Government (Khama, 1970a). Faced with these bleak economic prospects, since Botswana’s independence, its governing elite has held the conviction that economic development should be one of the national priorities. Their view was that the revenue generated through economic growth would facilitate the construction of infrastructure and improvement in the living standards of Botswana through the provision of social services such as health and education (Khama, 1970b; Mogae, 2005). Accordingly, up until 2007/08, Botswana has achieved remarkable economic growth of 8.7 per cent in Gross Domestic Product (GDP). Nevertheless, the rate of the GDP growth has declined in subsequent years due to, among other factors, global economic recession (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2009a, pp. 34-35).

The economic growth success of Botswana has predominantly been attributed to resources such as cattle and minerals (Narayana et al., 2005; Makepe, 2005; Sentsho, 2004). Although at independence, agriculture contributed 40% of GDP, mostly through revenues generated from the European Economic Commission (ECC) beef market (Narayana et al., 2005; Makepe, 2005), the sector declined to almost 2% by 2012 (Hillbom, 2012; Matambo, 2014; World Bank, 2013). Nevertheless, cattle remain a source of rural livelihood, thus, cattle ownership indicates wealth and social status, such that a family that has a large herd of livestock is regarded as wealthy. Regarding mineral resources, the discovery of diamonds in 1968 in Botswana became the key turning moment in the country’s otherwise bleak future as
these have been considered the most popular explanation for Botswana’s economic and
democratic success (Harvey & Lewis, 1990; Mogae, 2005; Sentsho, 2004). Consequently,
mining overtook agriculture as the largest contributor to economic growth in the 1980s, and
has remained so to date. Of importance, Botswana has used the mineral revenue boom to the
nation’s advantage such as providing finances for infrastructure and social services (Harvey
and Lewis, 1990). Therefore, due to this economic growth success Botswana has been
considered an exemplar for economic development in Africa (Narayana et al., 2005; Samatar,
1999). Other reasons for Botswana’s economic growth success relate to the following:
functioning institutions (Acemoglu et al., 2003; Harvey & Lewis, 1990; Hillbom, 2014;
Robinson & Acemoglu, 2012); appropriate policies that have emphasized prudent economic
management (Harvey & Lewis, 1990); good governance, effective leadership, peace and
democratic stability (Maipose, 2003; Sebudubudu & Bothlhomilwe, 2012).

However, despite its economic growth success, Botswana currently faces challenges
of economic inequality. This inequality is projected through poverty, unemployment and
income inequality (Narayana et al., 2005). Although poverty at a national level has been
reduced from 59% in 1985/86, to around 20.7% in 2009 (Central Statistics Office, Statistics
Botswana 2009, 2011), poverty is a development paradox in Botswana with rural poverty
levels remaining as high as 48.6% (Statistics Botswana, 2011). Specifically, the economic
inequality in Botswana is exacerbated by the country’s narrow economic base, which is
dominated by a mining sector that only provides 4% of national employment (Sentsho, 2004).
Moreover, according to Harvey and Lewis (1990, p. 64), the greatest beneficiaries of income
distribution in Botswana are “urban elites, cattle owners, and foreigners”. In view of these
inequalities, the focus of recent development planning has been to address poverty alleviation
through measures such as small enterprises and backyard gardening (Ministry of Finance and
Development Planning, 2003, 2009a). Following this, an emerging trend in Botswana’s
development strategy since the 1990s has been the need to diversify its economy from being
state-run and dependent on minerals (Maipose, 2003). However, current literature reflects a
growth in the non-mining sector as signs of progress in economic diversification (Matambo,
2014). While there has been a growth in the non-mining sector, economic diversification that
can address issues of unemployment and income inequality remains a national development
priority in Botswana. Accordingly, this study also examines the connection between the role
of Btv and economic diversification in Botswana.
Overall, the economic performance of Botswana, as explored above, reflects a country with an economic growth paradox. On the one hand, there is evidence of a state-run mineral based economy. On another hand, there is poverty, which mainly affects people in rural areas. Therefore, this study examines how the economic context of Botswana has implications on the national television broadcaster in regard to its ownership, financing and consumption. Equally important is the implications of these economic inequalities on the programming decisions at Btv, specifically in ensuring programming benefits for both the economically advantaged and disadvantaged sectors of the Botswana society. Furthermore, this study aims to consider how this economic context influences possible media policy directions that can be considered in formulating future broadcasting policy in Botswana.

1.5.3 Political performance

Since democracy is one of the facilitating features of modernisation (Pye, 1963), an overview of the political system of Botswana is explored in this study. Generally, Botswana has maintained peace and stability. Partly, this has been due to the way its colonisation by the British Government was facilitated. As a former British colony, Botswana (then Bechuanaland) attained democratic rule from Britain after peaceful negotiations, contrary to the widespread struggles that involved violence in the decolonisation of other countries in Africa (Khama, 1970a). This was due to, among other factors, a different approach to the colonisation of Botswana by the British. In particular, Botswana, unlike other colonial countries, sought British protection from the Boers based in South Africa, as opposed to the colonial process of foreign invasion by colonial powers. However, it has also been contended by other scholars that the protection of Bechuanaland by Britain was for strategic reasons. Their view is that, sandwiched between South Africa, the Republic of Rhodesia (Zimbabwe) and South West Africa (Namibia), which was a German colony, Botswana thus provided a barrier against the expansion of both the Boers and the Germans into central southern Africa, while also improving British access inwards into southern Africa (Mogalakwe, 2006; Tsie, 1996).

In addition, during the colonial time, Britain administered Botswana from South Africa. This was because Botswana, Lesotho (then Basutoland) and Swaziland, all neighbouring South Africa, were part of a debate between the British and South Africans for possible incorporation into the Union of South Africa (Dale, 1991; Spence, 1964) or Southern Rhodesia (current Zimbabwe). Nevertheless, the failure to incorporate Botswana into the
Union of South Africa, only became clear after World War II when the territories, with the support of the British, stated that they were against incorporation, mainly by putting forward the apartheid policies of South Africa as a contentious ideological framework which was different from those upheld by the territories and the British (Spence, 1964). This resulted in Botswana peacefully negotiating independence from Britain. Subsequently, the British Government facilitated Botswana’s self-rule. Thus, Botswana has always maintained a peaceful political environment. Therefore, it is significant to examine how Btv facilitates this maintenance of peace and stability, and how this political context shapes the operation of national television in Botswana.

An issue that resulted during the colonisation of Botswana is that the British Government had a policy of minimal investment and involvement in Bechuanaland. Consequently, there were perceptions that the British Colonial Government had neglected Botswana (Khama, 1970; Mogalakwe, 2006). The conditions of Botswana at independence, which reflected limited infrastructure and established institutions such as schools and health facilities, demonstrate this view. In addition, while the colonial government facilitated the introduction of services such as a national radio, national television was not provided, possibly due to both limited infrastructure and possible colonial ‘neglect’.

Perhaps another pertinent issue with regard to democracy in any country is about who the decision makers are. It is clear that during independence, Botswana opted for both the traditional system of Bogosi (Chieftainship), which existed before British colonization, and Western liberal democracy that was introduced by the colonial government (Khama, 1970a). Prior to independence, Botswana’s political system the bogosi was organised around the Kgosi (chief) and his advisors, which included the Kgosana (headman) or the Kgosi’s uncles and siblings. In Botswana, the Kgosi is the most senior tribesman, vested with both judicial powers, and the jurisdiction over the allocation of tribal resources on behalf of the morafe (tribe). In each tribe, it was mostly the Kgosi and his relatives who acquired more herds of livestock through established systems such as the collection of gifts or tributes, fines and stray cattle as well as looting in wars (Good, 1992; Tsie, 1996). Some Dikgosi, cattle barons, and a few learned Batswana, with the support of the colonial government, formed the ruling Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) in 1962. Seretse Khama, who later became the first president of Botswana in 1966 when the BDP won the first national election in 1965, led the BDP (Good, 1992; Tsie, 1996). Thus, the elite in Botswana combined cattle farming,
commercial activity, and bureaucracy or political office (Holm & Molutsi, 1989; Solway, 2002).

Regarding Western liberal democracy, Botswana adopted a multi-party system and to date, has held successive national elections every five years since 1965. The ruling BDP always won these elections, and thus has remained in government for over 45 years. In addition to the modern democratic system, the Dikgosi, through an institution called the House of Chiefs, provide an advisory role to the Botswana Parliament. This merger of traditional and modern institutions has allowed the Botswana elite to forge ahead with development goals, based on their traditional legitimacy through the support of chiefs, and modern democracy through the ballot box (Robinson, 2009; Sebudubudu & Molutsi, 2008). Moreover, these elites have had limited fear of becoming political losers, in that they have had support from the traditional system. Acemoglu et al. (2003) and Harvey and Lewis, (1990) state that these elites ensured that Botswana’s development was not only urban based, but the needs of the rural population, were also provided for. This study explores how this unique democratic system has influenced state and media relations with a focus to consider how the political elites’ shape media policy within the trajectories of national development in Botswana.

However, despite being declared an exemplar of sound democracy, some scholars have questioned Botswana’s democratic credentials. For instance, one of the strongest critics of Botswana’s democracy is Good (1996), who since the 1990s, has been critical of Botswana’s participatory democracy, labelling it ‘authoritarian liberalism’ due to what he called limited participation. Recent literature also projects a similar view, arguing that there is limited freedom in Botswana due to limits on the expression of dissenting views and signs of autocracy by the government (Bothomilwe, Sebudubudu, & Maripe, 2011; Taylor, 2003, 2006). In addition, Good (1999a) described Botswana’s democracy as elite due to concentrated presidential powers. Good (2008) has also questioned Botswana’s corruption levels, arguing that corruption is rampant among the political elite. In view of these criticisms, the focus of the study is also to investigate the involvement of the State Government on Btv, to establish whether this impacts on its role and operational performance as a national broadcaster.
1.5.4 Development strategy

The preceding sections have highlighted Botswana’s social, economic and political contexts, pre and post-independence, with a view to proposing how these are relevant issues of focus in this study. In this section the focus is on Botswana’s approach to national socio-economic development. Key developmental problems that Botswana has had to address since independence include among others limited social services, poverty, dependence on foreign aid, drought, low education levels and being landlocked (Khama, 1970a). Although at independence Botswana appeared to have evaded specifying its developmental ideology along either socialism or capitalism, stating that it would adopt pragmatism, current literature reflects that Botswana is a capitalist state (Harvey & Lewis, 1990; Narayana et al., 2005). The adoption of capitalism is consistent with the general overall strategy of the new, post-independence government of Botswana through its adoption of most of the legal framework and polices established by the British Colonial Government. Thus, in a way, capitalism was one of the ingredients for the implementation of the modernisation project in Botswana. Nonetheless, within the pragmatic approach and a capitalist ideology, Botswana’s development strategy is grounded on national development planning.

Regarding national development planning, which is a feature of a modernisation approach to development (Leys, 1996; Okolie, 2003), the Botswana Government has always been committed to planning in order to rationalise resource allocation so as to drive the social and economic development of the country. As such, since independence in 1966, Botswana has always had a national development plan (NDP), with milestones set for five-year periods. Each national development plan (NDP) has been a strategy outlining the policies and national objectives to be pursued by the government; projects to be implemented, including their associated costs; as well as providing a review of previously planned projects. In addition, this planning has been central to Botswana’s achievement of the primary goals of a united nation and assisted in overcoming tribal and racial rivalries (Aquah, 2005). This is because the plans are generated through a consultative process that involves participation from the village to the national level. At village level, consultation is done through a Village Development Committee (VDC) to identify the needs of the community, and then a body of bureaucrats and political elites called the National Economic Advisory Council (NEAC) at national level prioritise and decide on projects and policies to be included in the NDP. The Ministry of Finance and Development Planning oversees the whole NDP process. In view of Botswana’s developmental goals, this study examines the prioritisation of a national
television station in Botswana, with a view to establishing why it was introduced in 2000, after many national projects were undertaken, as well as the articulated functions of this medium in regard to its role in communicating national development issues.

Another key component of Botswana’s development strategy is the country’s national objectives, which guide national development. These objectives are stated in all development plans as; sustained development, rapid economic growth, economic independence, and social justice (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2009a). Ostensibly, the first three objectives are expressed in economic terms and broadly relate to the need to improve the country’s economic performance, as well as use the revenue generated in a sustainable manner to ensure both current and future generations benefit from the resources (Sentsho, 2000). It can be concluded that Botswana has made progress towards economic independence by significantly reducing over reliance on foreign aid. This is demonstrated by Botswana’s ability to finance close to half of its budget, compared to the situation soon after independence when the country’s largest share of the budget, 60%, was provided for in the form of aid from the former colonial government (Leftwich, 1995; Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2003).

The only national development objective for Botswana, which is expressed in non-economic terms, is social justice. Central to this objective is the desire for all citizens to have equal access to the country’s resources. The implication for this is that the development of the country’s resources has to be as widely accessible to the citizenry as possible. The current figures of access to social services reflect that Botswana has made strides in making services such as water, education, health, and roads accessible to the public. For example, 96% of the population has access to potable water, the literacy rate of the population above 15 years is 84% (World Bank, 2013), and at least 84% of the population lives within a 5km radius of a health facility. However, of relevance to this thesis is the extent to which Btv, as a national service, is accessible and beneficial to the citizenry in Botswana as espoused in the national objective of social justice.

Consistent with a shift towards a more human development oriented as opposed to mainly economic based development strategy, Botswana since 1997, almost thirty years after independence, adopted an additional approach to development planning. The development aspiration is captured in a strategy called Vision 2016 ‘Towards Prosperity for all’. Vision 2016 represents Botswana’s aspirations to be achieved by the country’s fiftieth anniversary. These include the following seven priority areas commonly referred to as pillars:
• An educated and informed nation
• A productive and innovative nation
• A compassionate, just and caring nation
• A safe and secure nation
• An open, democratic and accountable nation
• A moral and tolerant nation
• A united and proud nation.

These pillars are essential in this study as they are a reference point with which to analyse the performance of the national television in Botswana as regard its role in national development.

1.6 Media in national development in Botswana

Within the modernisation theory, which is part of the theoretical framework used in this study, the media is ascribed the role of information dissemination (Amienyi, 2004; Lerner, 1958; Vilanilam, 2009). In view of this, this section considers the anatomy of the media in Botswana, broadcasting and Btv in particular, to explain how the media are connected to national development in Botswana. The Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, through the NDPs, has stated that the role of the government owned media in Botswana is to raise public awareness about the Government’s national development policies and objectives (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2003, 2009a; Republic of Botswana, 1966). In the context of high illiteracy rates of 75% at independence, it can be argued that radio, television and the kgotla have been the most appropriate channels for development communication in Botswana since independence. In particular, Radio Botswana, which was inherited from the colonial government, was praised after independence, for “mobilising the people towards self-help efforts, creating a strong sense of national identity” (Republic of Botswana, 1966, p. 69). In addition, commercial radio stations were introduced in Botswana in the 1990s. Consequently, radio in Botswana has remained the dominant and most relevant medium of mass communication (Lesitaokana, 2013; Peirce, 2011; Zaffiro, 1991), whereas a national television network was only introduced in 2000, and its role and performance in this regard, have yet to be studied.

Regarding traditional communication, the bogosi system discussed above also facilitated national development communication. It has been a practice that government officials, incumbent members of parliament, council representatives and bureaucrats mostly
from state owned enterprises, address *kgotla* meetings to consult with the public and disseminate information on a non-political basis. The *kgotla* meetings are community level gatherings presided over by the *Kgosi*, who ensures the issues discussed are non-partisan. This is a challenge in that by their nature, national development discourses are political issues. The relevance of the *kgotla* as a traditional form of communication in this study is that as indicated above it is a consultative forum, and a communication channel in Botswana. In view of this, the *kgotla* is useful in this study in contextualising development communication regarding specific traditional forms of communication within which a national television service in Botswana operates.

### 1.6.1 Television broadcasting in Botswana

Unlike radio and print, Botswana did not inherit a national television service, nor was there a commercial service with nationwide signal reach. Although the media market was liberalised in the 1990s, and radio has responded positively with three commercial radio stations currently operating in Botswana, commercial television’s response has been disappointing. A commercial service, eBotswana, formerly Gaborone Broadcasting Corporation (GBC) was awarded a national license in 2007. Nonetheless, due to budget constraints, its content that relates to Botswana is mostly information about events taking place in Gaborone, the capital city, where it operates. As a 24-hour syndicated version of South Africa’s e.tv, most of eBotswana’s content is South African. The Botswana Communications Regulatory Authority (BOCRA) has made efforts to license foreign owned satellite subscription channels in Botswana, such as GTV, the Munhumutape African Broadcasting Corporation (MABC) and Black Entertainment Satellite Television (BEST TV). In fact, MABC and BEST TV failed to launch and while GTV was launched in 2007, it ceased to operate in 2009, due to financial constraints (BTA Annual Report 2009). The only commercial television service in Botswana, which remains successful, is Multichoice’s DStv, a subscription pay service offering various packages of foreign channels. However, although a cursory look at these commercial services operating in Botswana indicates that they reflect a globalising media environment; local content in these channels is minimal. Perhaps, as a national television service, Btv should fill this gap by providing not only local content, but also context that reflects Batswana. Therefore, this study examines its significance in this regard.
1.6.2 Botswana Television (Btv) overview

Btv is a state-owned television station operating as a government institution within the Department of Broadcasting Services (DBS). Since its launch on 31st July 2000, Btv has mostly remained at arm’s length from the Office of the President (OP). In 2000, Btv operated as a division in the Department Information Services (DIS), which was accountable to the sub-ministry of the State President. In 2003, upon the introduction of a new Ministry of Communications Science and Technology (MCST), Btv was moved from the OP to the MCST, and the DBS was further split into two: the Department of Broadcasting Services (DBS) and the Department of Information Services (DIS). In 2009, with further restructuring of the MCST into two new ministries: the Ministry of Transport and Communications (MTC) and the Ministry of Science and Technology (MST), Btv and other government media departments were moved back to the OP, instead of moving to MTC, or to the Ministry of Youth Sports and Culture (MYSC). Perhaps the political leadership of Botswana viewed the media as too important to be far from the centre of the country’s most influential office, the OP.

The national television service was launched in Botswana after lengthy debates about the need for a television service (Mmusi, 2002; Mosime, 2007). Perhaps these lengthy debates culminated in delaying the introduction of the service. Kijeski (1995) attributes the delay in the launch of a national television service to the overall national development planning strategy adopted in Botswana. He argues that television may have been delayed to avoid introducing a service that may not have benefited the nation at large (Kijeski, 1995), as infrastructure such as electricity was still not generally available. As a sparsely populated country, the cost of providing electricity has remained high (Botswana Power Corporation, 2012), limiting the provision of services that have required large amounts of electric power, such as televisions. Zaffiro (1992) explains that consultants engaged by the Botswana Government to explore the possibility of introducing a national television service had warned the government about the need to launch a service that would be widely accessible countrywide, including both the urban and rural areas. One question that needs to be asked, however, is whether these infrastructure concerns were addressed prior to the launch of Btv, and if so or if not, how has that impacted on the channel’s performance in regard to its role in the national development of Botswana? This study attempts to addresses this question.

Regarding the functions of Btv, the Botswana Government website (www.gov.bw) states that the main function of the DBS and the role of the state media is to provide news,
information and entertainment. Thus, Btv, as a service under the DBS, has an obligation to provide government communication functions. Nevertheless, as a public institution in Botswana, Btv remains open to public criticism and or praise. Consequently, this study also seeks to examine the programming output of Btv to explore the extent to which its content is consistent with its ascribed and or expected functions. Furthermore, the study solicits audiences’ perceptions of Btv regarding its role in national development. The focus of this is also to establish the extent to which there is a shared understanding of the role(s) of Btv, as an information disseminator for the government, among the various stakeholders involved in television in Botswana. These stakeholders are media professionals, policy makers, media activists and the public. As a result, representation of these stakeholders, including Btv audiences, as informants, has been brought into this study.

1.6.3 Media policy in Botswana
The expectation in any society is for the role of media to be outlined in media policy documents (Franklin, 2001, Freedman, 2008). This is because media policy sets parameters and guidelines through which the media operates (Freedman, 2008). Nonetheless, in Botswana there is no formal broadcasting policy. However, there are statutory instruments, for example, the Botswana Communications and Regulatory Act (BOCRA, 2012), together with actions and decisions of the Botswana Government that are considered and referred to as media policy in this study. Zaffiro (1992) observed that by the 1990s, the Botswana Government was considering a combination of the Western style liberal media philosophies and developmental journalism as possible guiding principles for the operation of the media in Botswana. Nonetheless, these were not stated as media policy. In this regard, Zaffiro (1992) wondered how media policy would be framed in Botswana in subsequent years, in consideration of emerging demands from opposition political parties in Botswana wanting more access to State owned media, and increasing pressure from the public demanding that the government address the socio-economic challenges facing the country. Also, there are growing concerns about the government control of state media (Balule, 2013b; Fombad, 2002; Tutwane, 2011). Therefore, given the lack of media policy in Botswana, this study suggests possible policy considerations that could guide broadcasting media in Botswana, particularly Btv, within the development communication framework.
1.7 Summary and outline of chapters

This thesis is structured in six chapters. In this Chapter 1, the focus has been to introduce the study, highlighting the statement of the problem, the research aims, objectives and key research questions. This Chapter 1 ends with the contextualisation of national development in Botswana, where issues such as the demographic profile, economic and political performance, developmental strategy, media in development, television broadcasting, an overview of Btv and an overview of the media policy in Botswana are discussed. The aim of this chapter has been to situate the Botswana context as a relevant case for this study. Next is Chapter 2, which explores the literature on development communication, with a view to identify the various ways in which development is conceptualised. The chapter further explores the relationship between television broadcasting and national development, specifically in the African context. The other key issue in the literature review is the role of the state in development communication, an issue dominant in the state media relations in Africa and other developing countries. Chapter 3 extends the literature review and discusses modernisation and political economy as the theoretical frameworks that underpin this study. Chapter 4 outlines the qualitative methodology, as well as the research methods adopted in this study. Also in this chapter, data collection processes through document analysis, schedule analysis, in-depth, interviews and focus group discussions are explained. In Chapter 5 the key findings of the study are presented in four sections consistent with the methods used. The first section presents the findings from the analysis of the documents, the second section presents the findings of the schedule analysis, the third section presents the findings from semi-structured interviews and the final section presents the findings from the focus groups. The final chapter, Chapter 6, offers further analysis of the findings of the study particularly in light of the literature review, and addresses media considerations. In addition, the thesis contribution to knowledge in terms of theory, methodology and policy as well as the research limitations and suggestions for future research are stated. The final part of Chapter 6 offers the concluding statements of this study.
Chapter 2  Literature Review

2.1 Introduction
This chapter provides a review of the literature that relates to the key elements of this study, which are development, development communication, and television broadcasting in an African context with a view to demonstrating the various conceptualisations of development, and how the criticisms of modernisation are limited as alternative explanations of development. In addition, the literature review provides an analysis of the political and economic challenges generally faced by broadcasters, with a view to analysing how these influence the possible alternatives to structuring broadcasting in developing countries as broadcasters position their media systems to contribute to national development. In this chapter, the diverse global perspectives relating to the evolution of development paradigms and practice are explored in Section 2.2. Next, in Section 2.3, the focus is on television broadcasting in Africa, specifically its origins, structure, and challenges. In Section 2.4, the literature on the role of television in national development within the modernisation paradigm is reviewed. In Section 2.5, an overview of media policy is provided, while the last section of the chapter presents the conclusions of the literature review.

2.2 Definitions of development and development communication
Various attempts have been made to define development in the literature. Nonetheless, at least four distinct conceptualisations of development are evident: structural, critical approach, alternative or another development, and post-development approach. It must be noted that, while these views are rooted in diverse theoretical frameworks, this section will not dwell on individual frameworks, but rather offer an overview of the broad arguments under the four specific approaches mentioned above, with a view to underscoring their importance in this study.

First, the definition of development within the structural analysis framework relates to how societal structures can influence change. The origins of development are linked to the reconstruction of Europe in the aftermath of World War II, which was spearheaded by the United States through the Marshall Plan aimed at assisting war devastated countries to rebuild their economies, and was extended to developing countries to help improve living conditions in those societies (Melkote, 2012). At this time, the desire of Western governments to improve the economies of their colonies and former colonies coincided with
the decolonisation wave of the 1950s and 1960s. Indeed, the political reasoning for
development was based on the liberal political theory of enlightenment, which was to be
transferred to other non-Western contexts to emulate (Mody, 2003). The emphasis on
development after World War II was thus on societal structural transformation towards
modernisation (Sumner & Tribe, 2008). The main emphasis was on transforming non-
Western societies into “modern” states; in other words, to make them look like the West
(Lerner, 1963, Schramm, 1963), as opposed to adopting Soviet communism ideologies.

The transformation was to involve industrialisation and accelerated economic growth
(Leys, 1996; Pieterse, 2010). These views were grounded in the neo-classical economic
school of thought that development could be achieved through economic growth. In this
viewpoint, economic growth was connected to industrialisation, and both were associated
with improved living standards for the population through the *trickle-down* effect (Rostow,
1960). In addition, development was associated with modernity, which involved the
transformation of traditional institutions into modern ones (Melkote, 2003). Modernity was
characterised by urbanisation and technological advancement (Willis, 2011). Furthermore, as
societies were categorised into “pre-modern” and “modern”, pre-modern societies were to be
transformed into “modern” societies through a “diffusion of modernity” and societies with
modern values were expected to mimic Western societies and aspire to be similar to them.
Sachs (2010) succinctly sums up the modernisation view as an agenda to westernise the
world.

In addition to societal structures and their influence on change, the definition of
development within the structural analysis approach to development involved psychological
and sociological assumptions about human beings. Within this psychological view, societies
could become modern through changing the behaviours of the population. For example,
McClelland (1961, 1963) hypothesises that the individual’s urge for achievement is a source
of motivation to engage in activities that could lead to economic growth and national
development. In addition, Lerner (1958) also expresses a psychological view through the
notion of “empathy”, which, he argues, motivates people to adopt new ideas. Similarly,
Rogers (1962) is of the view that new innovations from Western societies could be diffused
into developing countries, and the “elite” of a country would presumably adopt them,
concluding that the elite should become the target of said innovations, on the assumption that
they will diffuse the new values to the peasants in their countries (Rogers, 1962). The
ultimate objective of these psychological and social changes suggested by such researchers as
Lerner, McClelland, and Rogers, is that the developing countries would modernise, thus changing their social structures to supposedly lead to economic growth. The conceptualisation of development within the structural and behavioural change as described above constitutes what came to be known as the dominant paradigm of development. The dominant paradigm commonly refers to theoretical explanations of development that centre on the need for behaviour change as a pre-requisite for societal change. Moreover, such explanations underscore the importance of information and knowledge as mechanisms for propelling desired social change (Waisbord, 2001).

The second, critical approach defines development as a reflection of global inequalities that create dependency. In view of the rising evidence of the failure of the dominant paradigm of development to bring economic growth in developing countries in the 1960s, other explanations of development have emerged with the intention of explaining the causes of the persistence of underdevelopment in some contexts. Examples of the critical approach include the dependency approach which states that modernisation leads to dependency (Cardoso & Faletto, 1979) and imperialism. In the critical approach perspective, global structures are said to perpetuate inequalities (Hamelink, 1983; Boyd-Barrett, 1977; Golding, 1974). The understanding of development within this dependency idea is similar to that of modernisation, in that the focus is on economic growth. Their point of departure from the dominant paradigm is that the dependency theorists, mostly Asian and Latin American, blamed the lack of growth in developing countries on the global inequality (Cardoso & Faletto, 1979).

The conception of development within the dependency approach can be mapped from the work of Karl Marx (1976 in Webster, 1990) as he explains the inequalities between “developed” and “underdeveloped” societies. Central to the view of Marx is that economic inequality and social division are perpetuated by the desire of certain individuals to accumulate capital. Marx further argues that in pursuit of such capital, the dominant class, that is those with the means of production seek to exploit those without the resources, in this case the working class. Marx further demonstrates that this relationship extends beyond national borders, as demonstrated in the eighteen century as when wealthy European merchants grabbed raw materials from other nations (Marx, 1976 in Webster, 1990) in order to fuel their own industries in the West. Thus this accumulation of capital through exploitation of resources specifically from Latin America, Africa and Asia, became the fundamental ingredient in the development of capitalism as well as the foundation of
theoretical discussions on development and underdevelopment. For example, scholars like Andre Gunder Frank (1967) explored this export based relationship between the West and former colonies, as a source of the latter’s ‘dependent’ relationship on the former.

The colonialisation of Latin America, Africa and Asia has allegedly strengthened the existing economic system of export-led economies of non-western societies. Colonialism thus provided European economies with raw materials, and cheap labour. Frank (1967) also observes that the third world elite, whom he called *compradors*, perpetuated this system as they endorsed the economic order of export led economies. In addition, the compradors adopted the lifestyles of the West, and are characterised by high standards of living. These elites are intermediaries between the West, and their countries. Frank (1967) calls the West the centre, and the developing countries the metropolis. The elites acquire the materials for export from the rural communities or peasants, whom Frank calls the satellites. Frank contends the economic system is organised in such a way that the elites in metropolis acquire goods from the satellites for export to the West. This he argues creates a chain of dependency. It is this chain that Frank argues should be broken to allow the accumulation of surplus by the satellites. A similar view has been expressed by Nkrumah (1965), who argued that while many African countries may have attained self-rule, their economies remain controlled and influenced by external forces; in this instance, Europe. In general, the evidence in the 1970s was suggesting that industrialisation which was advocated for by the dominant paradigm was having adverse effects such as rural-urban migration; dependency as opposed to self-reliance; and undermined local cultures at the expense of Western values (Beal & Jussawalla, 1981; Stewart & Streeten, 1976).

The third, alternative or another development, approach, relates to views of development that are opposed to the focus on quantifiable economic indicators such as economic growth, and technological determinism of the structuralists (Melkote, 2003), and interconnectedness as opposed to dependency views (Cambridge, 2007). The “another development” approach focuses on human dignity and participation in the development process (Servaes, 1999). The focus of the participatory approaches is thus centred on individual levels of the formulation of development, and contends that development should focus on “self-reliance” and should be an endogenous process (Servaes & Malikhao, 1994, p10). Furthermore, the participatory approaches, also expressed as “multiplicity” or “another development”, define development as focusing on poverty eradication as well as environmental sustainability. Central to the participatory approaches are the notions of
Empowerment (Melkote and Steeves, 2001) and social justice (Melkote, 2012). Empowerment explores the constraints and, mostly, the power inequalities that influence development (Melkote, 2001). Within the alternative development paradigm, development is beyond economic growth and technological diffusion, but involves “growth with equity, provision of basic needs, meaningful employment, and rich and varied interpersonal relationships” (Melkote, 2003, p.137). Melkote further states that native cultures and environment are intrinsic to development within this view.

The alternative paradigms of development comprise what can be described as an eclectic view of development (Leys, 1996). Due to the persistence in the lack of the desired changes, institutions concerned with development practice – herein called ‘development community’ (Leys, 1996), international community or donor organisations – intervened with an alternative approach to tackling developmental challenges mostly by investing in human beings (Pieterse, 2010). This approach focused more on short-term, measurable changes in both societies and individual human beings. A rather technocratic view of development (Gore, 2000) focuses on measurable indicators and outcomes that determine change. Examples include poverty-reduction strategies and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) as preferred indicators for the measurement of social change. This eclectic view has been challenged for pursuing outcomes that might not necessarily be the priorities of the beneficiaries of such programs. It has been further criticised for divorcing the concept of development from socio-economic structures, due to its over-emphasis on poverty eradication at the expense of other institutions, such as legal and political structures (Sumner & Tribe, 2008).

The fourth view of development, which takes a much more radical approach, is a post-development perspective that questions as well as dismisses the notion of development (Escobar, 1995; Esteva, 1992; Sachs, 1995). Scholars holding this post-development perspective describe development as “a ruin” (Sachs, 1992, p. 1), “obsolete” (Sachs, 2010, p. xv), “facing extinction”, “evaporated” (Esteva, 2010, pp. 1, 16), and are already writing the “obituary” of development (Hornick, 1988). The post-modernist or “post development” school of thought views development as a Western understanding of modernity to be imposed on other countries, and argues that within the development “discourse” there is an inherent attitude of inferiority and superiority (Sachs, 2010). Therefore, the post-development approach challenges developmental orthodoxy and dismisses development on the basis that it has allegedly worsened the living conditions of the poor more than it has improved them, and
that it is “nothing else but the Westernisation of the World” (Sachs, 2010, p. xviii). Sachs (2010) contends that the economic view of development is misleading and should rather be replaced with a less materialistic view of prosperity, which recognises the other non-quantifiable factors, such as spirituality and self-reliance. In addition, he argues that globalisation has rendered nation-states insignificant as actors in their own development. Sachs (2010) argues that former United States President Harry S. Truman’s postulation of the need for “underdeveloped” countries to aspire to be like developed countries is challenged by ecological factors in the form of environmental sustainability with which the developed countries now have to contend. This, he argues, reflects that development is not a replicable model. Sachs further explains that development is linked to the political system of capitalism against socialism, as Truman espoused the global dominance of American political system. In addition, Sachs argues that with the weakening political differences between the East and the West, development may change form, “prevention replaces progress as the objective of development; the redistribution of risk rather than the redistribution of wealth now dominate the international agenda” (Sachs, 2010, p.xvii). While rightly acknowledging the challenges of development, specifically modernisation’s outcomes of societies caught between modernity and tradition, the post development paradigm as demonstrated by Sachs (2010) fails to offer alternatives that have both theoretical and practical implications (Pieterse, 2000). Post-development theory, as observed by Matthews (2004), ignores the African context, and thus appeals less to scholars in Africa.

Although divergent views prevail regarding the notion of development, there is a common understanding among development scholars and practitioners that development involves change and improvement in livelihoods. Rapley (2004), however, notes that there have been variations in views on how to determine change. These could be through either economic indices or human indices. The economic indices-based method of evaluating change resonates with the growth-lead theories, such as the modernisation paradigm, while the human indicators approach is prevalent in the multiplicity paradigms. However, Rapley (2004) observes that within the post-modernist school of thought, contrary to that of the developmentalist view, development has less to do with improving living standards and more to do with social control.

In this study, a hybrid approach to development is adopted. This is because none of the approaches outlined above offer a conclusive solution that addresses the overall focus of development, which as demonstrated through the various definitions above, encapsulates a
variety of structural and humanistic factors. Moreover, consistent with views on development in other African contexts, which focus on improving the living standards of citizens (Okigbo & Eribo, 2004), the focus of development in Botswana is on both improving living standards (humanistic) and economic growth (structural), although there is evidence of high levels of social inequality in Botswana, as demonstrated in Chapter 1. Considering the socio-economic and political context of Botswana and the challenges facing the country, such as social inequality, the approach towards national development in this study is pinned on a hybrid, structural approach that focuses on ensuring both the government and the citizens’ work together to improve living conditions, influenced by the context of Botswana. As such, this study adopts a mixture of an orthodox approach to development and an analysis of the socio-economic context of Botswana. A more detailed analysis of the theoretical position of this study is provided in Chapter 3, where the modernisation theory of development and political economy are employed to examine the role of television in Botswana’s national development.

2.2.1 Development communication defined

Similarly to the variations in definitions of development, the conceptualisation of development communication also reflects diverse schools of thought. “Media and development”, “development communication” or “communication for social change” – as it is often called (Servaes, 2008) – deal with questions about how communication can be used to bring about the desired economic and social progress in developing countries (Melkote, 1991; Servaes, 2008). Similar to the origins of development outlined above, development communication can be traced to the post World War II period, when developed countries tried to find solutions for underdevelopment in countries in Latin America, Asia and Africa as the disparities between the developed and the developing nations widened. An outcome of such efforts is the notion of development communication pioneered by Erskine Childers among others.

Erskine Childers was the leader of a unit of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) called the Development Support Communication Service (DSCS) (Colle, 2008). In an extensive paper republished by Colle (2008), Childers expressed ideas that remain influential to development communication. Childers and Vajrathan (1968, in Colle 2008) suggested that communication should be integral to development projects. Moreover, the authors strongly advocated for involvement of beneficiaries of developments through engaging them in deciding their ‘own development’, thus implying participation of
those beneficiaries. According to Childers and Vajrathan (1968 in Colle, 2008), the key features of development communication among other factors involved planning and research. Planning was necessary to identify resources as well as messages to support development projects. Likewise, research was essential in ensuring the development messages systematically related to the information needs of the beneficiaries (Colle, 2008).

The phrase “development communication” is associated with Nora Quebral (1975), of the University of Philippines in Los Ban˜ who coined the phrase while working with other researchers on improving agricultural output in the Philippines. In the initial conceptualization of development communication, Quebral focused on applying human communication to induce speedy social change aimed at reducing poverty and promoting economic growth, as well as ‘greater social equality’ (Quebral, 1975, p. 2). Thus, Quebral conceptualized communication as a catalyst of social change. In her view, such change would improve economic growth and social equality. Possibly, with existing lack of economic growth and social inequalities persisting in developing countries, Quebral (2002, p.16) defined development communication as ‘the art and science of human communication linked to a society’s planned transformation from a state of poverty to one of dynamic socio-economic growth that makes for greater equity and the larger unfolding of individual potential’. In this regard, development communication requires planning to achieve specific desired goals aimed at equitable distribution of resources. Manyozo (2004) shares a similar view, but adds the dimension of enhancing grassroots’ decision making with the view to promote promoting social justice.

Moemeka loosely defines development communication as:

“the application of the processes of communication to the development process. In other words, development communication is the use of the principles and practice of exchange of ideas to fulfill development objectives. It is, therefore, an element of the management process in the overall planning and implementation of development programmes” (1991, p.19).

From this definition, development communication involves processes of communication aimed at supporting the general development activities. In other words, development communication could be a means of attaining development goals. Moemeka (1991) further states that in this regard, development communication has a transformative role of exchanging ideas for social change, and a socialisation role of introducing and maintaining
certain societal values that are perceived to be ideal to development. Summarising the conclusions of the International Conference on Communication Policies for Rapidly Developing societies held at Mashhad, Iran, in 1975, Moemeka lists six priorities of development communication as follows:

- Determination of the needs of the people and citizens’ access to the media. The implication is that citizens will also use the media to give feedback to government
- Provision of a holistic communication system that allows for communication across all levels of society
- Provision of media to share cultural values, thus enhancing preservation of local cultures
- Provision of appropriate and relevant information aimed at human development
- Provision of support for specific development projects and initiatives
- Awareness raising among the community members to familiarise them with human and national development opportunities as well as motivating them to participate in such activities (Moemeka, 1991, p. 19-20).

Thus, the interface between development and communication has been grounded on an understanding that for development to occur, there is need for communication among the various stakeholders involved in the development process. Such inclusiveness would be demonstrated by the participation of the grassroots in the communication process. As shown in the following sections that discuss the various definitions of development communication, participation and information dissemination are not the panacea for development, but rather various factors influence communication and the development process.

Melkote and Steeves (2001) observe that views on development communication are spread between two broad perspectives: “those who view development as an organisational delivery system versus those who view communication more broadly, as inseparable from culture and from facets of social change” (2001, pp. 37-38). Similarly, Manyozo (2007) summarises the views on development communication into two broad areas. The first perspective comprises views that development communication involves transmitting development-oriented messages to the poor. The second area includes views that perceive development communication as a process putting the locals at the centre of design and dissemination of messages. Thus, views on development communication can be grouped
along the dominant paradigm on the one hand, and the participatory frameworks, on the other.

In the dominant paradigm that encompasses modernisation and diffusion of innovations, the overarching aim of communication is that communication, largely through the mass media, is essential in assisting social development of Third World societies such as those in Africa, Asia and Latin America (Fred, 1980). There is the notion that development communication should entail the transmission of messages, information and knowledge from the centre to the periphery (Melkote and Steeves, 2001). Melkote and Steeves (2001), state that the conceptualisation of development communication within the dominant paradigm is consistent with the post World War II Western initiatives, specifically the Marshall Plan. The aim of these initiatives was to improve economic conditions of the least developed countries. As it will be discussed further in the theoretical framework chapter (Chapter 3), the Western based scholars such as Daniel Lerner (1958), Everett Rogers (1962) and Wilbur Schramm (1964) were among the earlier scholars involved in studies establishing how communication can be used to support economic development strategies.

The role of communication in development within the dominant paradigm is expressed within a behavioural framework that entails diffusing new ideas, values and technologies to the public for adoption with the intention of ultimately changing behaviour. Melkote and Steeves (2001) state that the goal of communication within this school of thought is persuading the public to adopt new ideas advocated for by the decision-makers in society. The main channel of communication within the dominant paradigm was the mass media. The mass media could thus do the following in support of national development:

- Widen horizon
- Focus attention
- Raise inspiration
- Create a climate for development
- Help change strong held attitudes or values
- Feed the interpersonal channels
- Broaden the policy dialogue
- Enforce social norms
- Help form tastes
- Affect attitudes lightly held and canalise stronger attitudes and
• Help substantially in all types of education and training (Schramm, 1964, in Moemeka 1991).

The belief in the role of the mass media in diffusing new ideas towards social change can be traced to the conceptualisation of the power of the mass media by the “magic bullet” theory. The assumption within the discredited ‘magic bullet’ theory was that the media had a powerful manipulative effect on individuals and society, and hence should be used to disseminate information aimed at changing individual’s behaviours (Shannon and Weaver, 1949 in Baran & Davis, 2006). This was because of the assumption that individuals could be manipulated through dissemination of propagandist information through the media. This assumption however, ignored the ability of individuals to digest and question the information and possibly give specific meaning and interpretation, which may be different from those of the sender of the message. Within this paradigm, the overarching objective of communication was thus persuasion, aimed at achieving a specific response form the receiver of the message. The media within the dominant paradigm of development communication was thus assumed to have among other things, the positive impact of improving literacy as well as developing new aspirations (Rogers, 1962; Schramm, 1964). Moreover, communication was to initially target the elites, whom it was assumed would pass on, or “trickle down” the benefits of communication (Rogers, 1962; Moemeka, 1991).

Development communication as defined within the realm of imperialism and dependency is premised on the argument that information dissemination alone is insufficient to produce meaningful change, but rather the large social structure also influences social change. This view on the focus of development communication from a structural perspective is consistent with dependency views on development alluded to in section 2.2 a. In the area of communication, the emphasis on structural constraints is dominant in scholarship analysing communication systems and media structures (Felstehausen, 1973, Boafo, 1988). In an analysis of development communication theory, Felstehausen (1973) suggested more than just the need for conceptualisation of development communication beyond human beings as factors of analysis, but to consider social structure within which communication takes place as well. Similarly, as it will be discussed further in the theoretical framework chapter of this thesis (Chapter 3), the analysis of the social structures lead many critical scholars mostly Latin American to view the dominant approach of development communication that involved transfer of knowledge from developing countries as a form of dependency and imperialism (Felstehausen, 1973; Beltran, 1976).
Studies conducted within the dependency view, underscored the need for developing countries to be self-reliant (Galtung, 1971) and reduce dependency on developed countries (Golding & Harris, 1997; Smythe, 1981; Santos, 1970). The view within Latin America was that due to the region’s already existing socio-economic and political dependence on the United States, the area of communication was no exception and was thus a reflection of the existing social system (Beltran, 1976). However, the definition of development communication as a process of creating dependency mostly focused on mass media and cultural imperialism, but is inadequate in explaining how individuals in such dependent society may resist or benefit from the dynamics of the relationships with the West. For instance, in Botswana like in other African contexts where innovation is still limited, it is inevitable that Botswana relies on technologies and innovations from the West. Additionally, the developed countries depend on the developing countries to consume these products or technologies.

The participatory school of thought about development communication that was dominant in the 1980s is a critique of both the dominant paradigm and dependency schools of thought. The participatory approach holds a contrary view on the role of development communication in persuasive marketing and the diffusion of ideologies, largely criticising the dominant paradigm for ignoring the contextual environments within which development takes place (Melkote and Steeves, 2001). The epistemological origins of development communication within participatory framework can be linked to Paulo Freire’s (1983, 1994) dialogical pedagogy which focuses on ensuring contexts or environments are central to learning. Freire (1983) therefore stated that the mechanical model of sending message to a passive receiver produced citizens who lacked a critical view and were thus limited in the extent to which they could bring about social change in their societies. The implication for this explanation, as elaborated in Freire’s (1983) theory of dialogical communication, is that development communication should be a tool for the grassroots to effect social change in their communities.

Development communication within the participatory approaches involves consideration for the cultural contexts of a society within which developmental practice is taking place. In addition to this, the beneficiaries of proposed development projects should be given the opportunity to play a role in the decision-making process; thus, the citizens can resist or have a say in the final projects to be implemented in their communities. Thus the focus of development communication should include the resources available as well as the
values of the specific community or citizenry. Within this paradigm, development communication is conceptualised as empowerment and freedom (Sen, 2001), participatory (Servaes, 1999) and dialogical (Freire, 1970).

In a nutshell, the role of development communication emphasises participation at all levels including individual, national and international levels (Servaes, 1999). Contrary to the dominant paradigm, the focus of development communication is not only concerned with the diffusion of new ideas, but also involves the grassroots being able to express their developmental needs. Consequently, participatory development approaches conceptualise development communication in development project stages such as planning, implementation, and evaluation. Huesca (2003) explains that participation is not necessarily a new concept in development communication. This is because in their attempt to address the limitations of the modernisation paradigm, modernisation scholars included the notion of participation as a defence to critiques of the theory in the 1970s (Huesca, 2003). Nonetheless, the difference between the participatory approach and the dominant paradigm approaches to participation is that in the former, the aim of participation is to increase economic growth, while in the latter the objective is the self-determination of individuals (Huesca, 2003). Similarly to UNDP spearheading the need for development communication, the United Nations Food and Agricultural Organisation, FAO, has been central to promoting participation in development communication projects (Colle, 2008). FAO in its website (http://www.fao.org) defines development communication as a “results oriented communication process based on dialogue and participation that allows rural people to voice their opinions, share knowledge and actively engage in their own development”. The participatory approach remains the current approach to development communication, although it is inevitable that with the persistence of underdevelopment and changes in societies, scholars will continue to seek answers for more appropriate approaches of development communication.

From the preceding discussions on the definitions of development communication, it can thus be deduced that from a communication viewpoint, the lack of development was generally attributed to the following:

• lack of information and knowledge among the populations of developing countries (the modernisation and diffusion of innovation perspectives),
• power imbalances in the global economy (dependency, imperialism)
• lack of citizen participation in developmental processes (participation, empowerment, capacitation).

2.2.2 Approaches to development communication

The preceding paragraphs have outlined the various definitions of development communication. In addition to these conceptualisations, there are variations of the approaches used in development communication (Moemeka, 1991). These include interpersonal, mass media and an integrated approach. Interpersonal communication involves face-to-face communication. The mass media approach focuses on the use of mass communication channels such as radio, television and newspapers, as tools for disseminating information about development with the view to create an appropriate environment for social change to occur (Moemeka, 1987, 1991). The integrated approach involves combining elements of interpersonal and mass media to facilitate communication on issues of development.

The key area of focus of the interpersonal approach to development communication involves the use of traditional forms of communication. Moemeka (1991) states that this approach is an aspect of the rural development approach involving information dissemination in areas such as health, nutrition, and agriculture. The information dissemination mostly involves ‘experts’ in the form of development agents who move from community to community doing extension work aimed at diffusing information in the specific areas of desired change, such as sanitation (Moemeka, 1985). Moreover, such information could be disseminated through other channels such as social forums, town crier, and village market among others to communicate with the populace (Moemeka, 2000). As a community based approach, interpersonal communication approach to development communication holds in high regard the need to engage communities in generating solutions to their challenges, thus inculcating community participation in development projects. Likewise, as a context based approach, the role of community values is thus apparent, hence the need to consider those values for communication to be effective within such communities. Thus in the traditional African context, the values such as respect for the elders and authority, communitarianism as opposed to individualism, as well as religious practice should be incorporated in communication (Moemeka 1994, in Moemeka 2000). Various scholars have demonstrated the successive use of this method especially among rural communities (Rogers, 1977; Rahim, 1976; Moemeka, 1991). Rahim (1976) demonstrated how this approach effectively enhanced
communication among illiterate communities in India. Focusing on a study that explored the preferred form of communication between traditional and mass media among a rural community in Bendel State in Nigeria, Rogers observed the popularity of traditional channels of communication over the use of mass media (Rogers, 1977, in Moemeka 2000). A similar view was noted by other scholars such as Kashem (2009) and Longo (1990) who were more specific and highlighted the suitability of interpersonal communication in explaining innovations in agricultural development projects. Nevertheless, this approach is limited in terms of the distance barriers, and the number of people, for instance farmers, that extension workers or community members can reach to disseminate information. Thus, the use of this approach has been hampered by the lack of human resource capital.

A dominant theme in development communication scholarship initially advocated for the use of mass media as a preferred form of communication approach in development related work (Moemeka, 1987; Katz and Wedell, 1977; Schramm, 1964; Rogers, 1962). Within this approach, development communication thus focused on ‘experts’ disseminating development projects information through the mass media channels such as radio, newspapers and television to ensure wider reach of the population. The limitation of human resources necessary to reach wider audiences as explained in the interpersonal approach could thus be addressed through the use of few experts sending messages through the mass media to a mass target audience, and transcending the distance barrier (Moemeka, 1991). The limitation of the mass media approach, which will be elaborated more in the theoretical framework of this study, has been stated as their inability to engage in meaningful communication due to limited opportunities for feedback in earlier mass media channels. In this regard, Moemeka, 1981, states that the mass media approach is insufficient in that while the messages may reach intended audiences, there is limited effectiveness of communication, as the community may need further discussions and deliberations on the message before implementing suggested changes. Therefore, an approach that could accentuate the benefits of both interpersonal and mass communication as well as address the limitations of these approaches was necessary, hence an integrated approach to development communication.

In the integrated approach, or the holistic approach, the interpersonal and mass media approaches are combined to enhance communication aimed at social change. In this approach, the interpersonal communication is preferred due to its ability to effect social change while the mass media are desirable for their ability to disseminate information to large audiences at once. For example a study by Rogers (1977, quoted in Moemeka 2000) has
shown how the mass media channels and interpersonal communication supplement each other in development communication. Rogers established that while a majority of the participants (80%) initially got information about development projects from radio as a mass medium in rural Nigeria, most of the participants’ decisions to undertake such projects were more influenced by interpersonal communications such as face-to-face discussions with other community members. In this way, it can be argued that development communication should entail a synthesis of communication on both levels; interpersonal and mass communication. As suggested by Melkote and Steeves (2001) communication should focus on two levels of development communication: the micro (individual) and the macro (national or global) levels, although in practice these two levels influence each other. Concurring with this view, Boafo (1985) defined development communication as application of traditional and modern communication technologies to facilitate social change.

This study adopts Melkote and Steeves’ (2001) postulation and avoids the binaries in development communication; it defines development communication within a process that entails communication among development stakeholders to improve the livelihoods of the citizens. Consistent with the conceptualisation of development in this study, communication for development is understood as a process that allows for the sharing of information among the citizens, the government, and the civil society with the intention of bringing about social change. Such information sharing should reflect a hybrid approach by exposing the views of the decision makers, as well as those of the citizens, with a view to addressing inequalities in society. Moreover, this study recognises the significance of a development communication approach that addresses the social communication needs of society at both individual and national levels.

2.3 Television Broadcasting and development communication
National television systems throughout the world remain a subject of scholarly study, with the focus on what their role should be in the specific context within which they operate. In developed media markets such as Europe, television is mostly used as a democratic and cultural tool, and a window onto the world (Livingstone, 2004). However, scholars in these societies also focus on television in the post-broadcast era (Tay & Turner, 2008). In other parts of the world, such as Asia, the perception is that television has just realised its optimal use and development (Athique, 2009; Chadha & Kavoori, 2000). In the context of Africa, as social change is also a key social policy objective (Banerjee & Kalinga, 2005), public media
is ascribed a developmental role. In this regard, as Botswana is a developing country, this thesis approaches the study of a national television system through an analysis of its role in social policy objectives, specifically national development. Thus, this section of the literature review discusses the structure and processes of television systems with a view to examining the performance of the media, particularly, television with regard to its role in national development.

2.3.1 Television broadcasting in Africa

Television broadcasting in Africa dates back to the late 1950s, a period characterised by the beginning of independence of some African countries. Bourgault (1995) links the origins of national television systems in Africa to the continent’s colonial subjection. For example, Nigeria inherited its national broadcaster from the British, its former colonial rulers. Nigeria introduced its national television broadcast in 1959 (Uche, 2000, cited in Olorunnisola & Akanni, 2005). Other countries, such as Egypt, Ghana, Senegal and Sudan, established their national broadcasters in the 1960s. In some instances, television was introduced in partnership with international organisations; for example, Senegal partnered with UNESCO to launch an educational television service (Katz & Wedell, 1977). Nonetheless, countries such as Togo, Uganda, Tanzania and Swaziland delayed the introduction of a national television service until the 1970s, mainly due to financial constraints (Bourgault, 1995). Moreover, some countries such as Namibia, Burundi and Mauritania did not have national broadcasting services until the 1980s. Some counties, like Rwanda, could not boast a national television service until the 1990s. Among the late-comers in the 21st century is Botswana.

Katz and Wedell (1977) explain that the introduction of national television in Africa coincided with socio-economic planning but contend that there was an oversight in the relationship between television and development. While Bourgault (1995) associates the establishment of national television with nationalism – as television was introduced as a national asset – Katz and Wedell (1977) demonstrate how, for various reasons, television was introduced rather haphazardly in developing countries, with less formulated broadcasting policies. For example, they show how, in Senegal and Uganda, television was launched to coincide with special events; to celebrate sport in Senegal and the wedding of former president Idi Amin in Uganda. Katz and Wedell (1977, p.14) summarise the introduction of television in developing countries as:

“an opiate of the people, as a symbol of nationhood, as a project of the image of the
leadership, as part of a national celebration, to transmit a sporting event, as a result of an attractive proposal by a foreign broadcasting company or set manufacturer, as a result of the educational prodding of UNESCO, or to meet the cosmopolitan expectations of big city dwellers demanding the right to be entertained in the cosmopolitan manner”.

Likewise, Lee (1994) provides similar explanations for the introduction of television in developing countries and puts it down to the desire to use television to serve the entertainment needs of the urban residents. Again, this urban focus resulted in issues of limited access to the signals of such services by populations beyond the urban centres. This is a challenge that still haunts broadcasting access in developing countries (Mytton, 2000). There is literature that focuses on the introduction of television in the 20th century, and a dearth of studies examine the introduction of television services in the 21st century in view of the changed economic and political conditions worldwide. Specifically, few studies have attempted to explore television broadcasting in Botswana.

Prior to the launch of Btv in 2000, scholars such as Fako and Nyamnjoh (2000), Kijeski (1995); and Zaffiro (2000) addressed the absence of a national television system in Botswana, emphasising the need for television to supplement radio broadcasting and print media. After its launch, Thapisa and Megwa (2002) contracted by the Department of Information and Broadcasting, conducted an audience study assessing the use of Btv by the viewers. Mosanako (2004) conducted a study evaluating the extent to which Btv promotes national identity. Mosime (2007) examines the use of the national television service for cultural productions in Botswana. The common conclusion among the studies conducted after Btv’s introduction is that the service performs reasonably well given the fact that it is relatively new. Other scholars reflect on the propagandist approach of Btv, and thus advocate reforms of the state broadcaster to a public service broadcaster (Balule, 2013b; Fombad, 2002). However, within these existing analyses of Btv’s performance, none have explored the origins of television in Botswana within the development communication framework. In view of this, this study examines the national television system in Botswana with a view to determining the reasons for its introduction in relation to the role of the media in the context of Botswana’s national development.

Other scholars analysing the media in post-colonial societies observe that many national broadcasters in Africa display some colonial legacies (Bourgault, 1995, Oon, 2006;
The post-colonial legacy of broadcasting in Africa is evident on two fronts: in the perception of the use of broadcasting for educational purposes, and in the use of state-owned media for propaganda. Colonial governments used the mass media to educate the public about colonial policies (Bourgault, 1995). Eko (2000) suggests that post-colonial states in Africa under the influence of both UNESCO and the former colonial governments used television for educational purposes through educational broadcasts and literacy programs. Likewise, colonial governments used the media as a war propaganda tool, and the new self-ruling governments of post-colonial states adapted the same approach to spread their own ideologies (Alhassan, 2005; Bourgault, 1995; Oon, 2006). In the case of Botswana, radio was used during independence to mobilise the public to support the newly independent Botswana state (Republic of Botswana, 1966). In addition, other scholars note the connection between colonial legacy and the control that current African governments have on state media, as well as the governments’ propensity to limit access to opposition political parties. The politicians are concerned that if the media is independent, opposition political parties will have a platform to challenge the government (Oon, 2006; Phiri, 2010).

As regards the structure of television broadcasters in Africa and other developing countries, the dominant broadcasting model is state broadcasting, which refers to national channels that are owned by national governments, including those inherited from colonial governments (Banda, 2007; Banerjee & Kalinga, 2006). Some scholars call these broadcasters “public broadcasters” (Banerjee & Kalinga, 2006; Eko, 2003; Ojo & Kadiri, 2001). These broadcasters are state-run enterprises, are characterised by the interference by the ruling elite, and they face political, economic and administrative challenges that have an impact on their performance (Storr, 2011). Thus, Mytton (2000, p. 28) describes broadcasting in Africa as being generally “centralised, national and state dominated”. The state-run model is dominant in African countries, and elsewhere such as Malaysia (Khattab, 2006) and post-socialist societies, such as Russia (Vartanova & Zassoursky, 2003).

Nevertheless, literature from other parts of the world indicates that the dominance of this state model is weakening (Athique, 2009; Keshishoglou & Aquilia, 2003, Thussu, 2000). Neo-liberal policies are said to have facilitated this decline, for example, in parts of Asia such as Singapore and India (Athique, 2009; Thussu, 2000) and the Caribbean (Storr, 2011). Eko (2000) argues that organisations such as the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank promote policies such as structural adjustment that might have induced the weakening of the state model as these policies advocate for minimal state intervention in the
media. Such organisations insist that developing countries privatise and liberalise their media operations to allow competition with commercial media. As a result, state-owned broadcasters experience cuts in their government-funded budgets, leaving them dependent on commercial means of funding their operations (Alhassan, 2005). However, examples from Ghana (Alhassan, 2005) and India (Fürsich & Shrikhande, 2007; Straubhaar, 2007) demonstrate that commercial objectives can prevail over equally important social objectives of local content central to the developmental needs of these developing states by securing revenue through increased advertising, scheduling popular programs to attract audiences and competing for audiences with commercial broadcasters. Due to commercial pressure, the managers of India’s state broadcaster have turned into “capitalists” (Pashupati, Sun, & McDowell, 2003) or “imitators” (Fürsich & Shrikhande, 2007). With such a conundrum over the limitations of state broadcasting such as state control and propaganda on the one hand, and the limitations of commercialisation such as limited local content aimed at social policy objectives on the other, a resulting question is how the media should be structured in developing countries to maintain a balance between these competing but necessary social objectives?

2.3.2 Contemporary trends in broadcasting in Southern Africa

In recent years, an increasing amount of literature has been published in regard to the transformation of state broadcasting into public service broadcasting model in Africa (Balule, 2013b; Heuva, 2010; Kaswoswe, 2005; Mbaine, 2003; Paterson, 1998; Zaffiro, 2000). Despite challenges in a unitary definition of public service broadcasting, the model entails a broadcasting institution publicly funded, with informative, educational and entertainment programs aimed at public interest and reflecting diversity (Banerjee & Kalinga, 2006; Holtz-Bacha & Norris, 2001; Raboy, 1995). The desire for this model in Africa is expressed in many documents emanating from regional and international forums and organisations1. For example, at a continental level, the African Charter on Broadcasting focuses on the need for African states to reform their broadcasting systems to have a three-tier system comprising community, commercial and public service broadcasting. Regionally, the Southern African Broadcasting Association (SABA) lobbies for the transformation of state broadcasters into genuine public service broadcasters. State broadcasters are accountable to the state and hence

---

1 See a UNESCO publication by Banerjee and Kalinga (2005), for a list of the declarations.
their content tends to be about government activity, while public service broadcasting is accountable to the public. In Botswana, there are signs that the public service model is being considered an ideal alternative to the current state broadcasting model (Balule, 2013b; Makgato-Malesu, 2011).

The desire for African broadcasters to move towards public service broadcasting is apparently to encourage media pluralism, which refers to the diversity of media outlets (Klimkiewicz, 2011) The assumption among scholars is that a plural media environment is ideal for democracy as it offers alternatives to state control of the media (Baker, 2001; Fombad, 2002; Fourie, 2003). Yet, Moyo and Chuma (2010b) observe that the transformation of state broadcasting in Southern Africa seems to have reached a “dead end”. They attribute this to the failure of the democratic process in Southern Africa, which they describe as superficial democracy, arguing that such a democracy leads to flawed media policies. Again, in places where broadcasting reform has taken place, such as in South Africa, Duncan and Glenn (2010) discuss how state interference and commercialisation at those public service broadcasting institutions, in this case the South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC), which has been heralded as a torch bearer for the feasibility of public service broadcasting in Africa, undermines the broadcaster’s pursuit of its public service mandate. For instance, many South Africans perceive the SABC as a propaganda tool of the governing African National Congress (ANC) because members of South Africa’s parliament are empowered to appoint members of the SABC’s board (Banda, 2008). Other scholars cite political discourses, such as the political system of a country, as factors that inhibit media reforms. For example, Rooney (2010) explains how Swaziland’s media reform is stifled by the socio-political context of its monarchy, and Phiri (2010) explains that Zambia’s efforts to transform state broadcasting is limited by the “media-phobic” state, which is suspicious of the possible exposure of its inefficiencies by the media should the state forfeit its control of such institutions. While Duncan and Glenn (2010) dismiss the three-tier broadcasting system – public service, commercial and community broadcasting – on the grounds of commercialisation, most scholars in Africa perceive public service broadcasting as a better model (Banda, 2008; Chuma, 2010) than state broadcasting as it supposedly addresses the major concern of many African broadcasters: state control. In view of the assumption that media pluralism facilitates democracy, how do the scholars account for contexts such as Botswana? On the one hand, the country is considered a democratic exemplar in Africa, while on the other there is growing perception that its media is state controlled. If the
alternative to state-owned media is public service broadcasting, how does this model perform in other contexts? These are some of the questions that need to be addressed in future studies dealing with the media in Africa. This study aims to suggest policy considerations for improving performance of state owned media in Botswana, with a view to suggesting that with ‘superficial’ democracy in Africa, reforming to public service broadcasting may not be the only option to improve national media systems.

Whereas scholars in Africa are advocating for reform towards public service broadcasting, contrary perceptions expressing frustration with this model dominates the literature on public service broadcasting in developed media markets, especially in Europe. Words and phrases such as ‘cross roads’ and ‘crisis’ (Barnett & Docherty, 1986), ‘dead’ and ‘future of public broadcasting’ (Dijk, Nahuis, & Waagmeester, 2006; Fourie, 2003), ‘what role?’ (Heap, 2005), ‘a challenge to public service broadcasting’ (Hills & Michalis, 2000; McCauley, Peterson, Artz, & Halleck, 2003), and ‘public service in transition’ (Price & Raboy, 2003) signal the diversity of concerns regarding the future of public television. Public service television has been under scrutiny mainly from two opposing camps. One advocates for public intervention in public service broadcasting and posits that public service broadcasting still has a future (Collins, 2007; Findahl, 1999; Heap, 2005), and the contrary view anticipates the demise of public service broadcasting, arguing that broadcasting should remain a private activity that should be delivered by the market (Armstrong, 2005; Dijk et al., 2006; Jacka, 2003; Rowland & Tracey, 1990; Saeys & Coppens, 2006). Both camps, however, base their arguments on issues of economics, ideologies, and technology. Murdock and Golding (1999), for example, explain that the ideology of public service broadcasting as a form of cultural expression and educational enlightenment has now shifted towards marketization ideologies, wherein broadcasting is perceived as an avenue for revenue generation. They also observe that the convergence of technologies has blurred the lines of delivery in public service broadcasting. Therefore, ultimately, one of the aims of this study is to suggest media policy issues for consideration to improve the performance of Btv. In view of these prevailing debates surrounding public service broadcasting, which is the preferred broadcasting structure in most African contexts; these debates inform the media policy suggestions provided in Chapter 6.

Notwithstanding the strong support for public service broadcasting in Africa, other scholars (Boafo, 2000; Kasoma, 2001; Olorunisola, 2002; Banda, 2003; Banda & Fourie, 2004; Manyozo, 2009) explored the need for community broadcasting in Africa. Their views
are that this model is desirable for the continent as community media is assumed to improve media pluralism, which is one of the challenges facing most African broadcasting systems (Kasoma, 2001). The community media is also believed to be capable of addressing limitations of audience reach faced by national broadcasters. In addition, the community media is better positioned to address information needs of development related issues such as health, agriculture and civic issues such as corruption (Banda & Fourie, 2004). However, similar to public service media, community media also faces challenges relating to policy, regulation, resources constraints, ownership and control as well as lack of capacity. Nonetheless, with its limitations, this model of broadcasting remains strongly favoured for community development of rural areas (Manyozo, 2009; Banda, 2003). Scholars and institutions tend to limit their description of community media to radio, raising questions as to whether this suggests that there is no place for television broadcasting in the form of community broadcasting. This issue will however not be the focus of this study, but it can be taken up in future research by others.

2.4 The role of television in development communication

The overarching aim of this study is to examine the role of television in national development. Thus, it is imperative to review the literature on the role of the media in development communication. As discussed in the beginning of this chapter, the origins of development and development communication can be traced to orthodox theories of development, specifically modernisation that sought to transform societies from ‘traditional’ to ‘modern’ through industrialisation and economic growth. Within this paradigm, the essence of communication, and thus of media content, is to teach the public new attitudes and behaviours that are considered intrinsic to development. In this regard, early connections between television and national development are found in the works of the dominant paradigm scholars such as Lerner (1958, 1967), Schramm (1964, 1967), and Rogers (1962) who state that broadcast media should assist developing countries in the areas of the modernisation and diffusion of new ideas. These issues are explored further in the theoretical framework of this study, which is the next chapter. In this section, the first part explores the roles of television as an educational, informational and entertainment medium. Other roles of television in national development, including nation building and the economic benefits of television, are also discussed. In the second part, in acknowledgement of the centrality of the state in national development in Botswana, there is a need to further explore the role of the
state in development communication, with the view to establish what should or could be the role of the state in development communication.

2.4.1. The role of television in national development

Various studies acknowledge the role of broadcasting media in national development through the media exposing citizens to new lifestyles (Bourgault, 1995; Eko, 2003, Johnson, 2001, Schramm, 1964). Thus, the media has had an educational role of introducing new ideas to the citizens in an effort to make them change their behaviours and adopt new ones perceived to be modern. In this regard, the international community, especially the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) and donors such as the World Bank – have been passionate about the role of television in socioeconomic development and have been willing to assist African governments to set up national broadcasting services to advance their national development agendas (Bourgault, 1995). Furthermore, it was thought that television and other mass media could be used to disseminate information on developmental innovations and projects. This thinking was based on the perceived power and influence of the mass media (Eko, 2000). Nevertheless, the extent to which television has met the educational objectives of developing countries, was aptly captured by McClelland (1986, p. i) in that “after 25 years of experience with television in Africa, there is widespread disappointment with the medium and its capacity to enlighten and educate the general public” While this claim may have been made in the 1980’s, the current literature echoes the same sentiments about the disappointing performance of national broadcasters in most African countries (Moyo & Chuma, 2010; Nyamnjoh, 2005). However, while most of these studies draw their conclusions on an analysis of the media systems of African societies, they fail to account for the views of audiences regarding their consumption of content. This study aims to fill this gap.

There are contending views as regard the role of television in development in relation to entertainment. On one hand, some scholars criticise entertainment programming for its unintended effects relating to social ills (Gray, 2008). In fact, as observed by Lee, 1994, there is a preference for radio over television by governments and citizens, as the latter is considered inappropriate for national development due to factors such as the costs of television and the dominance of foreign programs and entertainment, among other factors. In addition, entertainment on television is criticised for its tendency to divert people’s attention from their problems, as well as from sensitive issues such as political debates (Katz and
Wedell, 1977). On the other hand, other scholars argue that entertainment programming can be a tool for development (Lee, 1994; Lerner, 1958; Singhal & Rogers, 2001). Most of these scholars argue that through edutainment, which is a combination of television’s dual roles of entertainment and education, television entertainment can have a role in national development. In this regard, convincing evidence about the role of entertainment in national development is evident in scholarly work that frames development communication projects within social marketing techniques, such as entertainment-education, or edutainment (Kotler & Roberto, 1989; Singhal & Rogers, 1999; Singhal & Rogers, 2001, 2004; Tufte, 2008). For example, studies largely focusing on health communication and agriculture, such as a review of the role of edutainment in the fight against HIV/AIDS in South Africa, through Soul City, an initiative aimed at improving health through communication, reflect current trends in development communication scholarship, which acknowledge the role of edutainment in social change (Tufte, 2008). Tufte (2008) heralds the Soul City edutainment model for its ability to focus on multiple levels of social structure, namely the individual, community and society, as well as the model’s suitability to extend traditional edutainment to include participation. Thus, the example of Soul City demonstrates the possibility of mixing educational and entertainment content. Likewise, Singhal and Rogers (2001) have concluded that the use of entertainment for developmental purposes challenges previous arguments that have implied that entertainment programming undermines the intentions of development broadcasting.

Other studies have also framed the role of television within a nation building perspective. In Africa, as elsewhere in the world, media is expected to contribute to national integration, nation building and national identity through the advancement of national culture (Amienyi, 2004; Fourie, 2003; Matlosa, 2007; Raboy, 1995; Zaffiro, 2000). The introduction of television coincided with post-colonialism in most developing countries, with the electronic media assigned national integration roles. Eko (2000) observed that because of the political instability in most post-colonial African states, the media was used to ensure cohesion in newly independent states. Perhaps the assumption among the leaders in post-colonial states was that the role of national integration played by television’s predecessor-radio would spill over into television broadcasting. Thus, similar to radio, television would have been expected by postcolonial governments to play a role in the national integration of the various ethnicities in the newly independent states (Head, 1985). Anderson (1991) explains the connection between television and the ‘imagined nation’ when he contends that
television projects the narratives of an ‘imagined’ nation. That is, national broadcasters are expected to provide content that is representative of the societies in which they operate through local content broadcasts. Indeed, the broadcast media are perceived as an agent of development in that the media would facilitate social mobilisation and social cohesion (Amienyi, 2004). Nevertheless, in general, there is contention in the literature in Africa and other parts of the world, as regard the extent to which television has played a role in national integration. Ives (2007) demonstrated how the SABC in South Africa continues to promote national identity, albeit different ‘national identities’. For example, public television in the apartheid-era promoted a ‘white’ South African identity, and post-apartheid television promotes a ‘rainbow nation’ identity. However, there is growing evidence elsewhere to suggest there are challenges facing national broadcasters’ efforts to promote the construction of national identity.

The reasons for the challenges regarding the role of television in national identity construction have been mostly framed within the globalisation discourse. Neo-liberals policies promote the commercialisation of media (Ives, 2007; Peke, 1998) and put pressure on public broadcasters to pursue economic goals at the expense of their social policy goals such as building national identity. Also, dependency based perspectives critique broadcasting systems conceptualised within the modernisation view, claiming that such systems marginalise traditional forms of communication and consequently undermine national cultures (Cambridge, 2007). Similarly, the media imperialism thesis questions the extent to which television can contribute to national development due to the dominance of foreign content on the television networks of developing countries (Galtung and Ruge, 1965, Hamelink, 1983). While these concerns are valid, they are limited as these studies largely focus on structural issues at the macro level of television content, but ignore the possible potential benefits of foreign content in some national contexts. Within the context of the general economic and infrastructural problems prevailing in African societies, as observed by Obijiofor (2011), the public may still rely on a mass medium such as national television as a pipeline for public information, education and entertainment. This is possibly because of limited access to alternative information outlets such as the Internet or pay television.

Numerous scholars have also explored the economic benefits of broadcasting in national development. For example, Locksley (2009) has given an extensive outline of how the media, through the content-production sector, could generate revenue as well as create employment opportunities. However, Locksley’s (2009) conclusion is based on media
industries in highly populated countries and regions, the United States, Canada, European Union and some developing countries such as the Philippines, India and Nigeria. Therefore, it is doubtful whether this plan would be true of less developed countries, particularly small states such as Botswana. In fact Ogan (2007) has acknowledged the challenges facing small countries in that their local markets are insufficient to cover production costs unlike the case with countries with bigger markets. As such, the production of local programs could be costly, and ultimately compromise the competitiveness of the content. Ogan (2007) extensively enumerated options available for small media markets as; quotas, subsidies and grants, co-productions, adapting foreign programs to local context, and resistance measures. However, while Ogan’s (2007) suggestions for improving local content may be valid, they fail to account for the issues relating to the broader world political economy of trade that may impact on the export of the content produced in small markets.

Related to the issue of the lack of local media content in developing countries international communication scholars have debated the dominance of American content in the media content trade, specifically through the media imperialism argument, (Boyd-Barrett, 1977; Gordon, 2009; Schiller, 1992; Thussu, 1998), with others demonstrating a decline in the flow of American content to other countries (Fourie, 2010; Thussu, 2000) and some studies revealing a preference for regional programs by audiences due to cultural proximity, among other issues (Boyd-Barrett, 2010; La Pastina & Straubhaar, 2005; Straubhaar, 1991; Straubhaar, 2007). The decline in the flow of American content is also attributed to self-sufficiency in content production in highly populous states such as India, Brazil and Nigeria (Fourie, 2010; Thussu, 2013). Still, developing countries’ share of exports of their own cultural products is a meagre 1% of the global total (Locksley, 2009). Thus, whereas international scholars have noted an increase in the content output of some populous countries in the developing world, the analysis of the economic role of the media from the global trade perspective fails to consider other economically related roles of the media, such as advertising, which can be a catalyst for the consumption of goods and services in the context of developing countries.

The dominant critique of television’s role in development relates to the control of the media by governments on the basis of nation building in developing countries (Amienyi, 2004; Fürsich & Shrikhande, 2007; Sani, 2005). In summation of the assessment of the role of the media in national development, Amienyi (2004, p. 109) stated, “the overall assessment of this discourse is then that African broadcasting systems have been a benign force for social
mobilization. Due to the excess of government control, urban focus, structural inadequacies, illiteracy, and self-censorship, broadcasting, in Africa have failed to make a positive social impact”. Similarly, Mbaine (2003, p. 154) summarises the state of television programming in most Africa countries as “faithful reflection of ruling party and government views, lack of diversity in news, lack of controversy, lack of debates and live interviews, lack of coverage of the opposition during elections, and very little programming for rural and ordinary people”. Thus, the limitations of the media’s role in development relate to limited plurality of the media, as well as elitism in media coverage. A resulting question relevant to this study is whether or not Btv performs differently from other broadcasters in view of the country’s favourable socio-economic and political context outlined in Chapter 1.

2.4.2 State and development communication

With critical views suggesting state control of the media impacts on the performance of broadcasters, there is a need to explore what the role of the state in development communication should be in contexts such as Africa. In all, the role of the state in development was embedded early on in the conceptualisation of the modernisation approach to socio-economic development, in that the state was to be the agent of national development (Leys, 1996). For instance, financial arrangements such as those with Bretton Woods’s institutions such as the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank have empowered the national governments of new post-colonial states to manage, control and coordinate their economies (Leys, 1996). Thus, the state has become the key player in determining economic activities such as establishing national currencies, determining exchange rates; determining tax regimes and setting limits for interest rates. As most African countries have adopted the modernisation view of development (Okolie, 2003), it then becomes apparent that the state has an influential role in the development process.

Unlike the 1950’s and 1960’s, when the state was perceived as an agent in modernisation, the emerging view in the 1980’s was that states largely stifled economic growth through their economic policies, corruption and administrative inefficiencies (Leys, 1996). The proposed solution was to privatise government activity, allowing the market to direct economic activity. With this in mind, there was a change in the view of the role of the state in development. With economic liberalisation, the mandate of the state as a major developmental actor controlling economic activity was weakened, and the focus turned to the market rather than the state (Bauman, 1998; Pieterse, 2010), suggesting a possible demise of
the state in development. Nonetheless, some scholars contend the state is still relevant in the development discourse (Sparks, 2012; Waisbord, 2003). As demonstrated in Chapter 1, the state is still relevant in Botswana.

Turning to the role of the state in development communication, Waisbord (2003) states that development communication scholars pay little attention to the role of the state in development communication. Waisbord (2003) explained that even in the statist modernisation paradigm, the analysis of the state in development communication was peripheral. The focus was rather on ‘experts’, who were skilled expatriates from developing countries. Moreover, he shows that the dependency paradigm’s approach took a more globalist view, focusing on global power relations, overlooking the role of the state. Again, the critical paradigms of development, such as the participatory approaches, advocate for a focus on grassroots and its empowerment, dismissing government communication initiatives as top-down (Freire, 1970; Melkote and Steeves, 2001), thus consequently ignoring the state.

There are generally two views regarding the involvement of the state in development communication. One camp, mostly comprising of critical development theorists advocating neo-liberal and participatory approaches, theorises that the state’s involvement should be minimal, while other scholars maintain that the state still has a prominent role to play in development communication (Boyd-Barrett, 2012; Nancy Morris & Waisbord, 2001; Waisbord, 2003).

Consistent with the views of the modernisation paradigm of development communication mentioned above, the role of the state in development communication in the literature reflects that the state can protect its media industries through regulatory policies that control media markets (Pashupati et al., 2003; Boyd-Barrett 2012). In addition, the state could be involved in the provision of media infrastructure and funding (Puddephatt, 2008). In their study of the responses of Indian and Chinese government’s responses to digital broadcasting services, Pashupati, Sun, and McDowell (2003) observed that the Chinese government responded by tightening importation of foreign content. This finding also concurs with Chan (1994) about the Chinese government’s formalisation of state control of the media in response to the presence of foreign television channels through satellite. Moreover, other Asian countries (Banerjee, 2002; Chan, 1994) and African states (Moyo & Chuma, 2010), pursuant of the objective of national identity building, had to ensure government control and ownership of the broadcast media. Banerjee (2002) argues that such a structure of
the media served to ensure production of local cultures through shared meanings depicted on state-owned media.

The preceding illustrations are not meant to suggest endorsement of propagandist state control of the media, but rather to demonstrate efforts by governments to protect state sovereignty as well as to address imbalances in media flows through regulation. However, with evidence of the challenges brought by satellite and electronic technology that facilitate cross-border broadcasting, imports of foreign programs and globalisation, the extent to which the state can be effective in protecting its media industries remains an interesting area of academic enquiry as well as a media policy debate. As noted by Thomas (2014), the role of the state in broadcasting regulation is even more complex when developing countries have to contend with super powers. Thomas (2014) further argues that in emerging economies such as India, the dilemma of pursing neo-liberal polices as well as the desire to maintain national sovereignty may pose challenges to the role of the state in the allocation of communication resources. In this study, the role of the state in development communication is an important area for consideration in light of the ownership structure of Botswana Television (Btv) as well as the state-led development approach adopted by the Botswana.

2.5 Media policy
Freedman (2008, p. 13) defines media policy “as a process that concerns the interaction between different actors, the institutional structures within which they work and the objectives that they pursue”. Thus, media policy is concerned with choices that have to be made in the media sector towards the attainment of the specified objectives or functions of the media. Moreover, there are specific practices the media have to adhere to in order to achieve these objectives (McQuail, 2000; Mosco, 1996; van Cuilenburg & McQuail, 2003). Media policy is therefore concerned with directing the behaviour of a media system by identifying the actors, setting administrative and legal parameters of the media system, as well as determining the overall goals to be achieved thereof. Van Cuilenburg & McQuail (2003, p. 182) further explain that media policy can be used to “suppress alternative models of structure and behaviour”. This is done when one model of broadcasting is adopted and the other ignored. For instance in the case of Botswana, the adoption of state broadcasting and the lack of public service broadcasting could suggest the suppression of public service broadcasting system in Botswana.
From the literature, it can be deduced that debates in media policy and media performance in Africa are mostly informed by the Western and developmental media philosophies among others (Manyozo, 2011; Willems, 2011; Zaffiro, 1992). The Western liberal-pluralism model encompasses the need to structure the media as free enterprises, as is the case in most American media policy and in pluralism, which dominate European policies (Freedman, 2008). Moreover, although the media institutions in the West focus on neoliberalism, in Europe, mostly in the United Kingdom, media policy also advocates for the public service broadcasting model, and emphasises the accountability of the media to the public, while the American media policy focuses on the market and accountability to the public as consumers. However, both the Americans and the British pursue goals relating to media freedom, access to the media, accountability of the media, and democratisation of the communicative space (Freedman, 2008; Manyozo, 2011). Within the Western conceptualisation, liberal pluralism emphasises diversity within the market, autonomy from government control, and supported private ownership of the media as opposed to state ownership, since the state is perceived to abate press freedom (Freedman, 2008). However, Waisbord (2000) has demonstrated that in some cases, such as Latin America, the economic power of the state and the dominance of state advertising has compromised the extent to which the press could refrain from ensuring cordial relations with the government. Waisbord (2000, p. 51) concludes that in such cases, there is ‘cooperation rather than adversarialism, mutual advantage rather than complete autonomy”. Indeed in the context of Africa, liberal-pluralism is considered the desirable model to address the state and media relationship (Willems, 2011).

As regard developmental media policy approaches, the overarching philosophies are grounded in the paradigms of development; (i) modernisation and diffusion, (ii) dependency and New World Information and Communication Order NWICO, and (iii) participatory approaches (Manyozo, 2011; Servaes, 2003). Media policy within modernisation and diffusions approaches is theoretically underpinned by: developing media systems, funding national media and integrating media to national development planning (Manyozo, 2011). This media policy approach is nuanced by technological determinism which mostly assumes the presence of the media as sufficient for national development. Within the dependency and NWICO approaches, media policy focuses on addressing issues of dependency and cultural

---

NWICO is discussed in detail in the theoretical framework chapter
imperialism, reflected by imbalances in the flows of media products between the West and developing countries. Within this framework, media policy makes efforts to establish institutions aimed at improving local content production and media infrastructure (Manyozo, 2011). Participatory approaches on the other hand, overly emphasise participation and dialogue in development communication policy (Manyozo, 2011). Thus, the focus within the participatory approach would be on user generated content, as well as the empowerment of the grassroots to manage media institutions.

In general, despite the various possible policy alternatives within the developmental philosophy of media policy, a common conclusion is that there is a need for the legal institutionalisation of press freedom in the media systems of developing countries (McKenzie, 2006). Thus, the media policy of many developing countries aims to include the Western perspective of liberal views in the media, which claims that press freedom is necessary for the media to function properly. In addition, another conclusion within the developmental philosophy is the dual role of the media in being supportive of the government of the day on one hand, and being the watch dogs of government on the other (McKenzie, 2006, p. 81). As a study conducted in a developing country context, this study approaches media policy in Botswana within a developmental philosophy. Specifically the media policy approach in the study focuses on issues relating to structure, objectives, funding, and programming within the national television network, and how all these factors shape Btv’s performance as regard its role in national development. Moreover, these factors will frame the policy suggestions made in this study to improve the performance of Btv.

2.6 Summary
The overarching aim of this chapter has been to indicate that although national television services for development communication in various national settings have been widely explored, there is a dearth of studies that focus specifically on the television system in the Botswana context. In addition, the chapter has demonstrated that the role of television in national development relates to the informational, educational, and entertainment functions of the media. Moreover, the role of a national television service has been linked to nation building. As none of the studies reviewed in this chapter have been conducted in Botswana, there is a gap in the literature in regard to the role of the media in national development in the context of Botswana. Moreover, the unique context of Botswana as a country that did not have a national television service until 2000, as well as its economic and democratic
credentials, means that such a study is significant to contribute to the literature on the role of the media in national development in this context. Furthermore, the literature reflects that television systems in developing countries have generally performed dismally due to socio-economic and political factors such as state control and structural inequalities in developing countries. Thus, there is need to explore whether the economic and political conditions of Botswana have impacted on the national television service to perform differently from others in Africa. Moreover, there is near consensus in the literature that state control and insufficient resources impact the performance of national television. However, there is limited explanation on the performance of broadcasters based on cultural and other social contexts within which the media operate. As a medium that is foreign to African communication systems, there is need for studies to explore how the specific cultural contexts impact on the performance of television regarding its role in national development. Thus, an Afrocentric view can possibly explain the indigenisation of television in an African context. Such views may be helpful in illuminating and providing insights into media performance in African contexts. Nonetheless, this is beyond the scope of this study, although there are instances where context of Africa and Botswana are referred to in explaining some of the findings of this study.

This literature review has also reflected the desire among African broadcasters to reform their state-owned systems to public service broadcasting. However, public service broadcasting as a model in other parts of the world is contended on the basis that such systems are irrelevant as their original justifications, such as market failures and spectrum scarcity, have been addressed through technological advancement and market liberalisation. In view of this, as a national television service that has been launched within the global trends of negative perceptions of state control on one hand, and declining popularity of public service broadcasting on the other, what are the available options for structuring television systems in specific national contexts such as Botswana, where national development remain a priority? What media policies are needed to ensure the delivery of these development goals by Btv as a national broadcaster? These are the key emerging gaps and questions from the literature that this study seeks to address. In the next chapter, the theoretical framework of this study is discussed.
Chapter 3  Theoretical Framework

3.1 Introduction
The review of the literature in the preceding chapter examines the various types of development and development communication, origins of national television in various countries, the role of national television in national development and its relevance in modernisation, the role of the state in development communication and media policy. During the course of this chapter, the focus is to provide an in-depth analysis of modernisation and the political economy of communication as the chosen theoretical frameworks underpinning this study of the role of Btv, and the factors that impede its performance in national development. Moreover, modernisation is employed in this study to address the first research question, which seeks to examine the role of Btv in national development, whereas political economy of communications (PE) is used to examine the political and economic issues that impact on the performance of the channel. This chapter is structured into three sections. Section 3.2 offers an explanation of modernisation theory, how other researchers use it and the way it is suitable for use in this study. However, although modernisation has been widely used in development communication to examine the role and performance of the media in developing countries, some scholars have been concerned about its limitations. These limitations are discussed in this section through the analysis of dependency, imperialism, globalisation and participation theories. The second part of this chapter, Section 3.3, offers an analytical discussion of political economy as a second theory used in this study. The last part of this chapter features the concluding remarks on the theoretical frameworks used in this study.

3.2 Modernisation
In this section, before an analysis of the modernisation theory within a development communication perspective, a description of theoretical origins of modernisation is provided. The origins of modernisation are generally linked to historical political developments in the post World War II period. The rise of the United States as a super power after the war is one of the historical contexts that can be linked to the modernisation theory. The need to curb the spread of communism is also stated as one of the reasons for the emergence of modernisation theory (Preston, 1997; Tipps, 1973). In this regard, Tipps (1973) explains that at the end of the World War II, the United States aimed to counter the influence of the Soviet Union, hence...
the spread of American interests to Africa, Latin America and Asia to limit the potential spread of the Soviet Union and its communism ideology into these territories. Moreover, the emergence of Third World societies through independence from colonial rule during the collapse of European empires after the World War II also contributed to the rise of modernisation theory (Tipps, 1973; Preston, 1997). The Americans replicated their social system of political and economic advancement to these new states (Servaes, 2008). Indeed the American system appealed to developing countries as technology transfer, centralised state, economic planning and bureaucratic institutions enticed developing countries as viable strategies for achieving social change. Moreover, the need to study and understand these emergent states triggered European and American empires to channel resources to the study of Africa, Latin America and Asia. As such, the key scholars in the field of modernisation focused their modernisation.

As described earlier in the literature review, the focus of modernisation is the need to change societies from ‘tradition’ to ‘modernity’ (Lerner, 1958). The main discourse of the modernisation paradigm has been central to the assumption that the post-colonial countries of Asia and Africa were not progressing in the same manner as North America and other countries in Europe. According to Melkote (2012) and Shah (2011), the issues of behaviour, values and attitudes of the citizens in these countries differ significantly from those in developed countries and this has been purported to be because of a lack of progress, infrastructure and formal learning and other factors that are considered pertinent to influence change in society. The solution, as postulated by the modernists, is that citizens in post-colonial economies should change from traditional behaviours and attitudes in order to facilitate societal transformation. In particular, Lerner (1963) suggests that communication through media is one of the vehicles for this transformation. Lerner believes that with information, citizens in developing countries would be provided with modern values that can influence change from local traditional values to western values. In view of this, Lerner also advocates the creation of media systems that would be useful to disseminate information that will educate and inform the citizens in these countries about activities beyond their locality, such as in developing countries.

In particular, Lerner (1958), Schramm (1964) and Rogers (1962) theorise about the usefulness of the media in socio-economic development. Their view, together with that of other scholars, is that central to the dominant paradigm is the role of the media in disseminating information aimed at behaviour change (Lerner, 1958; Melkote, 2012).
Behaviour change is seen as critical for development, since the dominant paradigm theorists are unanimous in the perception that culture and lack of information and knowledge hinder development. They argue that the media constitutes an effective channel that exposes the masses to concepts and practices of modernisation. The media’s role in conveying messages for social change is influenced by the scientific communication model of “sender-receiver” posited by Shannon and Weaver (in McQuail, 2005) who emphasise the flow of information from sender to receiver. In developing countries, the media is seen as the “magic multiplier” or “magic bullet” or “hypodermic needle” that transfers messages automatically to people in developing countries as regards Western behaviours and practices (Davis & Baran, 2006).

This conceptualisation of the media as conduits of information assumes a perfect relationship of sender and receiver, where the sender is a government official and the receiver is the public. Moreover, this kind of normative thinking assumes that people learn from the media by following a set of instructions. In all, believing in the media as senders of messages reflects the influence of Tönnies notion of theory of gesellschaft. As the media send messages across various members in society, the media could be assisting in keeping societies together in a contractual rather than social bond relationship. These contractual relationships are a feature of the modern society.

Modernisation is also rooted in the neo-classical economic school of thought that focuses on economic growth (Melkote, 2012; Rostow, 1960). The neo-classicalists connected economic growth with urbanisation, and assumed that “increasing urbanisation has tended to raise literacy; rising literacy has tended to increase media exposure; increasing media exposure has gone with wider economic participation (per capita income) and political participation” (Lerner, 1958, p. 46). Focusing specifically on media in Western Europe and North America, both industrialised and capitalist democracies, Hallin and Mancini (2004) explain how modernisation has altered political life. Hallin and Mancini (2004) observe that modernisation is characterised by growth in individualism, which has weakened group solidarity. They state that instead of citizens organising along social groups such as churches and political parties, there is more individualism driven by a market-oriented system. This viewpoint is central to Weber, Durkheim and Tonnies’ ideas about the adaptation of individuals in social systems as a way of coping with social change as explained above in Section 3.2. Thus, modernisation has changed the social system characterised by prioritising individual needs as opposed to collective or community benefits as espoused by the socialism ideology (Cambridge, 2007). While this study does not seek to explore the connection
between economic growth and urbanisation and literacy rates, political and economic participation, modernisation theory in this study is used to explain the performance of a national television system within a modernising context.

3.2.1 Underdevelopment and modernisation in developing countries
A common belief among modernisation theorists is that underdevelopment in developing countries is caused by internal factors that are psycho-sociological, institutional and technological (Cambridge, 2007; Melkote, 2012). Within the psycho-sociological view is the concept of “empathy”, which Lerner (1958) describes as individuals developing interest to be like a fellow human being who is better than them. Thus, the notion of empathy involves a desire by individual members of societies to be similar to others who are already exposed to Western values, which were considered better than those of people living in developing countries. Lerner (1958) concludes that this “empathy” propels citizens in developing countries to adopt or accept the new ideas as influenced by actions or wellbeing of people in developed countries. Therefore, modernisation involves cultivating conditions for social change to take place by focusing on the psycho-social aspects of human beings with the intention of changing their behaviours and attitudes so that they can adopt Western values. Accordingly, the mass media is useful to cultivate an environment for modernisation to take place by preparing “ground for adoption of improved techniques” (Lindo-Fuentes, 2009, p. 769). Therefore, this study seeks to establish how Btv as a national television service in Botswana has been useful in informing the citizens of Botswana on national or global issues that the citizens perceive to be significant in improving their living conditions. In this study, Btv audiences will be researched to establish through their perceptions of the channel’s content, and whether their exposure to television instils in them a desire to want to change to be like others they consider better than themselves.

With regard to the institutional factors, Lerner (1963, p.342) points out that there is a need to establish certain institutions to drive the modernisation process. For example, he considers democracy as an essential institution for modernisation to take place. In his discussion on the connections between the mass media and a political system, Lerner states, “the connection between mass media and democracy is especially close”. He argues that within a democratic society, the citizens would become active participants in the development process. Thus, one of the conditions advocated for within the modernisation paradigm is the need for democratic principles in developing countries (McPhail, 2008;
Wilkins & Moody, 2001). Furthermore, consistent with the liberal democratic and economic conditions of the United States, Schramm, (1964) argues that the media should operate in a free market since in that way there would be freer debate of ideas with the intention of choosing and implementing the best ideas. In view of this institutional approach, the models of development that have worked in the West are to be transplanted into developing countries (Cambridge, 2007). For instance, when studying the use of new ideas and innovations in developing countries, Rogers (1976) believes there is a need for institutionalisation of development planning through the guardianship of economists and the political elite as a way to fast track social change. As an institution that can possibly drive modernisation process, Btv is examined in this study within the national development planning approach adopted from the West.

As regards the technological factors, the modernisation theorists posit that technologies, such as the mass media, are essential in disseminating new ideas on modernisation (Lerner, 1958; Rogers, 1962). Most importantly, the mass media is assumed to have such a powerful effect that it can influence people to change. The belief in the power and influence of the mass media appeals to developing countries, which introduced mass media institutions and expected them to disseminate information aimed at behaviour and social change (Menon 2004). This is because it is viewed that information constitutes enlightenment, which is in turn reflected as a central aspect of modernisation. As such, information is considered a necessity for development. A more ideological reasoning for the use of mass media is suggested by Cambridge (2007), who argues that the mass media disseminates information that would facilitate modernisation and capitalism, as opposed to Soviet socialism ideologies. In this study, it is therefore imperative to examine how television as an additional broadcast technology to radio in Botswana, is considered useful in influencing behavioural change among its audiences.

3.2.2 The use of modernisation by other scholars

Research in development communication shows the resilience of the modernisation approach in development (Kraidy, 2013; Shah, 2011). However, as demonstrated in the course of this subsection, the results from the studies using this theory to explore the role of the media in development vary. For example, Davis & Baran (2006) provide examples of media supporting the government to achieve economic development in Honduras and Brazil. Tomaselli and Dunn (2001) note that promoting development has resulted in little success in
some African countries. Over the years, meta-analysis studies have also reflected the continuing application of modernisation as a theoretical framework in development communication studies (Fair, 1989; Fair & Shah, 1997; Morris, 2003; Ogan et al., 2009). For instance, Fair (1989) analysis of theoretical orientations of studies conducted during the period between 1958 and 1975 concludes that modernisation is the dominant theoretical framework used in development communication studies. A different trend was emerging as regards the use of modernisation by the 1990s. In a study by Fair and Shah (1997) that reviewed studies conducted between 1976 and 1996, the popularity of modernisation was wanning, with emerging evidence of studies criticising the modernisation paradigm. In a similar study by Ogan et al. (2009) that reviewed studies conducted between 1998 and 2007, there was an emergence of studies focusing on globalisation and Information Communication Technologies (ICT) as a focus of development communication studies. In addition, Ogan et al. (2009) observed a resurgence of the application of modernisation as a theoretical framework in development communication studies. Ogan et al. (2009) explains the increase in the use of modernisation framework as a theoretical tool to the emergence of Information and Communication Technologies for Development (ICT4D) discourse that they assert is dominated by researchers who may have limited knowledge about the failure of the modernisation paradigm of development. A common conclusion among the studies reviewed is the association of the media with development through sending messages, and concurrently persuading people to change their behaviour.

3.2.3 Critiques of modernisation theory

Despite its use in many studies, modernisation has also been criticised by many scholars. The overall theme of the criticism of modernisation is that the approach fails to account for external and structural relations between the developing countries and developed ones, but rather, explains lack of development at a micro level focusing on individuals’ attitudes. For instance, Melkote (2012) raises concerns about modernisation’s top-down approach to social change. Due to its limitations, which will be discussed in this section, other theories such as dependency, imperialism, participatory approaches and globalisation are introduced to explain development, as they perceive modernisation theory to be inadequate.

The dependency theory of development communication challenges the extent to which modernisation, through connecting developing and developed countries, creates a situation of dependency on the West. The dependency paradigm posits that
underdevelopment is due to the broader socio-political structures featuring exploitation of developing countries by the West or core countries in the global economic system (Cardoso & Faletto, 1979; Huesca, 2008; Smythe, 1981). Also, the lack of development in these newly independent states is seen as an extension of capitalism and the world economic order, rather than a lack of knowledge as posited by proponents of the dominant paradigm (Cardoso & Faletto, 1979; Waisbord, 2007). The reliance on Western countries for technologies, finance, trade, politics, culture and education illustrate such dependency. As regards the mass media, the dependency critics contend that the approach of modernisation is anti-development, as the media in developing countries tend to exclude traditional forms of communication, thus undermining national culture and identity (Cambridge, 2007). The media, according to the dependency theory as observed by Cambridge, arouses expectations that often the economic systems of developing countries are unable to meet, thus creating frustrations for the citizens of developing countries through exposure to mass media. Also, the dependency critics base their conclusions on the dominance of foreign media content over local content produced by broadcasters in developing countries.

However, although dependency arguments are valid, they fail to offer substantive alternatives of how developing countries could improve their self-reliance. This is because of the developing countries' lack of both political capacity and economic muscle to influence media policies on a global scale (Smythe, 1981; Thomas, 2005). Nonetheless, emerging literature within international communication scholarship suggests that, in some instances, to improve their self-reliance, developing countries should introduce media and communication policies that emphasise increasing their local content (Amienyi, 2004; Straubhaar, 2007). The experiences of Latin American nations such as Mexico and Brazil show that this can work through the introduction of protectionist media policies aimed at increasing self-reliance in media content production (Appadurai, 2006).

Similarly, the New World Information and Communication Order (NWICO) reject modernisation because of structural inequalities. According to Colleen Roach (in Golding and Harris, 1997), during the 1973 Algiers Non-Aligned Movement (NAM) summit, Third World countries called for a New International Economic Order (NIEO), which was about global restructuring of the economic relationship between developing countries and the West (Gerbner, Mowlana & Nordenstreng, 1993). The developing countries were challenging the

---

3 See next section on political economy
orthodox development paradigms for perpetuating the under-development of developing countries through structural inequalities in the world economic order (Manyozo, 2008). The NAM, which Botswana joined in 1970, realised in the 1970s that despite technical assistance, an “information famine” persisted in developing countries as their cultural sovereignty was threatened. A UNESCO report by Nobel laureate Sean MacBride in 1978 highlighted the West’s domination of information flow largely through news agencies (Golding & Harris, 1997).

Although the NWICO aspirations of balancing the flow of information have been limited as ideological philosophies such as liberalism have complicated the extent to which developing countries can be self-reliant in content production, as demonstrated in the literature review, some populous, developing countries have made inroads as regards increasing content from developing countries. Although not necessarily associated with news flows as was the case with the MacBride report, television content from Brazil’s TV Globo, India’s Bollywood and Nigeria’s Nollywood are also efforts by developing countries to be content producers as well as to counter the flow of mass culture products from the developed global north (Straubhaar, 2007; Thussu, 2013).

Another criticism of the modernisation theory that relates to international flows of media content focuses on the media imperialism paradigm that concentrated on cultural implications of foreign media content in developing countries. The imperialists condemn the modernisation paradigm for weakening the flow of national communications through intrusion by expansion of foreign technologies and media content flows into developing countries from the West (Boyd-Barrett, 1977; Hamelink, 1993; Nordenstreng & Shiller, 1979). The media imperialism arguments contend that due to the use of similar technologies, the adoption of the same professional practice within media industries content production and ownership structures of media industries by commercial enterprises or state, the mass media in developing countries are mostly a reflection of the dominant ideology of the West (Boyd-Barrett, 1977; Hamelink, 1983). However, while these arguments may be valid to some extent, there is evidence within international communications scholarship as regards the changes in the flow of American content in developing countries. The growth of regional broadcasters in developing countries (Straubhaar, 2007), and the decisions of the media professionals to localise foreign content (Boyd-Barrett, 2012) suggest that the sustainability of the imperialism argument in developing countries is beginning to be re-configured. The emerging trend is that, in some instances, the foreign content has benefited the media systems
of developing countries (Boyd-Barrett, 2010), especially through the adaptation of program formats.

Furthermore, within these criticisms of modernisation on the grounds of structural inequalities is the notion of globalisation. Giddens (1990, p. 64.) defines globalisation as “the intensification of world-wide social relations which link distant localities in such a way that local happenings are shaped by events many miles away and vice versa.” Globalisation has been used to explain the presence of foreign television content, especially American, on non-American national televisions (Eko, 2003), and in this regard, globalisation focuses on interconnectedness of societies. Television is arguably one of the industries profoundly affected by globalisation (Appadurai, 2006; Chang, 2003; Sreberny, 2006). This is demonstrated by similarities in global television formats, for example “Big Brother” and “Sesame Street”, which is due to the sale and exchange of programs among nations, thus facilitating interconnectedness. Deregulation policies and technological advancements that facilitated a stage for “global” television, in a “global village”, as Marshall McLuhan put it (Straubhaar, 2007); expedite this interconnectedness of program formats of various television programs across the world. Herman and Chomsky (1988) and Appadurai (2006) question the concept of global media and argue that the media is American or Western, and therefore promotes ideologies of the West at the expense of the local people. Paterson (1998) concludes that these foreign programs tend to lead to cultural homogenisation, a view also shared by Hamelink (1983) and Schiller (1976) (in Appadurai, 2006). This cultural homogenisation, or Americanisation, allegedly erodes local cultures and ushers in a mass consumerist culture. However, Appadurai (2006) contends that this is not always true, as cultures from the metropolis may be localised in one way or another. Some localisation strategies include subtitling, repackaging of programs to accommodate local viewers, co-productions and buying program formats like “Big Brother”. In fact, Waisbord (2013) and Sparks (2007) argue that globalisation fails to account for local cultures at the expense of focusing on global factors. In this study, the analysis of Btv content through the analysis of schedules is used to explore these structuralism-based arguments relating to the flow of television content. In addition, the audiences’ perceptions as regards foreign content are analysed with a view to determining the validity of the criticisms of media imperialism in the context of Botswana. The interviews with media professionals are also used in this study to explore the factors shaping the usage of foreign content on Btv.
The other criticism of modernisation, which is rather divergent from those mentioned above, is the alternative paradigm of development communication. The critics of this paradigm are against a top-down, one-way flow of communication evident in modernisation, and advocate a bottom-up, culturally based and participative development communication process (Manyozo, 2012; Servaes, 1999; Servaes & Malikhao, 2008). As a result, participatory communication has emerged as a preferred approach that promotes culture as a bottom-up rather than a top-down form of communication and self-reliance. In fact, the preferred approach to the media within this paradigm is small media that encourages local strategies to addressing development challenges. Consequently, current development communication is dominated by the use of this approach in the development scholarship and practice (White, 2009; Mefalopulos, 2008). However, as observed by Schramm (1979), development communication should be a mix of both small and big media, as well as local and foreign ideas. Similar to the other criticisms of modernisation discussed above, the participatory approach also has limitations. The approach fails to account for broader social structure, specifically the role of the state in national development. Thus, the applicability of participatory approaches in this study is limited to instances where it can help in the analysis of the findings.

In summary, the dominant paradigm of development communication, which includes modernisation theory, has been criticised for “its ethnocentrism, its historicity, and its linearity, for conceiving of development in an evolutionary, endogenous fashion and for solutions which actually reinforced dependency rather than to overcome it” (Sreberny, 2006, p. 606). Nonetheless, the continuing trend towards underdevelopment suggests that while the criticisms of modernisation are largely valid, in a similar way to modernisation, they have failed to provide an all-encompassing theoretical explanation of the persisting challenge of underdevelopment. Thus, while these criticisms will be noted, this study seeks to demonstrate that despite its limitations, the modernisation theory still frames media systems in contexts such as Botswana. Consequently, the dominant theoretical framework shaping this study is modernisation. Nonetheless, in view of the observation by Schramm (1967) and McChesney (2008) that the media system of any country explicates the broader societal context within which the media operates, there is need to examine the factors influencing the performance of the national television broadcaster Btv. Therefore, a second theory, political economy of communications, is employed in this study to analyse the factors that impact on the
performance of Btv in its role in national development. The next section focuses specifically on the political economy of communication.

3.3 Political economy of communication

Political economy of communication, which will be referred to as political economy, involves an analysis of how the interaction between the political process and the economy impacts on the media. Mosco (2009, p. 2) defines political economy as “the study of social relations, particularly the production, distribution, and consumption of resources” Thus, political economy focuses on structural inequalities in production and consumption of media content (Fenton, 2007; McQuail and Davis 2006). Central to political economy are issues of ownership and control of the mass media. Political economists such as Smythe (1981), Schiller (1969), Herman and Chomsky (1988), and McChesney (1999) draw from the institutional and Marxian approaches to analyse the economic and political factors influencing the media. They draw attention to the power and profit motives of media companies and how they impact on content.

Political economy of communication can be traced to Harold Innis, an economic historian. Innis (1944, 1950 quoted in Graham, 2007) explained that through history of mankind, some groups in society have enjoyed privileges of knowledge more than others. Innis applied a political economic approach to the study of media by analysing how media content relates to a certain civilisation based on the type of technology used (Innis, 1950). In addition Innis was instrumental in delineating the distinction between technology and communication. Innis concluded that communication should focus on content of the media, while media technologies were a reflection of civilisation and a root course of Western domination of developing countries. Contemporary prominent political economy scholars include Nicholas Garnham; Herbert Schiller; Robert McChesney; Naom Chomsky, Robin Mansell, Janet Wasko; and Vincent Mosco, Phil Graham, Peter Golding to mention but a few. These scholars influenced by focus on the issues of media ownership, media industries, control of the media as well as the relationship between media, economic and political systems.

One of the assertions of political economy is that the media supports the status quo by promoting the ideas and views of the ruling class, or the elite (Davis & Baran, 2006; McChesney & Valdivia, 2012, Thomas, 2102). In their book, Manufacturing Consent: The Political economy of the mass media, Herman and Chomsky (1988) developed a “propaganda
model” which reflected the influence of market forces on media production and content. This is associated with what they called ‘media filters’. These are processes that content has to pass through before it can reach audiences. Herman and Chomsky (1988), in their propaganda model, state that the significance and worth of content is reflected by the placement of items, headlines, word usage, video usage and other forms of generating interest. They concluded that the media, in the United States were undemocratic as their news agenda or content is framed to reflect the interests of the elite as opposed to the interests of ordinary citizens. Thus, the media is said to reinforce existing power relations in society. Ultimately, the media maintain the status quo by being pro-elite and possibly promoting propaganda (Herman & Chomsky, 1988). This viewpoint about the media serving the interests of the elite is a dominant theme in political economy scholarship. In this study, as demonstrated in Chapter 1, the elites in Botswana are influential in driving national development; hence their views need to be considered with the intention to determine whether their ideas dominate the media content on Btv. Thus, the data from the in-depth interviews and the focus group discussions conducted in this study is analysed to determine the dominant view in a national television system, to consider who really benefits from this national service and the implication for this to the role of Btv in national development.

Within a political economy perspective, the role of public television in development may be undermined by the global economic order among other factors. The current economic order appears convenient for developing countries as they acquire cheap programs from developed markets. However, this comes at a cost since that content may fulfil entertainment needs but not the normative media functions such as development and democracy (Barnett & Docherty, 1986; Collins, 1994). In addition, heavy reliance of developing countries on foreign content may lead to underdevelopment of media industries of developing countries. This is because local producers may not have an opportunity to develop their skills for production of certain genres. This may lead to perpetual dependency on the global media market for content, a view shared by media imperialism and dependency theories as explained in the literature review.

Political economy also examines the relationship between the media and the market structure. In this regard, an analysis of advertising, profit motivation, media content and media policies is essential to determine how these factors shape the operations of the media (McChesney & Valdivia, 2012). For instance, political economists argue that the overriding goal of profit making in the American media has led to commercialisation of media content
aimed at attracting audiences, at the expense of programs aimed at enhancing democratic debate in society (McChesney, 2004; Schiller, 1989; Smythe, 1981). Thus, from a political economy perspective, the media, specifically in America, is part of the broader ideology of capitalism.

According to Smythe (1981) the media perpetuates capitalism in that it produces audiences for advertisers. Also, the analysis of media ownership reflects that the media is concentrated in the hands of few corporations (Thomas, 2012; Murdock & Golding, 2005; Thomas & Nain, 2004; Wasko, 2001). However, in the case of Botswana, more studies are needed on media ownership, specifically in view of the weak commercial television sector in Botswana as demonstrated in Chapter 1 of this thesis. Moreover, as the study focuses on a state-owned broadcaster Btv, the relationship between the state and the media structure in Botswana suggests a symbiotic relationship. Similar to an observation by Curran (2000) and Wasko (2004) that the media relies on the state for media friendly policies, the national television Btv relies on Botswana government for funding and media friendly policies. In return, the government demands favourable media coverage. Thus, in this study, the political economy analysis is useful in examining how the current ownership structure of Btv as a government department impacts on the performance of the channel. This is important in view of the existing classical liberal views about the perceived limitations of the state’s monopolisation of media policy making as well as media ownership (Curran, 2000). In such situations of state ownership, there are concerns that the state, through regulatory frameworks, has restrictive laws and regulations that may limit press freedom (Curran, 2000). In developed media markets such as the United States of America, the influence of major media companies and conglomerates in media policymaking has been noted (McChesney, 2004). These companies are said to exert pressure on legislators to generate media friendly policies. In addition their economic contribution to their national economies allows them to have such influence. As this study focuses on media policy issues, a political economy approach is ultimately useful in determining the policy makers in the absence of media conglomerates and in the context of a state-dominated economy.

Lastly, a political economy approach is useful in the analysis of media policy (McChesney & Valdivia, 2012). This is because political economists explore the possible options available for a media system, with a view to explaining the options adopted in such a system. As described in Chapter 1, the television broadcasting media landscape in Botswana reflects a sector that is still in its infancy, so various options regarding possible media
ownership structures are still to be considered. One of the key aims of this study is to explore possible policy directions for improving the performance of Btv. In this study, through an analysis of the documents, the historical context of the media in Botswana is explored to consider why certain policy directions were adopted, and which ones could have been considered. In addition, in-depth interviews with media policy makers are conducted for insights on the decisions made by the elite in Botswana as regards policy directions considered for broadcast media in the country.

As regard the application of political economy of communication specifically in developing countries context, it can be deduced that the theory has been mostly applied in the analysis of state and media relations in Africa. Berger (2002) has observed that African scholarship post-independence had a functionalism orientation as the focus was on national development. As evident from the critics of modernisation above, it has been apparent that there is need to analyse the broader social and economic structures within which the media operate. The example of the need for a New World Information Order explained in Section 3.2.2 underscore the emergence in the 1960s through to the 1970s of the need for a review of the economic and political contexts within which the media operate. The focus of communication scholarship in Africa was thus the need to explore how issues of media ownership, control and content impacted on the performance of the media. There is near consensus in African scholarship as regard the undesirable issue of state control of the media, specifically broadcasting (Nyamnjoh, 2005; Tomaselli, 2002; Bourgault, 1995; Head, 1977). While colonial inheritance has been blamed for the trend of African leaders to control the broadcasting media, Nyamnjoh (2005) also notes that the African media discourages dissent under the pretext of development communication. Ultimately in such undemocratic setting, the views of independent sources are limited if not curtailed (Bourgault, 1995). In light of this, Nyamnjoh (2005) is of the view that in Africa, the biggest threat is repressive governments than media conglomerates or media concentration.

However, there are regional variations in terms of the focus of political economy of communications and its influence on media policies. In Europe, political economy research has taken a more Keynesian approach, and has concentrated on the defence of public media, compared with the American model, which focuses on media and democracy. The dominant theme in American scholarship is the analysis of media performance within free market economics and liberal democracy ideals. Murdock and Golding (1973) are European scholars who focused on class power and its influence on media content and media policy (Mosco,
In developing countries, influenced by development paradigms, media are associated with national development, and political economy research has also been broadened to include power struggles both within the media at national and international level of flow of information (Mosco, 1996). In Botswana, Mosime (2007) explored cultural production at Btv using a political economy approach to analyse the state media relations at Btv and their influence on cultural production role of Btv. This study extends the literature on an African context through an analysis of political and economic factors influencing the role of national television in national development in Botswana. For Btv to achieve its objectives in social change and national development, local content policy choices need to be well thought out. However, regulating national content is never going to be easy. There is need to consider trade-offs in importing or producing content locally (Collins, 1994). Importing may appear cheap but may have consequences on the growth of local producers in that they may not have the opportunity to develop skills in production of genres. As a result, broadcasting policy in Botswana, like elsewhere in the world, faces rival challenges of producing content that can be exported and at the same time protecting their industries from inflows of foreign content.

Media policy within a political economy framework is concerned with choices that have to be made in the media sector to help media achieve its normative functions (Mosco, 1996; p253). Generally choices on foreign content acquisition may be made based on prescriptions in terms of number of foreign programs to be included in program schedules, or in terms of origins of a program (Collins, 1994). Programs may be totally produced abroad, or may have a certain percentage of foreign production involving foreign crew and resources. Such choices are usually made against programs that are locally produced, although there is also need to specify criteria for what constitutes a local production. Media policies aimed at social policy objectives such as national identity and development therefore guides decisions on content acquisition.

Although political economy has been widely used, the theory has also been criticised by cultural theorists for failing to account for the influence of audiences on the media. This is signalled by insufficient audience research based on the political economy approach (Raboy et al., 2001). The cultural theories observe that political economy fails to acknowledge the ability of the audiences to give their own interpretations of the media content (McQuail and Davis, 2006; Raboy, Abramson, Proulx, & Welters, 2001). Thus, political economy is quizzed for an overly simplistic view of the power of the media without being cognisant of the fact that the audiences also are not passive and may influence power relations through the
meaning they give to media contents. For instance, while the media may intend to perpetuate the status quo, the audiences may on the other hand give interpretations that are inconsistent with the espoused values of the media professionals. In view of the limitation of the political economy’s failure to acknowledge the audience interpretations of media content, this study will modestly address this limitation by soliciting audiences’ perceptions on the performance of Btv. This study engages with audiences through focus group discussions as will be discussed in the next chapter. The involvement of audiences is done to explore the possible interpretations they could be giving to media content on Btv.

Cunningham and Turner (2010) lament the shortcomings of political economy in accounting for cultural perspectives within which the media work. This is a valid observation; hence an attempt in this study to explore the social contexts within which Btv operates. Such an analysis will be implored in explaining the relationship between Btv and how it benefits audiences, especially on issues that pertain to cultural programming and national development.

3.4 Summary
This chapter has looked into the theories of modernisation and political economy that are used to examine the findings of this study. Overall, the chapter has focused on the relevance of these theories for use in this study, by offering their definitions, discussing how other scholars have used them and how they will be used in this study. As regards modernisation, the theory is used in this study to examine the key findings in relation to the first research question, which focuses on the role of the media in national development. Political economy is useful in the analysis of the findings of the study that relate to the second and third research questions, which examine the factors impacting on the operations of the Btv and the media policy, respectively. Political economy is employed in the study in the analysis into how societal factors, such as economic, political and social-cultural, influence the operations of Btv, with a view to suggesting how they could be addressed to provide a better media environment for the national television system to operate optimally.

In addition, the study discusses the ownership of Btv to consider how the media organisations are limited to work as free enterprises in a state-led economy, and a multi-party democracy that is dominated by one party such as Botswana.

It must be noted that while modernisation and political economy theories are used in this study, the researcher approaches this study with an intellectual orientation that
acknowledges both the Afrocentric and Botswana contexts as possible explanations of some of the findings of this study. This approach is consistent with calls made by other scholars (Okigbo & Eribo, 2004; Taylor & Nwosu, 2001) about the need to explore African explanations of the link between development and communication. Similarly, Asante states “Afrocentricity is a perspective on a phenomena that sees Africa as subjects, of history with their own agency in the midst of all phenomena (2004, p.12). Indeed in view of the persisting problems of underdevelopment in Africa, and the national development challenges facing Botswana as alluded to in Section 1.5, theorisation of development communication in Botswana should thus reflect foreign theories as well as contextual explanations. Nonetheless, there is lack of a consolidated theoretical framework on Afrocentricity. As such, this, where applicable, the African and Botswana context will be used to explain the findings in this study. The next chapter is a description of the methodology that has been chosen for use in this study.
Chapter 4 Research methods

4.1 Introduction
The aim of this study is to explore the role of television broadcasting in the national development of Botswana, and analyse the socio-economic and political factors affecting Botswana Television’s (Btv) role in that development. A holistic approach was adapted to study Btv by exploring issues relating to the operations of the service, the themes of its programs, as well as the audiences’ perceptions of those programs. As Croteau, Hoynes, and Milan (2012) suggested, media research should transcend the analysis of media content from the media producers’ perspectives only, and should include an analysis of the audiences’ interpretations of such content. Whereas the review of programs (media text) is sufficient to understand the intended messages of the media, exploring whether the audiences interpret these messages as anticipated by the media producers is necessary (Croteau, Hoynes, & Milan, 2012). To achieve this analysis, in this chapter, the focus is on the research methodology that was adopted to conduct this study. The chapter is divided into four parts. First, the research design is outlined in Section 4.2. Second, the four methods of data collection are presented in Section 4.3. Third, the research design is evaluated in Section 4.4. Finally, ethical issues relating to confidentiality and anonymity are addressed in Section, 4.5.

4.2 Research approach
As an exploratory study, a qualitative design was the most suitable approach as qualitative research deals with the exploration and understanding of meanings given to certain phenomena (Cresswell, 2009; Wimmer & Dominick, 2006). Qualitative research is concerned with how people give meaning to events happening around or beyond them. Wimmer and Dominick (2006) observed that in the process of giving meaning to events, people become involved in the interpretation of such events. Owing to individual differences, the same events might be interpreted differently or similarly by different individuals. This suggests that a single reality does not exist: people create various realities because the contexts within which they live (Holloway, 1997) influence their meaning making. A qualitative approach, therefore, facilitates an understanding of reality from the perspective of the meanings given to situations. In this study, a qualitative approach helped to understand the past and present structure, role, and performance of television in Botswana from the perspective of the research participants.
4.2.1 Purpose of research
Exploratory research entails purposive and systematic studies that generate explanations about social phenomena (Stebbins, 2001). Babbie (2013) stated that social research could serve various purposes, including exploration, description, and explanation. In exploratory research, the focus is on studying new areas or even persistent problems. The focus of descriptive research is on describing situations and events, whereas explaining the reasons for situations and events is the focus of explanatory research (Babbie, 2013). This study is exploratory because, through it, an in-depth understanding of television in Botswana was sought. This includes asking questions about Btv’s origins, roles, and overall performance. Furthermore, in this study, the broader issue of the media’s role in Botswana’s national development was explored.

4.2.2 Philosophical assumption
Various worldviews guide research. Creswell (2009) outlined four of these. The first is positivism, which includes a deterministic and empirical view of the world. The second worldview is social constructionism, in which social construction of meanings are emphasised. The third one is advocacy or participation, which is empowerment-oriented in its approach to the world. The last worldview is pragmatism, which assumes a practical orientation to the world. In this study, a social constructivist philosophical worldview was adopted.

The key assumption in the social constructivist worldview is that human beings constantly seek meanings concerning the world they live in based on their subjective experiences (Creswell, 2009). Thus, the social systems within which they live might influence their meanings. In addition, human beings are reflective and their actions are purposive, and this might affect the meanings that they give to situations (Baxter & Babbie, 2004). The meanings that are given are, therefore, interpretations that are based on people’s experiences of the world in which they live.

Because an understanding of national television in Botswana was sought through this study, the assumption that people’s meanings concerning the world are subjective and socially negotiated and are influenced by their context was adopted. An understanding of television through the eyes of the research participants, in this case producers and other key stakeholders involved in decision making about content production at Btv, was sought in this study. The program producers’ perceptions of the role of television possibly influence their
views on what type of programming they should broadcast on television. Similarly, the perceptions of Btv’s audiences were explored to understand how they interpreted the programs being broadcast on the national television.

4.2.3 Enquiry strategy
As a qualitative study, the study adopted a phenomenological strategy of enquiry. The qualitative methodology includes various paradigms: phenomenology, ethnography, grounded theory, and case studies. According to Creswell (2009), phenomenology is a strategy of inquiry that involves understanding phenomena by analysing how human beings experience them. Inherent in this strategy is the manner in which researchers understand the phenomena from the viewpoint of the research participants. Positioning the interpretation of the data from the viewpoint of research participants is also consistent with the philosophical assumption of social constructivism adapted in this study. Thus phenomenology suited this study because it helped the researcher to understand the role of television in Botswana, as perceived by key decision makers, who were involved in television production, and relevant government officials. This is because, from a phenomenological position, content producers and decision makers, consciously construct the role of television by making decisions on the content that appears on television. Moreover, phenomenology allows for understanding the role of television from the audiences’ perspective.

4.3 Data collection methods
In view of a social constructivism worldview, and a phenomenological strategy of enquiry, the research methods adopted in this study had to focus on generating data from the research participants. Thus in-depth interviews and focus groups discussions were conducted to generate data from the viewpoints of research participants involved in the operations of Btv on one hand, and those involved in the consumption of services provided by Btv on the other. In addition, other qualitative methods of data collection such as document analysis and schedule analysis were also employed in this study. These four methods of data collection—document analysis, schedule analysis, in-depth interviews, and focus group discussions, are discussed below. The data were collected from August 2011 to February 2012 and from August 2012 to October 2012.
4.3.1 Document analysis

Document analysis is “a systematic procedure for reviewing or evaluating documents—both printed and electronic (computer-based and Internet-transmitted) material” (Bowen, 2009, p. 27). Likewise, Singleton and Straits (2010, p. 393) observed that documents might be available from various sources, such as public and official records, private collections, mass media, as well as physical non-verbal materials. Similarly, Start and Sloan (2003) listed various document source categories: published records, official and personal, original and secondary written records, statistical data, oral sources, pictorial sources, physical remains, and Internet sources.

Document analysis was a preferred method for this study due to various reasons. The method allowed the researcher to understand the past (Singleton & Straits, 2010) of Btv through the perusal of archival data. Furthermore, the method allowed recognising gaps in policy and practice, as Bertrand and Hughes (2005) suggested. Additionally, document analysis, as noted by Bowen (2009), allows researchers to assess change and continuity in a phenomena being investigated. For instance in this study, what have been the changes if any, regarding the conceptualisation of the role of Btv by the government of Botswana. The other reason regarding the preference of document analysis as a data collection method was that, unlike other methods, such as interviews and focus groups, which might have been influenced by the researcher’s presence, the documents contain data that has not been influenced by the researcher’s presence (Bowen, 2009). In addition, Bowen (2009) stated that documents help the researcher understand the context of the phenomenon being studied. At a practical level, an advantage of using documentary evidence is that the method could be comparatively less costly (Singleton & Straits, 2010). For example, in this study the costs of collecting documents were cheaper than those of collecting data by conducting interviews and leading focus groups.

Conversely, Sarantakos (2005) noted that document analysis is limited in that the documents might not be representative and that; therefore, the findings that one might obtain from them cannot be generalized. To counter this weakness, interview data were used to cross-validate the findings of document analysis. The other disadvantage of this data collection method according to Bowen (2009) is that the documents’ contents might be insufficient for the researchers to comprehend them fully because they might have been produced without a research focus. Therefore, the researcher contacted the relevant authorities to clarify the documents’ contents to enable her to comprehend the context within
which the document had been produced. As demonstrated in the presentation of documents analysis findings, the researcher used interview data where necessary to contextualise the documents data. The other disadvantage of document analysis is that documents might be unavailable for other researchers who may want to use similar documents in their studies (Bowen, 2009). This possibility was substantiated by the challenges that were experienced by the researcher in accessing the documents for this research. For instance, the researcher could not access the Cabinet memorandum document that was used to establish Btv, despite this document being necessary to the study. Moreover, the officials were extremely selective regarding the documents that the researcher could access. Whereas the researcher respected organisational confidentiality, Btv officials’ selectiveness limited the researcher access to other crucial documents, such as consultancy reports, which could have been useful in providing greater insights into the operations of Btv. However, the use of other methods, in this case interviews, allowed the researcher to generate data from Btv employees.

Bowen (2009, p. 33) stated that documents must be evaluated for “authenticity, credibility, and representativeness”. Following Startt and Sloan’s (2003) suggestion, the documents that were used for this study were subjected to both internal and external criticism. Startt and Sloan (2003, p. 164) defined internal criticism as “determining the credibility of a document” whereas external criticism as “determining the authenticity of a document”. Thus, internal and external criticisms allow researchers to ensure that the documents that they reviewed are genuine and dependable.

In this study, the documents reviewed include those that were produced prior to the establishment of Btv, as well as after its launch. They provided data to assist the researcher to draw conclusions regarding the continuing and changing focus of media policy in Botswana. The documents that were collected for analysis in this study, such as government documents, were assessed as credible because they were collected from Btv and government officials whose roles were related to the documents that were requested. In most cases, an attempt was made to obtain copies of the same document from various sources. For example, a copy of the same commissioning strategy was collected from both the General Manager of Btv and the Commissioning Editor. For example, the online documents National Development Plan 10 (NDP 10) and the Broadcasting Act (1998) were downloaded from the government website www.gov.bw. Following Startt and Sloan (2003) suggestions about ensuring credibility of documents by collecting copies of the same document from various sources, hard copies of the same documents were also purchased from a Botswana Government
Printer bookshop to assess the text in the documents to ensure their authenticity and credibility. As Craig Allen (2006, p. 222) observed, the written records related to television “include founding documents, private memoranda and correspondence, diaries, appointment records, meeting notes and transcripts, and all types of personal papers”. However, some Btv documents, such as minutes of meetings and letters of correspondence, were considered confidential and too sensitive to allow the researcher to access them for this study. In addition, due to record keeping inadequacies, some documents, such as those covering the founding of Btv, could not be located. All available documents were collected from Btv and other publicly available documents, such as the *NDP 10* and *Vision 2016* (Appendix 1). The analysis of the documents required identifying four periods: the period without a national television broadcaster (from independence in 1966 to before the launch of Btv in 1999); the early years of Btv (2000–2005); the mid-years (2006–2011); and the current period (2012 to date). The analysis of the documents concentrated on policy dimensions such as structure, language, editorial independence, technology, and local content. However, the documents reviewed did not provide information on program output of Btv, hence the need to explore the schedules for generation of data relating to Btv programming with the view to assess the role of Btv in national development in Botswana.

### 4.3.2 Schedule analysis

The need to consider media content emanates from the understanding that content is a reflection of various elements at play in a media system. It reflects the value that is placed on audiences and the society and culture within which broadcasters operate (Wieten, Murdock, & Dahlgren, 2000). Similarly, McKenzie (2006) noted that media content provides an opportunity for review of factors such as philosophies of the media system, regulation, accessibility as well as exploration of intended audiences of media messages. Thus, programs generate messages that provide insights into policies, as well as into the function of the media. As such, exploring the output of Btv and deducing the meaning of the goals that the channel has pursued is necessary. Because this study explores the role of Btv in national development, the schedule analysis endeavours to explore the prevalence of development-oriented programs that Btv produced. Thus, the need to explore broadcast programming is intrinsic to the understanding of development communication at a practical level.

A schedule refers to the sequential ordering and organisation of broadcast programs, advertisements, and other material within a specified period of time (Bignell, 2004). Thus,
scheduling involves selecting and coordinating programs to place them in a slot in which a
target audience is most likely to watched them (Browne, 1984). Therefore, in this study, a
schedule analysis refers to an examination of the output of the programs that have been
arranged on a television service. Specifically, in this study, the analysis of Btv schedules
generated data that were useful in examining the role of Btv as portrayed through the
channels’ programs.

Because the schedules remained in their original format and were not manipulated,
they offered a superior tool for understanding the social agenda that was pursued on national
Television. In this context, the data that were generated through program analysis facilitated
cross-validity checks on the data that were generated through interviews and focus group
discussions because schedules could not be manipulated. Furthermore, the findings of the
schedule analysis served as the baseline with which the results of the interviews and the focus
groups were interpreted.

### 4.3.2.1 Selection of television schedules

Television schedules for the two selected years of study, 2010 and 2011, were requested from
Btv and sampled to make them more manageable. A sampling technique called a “composite
week” (Wimmer & Dominick, 2006) or an “artificial week” (Bauer, 2000) was used. Because
of the nature of television schedules, the researcher ensured that some days were not
excluded from the sample, which would have led to distorted data. A composite week was
considered to represent a six-month schedule (Bauer, 2000). Initially, the researcher intended
to review two composite weeks for each year; however, a preliminary review of the local
programs that were broadcast on Btv showed extremely little variance within each year.
Therefore, the researcher opted to create and use only one composite week for each of the
selected years under review.

When requesting the schedules, the researcher discussed with Btv transmission
producers any scheduling issues that had to be considered concerning the sampling of the
programs. The Btv transmission producer informed the researcher that the schedule, as
anticipated, varied daily. However, a critical fact was those most programs, other than news
and program repeats, were scheduled to be broadcast once a week. Therefore, when devising
a sampling strategy, the need to ensure that every weekday was represented in the sample was
paramount. In addition, the transmission producer at Btv informed the researcher that in
December the schedule usually diverged from the established generic schedule to cater for
the Christmas holidays, where some local programs might not have been scheduled. Based on this, the researcher excluded December from the sample population.

To create a composite week, the next stage was to randomly select a month and allocate it to a weekday. For example, within the 11-month sample, a month was selected randomly without being replaced and was allocated to a weekday until all the seven days of the week were allocated to the months in each of the sample years, 2010 and 2011. Sampling without replacement (Wimmer & Dominick, 2000, p. 85) was used to ensure that the days of the week and the months were removed from the sample once they were selected, to prevent them from being selected twice, and to ensure that the composite weeks closely reflected the Btv schedule.

The next stage involved identifying the transmission dates. In this phase, the sample population comprised all the same weekdays in a specific month. For example, all the Mondays in November: Monday 7, 14, 21, and 28. One date was randomly selected from these dates; in this case, it was Monday 21 November. Therefore, the schedule to be reviewed was for Monday, 21 November 2011. The researcher repeated the same process until a composite week was created for each of 2010 and 2011. Table 4-1 shows the sampled months and days. The daily schedules of the selected dates were combined to form a composite schedule for analysis (Appendix 2: 2010; Appendix 3: 2011).

Table 4-1

*Composite Weeks*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2010 Composite week</th>
<th>2011 Composite week</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Day</strong></td>
<td><strong>Month</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monday</td>
<td>November</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuesday</td>
<td>September</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wednesday</td>
<td>February</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thursday</td>
<td>May</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friday</td>
<td>July</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saturday</td>
<td>October</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sunday</td>
<td>January</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s fieldwork notes
However, Berger (2011) warned that data on its own might not reveal anything meaningful unless one can place them into context or compare it with something else. He suggested giving data a context by using historical or comparative approaches (Berger, 2011). Therefore, in this study, the findings of the schedule analysis were triangulated with the findings from other methods to provide data that were richer and more meaningful. The schedule analysis was useful in generating quantifiable data, such as the number of foreign and local programs, the hours that were allocated to foreign programs, and other similar variables, as the findings in Chapter 5 demonstrate. Furthermore, the program briefs of the scheduled local programs were reviewed to gain a greater understanding of the local content, which was an area of interest in this study.

4.3.2.2 Review of program briefs
The program briefs or synopses offered basic data that related to the names of programs, their genre, purpose, target audience, language, and transmission time (cf. Appendix 4 for a sample program brief of local content on Btv). The following policy issues guided the review of the scheduled local programs:

- Program types
- Foreign and local programs
- Program durations
- Source of local programs
- Language
- Target audience
- Messages of local programs
- Prime time scheduling

4.3.2.4 Analysis of Btv schedules
Prior to analysing the schedules the program categories had to be determined. The categorisation of television programs is a controversial exercise (Hellman & Soramäki, 1994), which is complicated by the fluidity of television genres because the classical genre categories are challenged by emerging genres (Creeber, 2001; Hellman & Soramäki, 1994). In this study, the principal categories that the researcher used were mostly as explained in the Btv’s generic schedule (Appendix 5) as well as being confirmed with transmission producers
at Btv. These categorisations also resembled those that had been used in other studies in which schedules were analysed (Hellman, 2001, p. 196; Schubert & Stiehler, 2004, p. 350).

However, as Altman (1987, quoted in Creeber, 2001) explained, researchers, in addition to using the established institutional categories, can also generate their own categories. In this study, the researcher developed a category called “government programming.” The programs that fell into this category shared the characteristic that those who produced them were public relations officers in government ministries who focused on their ministries’ goals and objectives, and avoided controversies. The following established institutional categories were developed for this study: religion, morning shows, cartoons, educational broadcasts, children’s shows, talk shows, news, current affairs, sports, soap operas, sitcoms, reality shows, government programming, magazines, drama, music, talent development productions, talent search shows, movies, and international feed. A distinction must be made between talent shows and talent development programs, as well as educational broadcasts and government programs. Talent development programs referred to low budget productions that were aimed at supporting upcoming media-content makers, whereas talent search shows were programs involving artistic performances to showcase the performers’ skills. Educational broadcasts were instructional curriculum-based educational programs that were produced by the division of Educational Broadcasting in the Ministry of Education and Skills Development. Whereas government departments produced them, they were not public relations productions; hence, they were categorised differently and referred to in this study as educational broadcasts while the other government departments produced programs were referred to as government programs. International feed refers to the relay broadcast of foreign news programs, such as France 24 or BBC World News. The programs that were categorised as “other” did not fit any of the above categories. For example, a scheduled program that was labelled “filler” would be classified as “other.”

To derive the data that revealed development-oriented content and media policy issues, which are the focus of this study, the researcher used Ahuvia’s (2001) interpretive content analysis technique, which allows one to understand the connotative meanings of media texts by “combining individual elements in a text to understand the whole meaning” (Ahuvia, 2001, p. 142). The researcher analysed the media texts for latent and manifest meanings to deduce messages that had both development and policy connotations. Ahuvia (2001) argued that drawing connotative conclusions from texts required both the theoretical and contextual expertise of the researcher (Ahuvia, 2001), so that the researcher could interpret and code the
data accordingly. This situation contrasts starkly with traditional content analysis in which a requirement is placed on coders to be trained, regardless of their level of expertise and understanding of the context. The researcher had the necessary skills that Ahuvia recommended based on the researcher’s understanding of the literature on development communication and of Botswana as one of its citizens, and on her previous professional experience as a media professional. Descriptive statistics, specifically frequency counts and percentages were used to present the data, which are shown in the findings chapter.

4.3.4 In-depth interviews

Interviews are a technique that involves asking questions to solicit information (Treadwell, 2011). They are principally employed to obtain information from the research participants’ perspectives, and are ideal to gain an in-depth understanding of the phenomena under investigation (Baxter & Babbie, 2000; Willis, Jost, & Nilakanta, 2007). Lindlof (1995) described an interview as a conversation with a purpose. Interviews are ideal for studying a phenomenon that cannot be observed.

Interviews can be structured, semi-structured, or unstructured (Baxter & Babbie, 2004). Structured interviews involve standardized questions that interviewees answer asked by and interviewer in a similar fashion. Semi-structured interviews entail open-ended, structured questions; however, the questions focus on certain research points as a guide to the researcher (Sarantakos, 2005; Wimmer & Dominick, 2003). Unstructured interviews follow a relaxed protocol in that they focus on discussing themes or points, as opposed to rigid questions. The advantage of structured interviews is that they could lead to meaningful and directed conversations. However, they might not always allow the researcher to adapt to the interviewee’s circumstances (Baxter & Babbie, 2004), thus limiting free-flowing conversations (Wimmer, & Dominick, 2003). Consequently, an approach that could allow for meaningful deliberations but without compromising the flexibility of the participants to dwell on issues that they deem important is the most preferred one. Moreover, as a social constructivism based study, it was apparent that the interviews are provided with questions that guide the discussion, but most significantly allowing the research participants to explain as much as they can the phenomena under investigation. In view of this, semi-structured interviews are the most applicable form of interviews adopted for this study. Thus, semi-structured, in-depth interviews were conducted to explore the objectives underpinning the establishment of Btv, its perceived role, factors influencing its performance, as well as how it can be improved.
4.3.4.1 Sampling of interviewees

Interviews were employed to generate data on the origins of television in Botswana and, most importantly, to understand why it was established. These questions were critical to understanding and explaining the performance of the national broadcaster within the broader national social policy objective of national development. The interviews were also used to clarify questions emanating from the other data collection methods that were used in this study. For example, specific questions, such as those concerning how programs were procured and whether local program production faced any challenges, were included in the interviews with the aim to put the data from the schedules into context.

A purposive sampling strategy was used to select interviewees. Purposive sampling is a non-probability sampling technique that is used to select participants whom the researcher believes that they would be useful to answering the research questions (Babbie, 2010). Thus, the interviewees were people who are adequately informed about the research area (Marshall & Rossman, 2011; Bertrand & Hughes, 2005), which, in this case, is Btv and the media in Botswana. In this study, the purposive sampling strategy was further strengthened when the media professionals suggested other possible research interviewees. That is, although the researcher had identified interview participants, during the interviews these participants voluntarily suggested others whom they thought also had an understanding of the issues being discussed. Although the researcher had already identified most of the participants that the interviewees suggested, this process allowed two research participants to be included who were not in the original list. These participants were retired media professionals who provided insights about the operations of government media. Ultimately, 37 respondents were interviewed as shown in Table 4-2. The interviews were grouped into four broad categories: television production (16 interviewees), project team members (four interviewees), policy makers (four interviewees), and the media industry interest group (13 interviewees).

The interview category of television production comprised media professionals working at Btv. As shown in Table 4-2, these were program producers, administrators, managers, and former employees. Two general managers were involved in this study because during the second fieldwork period, a new general manager for Btv was appointed, following the retirement of the other one who was interviewed during the first field work. The producers who became engaged in this study were randomly selected from a list of producers, which Btv had provided, who had been with the service for over five years. This period was used to ensure that the interviewees would have an in-depth understanding of the service.
Former Btv employees and former executives at the Department of Broadcasting Services (DBS) were included in the study. These employees mostly provided historical data about the national television service.

Table 4-2

Composition of Interviewees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Interviewees’ backgrounds</th>
<th>Number of respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Television production** | Programs Procurement Officer  
Deputy Permanent Secretary of Media (Office of the President)  
General Manager of Btv  
Head of Programs (in-house productions)  
Head of News and Current Affairs  
Marketing  
Channel Control  
Commissioning Editor (local productions)  
Btv Program Producers  
Former employees, Department of Broadcasting Services | 16 |
| **Project team**       | Coordinator of Project Team  
Engineering Coordinator  
Former Director (DBS)  
Programming Coordinator | 4 |
| **Policy makers**      | Former President of Republic of Botswana  
National Broadcasting Board | 4 |
| **Media industry interest group** | Opposition parties’ representatives  
Representative of ethnic minority group  
Independent producer  
Media advocacy organisations  
Commercial television  
Vision 2016 Council  
*Kgosi* (chief)  
Media academic | 13 |
| **Total**              |                                                                                          | 37 |

Source: Author’s fieldwork.

---

4 This is an organisation responsible for implementing Botswana’s vision for socio-economic development.
The interviewees in the category of “project team” (Table 4-2) were officials who established Btv. To launch Btv from the beginning, the Government of Botswana engaged a team of locals and expatriates to form what has been mostly referred to as the “Project Team.” The Project Team comprised a project coordinator and four other members in the fields of engineering, production, operations, and administration (Hunt, 2000). The senior project manager was recruited from the United Kingdom, whereas the operations manager was from Botswana, and the senior producer was recruited from South Africa. The Director of Broadcasting Services (DBS) was also involved in overseeing the project. Thus, although not part of the Project Team, due to the level of accountability, the former Director of the Department of Information and Broadcasting (DIB) was included in the interviewees for this study. The project team provided information on the establishment of Btv, and their data was useful in establishing the promise of Btv, and its performance. Of significance is the diversity of the project team as regard their backgrounds in that they comprised local and expatriate personnel. This could be mostly because by the time of the plans to have a national television, there were few experienced media personnel in Botswana. Thus due to limited capacity to launch a project of a magnitude of a television service, as well as in consistent with Botswana’s policy of engaging expatriate personnel where necessary, it was inevitable that a national television project team was to comprise local and expatriate staff.

The policy makers’ category was used to generate data that, among other things, related to media policy in Botswana. The interviews with former Botswana presidents were essential to this study because they also provided historical information on the origins of Btv. They were also key decision makers regarding the introduction of television. As national leaders, they were also responsible for media policy in Botswana. Some officials who were identified as possible interviewees declined to participate in the study. For example, the Minister of Ministry of Presidential Affairs and Public Administration (MOPAPA), who was responsible for state media, declined to participate, directing the researcher to the Deputy Permanent Secretary (Media) in the Office of the President. Similarly, former ministers responsible for state media also referred the researcher to the current Minister of MOPAPA. However, the involvement of high-level officials, such as former presidents, as well as the analysis of government documents, as outlined in Section 4.3.1, compensated for the limitation of the non-involvement of the government ministers responsible for broadcasting services.
The media industry interest group included various media sector stakeholders in Botswana (Table 4.2). Requests for interviews were sent to the three opposition parties that had representatives in Botswana parliament: the Botswana Congress Party (BCP), the Botswana National Front (BNF), and the Botswana Movement for Democracy (BMD). Two of the parties responded and advised that they would send a representative. The participants from this category mostly generated data that focused on the perceptions of the performance of Btv.

Some of the mentioned categories overlapped. For example, an interviewee could have been a former employee of the Department of Broadcasting Services, but was currently in a media professional role in a different organisation. In such instances, the employees’ current role was used to categorise them. Retired employees who were not actively involved with the media were categorised as former employees, and were grouped with the television producers because of their experience as former program producers. Interviewees who were members of a project team as well as former employees of the Department of Broadcasting Services were categorised as members of the project team.

4.3.4.2 Interview procedure and data analysis
The identified interviewees were contacted through various means. The most common initial contact was made telephonically, where both the researcher and the study were introduced. Regarding the government officials, they requested a written letter with proof of the researcher’s research permit, according to the regulations for conducting research in Botswana (Botswana Government, n.d.), which the researcher complied with. The officials at Btv took a long time to respond, stating that they were awaiting authorisation from the Deputy Permanent Secretary in the MOPAPA, who was constantly on official trips within and outside Botswana during the research period. Ultimately, follow ups were made through email, telephone, mobile phone, and visits to their offices. Other interviewees were largely contacted through telephone calls and email.

The interviews were conducted at the interviewees’ preferred location. Twenty-nine participants were interviewed in their offices in accordance with their requests to accommodate their work schedules. Five interviews were conducted in the respondents’ homes, as most of these interviewees were retirees. The other two interviews were conducted in restaurants, whereas one interviewee, due to logistical reasons, preferred to respond to the questions in writing. Thirty-three interviews were conducted in the capital Gaborone, where
all the respondents were based. The other three were conducted in three villages: Tonota, Tlokweng, and Ramotswa.

The interviews averaged 45 min, with the shortest being 24 min, and the longest 1 hour and 36 min. Most of the interviews were conducted in English, although the interviewees often switched between both Setswana and English, which is an extremely common trend in Botswana for bilingual speakers. In instances where quotes were used as exhibits in the findings chapter, they were translated from Setswana into English. The interviews followed the general protocol of semi-structured interviews, which involves firstly introducing the purpose of the interview, its scope and format, and dealing with ethical issues\(^5\). Interviewees signed a consent form\(^6\) before the interview began. Some interviewees were reluctant to sign a written consent, but wanted to consent verbally, which was allowed by the researcher. The interviewees also agreed to the use of audio recording device during the interview. The interviews were guided by the questions that are outlined in Appendix 8 of this thesis.

The interview data were analysed using thematic analysis, which involves grouping data into emerging themes and patterns (Braun & Clarke, 2006; Cresswell, 2009; Holloway, 1997). Thematic analysis involves the generation of descriptive patterns from interview transcripts (Patton, 2002). The analysis involved searching for related categories with similar meanings, and clustering them together to form themes (King & Horrocks, 2010). Thematic analysis involves various phases: familiarizing oneself with the data, generating initial codes, identifying themes, constructing thematic network, and integrating and interpreting (Robson, 2011). These phases were adopted in the study to guide the data analysis.

The first phase involves familiarisation with the data. Initially all the interviews were transcribed verbatim as electronic documents prior to the start of the first phase of data analysis. During this phase, Robson (2011) explained that researchers must immense themselves in the data. In this study, interview transcripts were read repeatedly. The first reading involved actively reading all the transcripts to recognise the patterns and meanings of the data. The second reading involved grouping the transcripts according to the interview categories that were listed above to search for patterns among the interviewees within similar categories for familiarisation of responses among the various interview groups in this study.

---

\(^5\) See attached inform sheet, Appendix 6

\(^6\) See attached information and consent form, Appendix 7
In the third reading, all the transcripts were grouped together, and notes on the emerging patterns were taken. In addition, the researcher listened to the interview recordings once more after reading the transcripts to improve the accuracy and understanding of the data.

The second phase involved producing initial codes. The codes were inductively produced by analysing the interview transcripts and grouping passages that had similar meanings. This process assisted the organization of the data into groups that were based on the codes that were generated from the entire data set. The codes were then manually extracted, and organised into electronic documents. To ensure that the transcript passages relating to the codes could be traced later when writing about the findings, the coded passages were assigned identifiers, for example, “Interviewee#2.” This process was also useful for presenting the findings because the researcher found these identifiers useful for counting the number of responses regarding a certain topic.

During the third phase, themes were identified. This stage also involved further organisation of the data based on the codes developed above. Thus, the codes were grouped further, depending on how similar they were to each other, to form sub-themes and themes.

The fourth phase of thematic analysis involved creating thematic networks. This stage involved a form of network that was based on themes and their sub-themes, and on the codes forming the sub-themes. This stage was useful because it provided a clear understanding of the thematic organisation of the data and furthermore allowed the researcher an opportunity to review whether the themes were appropriately organised. This approach permitted the researcher to return to previous stages to reorganise the data and to check for any discrepancies in the themes generated. Figure 4-1 provides an example of a thematic network, specifically, the overall theme of “understanding the origins of Btv.” Its subthemes were socio-political, pragmatic, technological, and economic factors. For example, the codes under socio-political included nationalism, countering South African content, government communications, and cultural value (Section 5.4.2.1).
The final phase involved integrating and interpreting the data. The researcher implemented this phase when writing about the findings (Chapter 5), where, by referring to the research literature and the context of Botswana, the data were interrogated. The contextualization of the data is necessary, as according to Creswell (2009), context-based interpretation of the data improves validity of the study because the interpretations of the data are based on the situation within which the responses were generated. Moreover, contextualising the data is consistent with both phenomenology and social constructivism theoretical underpinnings of this study.

In the presentation of the findings, in addition to the most commonly mentioned themes, the researcher consciously decided to include themes and statements that were not commonly raised, which Creswell (2009) called negative or discrepant information. Creswell (2009) argued that such negative cases represent a realistic view of the world, and improve the validity of the study. As Silverman (2011) suggested, the data analysis also involves selecting quotes from the interview transcripts that were used to substantiate the claims that were made in this study. Hence the interview findings are mostly substantiated by numerous quotes from the interview transcripts.

4.3.5 Focus group discussions
Following the exploration of the origin, roles, and structure of television through the analysis of documents, schedules, and interviews, it also became necessary to explore the audiences’ perceptions of the role of Btv with the intention to establish the extent to which they think...
Btv had met their developmental communication needs. As observed by Ellis (2007), the level of television usage and expectations on television differ radically among nations; hence, this study includes the aim of understanding the audiences’ perceptions and expectations of television from the context of Botswana.

In harmony with the social constructivist approach of this study, the researcher approached audiences as being able to interpret and impose meanings on media content. This further suggests that the audiences are active rather than passive receivers of information (Seiter, 2004). This approach of active audiences starkly contrasted the traditional media effects research, which has included a focus on behaviourism and media uses (McQuail, 2005; Napoli, 2012). Furthermore, an active audience approach differs from the ratings approach, which is linked to ratings research, and from media commercialisation or commodification, which are dominant approaches in media economics and media industries research (Napoli, 2012). Currently, audience research has included an approach to audiences as also being content makers (Morley, 2006). In this study, the researcher has adopted a reception approach to audiences, which includes the audiences’ interpretations of media content or text based on their social contexts (McQuail, 2005; Ang, 1991; Ross & Nightingale, 2003).

Focus groups are a critical source of data generation in social research because they allow participants to debate and express their opinions on a wide range of issues (Lindolf, 1995). Wimmer and Dominick (2006) identified one advantage of focus groups as enabling the flexible formulation of the research questions and design, as well as allowing researchers to clarify any of the responses from the research participants that might be confusing. The other advantage of focus group discussions is that they are an inexpensive method to collect data, because data are simultaneously and systematically collected from several people in one setting (Marshall & Rossman, 2011). The other advantage of focus group discussions is that they allow for the researcher to have data that reflects integrated responses involving information generated as a response to the researcher’s questions, as well as information volunteered by the respondents (Morgan and Spanish, 1984). For instance the interview involves participants responding to the researcher’s questions, while in participant observations, the participants volunteer the data. The advantage of the focus groups is thus the method allows for interaction, which involves both responses solicited by the researcher as well as those generated by the focus groups participants in their interactions as members of the group. Morgan and Spanish (1984) furthermore conclude that the method is a better
compromise of both interviews and participant observation in that focus group discussion allow for combining the two goals of probing and observation.

The other advantage of focus group discussions is their ability to cut across illiteracy barriers. This is because the method allows for data collection within participants who can read and write as well as those without these skills (Kitzinger, 1995). This is an advantage in this study in that this method will allow the researcher to solicit responses from participants across various literacy levels. Moreover, the focus group discussion allows research participants an opportunity to use daily anecdotes such as jokes, vocabulary and humour to communicate issues of importance (Kitzinger, 1995). Moreover, these may encourage participants to express their views without fear of sounding as if they have nothing to say. This argues Kitzinger, enhances the data as participants may express themselves without fear of having to sound logical through well thought out responses.

In this study, focus groups were considered the most appropriate method for exploring the views of Btv audiences because the method allowed for an in-depth understanding of the issues that are the focus of this research. Alternative manners of soliciting audience views are surveys, observations, or interviews. However, due to the nature of this study, a survey was not appropriate because it was unsuitable for exploring the audiences’ interpretations of media content within the specific context of Botswana. Similarly, conducting individual interviews and observations is often challenging because of the size of the audience.

However, one of the weaknesses of focus group discussions is that the group dynamics could cause situations where minority or opposing views might be withheld for the desire to conform to the group (Wimmer & Dominick, 2003), or where one member might dominate the group discussion (Marshall & Rossman, 2011). In this study, in one focus group discussion, one participant nearly dominated the discussion, whereas in another focus group another participant was extremely silent. In both cases, intervention involved politely asking the dominant participant to let others talk. Having realised that the participant was dominating by wanting to be the first to respond to all the questions, the researcher asked the group members about a strategy that could allow other participants to be the first to respond to questions. They suggested that they could take turns in being the first to respond to questions. Conversely, the quieter participant, who was also disabled, was constantly given opportunities to respond, which, initially, was challenging to the participant; however, eventually, the participant became more engaged in the discussions. This suggested that the researcher could establish a rapport with the discussants.
4.3.5.1 Recruiting focus group participants
As Babbie (2010) and Wimmer and Dominick (2006) suggested, focus group discussions might involve four to 12 people who might be either demographically homogeneous or share common experiences. In this study, the smallest focus group comprised six participants, and the biggest comprised 10. Because the aim of this study is to explore audiences’ perceptions of the performance and role of national television in Botswana within a development communication framework, a purposive sample of television viewers was conducted. In selecting the sample, the researcher used their understanding of the population and its elements to select the sample purposefully. A purposive sample was conducted to reflect the diversity of Btv audiences, which include dimensions such as ethnicity, language, age, and residential area of the participants.

Seven focus groups were conducted in various parts of the country. In Botswana, one must negotiate access through the community elders to enter villages more easily. These could be the kgosi (chief), whom as described in Chapter 1 are central to the village set-up in Botswana. The other contact for negotiating access in Botswana could be through the District Commissioner for administrative matters. In the selected sites, apart from the ones that were based in the capital city, the initial contact was the kgosi, who was contacted by telephone and, subsequently, by an official letter as a follow up. The response was extremely positive and the kgosi consented and endorsed the participation of their morafe (community) in the research. They also offered venues for conducting the focus groups. In two of the villages, venues were unavailable because all the possible venues were being used. These discussions were conducted in the open area, under a tree. Holding meetings in a relaxed atmosphere under a tree is also a common practice in Botswana.

4.3.5.2 Focus group demographics and sites
The focus group demographics (Table 4-3) related to the place of residence, ethnicity, gender, educational level, employment, and age of the focus group participants. The descriptions that were used in the Botswana Population and Housing Census data (Central Statistics Office, 2011b) provided the basis for identifying the place of residence of the participants as being in urban, semi-urban, or rural centres. These were included because of the extent of the spread of development infrastructure among them, which tended to be linked to their status, with rural areas being the least developed, and urban centres being the most developed. This has also affected services; for example, the broadcasting bureau offices are mostly located in
urban and semi-urban areas, giving them greater media coverage privileges and access. However, in this study, other than Gaborone, none of the focus group sites had bureau offices. However, bearing in mind the large land mass of Botswana, all of the focus group sites were within reasonable distances, from less than 50 km to just over 150 km from a bureau office or a broadcasting headquarters.

Ethnicity was used as a demographic factor in this study because of its possible influence on the opportunities for social change in African societies. Whereas the focus of this study was not to seek the influence of ethnicity regarding access to either development nor television services, nonetheless, as stated in Chapter 1, the ethnic composition of Botswana warrants the need to consider ethnicity in recruiting participants. Ethnicity in Botswana is ignored in official documents; with the reasoning that ‘we are all Botswana’ (Mompati & Prinsen, 2000), and recognising ethnicity is said to divide the nation. Nonetheless, with hindsight that there is emerging trend of perceptions of disenfranchisement of ethnic minorities in Botswana as explained in Chapter 1, ethnicity of the participants was considered in recruiting them to participate in the study. Consequently, ethnic minority views were sought through conducting focus groups in the two ethnic minorities’ dominated villages of Masunga and Sesung. As a development-oriented study, the views of the ethnic minorities were critical, because some of the ethnic minorities in Botswana are among the poorest groups in that society, as well as the most critical of the status quo compared to mainstream ethnicities (Mompati & Prinsen, 2000).

Other demographics, such as age, gender, employment, and educational level were also critical in this study because other scholars have noted their influence on audience’s media content use (Ang, 1991; Ivala, 2007; McQuail, 2005). The demographics of the focus groups are shown in Table 4-3. A total of 59 people participated in the focus groups discussions. Their ages ranged from 20 to 81 years. Their educational levels varied from no formal education to tertiary education. Regarding employment, those who were engaged in this study were employed, retired, and unemployed people.
Focus group participants’ demographics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus Group</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Educational Level</th>
<th>Geographic Location</th>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Employment</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FGD.1</td>
<td>F: 5 M: 4</td>
<td>S: 3 P: 2 N: 2 T: 2</td>
<td>25-55 Rural Tswana village-north</td>
<td>Ethnic majority</td>
<td>Employed: 3 Unemployed: 5 Retired: 1</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD.4</td>
<td>F: 4 M: 4</td>
<td>S: 2 P: 4 N: 2</td>
<td>55-81 Semi-urban big village-north</td>
<td>Major ethnic minority group</td>
<td>Employed: 2 Retired: 3 Unemployed: 3</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD.5</td>
<td>F: 3 M: 3</td>
<td>T: 6</td>
<td>19-20 Urban-capital city</td>
<td>Mixed</td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD.7</td>
<td>F: 5 M: 5</td>
<td>T: 3 S: 2 P: 3 N: 2</td>
<td>20-68 Semi-urban</td>
<td>Major ethnic majority group</td>
<td>Employed: 6 Unemployed: 2</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s fieldwork notes.

Focus group 1: Dibete

This focus group discussion was conducted in a village called Dibete, which is approximately 100kms from the capital Gaborone. Dibete is considered the dividing point between North and South Botswana, and is the first village that one meets when heading north of the country. This village was selected because of its relative proximity to the capital Gaborone. The population is 1083 (Central Statistics Office, 2011a). This village is a typical mainstream Tswana village, with access to basic facilities such as a health post, primary school, kgotla.7

7 In this instance, the kgotla refers to the actual kgotla and government building used by government employees such as tribal secretaries and police officers who assist in running the kgotla as a modern institution. In other villages, there may be no buildings and government officials.
and has additional infrastructure such as a railway station and a tarred road. The participants in this group included a councillor (politician), the kgosi, a police officer, a health professional, a village development committee (VDC) representative and, other community members.

**Focus group 2: Sesung**

This focus group discussion was conducted in Sesung, a village in South-western Botswana that is approximately 150 km from the capital Gaborone. This focus group predominantly composed ethnic minority tribe Bakgalagadi. The population of this rural village is 1,481 people (Central Statistics Office, 2011a). As regard infrastructural development, this village is similar to Dibete, except that there is no access to a railway line. As regard the composition of the focus group participants, they comprised mostly of community members.

**Focus group 3: Lobatse**

This focus group discussion was conducted in an urban setting, in a town called Lobatse, approximately 70 kilometres from Gaborone. As a town, Lobatse comprises various ethnic groups. This site was selected for pragmatic reasons. Unlike other towns in Botswana, which are mostly based on mining, life in Lobatse is more laid-back, showing stronger similarities to village life than to other towns in Botswana. The town has a broadcasting history because the first radio network in Botswana, Radio Bechuanaland, was established in this town in 1961. After independence in 1966, the radio network was relocated to Gaborone and was renamed Radio Botswana (Zaffiro, 1991).

**Focus group 4: Masunga**

This focus group was conducted in the ethnic minority village of Masunga. The Bakalanga, a major minority tribe in Botswana, are the most dominant ethnicity in this semi-urban village of 5,666 people (Central Statistics Office, 2011a). The village is also the administrative headquarters of the North East District Council. Masunga is also over 500 km away from the capital city, where Btv is based. This site, although consisting of semi-urban settings, also represents a “big” village in Botswana. These “big” villages are highly populated and have considerable access to infrastructure and social services.

---

8 Ethnic groups: Tswana 79%; Kalanga 11%; Kgalagadi, Herero, Bayeyi, Hambukush, Basarwa ("San"), Khoi, Europeans 10% (http://www.state.gov/r/pa/ei/bgn/1830.htm).
**Focus groups 5 and 6: Gaborone**

These focus groups were conducted to obtain the views of the urban audiences in the capital city, in which Btv is located. Gaborone, which is the biggest city in Botswana, had a population of 231,592 people in 2011 (Central Statistics Office, 2011a). Because it is a capital city, mixed ethnicities are present and, compared to the towns and villages; greater access to infrastructure and social services is available. Focus Group 5 comprised urban youth, whereas Focus Group 6 comprised participants from diverse age groups who are ordinary residents of the city.

**Focus group 7: Ramotswa**

This focus group discussion was conducted in a mainstream Tswana village, less than 50 km from Gaborone. Ramotswa, like Lobatse, is located along Botswana’s border with South Africa. This village has a population of 28,952, which is similar to Lobatse, and is the administrative district of the South East District Council. As an administrative centre, the village is similar to Masunga because it enjoys greater advantages regarding infrastructure and social services, compared to smaller villages such as Dibete and Sesung. The village is also located on the tribal land of the Balete, one of the eight major Tswana tribes in Botswana.

### 4.3.5.3 Conducting the focus group discussion

Each focus group discussion began with a recap of this study’s aims and an outline of the researcher’s expectations of the participants. In addition, the researcher asked the participants to sign a consent form. Following the experience of the first focus group discussion, where participants felt it was time consuming to ask each group member to respond to the same question, the researcher firmly explained to the other groups that the need for individual responses was necessary to encourage the participation of all members in the group discussions. The participants of Focus Groups 3 and 4 requested that the discussions began and ended with a prayer. This is a normal practice for gatherings or meetings in Botswana. The focus groups were audio-recorded, as agreed to by the participants. As an icebreaker, the participants discussed the weather, which is also a common practice in Botswana. In addition, because the researcher was a former employee of Btv, the participants in some focus groups were also interested in discussing her experiences at Btv, which lead organically to conversations about the television programs that they watched. The focus group discussions questions are attached as Appendix 9. The questions began by asking the participants about
their television viewing patterns to help them settle comfortably within the group. The next phase involved asking key questions that sought to establish the group’s perceptions of local television programs, and what actions they thought were necessary to improve Btv. The questions that were asked during the last phase were designed to conclude the discussions; they included a recap of the participants’ responses in general, based on the notes that the researcher had taken during the discussions and crosschecking of the responses with the participants.

The focus groups were conducted in Setswana, the national language. In the two focus groups where ethnic languages were spoken, a research assistant was engaged to help to translate. The participants were strongly encouraged to use their ethnic languages; however, they mostly used Setswana.

Regarding the venue, two were conducted under trees in some villages as explained earlier. The focus groups participants suggested that meeting in such places is a common practice and that they were used as an alternative for school buildings and community halls. The other focus groups were conducted in the kgotla’s shelter (leobo), which was the place offered by the kgosi. This was despite the researcher’s reservations about using the kgotla on the understanding that the participants might feel constrained in discussing issues that were considered political. However, the participants and the kgosi assured the researcher that the kgotla has been used for similar purposes, and suggested that whereas political views were not allowed for public kgotla meetings, they could be expressed, as long as the gathering was not a pitso (public meeting). Indeed, their responses, which did touch on political issues such as censorship and perceived political bias at Btv, revealed that the participants appeared to have expressed their views openly, without the kgotla setting having placed any obvious limitations. The use of the kgotla was also advantageous in the context of Botswana, where research culture is still growing. The kgotla formalised and validated the researcher’s permission to engage with the community members. The use of the kgotla also facilitated open discussions with community members who felt protected because their involvement in such unfamiliar practices had been endorsed by the kgosi. In addition, the kgotla is an extremely familiar environment, especially for adults in Botswana. The urban youth focus group was conducted at their preferred location, at one of the participants’ house.
4.3.5.4 Data analysis

The thematic analysis phases by Braun & Clarke (2006) and Robson, (2011) described earlier (Section 4.3.4.2) in the analysis of the interview data that include becoming familiar with the data, generating the initial codes, identifying themes, constructing thematic networks, and integrating and interpreting the data, also guided the analysis of the focus group data.

Firstly, in the familiarisation phase, the focus group discussions were transcribed and notes were taken. In this phase, the recordings of the discussions were repeatedly listened to as a preliminary step towards transcribing in a manner that could enhance the appropriate matching of discussants and their recorded responses. The transcription process also involved using the field notes about the group interactions, such as those relating to moments where one discussant would be raising a point and others agreed or interrupted, or many people spoke at the same time. After transcribing, the recordings were listened to once more, and were compared with the transcripts for consistency. The assistance of a research assistant was sought regarding few translations of two recordings of the groups in which ethnic languages were occasionally used.

Secondly, the next phase of the analysis involved generating the initial codes. This was conducted by listing codes that emerged from the data set, as well as by making notes on their relevance to the research. This process assisted the researcher to organise the data into groups. In this phase, extracts were also selected for later use in the presentation of the findings. The focus group discussants were also allocated identifiers, for example female-urban group, in a manner that was similar to the interview data treatment. Fig4-2 shows an example of coding.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data extract</th>
<th>Coded for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>If I am really to share with you my views about Btv...umm... uh...I can say</td>
<td>“it is trying”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that our television does not reach out to the masses, it is trying, but</td>
<td>• “it is trying”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>it has still very far to go to reflect our lifestyles. Yes, maybe because it</td>
<td>• Lifestyle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>is still new, they will eventually improve. (male, urban group)</td>
<td>• Need to improve the service</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 4-2: Sample coding for focus group discussions data.*

Source: Author’s fieldwork notes.
Thirdly, the data analysis involved searching for themes within the codes that were generated in the preceding phase. The codes were regrouped to form potential sub-themes and themes. Fourthly, the themes were further reorganised and thematic maps were used as guide. In this phase, the candidate themes that were produced in the third phase were further regrouped, or collapsed, to form themes and sub-themes that would be used to present the data. In addition, following Braun and Clarke’s (2006) suggestion, the coded and collated extracts were read together once more to ensure that they had been properly placed under the appropriate themes. Thus, the researcher engaged in a constant iterative coding process, and refined the sub-themes and themes to ensure that they captured the essence of the data.

In the final phase of the data analysis, the findings were presented (Section 5.5). This involved integrating and interpreting the data, which revealed the focus group participants’ perceptions of Btv and its role in national development. It also revealed their views on how they thought the service could be improved.

4.4 Evaluation of research design
It is important for the researcher to examine their research design to determine the qualitative validity and reliability of their studies (Creswell, 2009). To ensure validity, which involved the accuracy of the findings (Creswell, 2009); strategies such as triangulation and reflexivity can be used. These were used in this study.

4.4.1 Triangulation
Triangulation refers to the use of multiple sources of data or methods (Baxter & Babbie, 2004). Denzin (1989) identified four types of triangulation:

• Methodological triangulation, which involves the use of multiple methods to examine the consistency of the results that have been obtained
• Data Triangulation, which refers to gathering data from multiple sources
• Investigator Triangulation, which involves using more than one investigator to collect and or analyse data
• Theory triangulation, which involves using multiple perspectives to interpret data

In this study, the researcher adopted methodological triangulation. Multiple methods of data collection involving document analysis, schedule analysis, in-depth interviews, and focus group discussions, were combined to improve the consistency of the data. Because different
methods have inherent limitations, using a variety of methods can help complement and compensate for such weaknesses (Patton, 2002). For example, a limitation of in-depth interviews is that they are subjective; however, schedule analysis, as an unobtrusive method, might offset such a weakness. Overall, triangulation leads to a more trustworthy and credible study. In this study, the key findings from various methods were in the end triangulated as outlined in Chapter 5, Section, 5.6, to discern key findings of the study.

4.4.2 Reflexivity

Reflexivity deals with understanding the role of the researcher in the research process. It involves identifying and even challenging the researcher’s assumptions, and recognizing the extent to which such thoughts, actions, and decisions shape the research process (Creswell, 2009; Mason, 2002). In this study informed by a social constructivist interpretation of the world that focuses on the researchers’ role as being to interpret the data, the researcher’s positioning in the study had to be also considered. Moreover, as an insider, who is a Botswana national, as well as a former employee of the Btv, indeed the researcher had to be reflexive. Whereas as an insider, it was inevitable that the researcher could use their understanding of the research content, the researcher made efforts to be reflexive by constantly reviewing the researcher’s assumptions throughout this study to remain as objective, neutral, non-judgmental, and open-minded as possible. Furthermore, the use of the various methods of data collection that were outlined above, some of which were unobtrusive, such as document and schedule analysis, also improved the objectivity of the data analysis.

4.5 Ethical considerations

When researching human subjects, the appropriate conduct of the researcher must be ensured and concern for the protection of human subjects must be shown (Babbie, 2010; Sarantakos, 2005). In this study, the researcher’s greatest concern was to ensure the anonymity and confidentiality of the research participants. Keeping the documents in a safe and lockable cabinet ensured confidentiality of the documents. The electronic documents were protected by always working on a private computer that was only accessible to the researcher. In addition, the participants’ responses were not shared with others. In addition, nameless identifiers such as “Interviewee#1” or “male-urban group” were used in the presentation of the findings (Chapter 5) to ensure anonymity.
The Ethical Clearance Committee at the School of Journalism and Communication of The University of Queensland granted ethical clearance. In Botswana, the Office of Research and Development at the University of Botswana, of which the researcher is an employee, also offered ethical clearance as part of enforcing the regulations that govern how its employees conduct research. Finally, the Botswana Government, through the Office of the President and the Department of Broadcasting Offices, granted the researcher permission to conduct this study in Botswana. In summary, this chapter has outlined the research design and methods that were used to generate data relating to the examination of the performance of Btv.

4.6 Summary
This chapter outlined the methodology used for this study. The study approaches the role of television in national development in Botswana from a holistic approach that involves media production and consumption. The four methods of data collection in this study, document analysis, schedule analysis, in-depth interviews and focus group discussion were triangulated as a way of ensuring rigour in the findings of this study. The documents analysis method allowed the researcher to explore the origins of television broadcasting in Botswana, as well as its stated roles in the key documents related to the broadcasting sector and national development in Botswana. The analysis of the schedules is useful in generating information relating to the messages broadcast by Btv and how the channel’s content relates to the national development priorities of Botswana. In addition, interviews with key informants also provided data on the role of Btv as well as the factors impacting on the channel’s performance. An audience perspective on the performance of Btv has also been incorporated in this study through focus group discussions with respondents of various demographic profiles. In all, these qualitative methods of data collection allowed the researcher to generate answers to the key research questions of this study. In the next chapter the findings of this study are presented.
Chapter 5 Findings

5.1 Introduction
In this chapter, the findings of this study are presented in accordance with the four methods of data collection that are employed in this study. The chapter is divided into five sections. In section 5.2, the focus is on the findings that emerged from the document analysis. In this section, this study’s findings are presented to explore the parameters for a national television service in relation to its role in national development. In Section 5.3, the findings presented extend the data on the role of Btv in national development by offering an analysis of the channel’s program output to explore the messages that are broadcast on the national television. In Section 5.4, the findings from the interviews reveal how various stakeholders understand the role of Btv in national development. In addition, the findings include a focus on the analysis of socio-political and economic factors shaping television broadcasting in Botswana. In Section 5.5, an analysis of the focus group discussant’s perceptions of Btv regarding the service’s role in national development is presented. Lastly, in Section 5.6, a summary of the findings of this study that was generated by triangulating the data from the various methods is presented to organise the key findings in relation to the research questions of this study. It must be noted that while the findings are mostly represented according to methods of data collection, occasionally, reference is made to interview data as a way of contextualising and clarifying issues in the documents and schedules reviewed.

5.2 Document analysis
In this section of the findings chapter an analysis of policy, legislative, and organisational decisions that bear on Btv’s current performance is offered, with a view to identify the official roles that were assigned to Btv, namely, what the channel is empowered to execute as a public institution in relation to the overall national development of Botswana. The researcher reviewed the documents guiding the state-owned media prior to the launch of Btv to explore the role of Btv in Botswana’s socio-economic development. The findings of this review are presented in sub-section 5.2.1, and demonstrate that prior to the launch of a national television, the state-owned media were ascribed a publicity role. Following this, in sub-section, 5.2.2, the findings relate to the analysis of the documents that were produced in
the early years of Btv (2000–2005). The overarching theme of the findings in this sub-section is that the views among media professionals and the Botswana Government on the key role of Btv were divergent. In the sub-section 5.2.3, the findings of this study demonstrate the Botswana Government and media professionals expressed interest in transforming the state media into a public broadcasting service in the midyears of Btv (2006–2011). Moreover, this period was further characterised by efforts to formulate a formal national broadcasting policy in Botswana. Nonetheless, in view of the failed efforts to introduce a formal national broadcasting policy, the data that is presented in sub-section, 5.2.4 reveal that current media policy in Botswana is a diversion from the possible reforms in the structure of Btv, as stated in the preceding years. Finally, in sub-section 5.2.5, a summary of the key findings of the document analysis is provided. In all, the focus of the findings of the document analysis is on key media policy issues, such as structure of Btv, language, editorial independence, technology, and local content. It must be noted that whereas no formal document exists on broadcasting or media policy in Botswana, the notion of media policy in this thesis largely refers to principles and decisions of both the government and media professionals that direct the actions of the media. It is also critical to bear in mind that the periodisation of media policy is for analytical purposes, because policy is an ongoing process.

5.2.1 Government media policies and practices before Btv (1966–2000)

The period 1966–2000 includes a period of media policy that preceded the commencement of a national television service in Botswana. During that period, broadcast media policy centred on radio broadcasting because it was the only existing state-owned broadcast media. As stated in Chapter 1, national television service in Botswana was introduced after radio, and the two belonged to the same department of Broadcasting Services. Thus, the policy directives for radio broadcasting were to shape and influence television broadcasting. This sub-section includes a review of the five key documents that established the parameters of broadcasting in Botswana prior to television. They are two national development plans, the Transitional Plan for Social and Economic Development (TNDP) and the first National Development Plan 1 (NDP1), two consultancy reports, the Hughes and The Lawrence reports, and the Broadcasting Act (1998). The key findings from these documents are outlined below.
5.2.1.1 The Transitional Plan for Social and Economic Development (TNDP) and the National Development Plan 1 (NDP 1).

The TND was produced during the period of informal self-rule, 1963–1966, preceding full independence in September 1966. During this period, just before Botswana achieved independence (1963–1966) and soon after its independence (1963–1975), the media policy was framed by the government’s Department of Information and Broadcasting’s need to provide publicity about government activities, as well as mobilise the public to support the initiatives of the new government. It must be noted that, at this time, the crucial focus of the newly independent Botswana was establishing a united nation, avoiding racial rivalries, and safeguarding territorial and sovereign integrity (Republic of Botswana, 1966). In addition, the focus of the government was to introduce resource planning in lieu of the limited national financial resources (Republic of Botswana, 1968). In view of these national priorities and the socio-economic conditions at independence, as explained in Chapter 1, the government-owned media were ascribed publicity and mobilisation roles both within Botswana and outside it. In this case, the media were to acquaint the Batswana about their country’s problems and the objectives of their government, as well as publicise the government’s development policies.

Specifically, both film and radio were considered the most appropriate mediums for establishing communication between the government and the Batswana soon after independence (Republic of Botswana, 1968). Moreover, radio was already an established medium that the colonial government had launched. Indeed, with illiteracy rates of approximately 75%, (Republic of Botswana, 1968) at the time of independence, radio and visual mediums, such as film, were perhaps the most appropriate media of communication. Furthermore, positive indications about the efficacy of radio were already evident as radio was said to have been instrumental in mobilising Batswana towards national objectives such as national unity and self-reliance (Republic of Botswana, 1968). Although a national television was not inherited at independence, the Botswana government’s decision to establish a film department suggests that it recognised the significance of visual communication. However, a question, which is relevant to this thesis, ensues as to why the government could not launch a national service soon after independence, opting, instead, for a mobile films unit. This issue is explored further in Chapter 6.

The media’s task was also to publicise Botswana internationally through the Information Department’s films production unit. It was to produce at least one film a year to be shown abroad to advertise Botswana with the view to attract foreign and technical
assistance (Republic of Botswana, 1966; Parsons, 2006). Botswana’s economic conditions at independence as demonstrated in Chapter 1 perhaps justified the need for foreign aid. Moreover, the reliance on the British colonial government’s aid that financed over half of Botswana’s budget soon after independence (Leftwich, 1995) possibly forced the country to seek alternative revenue base. Another possible explanation for the need to advertise Botswana to other countries at that time was the decolonisation process that was occurring in Africa and, more significantly, regionally. As demonstrated in Chapter 1, none of Botswana’s neighbouring countries was independent prior to the 1980s. In addition, perhaps attaining self-rule after decades of possible incorporation into the then Rhodesia and the Union of South Africa as discussed in Chapter 1 could have been considered a great political achievement that was worth sharing with the rest of the world. The state-owned media was thus to be useful in this regard.

5.2.1.2 Hughes Report and Lawrence Report
Hughes and Lawrence were Western expatriate personnel from the United Kingdom, who were engaged in advising the Botswana Government on media policy. They were contracted at different times to establish the role of the government media, as well as offer suggestions for improvement of the operations of the Government’s Department of Information Services that was responsible for government media. The results of their findings and recommendations were set out in the Hughes Report (1968) and the Lawrence Report (1978), which were accessed as primary sources in this study. The Hughes report was adopted as the guiding document for government-owned media, while the Lawrence report informed the Botswana Government’s decision on the introduction of a national television service. The two reports were consistent with the national development plans’ focus on the public relations role of the government media.

5.2.1.2 Hughes Report, 1968.
Hughes was an expatriate consultant who was commissioned by the Botswana government in 1968 through the Ariel Foundation to explore the information functions of government media. This culminated in a report, The Hughes Report, which he presented to the Botswana government in 1968 (Hughes, 1968), advising that if the report was to be accepted; it should be converted into a policy statement. Whereas indications exist that the government of Botswana adapted the report and formulated a presidential directive to define the information functions of the government, the Hughes Report was never turned into a formal media policy
in Botswana. Nonetheless, the report remains influential in understanding the operations of government media in Botswana on the basis that it is a reference point about the function of the government media in Botswana as alluded to by some interviewees in this study (Interviewees #20, #23, #30, and #15).

The approach to broadcasting policy shortly after independence was focused on ensuring public support of government activities, mainly through exhortation, as well as mindset change. According to Hughes, the functions of the government media were the following:

1. Interpret the policy and actions of Government to the people:
   a. By a continuing service of information and public relations, and
   b. By campaign and concentrated publicity on particular subjects.
2. Encourage and assist the people of Botswana to take an increasing interest in and responsibility for economic, cultural, and political development of their country.
3. Advise government on public opinion and in the field of public relations.
4. Develop and exploit media, which will assist ministries and Departments in performing their routine and extension duties.
5. Publicise Botswana outside its borders (Hughes Report, 1968)

The mentioned functions are largely similar to the ones that were outlined in the TNDP and NDP1, as stated above. Moreover, the government media was to provide extension services to other government departments. The findings of the interviews, schedule analysis, and focus groups that follow demonstrate the extent to which these roles shape the role of national television broadcasting in Botswana.

Regarding the relationship between the government and the media, the Hughes Report stated that radio was not to be adversarial towards government (Hughes, 1968). One of the key features of the Hughes report is the endorsement of state’s control of the government-owned media. Hughes observed that:

There appears to be little awareness among the staff of Radio Botswana as to what they are there for. They seem, on the whole, to be happy if they can fill the hours of transmission with programs. Those who do have some wider ideas of what their job is have the wrong ideas. Radio Botswana is not a public service corporation like the BBC. It is a government department, and its job is to assist all other Ministries and Departments in the execution of their various functions. Under no circumstances will it be used to embarrass, frustrate or oppose the Government of which it is a part (Hughes, 1968, pp. 29-30).
Moreover, Hughes (1968) endorsed propaganda-based news reporting, and was dismissive of impartial news broadcasting. Hughes did not specify what constituted propaganda. However, the report cautioned that propaganda should be covert. Propaganda was to be used in news with the intention to change the mindset of the people. Whereas Hughes’s clarified the role of government media as a system that has to be supportive of the government, as well as providing overt propagandist content, this findings is important in this study in that it underscores the perceptions of state control of the government owned media in Botswana as explained in Chapter 1.

Other media policy issues, such as language and programming, which were addressed in the Hughes report, are relevant to this thesis. Regarding the use of language on radio, the Hughes report recommended using three languages: Setswana, English, and Kalanga. Hughes justified the use of Kalanga as a compromise that was intended to appease the largest ethnic minority in Botswana, the Bakalanga. However, the current situation in both state radio and television demonstrates that the languages that are used in the state media are limited to Setswana and English, as it will be demonstrated further in the Schedule Analysis findings of this study.

The Hughes Report was prescriptive regarding programming. Hughes advocated the use of radio to conduct adult education and use of foreign content that would be of interest to the Batswana. He also advocated cultural programming; using the national anthem at the beginning and at end of broadcasts; broadcasting Ministers’ speeches; providing informal education-related programming, cultural magazine programs, and government spot announcements on topics such as elections, health, and animal husbandry. Such programs were intended to instil the spirit of nationalism. Additionally, the programs must be packaged with the intention of praising the good work of any one community for others to follow. Hughes recommended that radio should cover government department programs, especially during off-peak hours. In view of these suggestions as regard programming on government owned media, the review of the schedules will thus be undertaken to examine the extent to which Hughes’s recommendations set a precedent as regard programming for future state-owned broadcasters in Botswana, such as Btv.

Hughes’ views on the communication needs of some parts of the country might have been practical, but they were inconsistent with the overall aim of the government to communicate with rural communities. For example, Hughes suggested that media coverage and access should centre only on the more populous areas of Botswana because rural
communities were less important to the state in its efforts to raise awareness about national development (Hughes, 1968). Whereas Hughes’s justification for his recommendation which he based on the argument of limited resources was understandable bearing the economic context of Botswana soon after independence as explained in Chapter 1, Hughes’s decision to advise government media to ignore the remote and sparsely populated areas of Botswana contradicted the overall objectives of national wide access to development resources by all Batswana as outlined in Chapter 1. At the time of writing the report in the 1960s, Hughes’s suggestion to ignore the less densely populated areas of Botswana reflects the views of an outsider expert who was, arguably, unaware of the social dynamics of Botswana’s geography and its population. To exclude citizens who lived in less densely populated areas was tantamount to ignoring the communication needs of the poor and the ethnic minorities in Botswana, who lived mostly in those areas.

5.2.1.3 The Lawrence Report.
Another expert, Christie Lawrence, was sponsored by the Commonwealth Fund for Technical Cooperation, and was engaged 10 years after Hughes to advise the Botswana government on media policy options and evaluate the operations and functions of the nation’s government-owned media (Lawrence, 1978). Whereas the Lawrence Report endorsed the functions of the media as defined by Hughes, Lawrence’s point of departure was how the functions should be implemented. Lawrence was of the view that the public relations role of state-owned media included the expectation that government should not suppress the truth, and that state-owned media should be allowed to publish material that is critical of the government or not to the government liking (1978). Commenting on Radio Botswana’s programming, the Lawrence Report included the observation that “as long as the news and current affairs programs are regarded generally as providing solely a mouthpiece for Government, they will remain forever emasculate” (1978, p48). This signals a liberal orientation towards media’s function, as opposed to the propaganda-oriented function that Hughes espoused. The liberal thinking that dominated Lawrence’s report probably influenced the government to cling to Hughes’ policy recommendations, because the Botswana government did not adopt the Lawrence Report, unlike the Hughes Report, as guidelines for government media operations.

Of relevance to this study is the Lawrence Report’s recommendation concerning the need for a television service for Botswana. Lawrence advised the government of Botswana against having a national television service until the costs of both the transmission equipment and the television sets were reduced (1978). Indeed, the launch of Btv in 2000, almost two
and a half decades after Lawrence’s recommendation, suggests that the government heeded his advice. However, Lawrence advised the Botswana government to allow commercial “booster” television stations, which would have to pay an annual fee. Similarly, the presence of closed circuit television and a commercial television that were based in the capital, the then GBC, suggests that the government of Botswana was prepared to allow commercial television broadcasting in Botswana. The reasons that were enumerated by Lawrence against establishing a national television broadcaster at that stage were indeed based on issues of access (technology) and cost (economic), and, while they were practically applicable, they did not include the possible social policy goals that the medium could achieve in a developing country like Botswana. Lawrence’s suggestions are atypical of debates on broadcasting policy because they tend to focus on technological and economic factors at the expense of others such as the social, cultural and political aspects of the media (Hills and Michalis 2000; Simmons 2004).

5.2.1.4 Broadcasting Act.
The Broadcasting Act (1998) was enacted almost two years before the launch of the service, and was repealed in 2012. In fact, it was launched when a decision was already made to have a national television service in 1997. Of relevance to this thesis is Section 12 (1) of the Broadcasting Act, which states that no person shall broadcast without a license. The researcher argues that the introduction of such legislation was preparatory work in advance of a national television service. Surprisingly, Btv operates unlicensed, even to date. Whereas this was possible because Btv is a government department, the decision to launch Btv as none of the broadcast models—public service, commercial, and community—as provided for in the Broadcasting Act, remains one of the challenges of broadcast reforms in Botswana, and within Btv specifically. Whereas this study does not aim to critique the Broadcasting Act, the exclusion of government broadcasting in legislation in Botswana reflects a policy making process that ignores the realities on the ground, in that this model existed prior to the establishment of the Broadcasting Act, and, thus, should have remained the fourth type of broadcasting in Botswana. Perhaps the exclusion of government broadcasting in the legislation was also a suggestion that the existing government owned media would be reformed accordingly to fit with the models provided for in the legislation.

Overall, Botswana’s policy directives on state-owned media before the establishment of a national television broadcaster were consistent with the post-independence challenges
facing the country’s nation-building aspirations. As such, the media were directed to be supportive of the new state by providing public relations and publicity for the government’s activities. Because Btv was launched almost 34 years after independence, and Botswana was, by then, a consolidated democratic state, the question arises as to whether the function of state-owned media is still directed towards nation building. The next section explores the policy objectives during Btv’s early years.

5.2.2 Media policies: Botswana Television in the early years

The data covering the early years of Btv (2000–2005) indicate that Btv’s role was to emphasise the socio-cultural objectives of “reflecting Batswana to themselves”, showcasing culture, and nation building (Botswana Television, 2004; Director Broadcasting Services, n.d). In a statement on the Btv website (www.btv.gov.bw), the Director of Broadcasting at that time stated that:

The most basic benefit of introducing the nation’s own television service is simple really: - the people of Botswana had never really seen themselves in the manner they perceive themselves. Btv has overnight virtually become a symbol of nationhood. Its nascent stages have not damped the mood of the people of Botswana to take pride in watching a television that reflects the people they know, the thing of familiar salience, the depiction of Botswana culture in its pristine form, and the joy of visualising objects of functional salience. A BTV screen has become a picture of Botswana.

(Director Broadcasting Services, n.d9)

Similarly, Kevin Hunt, a British national who, at that time, was the coordinator of the Botswana television project, opined the following:

My brief—which I had found particularly attractive in this day and age—was to establish a television service, which whilst initially majoring in News and Current Affairs, would be primarily dedicated to reinforcing the cultural identity of the country (Hunt, 2000 p.1).

Thus, the role of television, as conceptualised by media professionals, in this case the Director of Broadcasting Services and the coordinator of the Btv project, reflected a shift from publicity and mobilization roles to a cultural identity role. A possible explanation of this

---

9 The researcher has concluded that the statement was made during the early years of Btv, as this statement was in the website since its launch in 2004. In addition, the context of the statement also reflects that it was made during the early years of Btv.
shift might be due to the influence of the British nationals’ understanding of the role of the media in a British context, where the media are cultural institutions. In this manner, the influence of Kevin Hunt might have nuances of what Servaes (1999) described as expatriate consultants mechanically transplanting their experiences of the West into non-Western contexts.

Nonetheless, this cultural role of the media as explained by media professionals starkly contrasts the stated functions of government media, to which Btv belongs. For example, the National Development Plan 9 (NDP 9) enumerated the functions of government media, which were similar to the role of the media in the years before Btv’s establishment, as follows:

• To interpret the policy and actions of Government to the people by continuing service of information and public relations and through campaigns and concentrated publicity on particular subjects
• To encourage and assist the people of Botswana to take an increasing interest in and responsibility for the economic, cultural, and political development of their country
• To develop and exploit media which will assist ministries and departments in performing their routine and extension duties
• To publicise Botswana outside its borders. (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2003)

Similarly, the educational and informational role of Btv is connected to Vision 2016: “the first pillar of Vision 2016, ‘Building an Educated Informed Nation’ is no less than the mandate of the Department (Broadcasting services) and willy-nilly, that of Btv” (Director Broadcasting Services, n.d). Likewise, the authors of Vision 2016 stipulated that the media is central to communicating the goals of Vision 2016 to ordinary citizens (Presidential Task Group on a Long Term Vision for Botswana, 1997). Thus, the role of Btv was to contribute to the ideals of an educated and informed nation as stated in the Vision 2016 document, which is analogous to Hughes’ views on the informational and educational role of state media.

The role of television during the early years reflects two related but different policy goals: cultural identity and mobilising public support for government policies or national development. Although these are all social policy objectives, their practical implications in the Botswana context have varying levels of influence on content of the broadcaster. Whereas cultural goals reflect the need to convey distinctiveness and indigenisation, national development implied a focus on government activity. In view of these considerations, this
study establishes, through interviews, focus groups, and schedule analysis, how Btv grapples with varied but realistic expectations.

Regarding the local content on Btv, the documents that were reviewed revealed that the government made no commitment to broadcast local content during the early period, although, internally, media professionals opined that local content needed to increase (Botswana Television, 2003). For example the then General Manager of Btv and a British national Simon Higman stated that local content would constitute approximately 60% of Btv’s content (Gotlop, 2000). Moreover, although the Broadcasting Regulations recommended for a minimum of 20% of local content on national television and 40% on radio (Broadcasting Regulations, 2004), these regulations could not be enforced because Btv is not licensed. In view of this, this researcher establishes the impact of this absence of commitment to local content on the program output of Btv in Section 5.3, in which the schedule analysis findings are presented.

Regarding editorial independence, whereas the documents that were generated at national level were silent on this issue, those that were generated by media professionals at the departmental level included statements that Btv enjoyed editorial independence (Department of Broadcasting Services, n.d; Department of Information and Broadcasting n.d). The absence of articulation of editorial independence at a national level suggests an absence of commitment to this issue at government level. Moreover, such a decision could be an outcome of Hughes’s policy suggestions (1968), which gave less importance to government media’s editorial independence. Guaranteeing broadcasters editorial independence is intrinsic to media policy (Franklin, 2001); however, in the context of Botswana, the silence of a democratic government on such a significant policy issue might support concerns on Botswana’s democracy, in that it displays signs of authoritarianism (Good, 1996). Conceivably the reality on the ground at Btv in 2001, a year after the service’s launch, reflects the dynamics of editorial independence of the national broadcaster. For example, the resignation of an expatriate Btv Head of News and Current Affairs, Chris Bishop, on grounds of government editorial interference suggests limited editorial independence at Btv. The findings of the interviews and focus groups, which are discussed later in this chapter, also highlight the restricted editorial independence of Btv.

Regarding audiences, the data emerging from the documents that have been reviewed demonstrate that Btv perceived its audience as both national and global. The vision of the Department of Broadcasting Services was ambitiously stated as providing information,
education, and entertainment to the Batswana and beyond (Botswana Television, 2003; Director Broadcasting Services, n.d.). This “local and global audiences” view would indeed affect Btv’s programs. The Btv had ambitions of being “the best television service in Africa that is admired by the rest of the world” (Botswana Television, n.d). The implication for perceiving audiences as national and global is that the content on the national television should also reflect this. This issue will be explored further in the schedule analysis findings.

The need to transform Btv into a public service broadcaster is a dominant policy statement in the early years of Btv. A Btv commissioning document includes the affirmation that “by all indications, the National Broadcasting Board aims to license Btv” (Botswana Television, 2003). This document cited other Btv and Ministry of Communications and Science Technology documents,¹⁰ which also signalled that Btv was to be privatised. The excerpt below from Btv’s commissioning document reflects the view to transform Btv as stated in various documents:

Several departmental and ministerial documents point to BTV becoming independent of government, inter alia; the Department of Information and Broadcasting Draft PMS Strategic Plan 2001-2010¹¹ proposes that BTV de-link from government and aim to become a parastatal¹², while developing a corporate business culture; The Ministry of Communications Science and Technology Strategic Plan (Final Draft-22 April 2003) has the privatisation of BTV as one of its key performance indicators under effective systems for liberalisation and commercialisation. (Botswana Television, 2003, p6)

Similarly, the NDP 9 policies and programs for the information and broadcasting sector included the commitment to improve effectiveness of Btv by restructuring the department of Broadcasting Services during NDP 9 (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2003). This signals the possible understanding at that time that the information and broadcasting services were inefficient in their current organisational structure. The transformation of Btv (or absence of such transformation) provides insight into the dominance of the state in Botswana. Possibly as observed by Mothusi and Dipholo (2008) the state in Botswana, compared to other African countries, could chose to privatise state institutions with limited

¹⁰ However, this researcher could not access these documents.

¹¹ PMS refers to Performance Management System. This is a performance monitoring system that is used by the Botswana government to monitor service delivery and performance of government departments.

¹² Parastatals refer to semi-government institutions in Botswana. They are commercially driven, although partially funded by the government, and are accountable to a relevant government ministry. Most of these institutions were initially government departments, but were commercialised to improve their efficiency.
pressure from the international community. Thus the state has the luxury to avoid privatisation as a way of ensuring the continued influence and control of the state in the national development process in Botswana.

Overall, the core role of Btv in its early years of broadcasting was expressed as a form of cultural reflection by the employees of Btv, whereas the central government documents reflected a continuation of the role of government media in national development by publicising government policies and actions as was the case during the years without a national television service. Moreover, transforming Btv into an efficient broadcaster, at least on paper, suggested acknowledgements of the possible limitations of state broadcasting in Botswana. In this sub-section the outlining of the media policy timeline is continued, and the key roles and other media policy issues pertinent to the mid years of Btv are explored.

5.2.3 The mid years of Btv

The “mid years” of Btv includes the period from 2006 to 2011. The national development planning context in this period is reflected in the focus on aligning the National Development Plan objectives with those of the national vision document, Vision 2016, and a shift in economic policy towards economic diversification (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2003). This period was characterised by efforts to establish a National Broadcasting Policy, as well as continuing aspirations to restructure the government-owned media. The key documents reviewed for the mid years of Btv are the Draft Broadcasting Policy of 2006, which was produced by the MCST, and the Performance Management (PMS) Strategic Plan for the Department of Broadcasting services for 2006 to 2016.

During the mid years, the Botswana government’s thinking was motivated by the need to transform Botswana’s broadcasting system to achieve a more diverse and socially responsible broadcasting agenda (Ministry of Communications Science and Technology, 2006). Two examples from the documents that were reviewed for this study illustrate this. First, in a speech at a consultative workshop on transforming the Department of Broadcasting Services into a “true” public service broadcaster, a cabinet minister, Dorcus Makgato-Malesu, affirmed Botswana’s commitment towards ensuring that both state radio and television were transformed into public service broadcasters. Second, the then Minister of Communications Science and Technology, Pelonomi Venson Moitoi, presented the Draft Broadcasting Policy to parliament in 2006. The transformation of state broadcasting was explicitly stated in that document: “The Department of Broadcasting Services will be transformed into a public
broadcasting services by an Act of Parliament and will fulfil the public mandate controlled by
the public at large through an independent and representative board” (Ministry of
Communications Science and Technology, 2006, p18). The document further enumerated
various objectives for the public broadcaster as follows: to reflect issues of concern, provide
diverse programs; provide a forum for democratic debate; showcase culture; act as a vehicle
for development; provide coverage of significant events; provide quality programming;
support local productions; be a reliable source of information; and provide a platform for
innovation (Ministry of Communications Science and Technology, 2006). Of significance in
the draft document was the introduction of three tiers of broadcasting in Botswana: public,
commercial, and community broadcasting. The three-tier system of broadcasting would align
with the Broadcasting Act, which provides for public service, commercial, and community
media.

The draft broadcasting policy attracted resistance from members of parliament who
opposed the introduction of community broadcasting. They feared that community
broadcasting could cause harm by dividing the nation, because its content could be used to
fuel tribal tensions (Botswana Press Agency, 2008). Indeed these concerns could be valid in
that community media was used to fuel ethnic tensions in countries such as Rwanda (Kellow
and Steeves, 1998) and Croatia (Vigna, Enikolopov et al., 2011). In other contexts it was
deployed to fuel hate, as was the case with radio in Nazi Germany (Cambridge, 2007).
Although this study does not include a focus on community broadcasting, community
broadcasting can provide two essential lessons for the media policy debates in Botswana.
First, although community broadcasting is considered as a threat to Botswana’s national
unity, the government must also recognise the potential of such a medium in giving voice to
communities by allowing them to broadcast issues of immediate concern to them, as opposed
to getting coverage of national issues as is the case with mainstream media. Second, the
political elites in the Botswana Parliament’s opposition to the draft broadcasting policy on the
grounds that community radio could divide the nation elucidates the contextual ethnicity
issues that Botswana must contend with as these issues permeate national policies, including
the media. As described in Chapter 1, ethnic minority groups in Botswana are increasingly
expressing that they feel disenfranchised (Good, 1993, 1999a), specifically concerning the
exclusion of their languages from public discourse in Botswana. Led by educated members of
the minority ethnic tribes, these groups have pressured government to amend Sections 77 to
79 of the Botswana Constitution because of their perceived tribal discrimination (Good,
The President established a commission of enquiry in 2000 to explore the issue. This culminated in a referendum and, finally, in the amendments of the sections, as well as in amended legislation, such as that relating to the House of Chiefs (*Nilo ya Dikgosi*). This reflects positive political reactions in a democratic society. In contrast to this amendment, the same decision was not extended to other areas, such as use of the ethnic minorities’ language in schools and in the media. Inevitably, the government has shelved the broadcasting policy and the desire of the ethnic minorities to have their languages recognised continues. This is one of the issues that future media policy in Botswana must face.

The decision to shelve the broadcasting policy signals the possible absence of political will to transform the broadcasting sector in Botswana as the sector is needed for political expediencies. Rather, the Draft Broadcasting Policy, while constituting a commendable effort, might have been a political gesture to quell the pressure that international organisations have exerted. Institutions such as UNESCO and the Southern African Broadcasting Association (SABA) advocate the reform of state broadcasting in Africa (Mbaine, 2003; Banerjee and Seneviratne, 2005; Nyamnjoh, 2005). However, internally, the government might have been unwilling to distance the media from government due to the dictates of the Draft Broadcasting Policy.

Overall, similar to the media policy issues in the early years, Btv’s attention during the mid-years of the service continued to be on improving transmission signal access and strengthening the commercial output of the service. In addition, the role of Btv in national development continued to be framed along the publicity role of the government media, as discussed in the preceding sections.

### 5.2.4 The current and future television policies

The current broadcasting policy environment (2012–2014) signals a complete departure from the reforms that were envisaged in the mid years of Btv. Although, as mentioned, a formal policy document does not exist, the documents that have been reviewed reveal two themes that are relevant to this thesis that highlight the policy direction of government broadcasting in Botswana. These are the dominance of the government-oriented communication role of Btv, and the establishment of legal recognition of the state broadcasting model. In this manner, policy has returned to the basic concept of the role of the media as prescribed by Hughes in 1968.
Before the launch of Btv, the role of the media, as explained above, focused on the publicity role of government media. Unlike the early years of Btv (2000–2005), where the media professionals prioritised Btv’s cultural role, in the current period there appears to have been a shift among media professionals towards conceptualising the role of Btv as a tool for disseminating government information (Department of Broadcasting Services, 2012). The objectives of Btv, as stated in the current strategy document, include a focus on the state media’s role in increasing awareness about government programs and policies. The expected outcome of information dissemination is an increased acceptance of Botswana government policies by its citizen. Thus, the focus of state media in Botswana is government communication. This can be explained by the fact that in a developing state such as Botswana, public institutions are tasked with supporting the developmental process of the country (Hillbom, 2014; Leftwich, 1995). The other peripheral reason for re-focusing government media into a government information tool can be explained contextually by the relationship between the state and commercial media. The need for the government to own, and, thus, be able to influence its own media, arise out of the government officials’ perception that the commercial media was adversarial (Maleke, 2012).

Accordingly, the emerging regulatory framework in Botswana indicates a shift from envisaging the broadcaster as a public service to legally recognising it as a state broadcaster. In 2012, the Botswana parliament enacted a new law, the Communications Regulatory Authority Act (BOCRA Act), which will replace the Broadcasting Act (1998), as well as the regulatory authority, the Botswana Telecommunications Authority (BTA), with a new one, the Communications Regulatory Authority (BOCRA) (Botswana Government, 2012). Although the Act is an honourable intention consistent with contemporary trends of media convergence, it defies the traditional three-tier broadcasting system that is advocated for in Africa (Article 19, 2006) by legally endorsing the state broadcasting model. Whereas the acknowledgement of state broadcasting is a reflection of a realistic regulatory framework in which the national context is considered, this act has considerable implications. The Communications Regulatory Act of 2012, exempts state-owned broadcasters from being regulated by the independent regulatory authority, which the Act had established. The Act includes the statement that “a state broadcaster shall not require a licence to operate” (Botswana Government, 2012). Moreover, the new Act does not clearly provide for public service or community broadcasting (see Section 34 on BOCRA Act) and is specific to commercial broadcasting. The decision to establish public service or community broadcasters
is left to the discretion of the Minister. This is a major policy issue that should not be left to the discretion of the Minister. Because the Minister who is responsible for Communications has previously failed to push the National Broadcasting Policy through parliament, it remains to be seen whether the Minister will be ever able to ensure that the Botswana media system becomes diversified through public service and community broadcasting. This episode of legally recognising state broadcasting or “governmentisation” in Botswana can be explained by Botswana’s political context. As discussed in Chapter 1, political scientists argue that, in Botswana, the state currently displays liberal authoritarian tendencies (Taylor, 2003; Botlhomilwe, Sebudubudu et al., 2011), and that civil society and opposition parties are weak (Molutsi and Holm, 1990). Hence, the state is likely to strengthen its control mechanisms in the absence of any strong institutions to counter such decisions.

Regarding local content, the current national development plan, NDP 10, includes the acknowledgement of the insufficiency of local content in the broadcasting sector, which is estimated at 20% (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2009). Although, in NDP10, the media is envisaged as a contributor towards Botswana becoming a knowledge-based society and as a source of entertainment, the suggested development strategies in the plan for this period focus on technology, in this instance, on the inevitable digital migration. However, NDP 10 is silent on increasing local content. Furthermore, the current NDP includes a focus on facilities, such as office accommodation, transmission, and distribution facilities, as well as on recruiting consultants to provide technical assistance to Btv (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 2009). Whereas these facilities are critical, the omission of any commitment to increase local content supports the argument made in this thesis: that content production is relegated to a peripheral position, while transmission, access, and distribution are the core objectives of improving broadcasting coverage in Botswana.

Regarding the future of broadcasting policy, the focus of the government media policy framing reflects a shift from information dissemination to knowledge building. For instance the previous government documents such as the Transitional Plan for Social and Economic Development (TNDP) and the first National Development Plan 1 (NDP1), as well as the consultancy reports by Hughes and Lawrence focus on the role of the media in relation to information dissemination. However, a recent document, the NDP 10, reflects that the focus of government of Botswana is shifting towards a knowledge-oriented society, with the media expected to facilitate this change. The extent to which the government media could
attain this knowledge-based as envisioned in the Vision 2016 document, is a possible area for future studies on the role of the media in national development in Botswana.

5.2.5 Summary of document analysis findings

The findings of the document analysis regarding the role of government media in national development is summarised aptly in Table 5-1:

Table 5-1

Role of Botswana State Media in the Reviewed Documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Role of state media</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Before Btv (Government public relations duties)</td>
<td><strong>Transitional period</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Nation building, national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Disseminate information on government policy to encourage self-help (self-reliance) and national identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Showcase Botswana internationally</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period before launch of Btv</td>
<td><strong>Early years (confusion over key priorities, cultural reflection vs dissemination of government information)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Symbol of nationhood (Director, DIB)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Cultural identity/picture of Botswana-Director (DIB) and Consultants (Project Team)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Mobilise Batswana towards national development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Educate Batswana in relation to national development goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Mid Years (signs of transformation of state broadcasters to PSB)</td>
<td><strong>The Mid Years</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Broadcasting policy rejected in parliament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Transformation of Btv from state broadcasting to public service broadcasting considered; PSB was to be controlled by the public and have an independent board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Envisaged various objectives in the draft broadcasting policy. These include public broadcasting media expected to be a platform for expressing views on issues of concern; democratic expression, cultural expression; innovation, quality programming; supporting local productions; vehicle for development and reliable source of information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Improve access to transmission signals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Improve commercial output</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
These findings lead this researcher to deduce that the rhetoric of national development, which the government was to lead through a set policies and activities, remains the focus of government media in Botswana, including that of Btv, whose role is to disseminate information about government policies and projects. The informational role of the media is central to this thesis because information was considered one of the central elements of modernisation, as explained in the literature review. In Section 5.3, the programming of Btv is reviewed against this backdrop to explore its national development objectives in Botswana.

5.3 Schedule analysis findings
As stated in the methodology chapter, the overarching aim of the review of Btv schedules is to examine Btv’s goals by analysing its programming output. This is because the program output of a television channel offers a synopsis of the function of the media (Bignell & Orlebar 2005). As a national channel operating in a society with competing interests, a critical examination of the service is based on the analysis of the extent to which it attempts to cater for the interests of diverse viewers by scheduling different program types. Also, there is need to assess the language used to present programs on the channel. In addition, the analysis of Btv’ programming output entails scrutinizing the origins of the programs broadcast on the channel, as well as their intended messages. The analysis of the schedules involved using a semi-summary indicators approach, such as that applied by Hellman (2001) in a study in which he reviewed program diversity in Finnish television. Such indicators, according to Hellman, might constitute summaries of informative, popular, domestic, and foreign programs. The following indicators were applied in this study:

- Program types
- Foreign and local programs
- Program durations
- Source of local programs
• Language
• Target audience
• Local programs messages

These indicators were also used to structure the findings of the schedule analysis. After
providing an overview of Btv to gain insights into scheduling on national television in sub-
sections 5.3.1, the types of programs that were scheduled on Btv are explored in sub-section
5.3.2. They are followed by an analysis of the origins of programs and the durations of local
programs on Btv in sub-sections 5.3.3 and 5.3.4, respectively. In sub-section 5.3.5, the
sources of local programs are explored, while in sub-section 5.3.6, the focus is on the
languages used on Btv. In sub-section 5.3.7, the findings are presented to delineate Btv’s
target audiences and explore whether the programs target the appropriate audiences in light of
the need for development communication to target the needy in society. Lastly, sub-section
5.3.8 includes a summary of the schedule analysis findings. Whereas the schedule analysis
was used as a standalone method, occasional interview data is used to explain some issues
that could not be clearly understood from the schedules.

5.3.1 Overview of Btv schedule

Btv broadcasts daily for 24 hours. The first five minutes of daily transmission (0555-0600)
are allotted to the national anthem and an inspirational religious message. The use of the
national anthem symbolises national identity. It is intended to project Btv as a Botswana
channel. On weekdays, the channel presents a morning show, Mascom Dumela Botswana\textsuperscript{13},
scheduled from 0600–0730. The channel then broadcasts various programs, such as news,
soap operas, sports, talk shows, documentaries, and children’s programs. These programs are
discussed further in the next section. The programs are scheduled between 0555 and 2359 on
weekdays, and between 1000 and 2359 on weekends. On weekends, an international feed is
allotted in the period between 2359 and the beginning of the next transmission schedule.
International news feed is allotted almost a quarter of daily broadcast hours during weekdays,
and close to two fifths of daily broadcast hours on weekends. Although the channel has
previously broadcast other foreign news programs a feed, including BBC World and
Deutsche Welle, the channel was carrying France 24\textsuperscript{14} feed at the time of data collection.

\textsuperscript{13} The name might change depending on the program’s sponsor. In this instance, the mobile telephone company
Mascom was the principal sponsor.

\textsuperscript{14} French international news channel
Transmission producers at Btv explained that the BBC feed was stopped due to financial constraints, whereas Deutsche Welle was offered free, with Germany expecting to benefit from Botswana’s’ awareness about Germany as explained by one of the interviewees in this study (Interviewee #32). France 24 is also offered free, in exchange for Btv raising awareness about France in Botswana. Whereas Btv should be commended for increasing its hours of transmission, its decision to have an international feed is problematic. Contrary to Btv’s role of “selling Botswana to the world” (Interviewees #8, #19, and #31), or publicising Botswana globally, as reflected in the document analysis findings (Office of the President, n.d., p. 6), Btv provides an opportunity for Western media organisations to reach Botswana audiences. The implications of the presence of foreign content is discussed in the next chapter because they relate to the critiques of modernisation on the basis of media imperialism, as outlined in the literature review in this study.

Program repeats are a common scheduling strategy for Btv. For example, in the 2010 sample week, repeats were aired from 0730 to 1300, except on Tuesdays, when a live health talk program, Talk Back, was scheduled for one hour between 1200 and 1300. Similarly, in 2011, on days when educational programs were not broadcast, the same period was dominated by program repeats. Whereas repeating programs is a common scheduling strategy, in this case, the extended period that is dedicated to program repeats or international feed, i.e., almost four and a half hours, raises questions about Btv’s readiness to broadcast 24 hours daily. With the Btv schedule dominated by foreign feed and repeat programming, it is indeed problematic for Btv to broadcast 24 hours, as well as for the Botswana Government to be considering a second channel as stated in the document analysis findings above.

As is the norm in scheduling, advertising time is not reflected in the schedule, other than for longer commercial programs, such as infomercials. The website of the Botswana Government, www.gov.bw, and Btv professionals (Interviewees #14 and #8) confirm that Btv carries advertisements. The rate card that is available online lists the channel schedules’ advertisement slots throughout the day, although, as Interviewee #8 explained, the advertisements are concentrated around prime time. Media professionals at Btv explained that the advertising slot is an endeavour to support the business community in Botswana to promote their products and services. Whereas this is an appropriate activity, the obscurity of this role of Btv as a marketing tool for the business community in Botswana is a noticeable

15 In 2000—Btv’s its launch year—Btv’s transmission lasted four hours (1800-2200) on weekdays, and eight hours (1400-2200) on weekends, to cater for sporting events.
omission in media policy described in the document analysis findings. As Botswana’s development strategy is arguably moving away from state dominated economy to a diversified economy, advertising related issues should be central to media policy in Botswana. This issue is explored further in the interview findings in section 5.4.

5.3.2 Program types on Btv

As a policy oriented study, an analysis of the types of programs that are screened on Btv is essential in establishing the extent of access given to different members of the public, as well as the choice of television programs that they can choose from. Thus, to guarantee diversity the channel should ensure that the public could choose from a variety of scheduled programs. Diversity refers to the heterogeneity of media content (McQuail, 1992). Various scholars have acknowledged the importance of diversity in programming because it reflects the differences in society and allows different views to be represented on television (Hellman, 2001; McQuail, 1992). McQuail (1992) argued that a review of the program choices that are available to audiences could suggest whether some program types are missing or are under-represented. However, Hellman (2001) acknowledged that choice on the basis of program types does not mean that the media serves the audience more adequately. Hellman argues that program choice is an analytical tool for gauging the efforts of media professionals in providing audiences with opportunities for content selection. With this hindsight, a combination of the two views of both McQuail (1992) and Hellman (2001) is applied in this study. The program types are reviewed to explore missing and available program types, and the analysis of the various types is used as an analytical tool. To address Hellman’s concern, the focus group discussions data augment the program analysis findings to establish the extent to which and how adequately the diverse programs serve the audience.

The program type categories for this study are the following:

1. Breakfast show
2. Children’s programs
3. Comedy
4. Documentary
5. Drama
6. Educational broadcasts
7. Government programming
8. International feed
9. Magazine
10. Movie
11. Music
12. News and current affairs
13. Reality shows  
14. Religion  
15. Series  
16. Soap opera  
17. Sports  
18. Talent search  
19. Talk show  
20. Youth programs  
21. Other

The program classifications above might vary. As Hellman (2001) stated, the categorisation of programs is always subject to criticisms. For example, the police program *Itshireletse* is a docu-drama, but is classified as a government program that is based on the fact that it is produced by a government department. Thus, although the researcher carefully classified the programs according to the various types, contentions about the classifications might arise. The classifications were produced for practical reasons: to analyse the type of programs that were broadcast on Btv.

Table 5-2

*Types of programs on Btv*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program type</th>
<th>2010 Program types</th>
<th>2011 Program types</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of local programs</td>
<td>Number of foreign programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children’s</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comedy</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentary</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drama</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational broadcast</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Game show</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government program</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A comparison of the programs of two composite weeks reflects extremely few differences between the program types that were scheduled on Btv in 2010 and 2011. Table 5-2 shows only two new program categories were added in 2011: educational broadcasts and documentaries. In particular, six school curriculum-based programs were scheduled in 2011. Educational broadcasts involve a subject-matter expert teaching using a classroom format. Educational subjects include mathematics, science, design and technology, and information technology. The scheduling of educational broadcasts is consistent with previous studies that observe the use of mass media, such as television, for instructional and educational purposes (Katz & Wedell, 1977; Mytton 2000). However, the extent to which these educational broadcasts are accessible is beyond the scope of this study. It can be assumed that, because of the limited access to televisions sets and electricity in mostly extremely remote areas of Botswana, it is possible that these broadcasts are not universally available to all students.
Thus, as Forsslund (1991) observed, factors such as equipment and scheduling affect the educational broadcasts’ usefulness to students.

This study also reveals the dominance of international children’s programs on Btv. As shown in Table 5-2, 23 foreign children’s programs were scheduled in 2010, and 22 in 2011. A review of the schedules reveals that Btv devoted at least three and a half hours every weekday (0730–0930 and 1430–1600) to children’s programs. The schedule from 0800–1600, excluding locally produced repeats, reflects a niche children’s channel that is dominated by foreign children’s programs, which one of the interviewees at Btv attributed to the reasonable costs of such programs. Nonetheless, this finding suggests that Btv attempts to schedule programs for diverse audiences such as children. Although Btv’s efforts to program for children are laudable, the dominance of international children’s programs is not quite as encouraging. Only one children’s program is produced locally, as Table 5-2 shows. The program, Mantlwaneng, is broadcast for 30 minutes on Saturdays, and is repeated on a weekday. The program targets children up to 15 years. Mantlwaneng follows a magazine format, with various segments ranging from profiles of children, do-it-yourself, traditional games, and viewers’ letters. This finding on the imbalance of foreign and local children’s programs has critical implications for policy makers who must ensure that Btv achieves a greater balance of foreign and local children’s programs. This underscores Osei-Hwere (2011) concerns about the need to improve the capacity to produce children’s programs in developing countries. The low levels of children’s locally produced television content on Btv could also be explained by the absence of commitment at the policy level to ensure sufficient local programs for children as these were not provided for in the repealed broadcasting Act, nor in the new BOCRA Act. This situation suggests lack of prioritisation of children’s programs at a national level.

Regarding drama, the data from the schedule analysis reveals that, in 2011, Btv scheduled two locally produced drama programs, Rebina mmogo and Thokolosi, which were both in their second season after becoming popular when screened five years ago (Mooketsi, 2009). The focus of the narrative in Rebina mmogo is on love relationships between members of a traditional dance group. The primary message concerns the management of adolescent sexual relationships, and the secondary message relates to HIV/AIDS. The second drama, Thokolosi, which was marred by controversy over the depiction of a village as the epitome of witchcraft, was also in its second season. The focus of this drama was on cultural beliefs relating to witchcraft and folklore. Overall, the use of drama to communicate health and
cultural issues suggests that media professionals are making an effort to provide content that resonates with national challenges and interests. This is because as explained in the introductory chapter of this study, HIV/AIDS remains Botswana’s greatest national development challenge because the scourge threatens to reverse the socio-economic advancements that were made since independence. Moreover, a possible explanation for drama on Btv schedules could be that drama is an avenue for rebutting the dominance of South African content, most specifically drama and soap operas, which an audience study in Botswana established as being the preferred programs by Batswana audiences (Probe Market Intelligence, 2009). Furthermore, within Botswana’s historical struggle to maintain national sovereignty, mostly from South Africa, the scheduling of Botswana drama productions could be used to encourage the Batswana to become inward looking by diverting attention from South Africa content. Although this researcher does not assume a causal relationship, establishing whether such drama programs on Btv have reduced the prominence of South Africa soap opera and drama programming is relevant to this study. This concern is discussed in Section 5.5.

Regarding talent search programs, an analysis of the descriptions of these programs shows that they are intended to serve as a form of cultural and artistic display of Botswana. These programs mostly focus on performing arts, such as music, dance, and poetry. The two talent shows broadcast are My Star and My African Dream (MAD). My Star is a music talent search show in which winners are given opportunities to record albums (Gaotlhobogwe, 2010). Btv has been broadcasting this show since 2006. The second show, MAD, although it was launched in 1996, debuted on Btv in 2002 as an annual performing arts cultural event that is organised by an independent group of artist promoters. Its aims are also to discover and nurture natural talent (www.maitisong.org). Perhaps the novelty of these shows, which share a target audience of young people and children, is their accessibility to participants from various parts of the country. Both shows have enjoyed sponsorship and support from the business community and the government, in particular the Department of Youth and Culture. At a political level, two presidents (former President Mogae and the current President, Khama) have also shown support by attending the finale of the shows. Nonetheless these programs’ significance in national development could be that they are more participatory in that unlike most of the programs on Btv, these are some of the programs with limited government officialdom, but rather encourage widespread grass root participation.
Btv’s involvement in these shows could be explained by its directors’ desire to increase local content. *My Star* is offered to Btv in exchange for airtime. The producer of the show organises sponsorship for the program to cover the production costs. Likewise, Btv is the official broadcaster of *MAD*, meaning the channel incurs its production costs. While these two scenarios have benefited Btv over the past years, the introduction of copyright laws in 2012 might change the equation altogether. The Copyright Act (2012) prescribes payment of royalties to artists. There are already indications that the producer of *My Star* expects payment from Btv for broadcasting the show (Gaolthobogwe 2009). As a result of the Copyright Act (2012), a regulatory body overseeing adherence to the laws on behalf of artists, the Copyright Society of Botswana (COSBOTS) also exists in Botswana. With COSBOTS ensuring artists are paid royalties, the concerns expressed by the producer of *My Star* as regard expecting Btv to pay for broadcasting the show, may challenge Btv to consider paying for that content, or terminating the agreement with *My Star* producer. All these reflect the challenges broadcasters have to contend with as they strive to provide content. On one hand they have to pay for content, and on the other they have to support the artists.

The other program category on Btv is talk shows. Locally produced talk shows focus on social issues. The channel scheduled three talk shows in both of the sampled weeks under review. One of the talk show programs, *Talk Back*, which has a focus on HIV/AIDS education, is targeted at school teachers and students and is scheduled in the mornings on Tuesdays. Whereas the Tuesday morning slot is suitable for the target audience, the implied exclusion of other members of the public is rather surprising because HIV/AIDS is a major health challenge, as discussed earlier. The focus of another talk show, *Silent Shout*, is on various young people’s issues, such as health, lifestyle, political education, and social issues. Similarly, diverse social issues affecting various sections of society are the focus of *Molemo-wa-kgang*, another talk show targeting the family as its audience. By their nature, talk shows can offer an opportunity for audience participation. In both the focus group discussions and interview findings, it will be explored further whether Btv leveraged the format of talk shows to afford citizens the opportunity to participate in the production of such programs because participation is critical for liberal democracy and is a cherished ideal in Setswana culture.

The music programs that are scheduled on Btv seem to serve three purposes: entertainment, the promotion of culture, and talent display. For example, *Mokaragana*, one of the oldest Btv stage music shows, which is recorded live with an audience, offers various artists opportunity to perform on television. The focus of the program is mostly on raw local
talent, with the intention of giving such artists exposure to possible links in the music industry. The program is arguably the most popular music program on Btv (Thapisa & Megwa, 2002), with some loyal audiences calling themselves lebandla\textsuperscript{16} and regularly attending the recordings. Nonetheless, the program’s focus on “raw” talent has also come at a cost, as the media professionals explained during the interviews (Interviewees #19 and #17). The “quality” of the artists performing on the program is said to be deteriorating, because some artists’ stage performance is appalling, mostly due to their inexperience. This poses a dilemma for the channel, because it has to offer “raw talent” the opportunity to perform, whereas the audience expect strong performances from the artists. Furthermore, a surprising finding is that traditional music (borankana) on Btv is not scheduled, unlike other genres such as gospel which is provided for in the program Melodi ya kgalaletso, and choral music in Melodi ya dinnoto. Nonetheless, music programs are meant to meet the entertainment needs of the audiences. The extent to which this has been achieved was reflected in the focus group discussions findings that were obtained by analysing the audience’s preferred programs (Section 5.5.3).

An encouraging finding is that Btv made efforts in 2011 to schedule programs that employed production techniques of greater complexity. For example, comedy, reality drama, and a documentary were all scheduled in 2011. However, the researcher did not review these programs’ content for the techniques that were used; therefore, this finding is based on this researcher’s understanding of the link between these genres and their production techniques. This result, therefore, must be used cautiously; however, it helps to understand the diversity of locally produced programs. Similarly, the prevalence of locally produced reality and comedy programs on Btv suggests that local program makers are potentially able to produce diverse programs for Btv.

As a national broadcaster, Btv also schedules programs that are of national interest. For example, under the program type the researcher calls “other,” in 2010, the Miss World\textsuperscript{17} beauty pageant was scheduled on Btv. Other national events, such as Independence Day and President’s Day, and international commemorations, such as World AIDS Day, are scheduled

\textsuperscript{16} Lebandla is slang for “group.”

\textsuperscript{17} The decision to schedule such events might also have been influenced by Botswana’s performance at such events. For example, in 2010, Miss Botswana, Emma Wareus, snatched second position in the final of the competition. Miss Botswana 1999, Mpule Kwelagobe, was crowned Miss Universe.
as special programs on Btv, although they are not reflected in the sampled week. Such programming might increase the amount of local content. The significance of these events is their possible contribution to nation building. Nation building has been a priority of national development in Botswana since independence (Republic of Botswana, 1966; Presidential Task Group on a Long Term Vision for Botswana, 1997).

Government departments with the intent of promoting the functions, policies, and initiatives of the various government ministries produce government television programs. Accordingly it can be argued that scheduling these programs on Btv is consistent with the media functions of government media that demand such institutions to support and extend work of government departments as discussed in the document analysis findings. In this regard, Btv schedules programs relating to agriculture, (Tsa Temo-thuo), health, (Tsa Botsogo), crime prevention (Itshireletse), and general issues relating to social welfare through the ministry of local government production, Batho-pele. A possible conclusion from the presence of these programs on Btv schedules is that Btv attempts to promote national development by scheduling content that is consistent with the national socio-economic objectives of Botswana’s development strategy. Nonetheless, as audiences give their own interpretations of television content, the extent to which the audiences attach similar meaning to these programs will be explored in the focus group discussion findings (section 5.5).

5.3.3 Foreign and local programs on Btv

The review of Btv’s schedule, with a specific focus on the programs’ origins, corroborates the findings of previous studies that have included the observation that foreign content on national television in developing countries is dominant (Estwick, 2006; Schiller, 1992). The researcher created two categories, “local” and “foreign,” to analyse the origins of the programs. Local programs refer to programs that were created by Botswana-based producers, whereas foreign programs are those that were produced internationally and were procured by Btv. Whereas the origins of the programs could be divided further according to their specific countries of origin, as is commonly practiced in media and international communication studies establishing the flows of television programs (Boyd-Barrett, 2012; La Pastina & Straubhaar, 2005; 2007), this study does not divide the two categories of “local” and “foreign” further because they provide sufficient data to inform policy making. As illustrated in Fig 5-1, in 2010, 65% of the programs that were broadcast on Btv were internationally produced, and the remaining 35% were local productions. Similarly, in 2011, a greater
number of programs (63%) were foreign, and fewer (37%) were local. This finding provides additional evidence of the persisting dominance of foreign programs in developing countries’ television schedules (Dunn, 2004; Gordon, 2009; Nuvianenu, 2004).

Figure 5-1

*Percentage of Local and Foreign Programs on Btv*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Percentage of local and foreign programs on Btv</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td><img src="percentage_of_local_and_foreign_programs_on_btv.png" alt="Figure 5-1" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td><img src="percentage_of_local_and_foreign_programs_on_btv.png" alt="Figure 5-1" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s fieldwork.

Whereas no formal policy document includes the expected amount of time to be allocated to local content on Btv or quotas, the findings of this research reveal a figure of approximately 35%. This is low compared to the 60% promised by media professionals at the time of the launch of Btv (Gotlop, 2000). However, the overall dominance of foreign content on Btv could probably be explained as a possible outcome of neglecting local content in media policy at the national level, as the document analysis findings of this study revealed. In view of this, media policy in Botswana should address media content related issues.

### 5.3.4 Program durations of local programs

The researcher reviewed Btv’s schedule further to establish the amount of time that was allocated to local programs. Btv’s transmission report (Botswana Television, 2011) included the allusion to overrunning as well as underrunning programs as a frequent fault in transmission. Therefore, the review of the programs’ duration that was based on the schedule
might not be an accurate reflection of their duration. However, this remains a useful analytical tool for policy-oriented studies that have the aim of establishing the prevalence of local content on television.

As shown in Table 5-3, news and current affairs programs, sports as well as breakfast shows have the largest share of scheduled time.

Table 5-3

*Durations of Various Program Types on Btv*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Type</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Duration (Minutes)</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comedy</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentary</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drama</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational broadcasts</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Game show</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government programs</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>News and current affairs</td>
<td>800</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reality</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sport</td>
<td>720</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talent search</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talk Show</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>3115</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Author’s fieldwork notes.*
Table 5-3 shows that news and current affairs, as well as sports, were allotted more time than other program types on Btv. As suggested by other studies (Lawe-Davies, 1995; Gordon, 2009), news occupies greater periods on television schedules elsewhere in the world, compared to other local programs. In this regard, Btv schedules four news bulletins during weekdays, and two on weekends. The first bulletin is at 1300–1330 in Setswana, the local national language. The second is a brief bulletin, mostly consisting of headlines, at 1800–1830 in English. The flagship bulletin is at 1900–1930 in Setswana, whereas the last bulletin at 2000–2030 is its English version.

In the two weeks under review, Btv scheduled two current affairs programs, *The Eye* and *Matlho-a-phage*. *The Eye* is one of the oldest Btv flagship current affairs programs. It is broadcast in the English language. The program provides deeper insights into and analysis of current issues, going beyond what is provided in the news. *Matlho-a-phage* likewise includes a focus on political issues, with various political parties’ representatives deliberating on political issues in a studio discussion. However, editorial interference is manifest through the cancellation of some programs for reasons such as the political sensitivity of issues and the boycott of discussions by the ruling party (Media Institute of Southern Africa, 2009). The dominance of news content in the schedule suggests that Btv upholds its mandate of providing news and current affairs programming, as suggested by Kevin Hunt.

Sport also dominated the time slots that were occupied by local programs, as Table 5-3 shows. The dominance of sport could be attributed to the live coverage of events, which requires longer program durations. An analysis of the channels’ output reveals that Btv schedules various sports programs targeting different sporting codes. For example tennis, soccer, darts, boxing, and volleyball were scheduled during the reviewed weeks. Whereas sport programs are a staple for television broadcasting, in the case of Botswana, a possible explanation for more sport programs could lie in the geo-politics of Botswana and South Africa. Because South Africa is Botswana’s neighbour, South African sport, most specifically soccer, remains widely accessible to Botswana audiences. In the context of continued need for “independence” from South Africa as explained in the introduction chapter of this thesis, it is possible that more sports programs are scheduled, to encourage Batswana to watch their own sports.

The breakfast show, as Table 5-3 shows, also occupies a substantial percentage of the scheduled time, perhaps because this show is a weekday program lasing at least one and a half hours every morning. The morning show has various segments, such as live interviews,
commercials, travel, health and fitness, sport, business briefs, and art reviews, to mention but a few. The morning show’s flagship section is *Discover Botswana*, which markets tourism-related activities in Botswana. The morning show is arguably the most commercialised show on Btv; different companies sponsor various segments in the show. This program’s offer of advertising space, as well as the revenue that is generates to sustain itself, reveals Btv’s commercial mandate. As stated in the document analysis findings, media professionals aspire to increase the commercial goals on Btv through advertising.

5.3.5 **Source of local programs**

The findings of this research show the four sources of the local programs that are broadcast on Btv as shown in Table 5-4. The first is collaborations. Btv co-produces these with the public, mostly by offering airtime in exchange of programs. For example, *MAD*. The second is government productions, which are generated by various government departments or ministries. The third is commissioned productions, which are bought from the independent production industry. The last type is in-house productions, which are programs that are produced within the TV channel.

Table 5-4

*Sources of Local Programs on Btv*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Programs in 2010</th>
<th>Programs in 2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of programs</td>
<td>Percentile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government department</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent production</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-house</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>26</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s fieldwork.

As Table 5-4 shows, most of the locally produced programs on Btv are produced in-house. In 2010, approximately a third of the programs were non-Btv productions, whereas in 2011 more programs were produced outside the station. The increase in government productions is explained by the introduction of educational broadcasts on Btv in 2011. Likewise, Btv
commissioned a greater number of programs from independent producers in 2011 than in 2010. An overview of the independently produced programs demonstrates that these programs tended to have less controversial and political implications. Examples include the business magazine program *First Issues, Prime Time*, a lifestyle magazine that mostly profiles events in the capital city, and the documentary *Dinoga tsa Botswana*,\(^\text{18}\) which profiles snakes in Botswana. Similarly, Btv tended to collaborate to produce programs that were less political in content. As this researcher argues in the discussion chapter, the limitations on local program production largely emanate from the political economy of Btv, which reflects a country whose government is at the centre of almost every activity.

5.3.6 Language

The review of the schedules revealed that, although a greater number of programs were broadcast in *Setswana* in both years, the overall use of the national language was modest. The three language categories were English, *Setswana*, and English and *Setswana*. The English and *Setswana* category refers to programs broadcast in both languages, as explained in the program briefs. In practice, the use of two languages is mostly achieved with two presenters switching between *Setswana* and English, although one multi-lingual presenter could also achieve this. Nonetheless, the focus of this study is on the bigger picture, and hence the study does not seek to establish the modes of achieving multi-lingual broadcasting.

Table 5-5

*Languages Used on Btv’s Local Programs*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>2010 (Percentage)</th>
<th>2011 (Percentage)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setswana</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English and Setswana</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{18}\) *Dinoga tsa Botswana* means “snakes found in Botswana”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language used during prime time</th>
<th>2010 (Percentage)</th>
<th>2011 (Percentage)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Setswana</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English and Setswana</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s fieldwork notes.

The data in Table 5-5 reveals that in 2010, 46% of the programs were in Setswana, 31% were in English and 23% were presented in both languages. In 2011, a comparable number of English and Setswana programs were scheduled; 43% were in Setswana, 41% were in English, and 16% used a combination of Setswana and English. The introduction of educational programs in 2011 could explain the slight increase in English programs in that year. However, Setswana programs dominate prime time programming. For example, in 2010, at least 50% of the programs were in Setswana, 31% were in English, and 19% used a mixture of Setswana and English. In 2011, 61% were in Setswana, 22% were in English, and 3% were in English and Setswana. Thus, Btv made an effort to broadcast programs in a language that a majority of viewers are most likely to comprehend, in this case Setswana, because at least 79% of the population speaks Setswana (Central Statistics Office, 2009). However, the absence of minority language programs on Btv was a significant finding. This suggests marginalisation of ethnic minority interest; a view expressed within the criticisms of Botswana’s democracy (Good 1993; 2008) as elaborated in the introduction chapter of this thesis.

### 5.3.7 Target audience

The researcher reviewed program briefs to establish the target audience of various local programs on Btv during the sampled weeks. Three audience categories emerged from the review: children and young people, family, and students and teachers. A media professional at Btv, (Interviewee #32) explained that those between zero and 15 years of age are considered children, whereas those who are considered young people are between 16 and 25 years of age. The family audience cannot be categorised by age; rather, it is a generic
audience involving children, young people, and adults. The category of “students and teachers” refers to primary and secondary school students and teachers.

Btv programming mostly targets “family.” As Table 5-6 shows, around 60% of the programs targeted the family in both years. A slightly greater number of programs (35%) targeted children and young people in 2010, compared to 20% in 2011, possibly because, in 2010, Btv commissioned two programs targeting young people, whereas, in 2011, the target of commissioned programs was family. The introduction of school educational broadcasts in 2011 could explain an increase in programs targeting students and teachers.

Table 5-6

**Target Audiences for Local Programs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target audience</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number of programs</td>
<td>Percentage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children and young people</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students and teachers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>26</strong></td>
<td><strong>100%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s fieldwork.

The most striking finding about Btv’s target audience is the absence of target audience diversity. The review of Btv local program synopses revealed that the channel’s target audience is a generic audience, in this instance the family. Thus, Btv did not broadcast programs targeting minority or special audiences. Moreover, contrary to targeting global audiences as discussed in section 5.2, Btv targets local audiences. A possible explanation for the generic focus on the family as an audience could also be grounded in the national development approach of Botswana, which prioritises equal access to infrastructure and services (Harvey & Lewis 1990). Thus, because Btv is a national service, its programming must be available to all, and in the context of audiences, the family is a more representative audience.
5.3.8 Summary of schedule analysis findings

In summary, Btv schedules have been analysed to establish the role of the channel as depicted by its programming, as well as to identify media policy issues that relate to programming on Btv. The data that were generated from the types of programs that are scheduled on Btv demonstrate that the channel’s programs focus on educational, informational and entertainment programs, which are mostly consistent with the national development objectives of Botswana. National development-related themes, such as HIV/AIDS, agriculture, crime prevention, school broadcasts, tourism, and talent development were prevalent on Btv schedules. The channel’s modest local content of 37% is a notable limitation of this service, which underscores the lack of prioritisation of local content in policy related documents as discussed in section 5.2. In general, the findings reveal a schedule that is dominated by foreign content; however, prominence is given to local content by scheduling such content on prime time. Regarding languages, the service’s absence of minority-targeted programming is a significant finding in that this underscores the social inequality facing Botswana’s socio-economic development in which the minorities in Botswana benefit minimally from Botswana’s economic and democratic progress. In all, the schedules mostly reflected a service that was consistent with the government of Botswana’s state media policy, the goal of which is to focus on providing government publicity information that is related to national development. The channel has, however, been limited in the manner in which its programs reflect its other objective of “selling Botswana” outside of its borders. Whereas the document and schedule analyses presented baseline information about the role of Btv in national development, as projected through media policy and television content, these findings do not reflect whether the various stakeholders, such as media professionals, policy makers, media interest groups, and audiences, share the same views regarding Btv’s role in national development. In the next section, the interview data is provided to explain how various stakeholders in Botswana interpret and understand the role of Btv in national development. In addition, the interview data included information relating to the other research questions of this study on the factors affecting Btv’s performance, as well as research participants’ suggestions on how it should be improved.
5.4 Interview findings

5.4.1 Introduction
This section presents data from interviews that were conducted with media professionals at Btv, policy makers, media activists, and the project team that was involved in the launch of Btv. Sub-section 5.4.2 of this section includes a focus on the reasons why Botswana needed a television service. This is essential to understand the anticipated role of a national television service in Botswana. Sub-section 5.4.3 includes an exploration of the structure of Btv, demonstrating there is lack of consistency in understanding the broadcasting model that was adopted for Btv. Sub-section 5.4.4 focuses on the role of television in national development in Botswana. The analysis of the findings reflects that Btv’s role in national development is consistent with the roles stated in the documents reviewed. However, the interviewees disagreed with one another over how the roles were to be implemented. In sub-section 5.4.5, the data that are presented relate to the challenges facing media production at Btv, and to how these influence the television channel’s potential to contribute to national development in Botswana. Following this last sub-section, a summary of the interview’s key findings is provided. Throughout the interview findings, in accordance with the ethical protocols that guarantee the interviewees’ anonymity during the interview data collection phase, the researcher allocated code identifiers to the interviewees, for example, “Interviewee #22,” to be used to attribute the interview data to interviewees.

5.4.2 Understanding the origins of Btv
Understanding the Btv original objectives is critical if the performance of the channel is to be assessed. Thus, this section includes an explanation of the early conceptualisations of television in Botswana; the arguments that were raised or not raised about a need for a television service in the country. The reasons for a need of a national television have been grouped into socio-political, pragmatic, and technological imperatives.

5.4.2.1 Socio-political imperatives of the origins of television.
Eighteen of the interviewees (from all four interview categories) associated the need for television with socio-political imperatives. The most frequently mentioned reasons related to
nationalism and countering South African television content. For example, some of the views of the interviewees included the following:

You could also see that they [the public] thought it [television] will also give meaning to their independence as an independent nation, and perhaps for national pride, you could say, just for national pride. (Interviewee #23)

There were nationalistic sentiments, which government also entertained, that is why should we be watching Bop TV? We should have our own television, so they said, we should see our own ministers, and we should see our own president, we should see our own sports men and we should see ourselves, on television, in our own television and not see other people, and they were very articulate. (Interviewee #6)

We were a protectorate, and the tribes were an amalgam of kingdoms. And we wanted to engender the whole thing that people must realise we are Batswana, we are a country, we belong together, we share views, we share ideas, and the national television really does bring about the national ethos. You bring people together, they dance together, nationally they look at themselves, and they see their president making a speech there, so it contributes a lot to national unity. (Interviewee #9)

The comments above reflect the assumption that television had a nation-building role, which was a view that was consistent with the national development planning of Botswana, which prioritises nation building. Thus, television was established to ensure that the nation reflects on itself. The prevalence of South African channels, for instance BopTv, as explained by Interviewee #6 above, also demonstrates that the omnipresence of foreign content was a concern that had to be addressed by introducing a national television service in Botswana. In addition to the foreign channels, other efforts, such as a closed circuit television in the mining towns of Orapa and Jwaneng, subscription to digital satellite television (Dstv) and efforts to establish a commercial channel (Interviewees #21 and #30), suggested the need to establish a television service in Botswana.

The interviewees’ comments that were quoted above also reveal the influence of Botswana’s political history on the media. Historically, as discussed in Chapter 1, Botswana, which was surrounded by countries with experiences of white minority rule and apartheid policies, has always strived to assert its independence and its own anti-apartheid ideologies (Interviews #6 and #9). Even more profound, as explained by Interviewee #9 was that, prior

---

19 Bop TV was a television channel of the former Republic of Bophuthatswana. It was transferred to SABC, following South Africa’s independence (http://www.info.gov.za/speeches/2003/03071116111001.html). Bophuthatswana was an independent homeland of the Tswana people in northern South Africa, and was reintegrated into South Africa after the 1994 elections.
to the national television service, an anomaly that was attributed to school children watching the foreign television service needed to be corrected: they confused Botswana’s president with Bophuthatswana’s. Similarly, the Batswana had greater acquaintance with most South Africa sports personalities than with their own. The confusion between Bophuthatswana and Botswana Presidents might be attributed to the similarities in the languages that were spoken by the Batswana in both Botswana and Bophuthatswana and that younger people might have found challenging to distinguish. The implication of this situation for post-colonial Botswana was the need to address this situation by using the same media outlet, in his case, television to address this situation.

Botswana’s economic progress also fuelled the desire for a national television service. Interviewees stated that, at the time of the discussions on the establishment of a national television, Botswana was considered economically stable, and, therefore, more deserving of a national television than other countries. In this context, television was needed for prestige. For example, Interviewee #23 argued the following: “Some people thought we should have a television service because it looked like other countries in Africa had a television service.” Similarly, Interviewee #28 stated that as an economically successful country, Botswana deserved to have a national television service that would signal the country’s growth. The same view that associated television with national prestige was espoused by Interviewee #25, who stated that “In any case, if countries as small as Swaziland, Lesotho, and others had television, then why Botswana wouldn’t have its own?”

The argument that Botswana should have a national television because other countries in Africa had television, especially Lesotho and Swaziland signalled the prestige associated with television. With a better performing economy than that of most African countries (Englebert, 2000; Acemoglu, Johnson et al., 2003), television was considered justified because the general public perceived the country to be wealthy enough to afford television.

One quarter of the interviewees (across all interview categories) said that television was needed for government to communicate its policies and programs to the people as demonstrated by the following excerpts:

It will be used to communicate with the masses, especially in the rural areas (Interviewee #21)

The official one [reason] for having a national television would be that it was created as another platform or medium to disseminate government information, because people have to know government programs, what is out there for them, and how can
they benefit from government programs [...] so broadly speaking it was created for development purpose. (Interviewee #17)

We are running a democratic government, a government where the nationals should know what is happening and we should have the opportunity to make information available to them [...] we also need to know what Batswana’s needs are and what they would wish us to do for them, so that even if government is not able to meet these demands, at least they are aware of those demands. Therefore, television was very necessary from the beginning to facilitate dialogue. (Interviewee #24)

There was a strong desire to have this television [...] Others thought we should have a television service because it will “promote development”, quote, because no one was articulating that word “development,” no one was unpacking the word development, what they meant by development; and because we are an agricultural economy, some thought it will show people how to plough, how to promote animal husbandry, it will also help in areas like disease control. (Interviewee #23)

The above responses suggest that the communication of government activity would be dialogical, involving both the government and the public communicating with each other. Both of these views are consistent with the original policy objectives of the government media that, as stipulated in the Hughes report (1968), included the expectation that the media would play a dual role of informing the government about public opinion and informing the public about government policies.

However, one respondent who belonged to the media production category argued that the government is aware that it needs television as a political tool for propagating the ideologies of some sections of society:

But the unofficial reason might be that media is used by governments to control populations, and popularise the dominant idea, the dominant ideology, which will be present, depending on who is in the controlling position and who is in power. Even in Africa, we all know that especially broadcasting is used by governments to control their populations by bombarding them with information from different government offices, so it is to continue perpetuating hegemony of those who are in power. It is not a reason that any government would advance. (Interviewee #17)

Indeed, the view of Interviewee #17 might be substantiated by the prevailing democratic context of Botswana. As a country described as a an example of democratic rule in Africa (Sebudubudu and Molutsi, 2008; Robinson, 2009), the leaders, in this case the Botswana government, might have refrained from publicly pronouncing its use of media for political gains as this would reflect badly on the country. This reflects that the hegemonic message of Botswana as a democratic society is projected through the avoidance by the ruling elites to openly assert the government’s use of the media for political expediencies. It can also be
deduced from the comment above that the media is used to indoctrinate the public with the dominant ideology of the ruling class in Botswana. This view is consistent with assertions of the hegemony theory by Antonio Gramsci (in Durham and Kellner, 2012) that posits that some institutions and groups dominate others and exercise power to pursue a certain dispensation. The national television in Botswana is thus used for political ends to ascertain the hegemony of the government and the ruling class as alluded to by Interview #17. Moreover, the view of Interview #17 above resonates with observations by political economists that the media perpetuate the status quo by promoting the ideas of the elites (Davis & Baran, 2006; McChesney & Valdivia, 2012; Thomas, 2012); in this instance the ruling elites in Botswana. Indeed, such use remains one of the contentious issues relating to the performance of Btv.

Regarding social reasons that were advanced to address the need of establishing a national television, eleven respondents across all interview categories attributed the need for television in Botswana to the cultural value of the service. They stated that television has the capacity to reflect national culture and identity through its programs. The views of Interviewees # 28 and # 23 demonstrate this:

I want to believe the core of having television was to bring our diverse cultures into one. I remember the first assignment they did, the first thing they did, they went around the country to show what the country was all about. (Interviewee #28)

Others thought it should help mirror cultural activities for our children. There were few people who thought it will introduce Botswana to the people of Botswana because people don’t know their country, they will see it, and be able to understand who they are, because the population is small and scattered. (Interviewee #23)

In short, a national television was to reflect Botswana’s diverse cultures. Taking into consideration Botswana’s national television’s role of fostering national culture and identity, together with its role of promoting national unity, as explained above, it can thus be concluded that a national television had to strike a balance in television programming to ensure that it comprises both unifying content and a reflection of cultural diversity. In the context of Botswana where diversity has been least promoted, as it was considered to be countering efforts of national unity, this has challenges for broadcasting in scheduling programs that provide these two competing objectives in Botswana. Perhaps, this explains why there is limited cultural programming on Btv as demonstrated in the schedule analysis findings.
5.4.2.2 Pragmatic imperatives

The second sub-theme relating to the reasons for establishing television in Botswana includes a focus on pragmatic imperatives. These relate to infrastructure, costs, television’s visual impact, and media diversification. Infrastructure, particularly electricity, is one of the most frequently mentioned pragmatic reasons. The respondents from the policy makers’ group argued that the establishment of television was delayed in Botswana because the power grid was inadequate. The interviewees said that the absence of electricity would limit access to television programs in certain areas, thereby restricting national coverage. However, as electricity became more widely accessible, politicians considered it logical to have a television service. Although their decision was based on a pragmatic reason, both economic and political factors underpinned the argument about the need to have a television because electricity became available. Based on Botswana’s resource allocation strategy, politicians endorsed projects and services based on the extent to which the majority of citizens would benefit from them (Harvey and Lewis, 1990), as compared to other African states where resource allocation might have been based on ethnicity (Englebert, 2000). Politicians also flaunt such projects for political mileage. The interviewees from the policy makers’ group and project team stated that the need for a television service in Botswana was advocated because of the perception that the nation was financially ready more so that the prices of television equipment, building materials and the associated labour costs for the new television facility were escalating. Indeed the financial arguments that media policy and project team interviewees refer to underscore the policy suggestions of both the Hughes and Lawrence reports, which advised the Botswana government to avoid launching a national television due to the financial costs that are associated with the medium. Because the economy had improved over the years since independence, as mentioned in the introduction, the argument of financial limitations began to be slowly addressed.

Furthermore, the interviewees suggested that there were signs that the nation was ready for a national television because of the perception that the living standards of Batswana had improved, and because the public desired media technologies such as television (Interviewees #24 and #9). Likewise, rural people expressed their desire for national television by highlighting the need for a television service during kgotla meetings (Interviewees #15, #9, and #24). As demonstrated in Chapter 1 the kgotla is a consultative
A forum where the public can identify national development related issues that they expect the government to address.

The other pragmatic reason for establishing television in Botswana relates to television’s ability to overcome the shortcomings of existing communication channels. Television was preferred for its visual impact and mass audience reach, as compared to existing forms of media, such as radio, newspapers, and the “kgotla” system (Interviewee #33, #36, #24, and #21). Interviewee #24 aptly captured the reason for deciding to establish a national television:

The establishment of the national television was in the logic of circumstances. Every government tries to communicate with people, with the electorate and with the nation as a whole. In our case, you know we have a famous kgotla system, and obviously broadcasting is much more efficient and effective in reaching audiences because for the kgotla you would have to arrange numerous meetings in various places to address the public about the same issue. (Interviewee #24)

While radio was considered immediate, interviewees argued that it lacked visual power. Similarly, whereas the kgotla offered a visual impact, it lacked a mass audience reach. This is because the kgotla meeting occurs in a particular locality. In this context, television was considered an alternative that catered for the shortcomings of both radio and the kgotla (Interviewees #21 and #3), as it integrated sound, visuals, and distance. Thus, television was a considerably more appropriate medium for communication in the context of Botswana, where, due to a sparse population, the existing visual medium, the kgotla, was inadequate.

Some interviewees suggested that television was introduced as a form of media diversification in Botswana:

You had to be complete as a public broadcaster. We had radio and needed television, we needed the pictures, and they speak better than words alone. When you modernise and improve service, you add on things that are not there. (Interviewee #15)

Similarly, Interviewee #20 argued that “the time had come for Botswana to be no longer having one type of media; there was need for a diversification of the media industry”. Interviewee #27 stated the following:

“Remember we didn’t have television, we had GBC\(^{20}\). And it wasn’t a television per se, and to see that the nation was in the dark, it forced government to see and have the pressure of establishing the national television”. (Interviewee #27)

\(^{20}\) Gaborone Broadcasting Corporation, was a commercial relay channel, it now operates as eBotswana.
Diversification would ensure that the government-owned media stable was complete, because it would now comprise radio, newspaper, and television. The other form of diversification was the media system in Botswana, which, as Interviewee #27 reflected, did not have a television system. Interviewee #27 used the metaphor “the nation was in the dark” to suggest that the nation would be “illuminated” or enlightened through the introduction of a television service and the diversification of the media platforms.

5.4.2.3. Technological imperatives
Technological advancements were also instrumental to the foundation of Btv. Interviewees #15 and #22 explained that the introduction of a national television was delayed, based on the precedence of radio access in Botswana. As a terrestrial service, a government radio channel was not yet widely accessible at a time when debates about having a national television service were ongoing. On this account, government concluded that it was illogical to launch a television channel that would be less accessible similar to radio (Interviewees #9, #15, and #22). However, technological developments in the form of satellite technology offered opportunities to improve the distribution of both, radio and television broadcast content. The 1995 launch of the PanAmSat satellite in Africa (Paterson, 1998) is an example of this development. Interviewee #15 stated that satellite technology was seen as the answer to politicians concerns over broadcast signal distribution that could limit nationwide access to television signals. Project team interviewees stated that a favourable condition when working for the government media was that the Government always allowed the broadcasting services (at that time, radio) to acquire the best equipment. The interviewees mentioned that the decision to obtain a satellite slot was made because satellite broadcasting was considered to offer coverage that was superior to that of the existing terrestrial network. Convinced that the government of Botswana would one day decide to have a television service, the media professionals—the management and the technicians of the Department of Information Services (DIS)—booked a satellite space on PanAmSat, a few years before the Botswana government committed to launch a national television service (Interviewees #15 and #22). The satellite slot was later described as a “white elephant” because the government had to pay annual subscriptions or “sit-in money” to keep the slot (Interviewee #22). The use of the

---

21 PanAmSat is an American based satellite company that is arguably one of the first satellite companies to offer Southern African countries an opportunity for satellite broadcasting (Paterson, 1998).
sit-in money for this purpose contradicted Botswana’s economic policy. The government of Botswana’s resource allocation policy opposes “white elephant” projects that do not benefit the public (Interviewee #22). As such, pressure was mounting on the government to establish a national television to ensure that the satellite technology that had been paid for would benefit the Batswana. This finding is significant because it reveals the preparatory work that preceded the decision to establish a national television service. Whereas it is inevitable that technology should be central to debates about the need for a television service, technology-based arguments are reflective of the general media policy in Botswana, which includes an emphasis on technology and in which local content is ignored, as demonstrated in the findings of the document analysis.

5.4.2.4 Resistance to television

The findings that were discussed above demonstrate that the dominant thinking was that television was needed in Botswana. However, Interviewees #22 and #4 stated that a few people, including themselves, did not advocate for television:

Personally, I knew what television was about from those activities [benchmarking exercises on the operations of television], and I wasn’t quite sure how it was going to be brought to Botswana. My worry was, if it came to Botswana, what would it carry in terms of content? (Interviewee #22)

Personally, I did not advocate for television. To me it was just an entertainment medium, so it was not going to add any value. Radio was enough, and was doing very well. (Interviewee #4)

Although only two interview respondents who were media professionals expressed doubts about the establishment of a national television, this finding is significant because it corroborates the findings of the document analysis: local content is largely ignored in media policy documents in Botswana. In addition, the resistance to television on the basis of content is also useful in this study as these concerns possibly explain the low levels of local content on Btv as reflected in Section 5.3.3 of this study. Moreover, concerns over low levels of local content possibly suggest resistance to television based on possible imperialism that could later occur as Botswana would have to import content from developed countries.
5.4.3. The structure of Btv: “Chameleon”

One of the objectives of this study is to explain the structure and mandate of a national television service in Botswana. This section includes a focus on the structure of Btv, and demonstrates that, whereas in the documents reviewed there is difference between state and public service broadcasting, in practice consistency is absent among the various stakeholders regarding the broadcasting model that characterises Btv. These findings revealed three prevailing views of Btv’s broadcasting model: Btv as a state broadcaster, a public service broadcaster, and a “chameleon.”

The interview findings reflect that, at the time of Btv’s launch, the government had not clearly outlined which broadcasting model the national television would adopt. Interviewee #15 stated that government officials assumed that, because Btv would be part of the government media, the channel was to be state-owned. Conversely, the consultants who were recruited to launch the service held a different view: they were establishing a public service broadcaster. Possibly, these two contending views are an outcome of the decision to launch Btv outside the existing legal framework of the Broadcasting Act (1998), as explained in the section on document analysis findings. The outcome of Botswana government’s disregard of the Broadcasting Act, culminated in the current challenge facing Btv’s confused identity as both a state and a public service broadcaster. A policy maker among this study’s respondents expressed the following concern:

I think Btv honestly has to open up and be sincere to the public and stop being defensive, and share with the public their mandate, especially whether it is government or public. If they could come up with a document, and we know it is written and people have committed to, the controversies surrounding Btv will rest. They should stop being a chameleon, when it suits them they are a state broadcaster, when it doesn’t suit them they say they are a public service broadcaster, just as a public relations exercise. They should be consistent, because this can help a lot. (Interviewee #7)

Acknowledging this view, an interviewee from the media production category stated the following:

It is imagined that there is some sort of contradiction between a state broadcaster and a PSB [Public Service Broadcaster]. The state delivers PSB, so PSB and state media is the same thing in this country. So, it’s like when we say a state broadcaster people imagine SABC, and those other corporations. Even then, SABC is run by the ANC22 in South Africa; they deliver the objectives of the owner. (Interviewee #31)

22 African National Congress, a ruling party in South Africa.
The interviewees belonging to the media policy category, specifically politicians, as well as some media executives in the media professionals’ category, insisted that Btv was a state broadcaster. They argued that Btv was state funded and pursued government communication as an information dissemination tool for government. Similarly, most interviewees in the production category stated that Btv was a state broadcaster. Thus, Btv was conceptualised as a state broadcaster, and, as the researcher discusses in detail in the next chapter, the structure of Btv as a state-owned broadcaster has implications relating to issues of state control of the media in Botswana, as elsewhere in Africa.

The second view is that Btv is a public service broadcaster. This view was strongly held among media activists, as well as among interviewees from the media production and policy groups. These interviewees held the view that Btv is a public institution that is funded by government, and that its goal is to serve the public, and not necessarily the government. However, they argued that the government appears to have “hijacked” Btv (Interviewee #6) and now uses the channel mainly for its own benefit. The interviewees who viewed Btv as a public service broadcaster based their opinion on the provisions of the Broadcasting Act (1998), which categorises broadcasting into commercial, community, and public service broadcasting. Public service broadcasting is defined in the Act (Broadcasting Act, 1998, p.3) as “broadcasting service provided by any statutory body which is funded either wholly or partly through State revenues.” In addition, in the Act, a public service broadcaster is described as a statutory broadcaster that is funded wholly or partially by the state, whereas a commercial broadcasting is defined by the Act as a profit-making broadcaster that is funded by private individuals or companies. In addition, community broadcasters are defined in the Act as non-for profit broadcasters that are funded by various means, such as donations, grants, sponsorship, or memberships fees. Interviewees contended that the description of Btv was closer to that of a public service broadcaster than to other broadcasting models provided for in the Act. This suggests that similar to the views expressed by Hughes (1968) regarding media professional’s perception of state media in the 1960s as stated in the document analysis findings (Section 5.2.1.2), media professionals even to date still harbour perceptions that government owned media is synonymous with public service broadcasting. This suggests public service broadcasting is their preferred model.

The third view is that Btv is a “chameleon” broadcaster, which implies that Btv changes from a state broadcaster to a public service broadcaster, as Interviewee #7 explained in the quote above, meaning that Btv switches from being an information dissemination tool
of the Botswana government to a service that is accountable to the public. Some interviewees from the media production and media policy groups also held this view. Interviewees from both groups cited the 2009 election coverage as an example. In preparation for the general election, the regulatory authority, the National Broadcasting Board (NBB), in consultation with media stakeholders, including the government, developed a Code of Conduct for Broadcasters to guide the election coverage. However, the code was withdrawn as the Minister of Communications, Science, and Technology, Pelonomi Venson-Moitoi, whose portfolio included broadcasting, questioned the legality of the code. The contested issue was that the NBB had no legal authority over state media in light of the provisions of the Broadcasting Act, which is silent on state-owned media. The interviewees saw this incident as an example of Btv’s “chameleonic” nature, because the issues regarding the Btv’s broadcasting model when the code was drafted did not exist. However, when it suited the situation, at a time when the code was implemented, the government evoked the understanding that Btv was a state broadcaster, which, therefore, was not legally bound by the code. The “chameleon” model is a combination of state and public service broadcasting, or “state public service broadcasting.”

A considerable disagreement subsists among the members of the project team about the inherent inconsistencies in Btv’s broadcasting model. From the beginning, the project team clearly expressed different views about the type of broadcasting that they were establishing. Members of the project team said that the disagreement was between the expatriate and the local staff who were employed by the Department of Broadcasting Services. The expatriate personnel and a few local people who were involved in the project embraced a public service model, or a “BBC style” broadcaster, in the words of Interviewee #37. Conversely, most members of the project team who were current employees of the Department of Information and Broadcasting (DIS) understood they were establishing a state-owned national television, a “Radio Botswana style” broadcaster. These different understandings imbued the new recruits who were to start working at Btv (Interviewees #15, #20, and #22). Thus, the diverse backgrounds of the staff who implemented the national television program influenced their perceptions of the type of television broadcasting that Botswana required. The expatriate personnel were recruited from countries that already had a public service broadcasting culture, such as the United Kingdom and South Africa. The team members who launched the channel had different understandings of the broadcasting model, which suggested confusion existed about Btv’s overall broadcasting objective. This is
because the two models of state and public service, although largely similar, pursue varying objectives.

The interviewees in the media production group and the project team remarked that various efforts had been made to address the issues relating to Btv’s structure, specifically its broadcasting model:

The Department engaged the Swedish, and they came here and took the management through the processes of public service broadcasting. The aim was to turn the whole department into a public service broadcaster, but still funded by the government. That is the Swedish Model. But this did not materialise because there was a feeling in government that once it [Btv] becomes a public service broadcaster, it means there is going to be a board, a board that will be in charge, and they [government] will lose grip of this most important medium. That is why they dropped the idea. The issue was the board and they abandoned the idea altogether. (Interviewee #20)

It almost happened [the privatisation of Btv] when the government separated broadcasting from information services. Government was ready to let go of broadcasting, and remain with information services. The unfortunate thing is that politicians infiltrated the staff, and it was the change of leadership, and the staff behaviour did not help either. So there was agreement to let things settle down. I don’t know whether things have not settled, or the plan is completely aborted. (Interviewee #22)

The most frequent suggestion for improving Btv was that it should be restructured and turned into a “parastatal,” “private,” or “corporate” organisation. These words are used interchangeably in Botswana to refer to quasi-government departments that are grounded in neo-liberal or pro-commercial thinking. Likewise, the possible restructuring of Btv, as alluded to in the document analysis findings, was one of the key policy areas in the early years of Btv (see Section 5.2.2). Whereas the documents that were reviewed did not reveal the reasons for the decision to halt the transformation of Btv, the excerpts that were quoted above demonstrate that the reasons relate to political insecurities and perceptions of low levels of professionalism among the media professionals at Btv. With the hindsight on the varying expectations on how national television should be structured in Botswana, this study includes a discussion in Chapter 6 on broadcasting models by analysing the tension between state and public service broadcasting through the diverse viewpoints in the literature. The discussion is offered with a view to suggesting a broadcasting model for consideration in the context of Botswana, in view of the fluidity of both state and public service broadcasting models in other parts of the world as discussed in the literature review.
5.4.4 Role of the national television

This section includes an outline of the role of Btv as perceived by the interviewees in this study. The findings reflect a diversity of interpretations of Btv’s role. Furthermore, the responses of some of the media professionals and the project team suggest an ineffective team that did not have focus and an understanding of their roles. In this sub-section, the sub-themes relating to the role of Btv have been grouped into two broad categories: most frequently mentioned roles and least frequently mentioned roles. The most frequently mentioned roles are to inform, educate, and entertain, show Botswana to the Batswana, and disseminate information on government policies. The least frequently mentioned roles are news and current affairs, enhancing Botswana’s global visibility, advertising, and Btv’s hegemonic role.

Members of the project team and the media production group contended that Btv’s mandate was never clearly articulated. They said they were unaware of any document that clearly outlined the expectations for Btv. Media executives said the government officials often talked about the need for Btv to support the government’s agenda, but they never addressed this issue in a written statement. Some of the respondents within the media production group said that the Btv’s mandate was unclear and so was its role. A member of the project team (Interviewee #20) agreed that the Botswana government never clearly stated what the channel should aim to achieve. However, two of the four policy makers who were interviewed in this study, Interviewees #9 and #7, when asked about the national broadcaster’s role, responded in a manner that indicated they did not clearly understand it either:

As a president, I was not going to cook the food. I had to make sure food is provided, that was the work of the minister, and the permanent secretary. It’s an assumption that you do, for example, if you have a ministry of health, you don’t become a doctor because you are the president, and those that trained in the craft will know what to do.

(Interviewee #9)

When probed further, however, Interviewee #9 explained that Btv, as a government broadcaster, should perform the same role as other government media by default: educate, inform, entertain, and publicise government policies. Nonetheless, both this assumption and the comment above demonstrate that leaving media professionals to determine alone what should be the role of such a service constituted significant oversight by the Botswana
Government. A policy maker’s view on the role of Btv revealed the implications of this omission:

I am not an authority on the mandate of Btv. He [the Deputy Permanent Secretary of Media] says Btv is there to serve the public with information, developmental programs, educational programs, and some form of entertainment, and to try to convey government policies to the public. But for us we just implement the Act [Broadcasting Act], and it doesn’t go far, but we want a government-owned broadcaster to provide public service to the public. It has to be seen to be objective, to be open to public feedback. That’s the mandate of Btv. (Interviewee #7).

The absence of a common understanding of the mandate of a national broadcaster is one of emerging key policy areas that must be addressed as will be discussed further in Chapter 6.

5.4.4.1 Most frequently mentioned roles of Btv

The most frequently mentioned themes relating to the role of television are summarised in Table 5-7; they were mostly consistent with the reasons that were advanced for a national television service, as already described in Section 5.4.2. In addition, the findings also suggested the domination of the role of Btv as a publicity channel for government information, as well as a medium of cultural reflection, as suggested in the policy documents that were produced by the media professionals at Btv.

Table 5-7
Most Frequently Mentioned Roles of Btv

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Interviewee category</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inform, educate, and entertain</td>
<td>Policy makers (4)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Project team (4)</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Media producers (16)</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Media industry interest group (13)</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>23</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Show Botswana to the Batswana</td>
<td>Policy makers (4)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Project team (4)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Media producers (16)</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Media industry interest group (13)</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>19</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Disseminate information about government policies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Policy makers (4)</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project team (4)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media producers (16)</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media industry interest group (13)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s fieldwork.

_Educate, inform, and entertain_

Most of the interviewees in this study interpreted the role of television as being to inform, educate and entertain them. This is consistent with the traditional Rethian interpretation of the role of the media (Holtz-Bacha & Norris, 2001; Mersham, 1998). Lord Reith, who is referred to as the founding father of public service broadcasting stated that the role of the media is to inform, educate and entertain. Table 5-7 shows that various interviewee groups acknowledge Btv’s information, education, and entertainment value. The consensus is that information will help the Batswana to become aware of opportunities that are available to them to improve their lives. The interviewees agreed that television could educate through instructional design or by imparting knowledge. Most interviewees agreed that Btv has provided credible information, and education-oriented programming. For example, Interviewees #15 and #25 consider Btv’s agricultural programs instructional and applicable to Botswana’s lifestyle. However, some interviewees expressed disappointment with Btv’s performance regarding its educational and information role. A policy maker (Interviewee #24) regretted that “young people” had hijacked Btv, and that it is now used more for entertainment than for other types of programs. Conversely, the media executives and activists expressed dissatisfaction with Btv’s entertainment programs, describing them as inadequate and boring. The use of the media to educate, inform, and entertain is discussed in the next chapter because it is central to the theoretical framework of this thesis, in that within the modernisation paradigm, the media’s purpose is to support development through information dissemination.

_“Show Botswana to Batswana”_

Nineteen of the 37 interviewees, as Table 5-7 shows, described television’s role as showcasing Botswana. For example, Btv is expected “to show Botswana” (Interviewees #23 and #21); “to show the Batswana” (Interviewees #3 and #15); and “to show Botswana to the

---

23 This was made in reference to media professionals at Btv
Batswana” (Interviewees #19 and #28). When these interviewees were prompted as to what they meant by Botswana in this context, they explained that Botswana encompasses the people, places, and ngwao (culture). As discussed earlier in this interview finding section, these references to “Botswana” or the “Batswana” have national connotations. The interviewees suggested two principal reasons why television should “show Botswana.” First, Btv is necessary for the nation’s self-representation, which is associated with nation building. Numerous Batswana previously watched foreign channels that did not show Botswana and the Batswana. Therefore, remedying this by broadcasting local content is a critical task for Btv. In this regard, for example, Turner (2004), in the context of New Zealand television, explained how a national television service could achieve a self-seeking function of the media through content that reflects national interests. In the context of Botswana, as explained earlier in Section 5.4.2.1, the prevalence of foreign content justified a self-centred view among the Batswana on the role of television.

The second reason why Btv should “show Botswana” is that television should reflect diversity of Botswana’s people, places, and culture. However, the interviewees from the media production and media activist groups who expressed strong views about this role were metaphorically referring to the manner in which the political elites in Botswana society dominated in television content, instead of having programs that represented various elements of Botswana. To use Anderson’s (1991) concept, the media production and media activist groups expected television to reflect the “imagined nation” of Botswana. In the view of media professionals, the nation of Botswana comprises diverse cultures that should be celebrated, whereas in the view of the government, diversity should be replaced with one national identity of being Botswana. The interviewees expressed modest levels of satisfaction with the extent to which television “shows Botswana.” Thus they credited Btv with promoting national artists and sports personalities. Moreover, numerous interviewees criticised Btv for reflecting “some” Batswana, largely politicians and urban elites. The role of television to “show Botswana to the Batswana” poses both practical and policy challenges. As explained above, Botswana is diverse, which raises the question of which parts of Botswana or which Batswana should be represented in Btv programs, since it would be practically impossible for the channel to reflect almost everything—places, culture, events, and people—in the country.
Journalism practice in developing countries often reflects a media system that supports the state (Banda, 2007; Papoutsaki, 2008; Skjerdal, 2011). Discussions with interviewees reflected a similar expectation concerning Btv. As shown in Table 5-7, 15 interviewees in all the interview groups said the role of Btv was to disseminate information about government policies. This view was strongly expressed by members of the media production and media policy groups. Interviewee #1 explained as follows:

The purpose of Btv is to connect government with Batswana, to provide Batswana with information about policies of government that benefit them whether in social life or economic aspects, and how they can access programs that have been put in place to support them in all spheres of life.

These respondents assumed that information about government policies would benefit the public because it concerns policies, initiatives, and projects aimed at socio-economic development of Botswana. Interviewee #2 used the example of the government policy on backyard gardening, which included the aim of alleviating poverty through encouraging Batswana to engage in small scale gardening in their homes. Btv was expected to disseminate and publicise this information to enable the public to become aware of opportunities that could be available to them. Interviewees in all categories largely acknowledged the transformative role of government in Batswana life, and, hence, appreciated the need for Btv to disseminate information on government policies. This could have occurred because of the Botswana government’s achievements in which, through a state-led model of development, the government has remained central to socio-economic development, as demonstrated in Chapter 1.

Nonetheless, views diverged on how Btv should play its information dissemination role. Some interviewees contended that Btv should mainly disseminate government policies, and cover national issues positively. These interviewees said that, in a developing country, the media should be supportive of the government. They further argued that, if the media were to be excessively critical of government policies, the uptake of government policies could be slow. This idea of reflecting only positive aspects of government policies suggests that the uptake of government policies and programs was based on exhortation. Information presented on Btv had to stimulate the citizenry to partake in government policies and programs. These views echo the role of media in national development as espoused in the developmental media theory. In this theory, the key assumption about the role of the media is that the media should be supportive of the government’s efforts towards rural and national
development (McQuail, 1984). In this way, the media should therefore partner with government in national development initiatives. The underlying assumption is that the government would be promoting policies that would propel economic growth and social change. While Botswana has attained some level of progress as discussed in chapter 1, the country is not significantly different from others in Africa bearing in mind the inequalities alluded to in Chapter 1 that demonstrate the failure of government to improve living conditions of a significant number of Batswana. In light of the poor outcomes of national development in Africa, critics have blamed the developmental media theory for negative outcomes such as government control of the media in Africa (Musa, 1997). Thus while the media should disseminate information in support of government development initiatives, there are also limitations in that such partnerships are still to positively influence national development in many African contexts.

Interviewees from the media production group mostly viewed Btv’s communication of policies negatively. For example, phrases such as “we are told” (Interviewees #1 and #13), “as a government media” (Interviewees #27 and #17), and “our bosses always remind us” (Interviewees #2 and #12) were used to express discontent with their involvement in disseminating government information. Perhaps this group mentioned this role more than others did because, as public servants, they were duty-bound to support the government. Nonetheless, the resistance of media professionals to their role of disseminating government information seems to have had limited impact on programming decisions as Btv schedules government programs as demonstrated in the findings of the schedule analysis (see Section 5.2).

Most interviewees acknowledged the need to allow government to communicate information about its social and economic development programs to its citizens, but also suggested that Btv should emphasise the significance of the citizens’ involvement in the government television programs that it broadcasts. One respondent said if this did not happen, “the leadership would be talking to itself” (Interviewee #20). Interviewee #28 said, “Btv should perform the role of a community broadcaster, in which it serves the needs of the community.” Interviewee #7 concurred by saying, “I think television has to, once in a while, focus on development, and try to go to some areas or communities and mimic community media.” Thus, the view among these interviewees is that Btv content should be a balance of government information and community participation. The expression “to mimic community broadcasting” can be interpreted to mean that Btv should provide a platform for dialogue on
national development issues, as well as giving a voice to the marginalised. In this case, Btv’s role in national development is viewed from a participatory approach. The role of the media in disseminating government information is discussed further in Chapter 6 to explain the implications of such an approach to broadcasting in Botswana.

5.4.4.2 Least frequently mentioned roles of Btv

The least frequently mentioned roles of Btv are providing news and current affairs, enhancing Botswana’s global visibility, advertising, and playing a hegemonic role.

News and current affairs

Seven respondents from both the project team and media production group mentioned Btv’s role of presenting news and current affairs. Interviewee #22 said, “the mandate of Btv was news and current affairs.” However, the challenge, as expressed by Interviewee #20, a member of the project team, was that

It was decided we need a television service; in fact, it was a news and current affairs service. What news, what current affairs? It was for people who were there to find out whose news Btv was to be broadcast. (Interviewee #20)

Whereas the Botswana Government’s decision that Btv should focus on news and current affairs was commendable, the government omitted to explain what constitutes news. This task was left to the media professionals. That the government might have assumed that Btv would provide news coverage about government policy and use subtle propaganda, as suggested by Hughes (1968), (Section 5.2.1.2) is a possibility. However, the media professionals assumed that Btv would provide them with an opportunity to exercise their professional judgement in deciding how they should define what constitutes news. As Interviewees 20, #17, #14, and #22 explained, these different assumptions about news content might have led to animosity between government and media professionals at Btv. These differences could explain why the government’s decision to transform Btv into a public service broadcaster eventually stalled as discussed in the document analysis findings.

Botswana’s global visibility

Another least frequently mentioned role of Btv, which the television station was expected to play as a national broadcaster, was its marketing role. Seven interviewees stated that they
expected Btv to enhance Botswana’s visibility across the globe, meaning that Btv has a public relations function. For example, Interviewee #8 suggested the following:

Right now we are colonised by media culture of America, because as a powerhouse, the Americans have really pushed their products such that we are culturally sensitive to the American way of life. So even as Batswana we can do that and push Botswana agenda, or even the African agenda, and even to define it [agenda] to what we want it to be. And we can do that through television. It has to sell Botswana. (Interviewee #8)

Similarly, Interviewee #19 said the following:

The advantage for Botswana is that it [Btv] is also available on satellite, and those people who have access to it can watch our channel. So, Btv should really tell the Botswana story, and set the record straight. (Interviewee #19)

These interviewees assigned Btv a marketing role of “telling the Botswana story” to the rest of the world. Interviewee #31 explained the Botswana story as content relating to national issues such as tourism, diamonds for development, safe and secure beef, resources management and leadership. Thus, television should project the achievements of Botswana and its developmental challenges. Similarly, although discussing foreign policy in Botswana, Zaffiro (1997) has observed that Botswana’s success is given prominence in local mass media, but remains invisible in the international arena. Accordingly, to improve the country’s prominence, Btv, like other mass media, is expected to produce Tswana-exclusive content that could be sold overseas. This high expectation could be rooted in the country’s need to diversify its mineral-based economy to include manufacturing and tourism (Matambo, 2013).

Selling content could generate income, as well as projecting Botswana as a possible investment destination. The metaphor “sell Botswana” could also be consistent with the other views about Botswana’s need to assert itself as a powerful nation as expressed by the participants in this study. The expectation that was placed on Btv to enhance the global visibility of Botswana is consistent with the findings of the document analysis (Section 5.2.2) in which this study demonstrated that the Botswana government ascribes to the government media the role of publicising Botswana internationally.

The ambitious role of Btv “telling the Botswana story” globally presents a challenge for Btv’s programming, in that the television channel has two diverging audiences: one local and the other global. The interviewees in this research opined that Btv had failed to market Botswana adequately. This view is sustained by the findings that emerged from the schedule analysis (Section 5.3.7): there is dearth of programming focusing on global audiences on Btv.
Although the interviewees expressed the need to produce content that “tells the Botswana story,” they appeared to ignore the geopolitics of broadcasting, in that Btv is a national and not an international broadcaster. Although the channel is available via satellite, it would be almost impossible for it to reach a global audience.

Advertising outlet
Like other television channels, Btv is assigned the commercial function of carrying advertising for the business community in Botswana. A policy maker (Interviewee #7) mentioned that Btv should “mimic” competition, whereas Interviewees #8, #14, and #28 expected Btv to be a marketing channel that carried advertising for local companies. Interviewee #7 used the expression “mimic competition” because Btv operates within an almost monopolistic environment in which the commercial television broadcasting sector is weak as explained in the introduction chapter of this thesis. The expectation that Btv should act as a commercial broadcaster further attests to the complexities of Btv’s objectives. As the schedule analysis findings revealed, Btv carries advertising. Furthermore, the document analysis findings (Section 5.2.3) also revealed that Btv focused on its commercial role during its mid years. As the researcher will discuss in the next chapter, advertising is one of the policy issues relating to funding a public television that is debated in the literature, and thus should be examined in the context of Botswana with the view to consider advertising as a revenue generating activity for the Btv.

Hegemonic role
Concerning the last least frequently mentioned role of Btv, a few interviewees provided an interpretation of the latent meaning of Btv’s content. They argued that Btv’s other role was to perpetuate the ideologies of the ruling class. One media executive explicitly articulated this role as that of

Perpetuat[ing] the ideologies and hegemony of those who are in power. It is not a reason that any government would advance. Even here [Btv] it is not like we broadcast what we want, and we are constantly reminded that this channel belongs to the government. (Interviewee #17)

Thus, the respondents’ perceptions of the role of Btv in promoting the ideas of the ruling class suggest the domination of government over media professionals as regard what content should be broadcast on the national television. The assertion that the media are not allowed to broadcast what they like, suggest the continuation of the broader social order in Botswana,
where the government is central in national development activates, hence the same supremacy is extended to the media operations. In accordance with the hegemony theory that observes that societies institutionalise hegemony (Murphy, 2003), the decision by the Botswana government to dictate what could be broadcast on Btv suggest institutionalisation of the hegemony of the ruling class in key sectors such as the media. This has implications for national development in that the dominance of the ruling elites may limit participation of the poor who may be in need of information about development projects.

5.4.5 Media production: Challenges facing Btv’s local content production

This section includes an outline of the findings on the factors that facilitate and inhibit media content production among Btv media professionals. According to Croteau, Hoynes, and Milan (2012), both political and economic forces constitute structural constraints on the media. Using a sociological approach, Croteau, Hoynes, and Milan (2012) have contended that media professionals display their agency by making decisions and take action to address structural constraints. In this context, the interviewees explained that various structural constraints might limit content production at Btv. The structural constraints that emerged from the field data were grouped into three themes: political, economic, and organisational. These are elaborated upon below.

5.4.5.1 Political factors

The interviewees stated that political factors, such as state control, censorship, and policy and regulatory factors influenced the performance of Btv. The interviewees expressed strong views regarding the state’s control of Btv. The interviewees expressed concern that the government is tightening its control of the state-owned media. This finding corroborates the finding of the document analysis that demonstrated that current media policy favours the government. For instance, the interviewees said that Btv has an unwritten editorial policy of covering the activities of the President and Vice-president of Botswana, and ensuring that stories relating to these political leaders are in the headlines and are placed at the beginning of news bulletins.

Moreover, the interviewees were of the view that Btv must also contend with subtle state control because, as a government department, its journalists are considered government employees. Therefore, media executives stated that they are expected to be loyal to the government in accordance with the terms and conditions of their employment as civil
servants. In its first 13 years, Btv has had five directors, and seven heads of news and current affairs. Media reports indicated that employees whom the government perceived as enemies were targeted for transfer because they failed to provide coverage of the President (Gaolthobogwe, 2009) or were perceived to be politically affiliated to the opposition parties (Baputaki, 2009).

Contrariwise, interviewees in senior positions at Btv and politicians opined that, in a developing country, some degree of state control is needed to steer broadcasting towards national objectives that are socially desirable, such as nation building and national development. However, the interviewees from the media activist category said that Botswana has politically matured as a nation, and, therefore, that it should embrace critical views. However, two media policy interviewees were adamant that Btv enjoyed editorial independence and a considerable level of press freedom. This finding on the negative perceptions of the state control of Btv corroborates evidence in the literature about the control of the media by government in the name of national development (Musa, 1997). In this study, this finding is significant in that it raises the question as to why a democratic state such as Botswana persists in controlling the media. As the researcher discusses in Chapter 6, the divergence of perceptions on state-media relations in Botswana brings to the fore the relationship between state-led development and national media systems.

Similarly, the research participants perceived that censorship had been applied at Btv. For instance, media professionals said that one obvious form of censorship involved producers submitting topics to their seniors who would subsequently forward them to government officials of greater seniority, such as the Permanent Secretary or even the Minister, for vetting. Some respondents said that the absence of active citizenship and media lobby groups perpetuated censorship at Btv. Interviewees #6, #17, and #21 gave an example where a regulatory office complained about the use of party colours on national television; yet, no members of the public lodged an official complaint. The general observation among those who raised this issue of inactive citizenship is that the Batswana can often be naïve or are conciliatory to a fault. Moreover, the interviewees stated that numerous Batswana are said to feel comfortable complaining on the sidelines, but find it hard to complain directly to the

---

24 Gaolthobogwe’s newspaper article gives examples of two senior news personnel—the Head of News and the Assignment Editor—who were transferred in 2010 for failing to cover the president. Other employees, mainly from the News and Current Affairs section, were also transferred. Baputaki’s article states that a total of six employees were transferred between October 2009 and November 2009. Four of them were from News and Current Affairs. Whether by coincidence or plan, the staff re-deployments coincide with the leadership of President Khama, whose government allegedly forcefully controls government-funded media.
relevant person. Interviewee #14 said, for example, that even academics who write editorial pieces fail to take their complaints to the relevant authorities. A disengaged citizenship is not specific to the media sector in Botswana. Moatlhaping and Kethomilwe (2012) had observed that, whereas Botswana ranks positively on various indicators, such as corruption, the rule of law, and political stability, to mention but a few, the country scores poorly in the area of “voice and accountability.”

Ultimately, media executives said that they often succumbed to government pressure and ended up covering issues that were less sensitive or political, and avoided investigative journalism. The media executives gave examples of less controversial social issues such as *bogadi* (bride price), male circumcision, and marriage. Although most media executives were aware of the government’s expectations for media coverage of controversial issues, they said they felt professionally handicapped:

> We have our own expectations. We want to produce interesting programs. Interesting is a wide thing, controversy interest, it makes people want to watch television. We want investigative issues, we want to talk about hottest issues, and those are not necessarily the things that [...] government wants to hear, because some of these things negatively expose the government, some do not reflect well about some prominent people in government, because they have power and authority. Those things never see light of day. But people want to know about them, people want the details, yet we are in a liberal democracy, and liberal democracies talk about pluralism and we are not able to offer it because the status quo does not allow that. Theoretically, they say they allow us, but practically no. (Interviewee #17)

The view expressed by Interview#17 reflects the subjugation of Btv’s editorial independence to the will of the government. The claim that investigative journalism is sidelined despite the public expressing interest in such content reflects that media censorship is used to perpetuate the status quo in Botswana. The investigative stories and journalists are thus considered a threat to the existing hegemony of having the current BDP government in power. The limitation on media professionals’ performance due to government censorship is a common theme in studies focusing on the political economy of media in African contexts (Chuma & Moyo, 2010; Mukhongo, 2010; Habberson & Rothchild, 2009). In these studies, it has been observed that the media’s watchdog role is compromised as media professionals are censored on the extent to which they can provide critical and investigative stories about the

---

25 At the time of data collection, circumcision was a sensitive topic because the Ministry of Health was engaged in a campaign to encourage voluntary male circumcision as one of its HIV/AIDS prevention interventions.
government. In most parts of Africa, the media are thus expected to express the views of government, and dissenting views tend to be allowed largely when they discredit the opposition (Wanyama, 2000).

As evidence of censorship, Interviewee #2 stated that media professionals might be transferred to other government departments as a disciplinary measure for perceived dissent. In circumstances where censorship and state control is perceived, questions also arise about the credibility of Btv. Interviewees from the media activists and media production categories were the most critical of Btv’s credibility. People in the media production category admitted that their reports sometimes were unbalanced and were biased. The blatant use of television as a government mouthpiece during the historic public service strike in 2011 illuminates this view:

When it comes to news, it is a rule in journalism that stories must be balanced if you are fair and transparent. And in my opinion this is what we are trying to do, but it is not always the case. I will use a recent example of the strike. I am of the opinion that the strike should have communications people from both the government side and the unions, and every time we had a strike story, we get views from both, but this was not the case. (Interviewee #19)

There is serious government control; it’s not a joke. People come here to edit stories, even though they are not employed here, but because they are ministers, they are permanent secretaries. If that thing can be reduced, I am sure people will trust Btv as a reliable source of information. Look at what happened during the coverage of the strike this year [the media blacked out the unions’ views about the strike; only government officials were interviewed for news stories]. That [coverage] made people lose trust in us, and they no longer take television seriously. (Interviewee #17)

The examples of the coverage of the national strike as elucidated by Interviewee #17 & #19 reveal concrete examples of how the government can determine editorial policies of the state-owned media. Moreover, the views expressed by these respondents extend the literature on the media performance of state broadcasters in Africa as regard their ability to tell the truth when the government is implicated in certain situations. Buckley et al (2008) and Mukhongo (2010) have outlined various examples of unintended consequences of African state broadcasters’ failure to be objective in their reports. For example, the post-election conflict of Kenya is partially attributed to the media for their failure to report the election fairly (Mukhongo, 2010). Most critically when the media fails to report issues in a truthful manner, this may breed perceptions of propagandist agenda. Such perceptions may be detrimental to
the overall goal of a country’s national development in that important development oriented messages may be dismissed as propaganda.

In the same manner, the programs referred to as government programs (Section 5.3.2), were considered educational, but were also dismissed as propaganda. For example, interviewees belonging to the media activists’ category stated the following:

Programs like *Tsa Botsogo* [a health program], if you become intelligent and analyse it, you will see there is a lot of propaganda. (Interviewee #5)

The reason people don’t like Btv programming, e.g., *Batho Pele*\(^{26}\), is because such programs’ first opening lines are about government. Everything is about the government, people get tired, they don’t want to hear “government,” and people want to see events as they unfold. As long as it’s about government, people will switch off. (Interviewee #34)

And those programs that are produced locally [...] government is becoming a producer, which is sad; almost every department now is producing programs [...] The challenge is when they are produced by government departments, it is just manipulation of the public. (Interviewee #8)

In the next section of the findings, Section 5.5, the researcher establishes the perceptions of the audiences towards these programs with the view to draw conclusions on their relevance to national development in Botswana.

Policy and regulatory factors are central to the focus of this thesis, even though only four interviewees mentioned them. Interviewees from the media production group said they were unaware of any policy on local content on Btv. Interviewee #31 was non-committal about percentages and said the following

Look I am not giving you a figure and say it’s 50% or 60%. Our target is to have a balance where you have more local content than foreign content because we will always have foreign content. But to give you a percentage is not realistic.

However, Interviewee #17 said the following:

I don’t know how long it is going to take us to achieve that mandate of running at 60% local content. At the moment, we are at 40% if I am not wrong. The quality yes, I think the little that we get is fairly good. (Interviewee #17)

Interviewee #17 further mentioned that it is common knowledge among the Btv employees that the channel has internally set itself a local content target of 60%.

\(^{26}\) Ministry of Local Government program
Accordingly, whereas the internal content quota is consistent with the views that media professionals held in the early years of Btv (Section 5.2.2), the absence of a coherent policy on local content at national level is a substantial limitation facing Btv. In the next chapter, the implications of a policy vacuum are explored, and suggestions for addressing local content are outlined.

5.4.5.2 Economic factors
Economic factors have been central to the introduction of a national television in Botswana and they continue to shape its operations. Indeed, the multi-million Pula media complex and the state-of-the-art equipment that was acquired when Btv was launched provide evidence that the Botswana government was financially ready to incur the costs of establishing a national television service (Interviewees #7, #22, and #15). A budget of P25 million\(^{27}\) was also made available for the whole project (Interviewee #37). However, the current funding situation for local content presents a different picture. Numerous media professionals at Btv attributed most of the blame for Btv’s low levels of local content, repeat programming, urban bias, and broadcasting of old foreign programs to economic issues, specifically budgetary constraints. For example, at the time of data collection in 2011, Interviewee #1 said the following:

"We have roughly P2 million\(^{28}\) roughly a year for [local] production. So, government will rather prioritise and take money to other more important projects. Even the advertising revenue goes to the government coffers. (Interviewee #1)"

This suggests that local content is of low priority, compared to foreign content. The budget for foreign programs could be as high as P7.3 million\(^{29}\) (Interviewee #32). The media executives’ justification for a higher allocation of funds to foreign content was that such content was cheaper and served the need to fill the television schedules. The budget of P7.3 million\(^{30}\) allowed Btv to purchase approximately seventy-two, 30-minute long international programs\(^{31}\) or episodes a year (Interviewee #32). Thus, Btv would have to schedule this

---

\(^{27}\) Interviewee #37 estimated that this is equivalent to approximately £4 million, using 1998 exchange rates.

\(^{28}\) USD 236,399.99 (2013 exchange rate of USD1 = P8.4)

\(^{29}\) USD 869,047.62 (2013 exchange rate of USD1 = P8.4)

\(^{30}\) USD 869,047.62 (2013 exchange rate of USD1 = P8.4)

\(^{31}\) Interviewee #32 explained that they purchased programs that were as old as 15 years, and stated that programs that are five years old are still considered new and that they might be expensive.
foreign content every five days to spread it out for a whole year. The channel ultimately repeated programs to fill this gap. Indeed, the funding allocation explains why Btv, as the schedule analysis findings demonstrated, broadcasted a greater amount of foreign content than of local content as well as the dominance of repeats on the channels schedules (Section 5.3.3).

The assertions by Interview#1 above substantiate the existing views in the literature as regard funding public broadcasters. These broadcasters are considered public utilities that are financed by either the state or the public through a licence fee. The state funds these broadcasters through government appropriation, subsidies or tax credits. The assumption behind government appropriation is that there is need for public media, which will be generally free from the economic pressures of profit making (Findahl, 1999; Raboy, 1995). The other explanation for public funding is that the society should share the cost of public service media content production. The society does this indirectly by paying taxes, and the tax money is used by the state to finance public service broadcasting. However, the challenge with government funding is uncertainty. Governments have numerous priorities and broadcasters are uncertain of their yearly allocations. This makes long term planning complex more so that funding tends to remain the same in real terms (Boardman and Vining, 1996). But the costs of program production always go up, creating a deficit for the broadcaster. This gap in financial allocations on one hand and the expected role of the broadcaster on the other, may impact on the performance of the broadcaster. The broadcaster is financially constrained thus impacting on ability to meet ascribed roles. The other challenge is that government appropriation has been criticised for its tendency to be used by the state to control media content in some countries, especially developing countries where broadcasters do not have a charter (Mbaine, 2006; Ojo and Kadiri, 2001). Hoskins and McFadyen quote the Peacock Committee Report that “it would indeed be astonishing if he who paid the piper did not occasionally hint at the tune; and it will be equally astonishing if the piper did not occasionally anticipate his paymaster’s call” (1992, pp. 286-287). Btv is thus no exception as demonstrated by the findings of this study as regard the state control of the media.

Whereas only one interviewee suggested funding the national broadcaster through a license fee, arguing that the Batswana living standards have improved and that they can afford the fee (Interviewee #21), the media policy interviewees dismissed the licence fee. They contended that the Batswana cannot afford the fees (Interviewees #6 and #7), and that
politicians would not endorse such a decision (Interviewees #9 and #24) that could be unpopular because the electorate, so far, has used free services. With the unemployment rate at 17.8% and rural poverty levels as high as 48.6% (Statistics Botswana, 2011), a license fee could exclude the socially disadvantaged, who might be the target audiences for developmental messages. In addition, paying for public services in Botswana is a relatively new phenomenon that might encounter resistance. In view of these contextual issues, it is imperative to adopt the funding of Btv as a central media policy issue in Botswana. Therefore, in Chapter 6, the researcher discusses broadcast financing as a key policy issue with the view to offer suggestions for funding Btv.

5.4.5.3 Organisational factors

The other challenge facing Btv is the sparse population of Botswana. Media executives complained that covering hundreds of villages in Botswana is practically impossible. Administratively, Botswana has 16 districts. However, Btv has crews in only five of the 16 districts. The television channel started with two pieces of satellite news-gathering (SNG) equipment. Moreover, the country’s geographic terrain poses technological challenges for Btv’s endeavour to cover various villages in Botswana. Interviewee #35 explained that some roads could damage the SNG equipment, as well as the outside broadcast (OB) vans. In view of this, coverage was compromised to avoid potential damage to Btv’s equipment, in light of the high maintenance costs and, at times, the absence of skilled personnel to maintain the equipment. Indeed these are practical limitations that Btv has to grapple with in its efforts to remain accessible nationwide.

The media professionals who were interviewed in this study admitted that they still must make greater efforts to include more ordinary people on television, as opposed to the elites. The media professionals who have more administrative roles, dismissed the view that opportunities for audience participation were limited, whereas those who were directly involved in production agreed with this view. Senior media professionals cited programs such as the studio talk show Molemo-wa-Kgang, The Eye, and Matlho-a-phage as interactive programs that allowed audience participation. News also uses vox-pops to ensure audience participation. Yet, The Eye and Matlho-a-phage are elite programs, with elite guests. Molemo-wa-Kgang, which discusses social issues, is studio-based, and studio guests reside principally in the capital or surrounding areas.
Moreover, the media professionals stated that efforts to engage the audiences are said to be limited because, as a government department, Btv must follow government rules and, according to the interviewees, the rules relating to transport and payments are particularly difficult. Interviewees #1, #2, and #26 explained that government regulations did not allow them to transport participants for their shows in government vehicles, even if the participants needed assistance with transport because of their socio-economic status or the costs of travelling long distances to the capital, where the studio is located. As such, media producers often engage participants who can afford to travel to the station. Concerning payments, government revenue rules prevent program producers from paying guests to appear in their shows, or covering participants’ expenses. Television is, therefore, mostly accessible to those within the capital or those who can afford to travel to it. Furthermore, the media executives admitted that they do not have audience surveys or data to understand their audience’s local content needs, but base their programming decisions on their professional understanding of television scheduling, focusing principally on genres. In all, the finding on varying concerns about limited audience participation on Btv programming can be explained by the ownership structure of Btv. The denial by media professionals with executive roles about audience participation could be explained by the fact that as civil servants, these officials are accountable to the government. Hence they would be less concerned if ordinary citizens have limited opportunities to participate in program making. The media professionals engaged in actual program production as front line service providers would thus be concerned about their consumers, in this instance the audiences. Another possible explanation for the varying perceptions among these professionals is that media executives are most likely to be political appointments. The executives may bare allegiance to their employer. Thus the varying concern about opportunities for audience participation in content production is an issue relating to the political economy of the media, specifically ownership structure of Btv. This lack of participation by audiences has theoretical implications that relate to the critique of the use of mass media within the modernisation paradigm.

5.4.6 Summary of interview findings
The findings of this chapter have provided data that relate to the first two research questions of this study: the role of Btv in national development and the factors shaping the national broadcaster. To understand the role of television in Botswana, it was also essential to explore the reasons for introducing a national television service in light of the fact that the country did
not have such a service until 2000. The reasons for its launch relate to the geo-political situation of Botswana, among other factors. Prior to the launch of Btv, the findings of this research suggest that the pressure from the foreign channels that are available in Botswana increased the demands and justifications for a service that would meet this need. Efforts by the commercial sector, for example through the closed circuit television in the Botswana’s mining towns, suggest that such a service was necessary. Moreover, there is evidence from the findings to suggest that television was needed to reflect the various people and locations of Botswana in view of its cultural diversity, even among the Tswana groups. In view of the key reasons that were advanced for a national television service, in the next section, the audiences’ perceptions regarding the performance of Btv are explored to analyse the extent to which it serves the needs of the public in Botswana.

Regarding the role of television in national development, the findings from the interview data reveal that the role of Btv relating to education, general information, and the dissemination of government information is consistent with the role ascribed to Botswana’s state media as demonstrated in documents analysis findings. However, the interviewees’ views about Btv’s role of reflecting Botswana or its culture were similar to those of the media professionals, as shown in the document analysis finding. Regarding the least frequently mentioned roles of Btv, the data shows that Btv was ascribed a public affairs programs mandate because its focus was news and current affairs. In addition, the television station was assigned a marketing role as an advertising outlet, as well as the marketer of Botswana globally.

In terms of the factors influencing the performance of Btv, the data from the interviews revealed that political factors, mostly the state’s control of Btv and censorship by both media professionals and politicians, affect the credibility of the information originating from Btv. Most significantly, the interviewees’ perceptions regarding state control vary, with some interviewees, such as media policy makers who have political portfolios, endorsing state control. This finding is significant because it also related to the finding concerning the view of media professionals and media activists who were interviewed in this study that Btv should be transformed into a public service broadcaster. As such, issues concerning state control and reforms of Btv are central to this thesis because, as this researcher discusses in the next chapter, the ownership and state control of Btv are policy issues that should be addressed to improve the performance of Btv. As with the media in developing countries, state-media relations are a dominant theme in the role of the media in development.
Generally, interviewees corroborated the findings of the schedule analysis about limited content on Btv. The interviewees largely blamed financial constraints, political influence, and unrealistic program procurement regulations, as well as their own professional constraints, for the insufficient local content. In the next section, focus group discussions findings are presented.

5.5 Focus Group Discussions

5.5.1 Introduction
The previous three sections in which the findings were presented included a focus on the origins of Btv, its stated roles in various documents, its programming output, and the factors influencing its performance. In this section, the key findings that are presented are a continuation of the analysis of Btv’s performance, and include a focus on Btv’s audiences’ perceptions about the role and on the relevance of Btv to evaluate the channel’s performance. The findings are generated from the discussions with seven focus groups comprising a total of 59 participants with various demographic characteristics, as elaborated earlier in the methodology chapter (Section 4.3.5). The findings emerging from the focus group discussions are presented according to four broad themes. The first theme includes the participants’ understanding of the origins of Btv, (Section 5.5.2). The second theme concerns their preferred television channels and programs (Section 5.5.3). The third theme comprises their perceptions of Btv (Section 5.5.4). The fourth theme (Section 5.5.5), consist of the focus group participants’ suggestions on how Btv could be improved. Lastly, the section concludes with a summary of the focus group discussions’ findings in Section 5.5.6.

5.5.2 Audiences’ understanding of the reasons for the establishment of a national television service in Botswana
The most frequently mentioned reason for the establishment of a national television service, as stated by focus group discussants, is that television had a strong visual impact, and that television was necessary to reflect the various cultures in Botswana. Focus group discussants strongly emphasised that television was important because it could provide visuals that might enhance their understanding of various issues. The excerpts below exemplify the other reasons for the establishment of a national television service:
It was necessary to show us Setswana culture, so that we understand other cultures. (Male, urban group)
It was necessary for our democracy, to show that Botswana is independent. (Male, semi-urban group)
It was necessary for its entertainment value. (Female, urban group)
Television was introduced late in Botswana. It was necessary to build this nation. It could have helped through showing other cultures in Botswana. (Male, rural group)

Thus, the need for television was based on the anticipation that it would reflect the various cultures in Botswana and build the nation. Thus focus group discussants understanding of the need for a national television service is consistent with the views of the interviewees in this study regarding the introduction of television for social and political reasons. Nonetheless, when asked for their views on whether Btv has met their expectations regarding its original goals, the participants used a common Setswana phrase, ‘e a leka’ (meaning, “it is trying”), to evaluate the channel. However, the tone that was used varied when expressing this phrase. Rurally based groups were affirmative and positive about the efforts of the national channel in their statements, as these quotations demonstrate:

*I can see we have various programs, catering for various demographics; like (for) youth they have Silent Shout32, there is Talk Back33 for teachers and students, there is Molemo wa Kgang34 for everybody, and the political one [Matlho-a-phage35], that discusses the government’s concerns about improving [the] lives of Batswana. Although there is room for improvement, in the end, e a leka [it is trying]. (Male, rural group)*

*I want to say that Batswana are shown various programs like Sedibeng,36 Molemo wa Kgang, Batho Pele, all broadcast in our language Setswana, e a leka [it is trying]. (Male, rural group)*

Notwithstanding the complaints that the participants made about the channel (as this researcher shows below), these comments indicated a level of contentment with Btv’s content based on some programs broadcast on the channel. Conceivably these audiences are of the view that these programs resonate with their expectations on what a national television in Botswana was established to do. Similarly, a semi-urban ethnic minority-group in the northern part of the country was also affirmative about the broadcaster’s performance.

Conversely, the elderly participants in a capital-based urban group also stated that Btv “is trying,” but they were not as affirmative as the rurally based groups. On the contrary, the

---

32 Young people’s program on Btv.
33 Health program for schools.
34 Talk show addressing social issues.
35 Studio-based political discussion.
36 Magazine program profiling people and places in Botswana.
group of urban young people expressed an extremely different perception of Btv. These participants were quite dismissive of Btv and did not use “it is trying,” as illustrated in the following conversation, which occurred during the urban young people focus group discussion:

**All participants:** It’s going down (everyone saying it at once: group bursts into laughter).
**Researcher:** Was it any good or was that because of the enthusiasm for a new product?
**Male 1:** That time it was improving from the CD\(^ {37} \)
**Female 1:** Yeah, that was like hypnosis, you will watch and wait for the national anthem. (Group laughs).
**Male 2:** … they should have boosted the enthusiasm, rather than let it decline. People were excited, and were hoping it will keep improving.
**Researcher:** Why is its popularity declining?
**Female 3:** They do not cater for other people.
**Male 2:** They should give people a chance to express their ideas.
**Male 1:** And unqualified people at work… how do you expect them to perform when they are not qualified?

The above discussion indicates that the overall perceptions of Btv’s performance by this group of young people was based on a comparison between what Btv offered during its formative years and what it currently offers to viewers. Seven elderly participants, as reflected in the examples below, also shared the view that Btv’s performance is deteriorating. For example they stated that:

Btv is very disappointing. They started very well, and they lost direction. Yes, we can see various programs that are useful and address some issues relating to our daily lives, but Btv has lost direction. (Male, semi-urban group)

Oh yes, my pension goes into a Dstv subscription. And at times one of my children will feel pity and pay the subscription for me. I rarely watch Btv, to watch *The Eye*, even though they [politicians] are also hijacking it… We had hope when television started, but it’s all gone; they are doing what they have done with radio. It’s a miracle, but some of us, we ignore this and watch other channels. (Female, urban group)

I can see that Btv has changed; it appears they are being censored a lot. When they started, we could see pictures of houses of squatters being demolished. Nowadays, they just talk about demolitions without showing pictures. I think we should not be too censored and not be afraid that our nation can be divided; the growth of our nation should

\(^{37}\) Referring to a television test pattern that looked round like compact disc (CD) which would be on display when there is no transmission.
also be reflected in a diversity of views, but [we will] still remain united. (Female, urban group)

These statements are an indication of the perception that negative changes have taken place at Btv. The perception that Btv has lost direction indicates that, at an earlier stage, there was the view that Btv was on track. It must be noted that the respondents’ perceptions about Btv may be influenced by the location and worldview of the participants. For instance, the respondents from rural groups strongly affirmed the performance of Btv, compared to semi-urban ones, and urban based respondents who were more critical. The rural based participants tend to be less critical of the government, while urban-based ones have higher expectation on the government and are thus very critical. This could also be explained by the varying worldviews of the participants. Rural participants may be appreciative of having a national television service, while semi-urban and urban- based ones who have more media exposure may be very critical of the service.

Focus group participants gave examples that they were beginning to observe overt censorship at Btv. Thirteen participants expressed disappointment with the coverage of national issues, citing three examples, namely, the split in the ruling party, the health of the Vice-President, and the national strike. These issues were current and topical at the time of data collection. The health of the Vice-President was topical in both 2011 and 2012, and he ultimately retired in July 2012 because of ill health (Modikwa, 2012). The split of the BDP was also topical. Although the actual split occurred in 2010, the issue was still topical a year later. The following examples reflect the participants’ concerns with the coverage of these national issues:

Sometimes the government media and private media can be contradicting each other. For example, the recent media reports about the health of the vice president. But in the end, it emerged that the private media was accurate; so it appears the government media is censored. (Male, rural group)

Btv started with full-force, we were very happy with it. But it keeps on disappointing us. The recent [public service] strike proved to me that the national channel might have been lying to us with its coverage. (Group laughs). (Female, urban group)

I think SABC is better, and it can be trusted. For example, the recent strike was much better reported on SABC, although it later on disappeared (laughs), so for me, I mainly watch SABC, and even when I watch Btv, it is only because it is our national channel; what can we do? (Male, semi-urban group)
Like during the [public service] strike, we saw miracles, and that was the time I opened my eyes and realised just how much has been concealed from us. (Female, semi-urban group)

The urban young people expressed similar sentiments in a group discussion:

**Female 1:** Did you see what happened during the [public service] strike? There was very little exposure.

**Male 2:** You are saying “little;” there was nothing at all (Laughs).

**Female 1:** People can fire Zuma\(^{38}\) with questions, we can’t even do that, in our country if you think about a high-ranking person, you think of Kalafatis.\(^{39}\) (Group laughs)

**Male 1:** In politics, they [Btv] do not like telling the truth, but Batswana like being told the truth. For example, during the split of the BDP, it was disappointing that there was nothing said about the BMD [Botswana Movement for Democracy], they were denied airtime and coverage.

The issues that participants referred to here are political. The Vice-President is obviously a political figure. The break-up of the ruling party, Botswana Democratic Party (BDP), was an historic political event in Botswana. It was the first time that the ruling BDP’s factional tensions escalated to the extent that they led to a party split. The offspring of the split is the Botswana Movement for Democracy (BMD), referred to above. The civil service strike, although a labour issue, was politicised. Opposition parties supported the workers’ demands for salary increases (Kayawe, 2011). The strike was arguably Botswana’s longest, biggest, and most bitter nation-wide industrial action. It involved over 90,000 civil servants belonging to various unions within the civil service (Mosikare, 2011). As reflected in the above excerpts, national political issues tested the credibility of Btv, and, in light of the above comments, the television channel failed that test. The challenge of Btv’s credibility in comparison to the SABC expressed by a male focus group participant above is similar to the observations made by scholars about the credibility of foreign channels, mostly the BBC in Africa. Scholars such as Temin (2003), Mytton (2000), and Wilkinson (1972) have noted African’s reliance on the BBC as a credible source of information in their countries where there is no alternative voice to the national broadcaster, or in countries with repressive regimes. Likewise, as an emerging African broadcaster, the SABC is viewed in the same light

---

\(^{38}\) South Africa President, Jacob Zuma.

\(^{39}\) Kalafatis is used metaphorically to express the perceived intolerance by the state in Botswana. (John) Kalafatis was a suspected criminal murdered by Botswana security agents in May 2009.
as a foreign channel that is more credible than local services especially on coverage of political and controversial issues. The limitation of credibility of Btv is a policy issue that needs to be addressed to enhance the performance of Btv.

5.5.3 Participants’ preferred television channels and programs

The findings that are reported here relate to the focus group participants’ preferred television channels and programs. The focus group participants’ responses were analysed according to various demographics: age; gender; place of residence; ethnicity; employment status; and educational status. However, the differences in the participants’ responses based on their demographics were insignificant, except for geographic location and age. Therefore, the findings that emerged from the focus groups, which are presented here, largely include demographic data relating to the participants’ place of residence. The urban young people are also used occasionally as a stand-alone group in instances where their comments differed significantly from the rest of the participants. The data on the television viewership are presented according to two sub-themes: preferred television channel and preferred programs.

5.5.3.1 Television channel preferences

Btv is the most popular television channel among focus group participants. Table 5-8 shows that Btv is preferred by nearly two-thirds of the participants (i.e., 37 out of 59 participants).

Table 5-8

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preferred Channel</th>
<th>Origin</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Btv</td>
<td>Local</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SABC</td>
<td>Foreign</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DStv</td>
<td>Foreign</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M-Net</td>
<td>Foreign</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emmanuel TV</td>
<td>Foreign</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>59</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s fieldwork notes.
Btv was the most preferred channel in four out of seven focus groups. These were the two rurally based groups, one semi-urban group that was based in the northern part of Botswana, and one urban group that was based outside the capital of Botswana. Btv’s popularity among the viewers was anticipated given that it is a monopoly national broadcaster that has only one channel, and that local commercial television is weak as demonstrated in Chapter 1.

The South African public service broadcaster, SABC, was the second most preferred channel, according to the participants. Overall, close to a third of the participants expressed a preference for the SABC, as shown in Table 5-8. SABC was considerably popular among the members of two focus groups: a semi-urban group that was based in the southern part of the country and an urban group that was based in the capital city. At the time of data collection for this study, in 2011 and 2012, SABC was available on free to air decoders. Its competitor, e.tv launched a court case in South Africa in 2011 to request encryption of the SABC’s signals because these signals were pirated in Botswana and, thus, compromised the viewership of eBotswana and, consequently, its revenues. In 2013, because of a court ruling, the signals were encrypted in Botswana, and possibly in other countries in the southern African region that have been receiving the pirated signal.

Other preferred channels by focus group participants are Dstv, M-Net, and Emmanuel TV, albeit these were mentioned infrequently, as Table 5-8 shows. Dstv and M-Net are all South African-owned pay television channels that are available through satellite. Emmanuel TV is a free-to-air Nigerian-based Christian channel that is owned by the Synagogue Church of All Nations (SCOAN). Both SABC and Emmanuel TV are available through free-to-air decoders, commonly known as philibao.

The preference of foreign television channels gives insights into the possible choices that are available to Botswana television audiences either free to air or on subscription. Some of these channels, SABC and Emmanuel TV, are free-to-air, whereas others—Dstv and M-Net—are accessible through subscription. Dstv offers its programs in various bouquets, with prices ranging from USD8 to USD68 equivalent per month. Given the economic challenges in Botswana, such as poverty levels of 20.7% of the population and an unemployment rate of 17.8% (Statistics Botswana, 2011), it is likely the participants might prioritise spending money on acquiring basic needs rather than on a television subscription. The socio-economically disadvantaged in Botswana are given a social welfare allowance of nearly USD12 per month by the government (Matambo, 2013). This makes it challenging for the
poor to afford television subscriptions. In this context, the multichannel pay television Dstv might be less popular than other foreign channels because of the associated economic burden of purchasing the decoder and paying the monthly subscription fees to access the service. The prevalence of foreign content reflects the globalisation wave within which the media generally operate. Most significantly, using the hindsight, which was gained from the interview data, that Btv was introduced to counter the dominance of foreign content (Section 5.4.2.1), the prevalence of foreign channels suggests that the pervasiveness of foreign content in a globalising media environment is one of the challenges that national broadcasters such as Btv must contend with. However, in Chapter 6, this researcher discusses the implications of the foreign channels in the Botswana context regarding its influence in pressuring the Botswana government to launch a national service.

Surprisingly, none of the participants mentioned Botswana’s commercial television channel, eBotswana, as their favourite channel. eBotswana is received only within the capital city, Gaborone, and neighbouring areas. The unpopularity of eBotswana raises questions about the success of commercial television in Botswana. Similarly, a commercial South African channel, e.tv, which is under the same ownership of eBotswana, was not mentioned by any participant as a preferred channel. Unlike SABC, e.tv’s signal in Botswana is encrypted, rendering the channel unavailable on the free-to-air decoder, philibao. The television channel e.tv is only accessible by subscribing to the multichannel pay television, Dstv. The lack of popularity of eBotswana could be traced to the nature of content offered by its South African based counterpart e.tv, as well as the historical context of Botswana and South Africa. Regarding the content offered by e.tv, Froneman (2008) has observed that the service has more foreign programs and entertainment programs. Most crucially, e.tv as a Cape Town based broadcaster is said to have more Cape Town flavour. Its content targets mixed race audiences (Froneman, 2008). Therefore, when such content is rebroadcast to Batswana through eBotswana, it may be unpopular due to Batswana’s salient resentment of connotations of apartheid. As discussed in Section 1.5.3, Botswana has always resisted apartheid ideologies of South Africa (Spence, 1964). Consequently, any institution that may be perceived to be operating along racial divides could be shunned in Botswana. Probably, the lack of popularity of eBotswana based on its content offering could suggest that Botswana needs a commercial service that has a Botswana character in terms of ideologies promoted by such a service.
Another possible explanation for the lack of popularity of a commercial service in Botswana could be that eBotswana is a capital city based broadcaster without national audience reach. By rebroadcasting etv content in Gaborone, eBotswana may be perceived as a South African channel on an experimental mission. Hence eBotswana may be considered lightly by the viewers, advertisers, or even news sources in Botswana. Moreover, the licensing of eBotswana as a town based broadcaster, while not the focus of this thesis, is a significant finding in that such a decision could imply that there are efforts in Botswana to curtail the rural populations’ exposure to diverse views. This is a founded explanation in that in other parts of Africa, for instance Kenya, allocation of frequencies for commercial broadcasting was used to ensure rural populations, who were strongholds of the ruling party, do not have access to commercial media which offered critical views about the government (Mukhongo, 2010; Wanyama, 2000). Although eBotswana is not a potential threat to this effect since its content is mostly South Africa, its licensing restriction possibly limits the extent to which the service can prioritise local content production. With limited local content on eBotswana, Btv remains the dominant broadcaster, hence limited diverse views in Botswana due to a weak commercial service.

5.5.3.2 Preferred television programs

Table 5-9 shows the diversity of program choices among the focus group participants. For clarity, their preferred programs are categorised according to genre. It is apparent from Table 5-8 (in the following page) that the most frequently mentioned program genres are news and current affairs and government television programs. Within these genres, the most frequently mentioned programs are news/Dikgang and Itshireletse.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Genre</th>
<th>Most mentioned</th>
<th>Number of times mentioned</th>
<th>Least frequently mentioned</th>
<th>Total frequency per genre</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>News and Current Affairs</td>
<td>News/Dikgang</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>The Eye</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Eye</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Weather</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Morning Show</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Matho-a-phage</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Mokaragana</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>My Star</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dikhwaere</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Flava Dome</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Melodi-ya-Kgalaletso</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sport</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Tshamekang</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government Programming</td>
<td>Itshireletse</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tsa Temo-thuo</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Batho Pele</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tsa Botsogo</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Cartoons</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Sedibeng</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talk Show</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Molemo wa Kgang</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drama</td>
<td>The Secret Garden</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s fieldwork.
As Table 5-9 shows, the government programs were the most popular programs that were identified in this study. A total of 45 of the 59 participants preferred them. Specifically, compared to other programs, the police docu-drama, Itshireletse, is the most popular program among the focus group participants. Itshireletse is a crime-prevention educational drama series that is broadcast weekly on Btv. The most commonly cited reason for the participants’ choice of this program is its educational and informational value, as the quotations below illustrate:

With me [I like] the police program, I think it is educational. (Male, semi-urban group)

But for others [other programs] like Itshireletse they educate us about modern criminal tactics. (Female, rural group)

And (from) the police program, I can get information. (Young person, urban group)

Of course, government programs, although they are boring, they really educate our people in the villages. (Female, urban group)

These comments indicate that participants preferred Itshireletse because form it they could acquire knowledge about crime-prevention. It could, therefore, be defined as “edutainment”, that is, a program in which education and entertainment are integrated to disseminate information that is aimed at social change (Servaes, 2007). The program’s content addresses one of the central social challenges facing Botswana: crime. Moreover, fighting crime is essential to achieving the national development objective of a “safe and secure nation,” as articulated in one of Botswana’s development strategy documents, Vision 2016.

The other reason given by focus group participants for the popularity of Itshireletse is that this drama puts on display promising acting talent among the Batswana. The following statements illuminate this observation:

I am a loyal Btv viewer. The police program is a reflection of Motswana’s (acting) skills, potential, and ability. (Female, semi-urban group)

I think it will also encourage young people to become actors on television programs. (Female, semi-urban group)

_Itshireletse_ has probably set a national precedent for acting in television dramas. The actors in the program were awarded the Presidential Honour for Meritorious Service in 2012, in recognition of their contribution to the community (Regonamanye, 2012). Urban participants attributed their choice of _Itshireletse_ to the high quality production of the program. For example, an urban-based, employed female participant, aged 35 years, stated “the police program is so good, if we had similar programs, the same quality, we would be happy with our television, and we could be saying; yes, we have television.” As the most popular genre on Btv, some of these “public relations” programs by government departments set a new standard and a taste for local programming among viewers. Indeed, participants used these programs as a standard for comparing the performance of local programs on Btv.

One urban-based, self-employed male participant with secondary education, who said that he prefers SABC over Btv, mentioned that he liked this police program because of its independence from political influence. Comparing _Itshireletse_ with other Btv programs, he stated the following:

Other programs could be good, for example _Tsa Temo-thuo_, because the interviewees are farmers, and the police program is good, too. But other programs you can tell that no, no, no… for example [the] poverty-eradication program, you can just tell that this is [a] political campaign, but in _Itshireletse_, there is no room for political games. (Male, urban group)

This indicates that perceptions of editorial independence might influence the participants’ program choices. The comment above suggests that some participants might have preferred programs that use ordinary citizens as their principal sources of information, as is the case in _Itshireletse_. Although the actors are real police officers, in this drama series, their roles are those of ordinary citizens; hence, they are perceived as “ordinary” citizens involved in criminal activities, either as victims or as perpetrators.

However, participants also expressed cautionary sentiments about _Itshireletse_. Three participants, in semi-urban and rurally based focus groups, contend that television could also teach undesirable behaviours. For example, they stated the following:

I think it [_Itshireletse_] can also teach children how to engage in criminal activity. (Male, semi-urban group)
I think they [Itshireletse] are giving people ideas and skills of how to engage in criminal activity. (Female, rural group)

I am complaining about the police program in that, although it is a noble program, it may be unintentionally teaching criminals more tactics. Even young people, they play and try to use dangerous objects that they saw on television as demonstrated in the police drama, so that is my reservation with the program… (laughs), although I like it. (Female, semi-urban group)

*Itshireletse* does not display a disclaimer to warn viewers against replicating the acts shown on television. In the absence of this, and in the Botswana context, where television is relatively new, negative influences from media are likely to concern viewers.

As reflected in Table 5-9 above, approximately one third of the participants mentioned Ministry of Agriculture documentary, *Tsa Temo-thuo*, a Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development (MLGRD) program, *Batho Pele*, and a Ministry of Health program, *Tsa Botsogo*, as their preferred Btv programs. *Tsa Temo-thuo* is preferred by just over one quarter of the participants, despite Botswana being an agriculturally based society. *Tsa Temo-thuo* is a documentary that is aimed at visually simplifying complex or technical information in relation to the commercialisation of agriculture, as well as disseminating information about government agricultural policies and the operations of the Ministry of Agriculture. The participants recognised *Tsa Temo-thuo*’s educational value, as did those watching *Itshireletse*. The rest of the government programs could be less popular largely because of their production styles. Explaining why two of the government programs, *Itshireletse*, and *Tsa Temo-thuo*, are popular, whereas the other two, *Tsa Botsogo* and *Batho Pele*, are unpopular is difficult. Nonetheless, the popularity of these programs whose themes relate to national development priorities in Botswana such as agriculture and crime prevention, suggests that some Btv’s government programs are relevant to national development objectives of the country. Moreover, although these programs were consistent with the role of the media in providing extension services to other government departments as one of the roles of government owned media (see Section 5.2.1.2), the views among interviewees and focus group participants diverged: the latter describe the programs as propaganda, whereas the former found them useful. This divergence of views regarding propaganda on Btv is discussed further in the next chapter.

*Dikgang* (News) is the most popular program among rural and semi-urban audiences, whereas only one-quarter of urban-based audiences mentioned *Dikgang* as a preferred program. Of the 27 participants who mentioned news as their preferred program, 13
participants attributed their knowledge of current events to Dikgang. Participants in rural focus groups expressed delight at how television’s visual impact could improve their understanding and knowledge of current issues. Indeed, participants displayed knowledge of current affairs by frequently giving the example of Gadhafi’s death, which was topical at the time of the data collection in 2011. Other examples were regular references to the Somali famine and the Botswana civil service strike.

A divergent finding in program choices is indicated by the dominance of foreign programs, such as a Korean drama, The Secret Garden, which is broadcast in Korean with English sub-titles. Compared to other programs on Btv, this program was the third most frequently mentioned preferred program after Dikgang and Itsireletse, as reflected in Table 5-9. Although most participants in various focus groups protested against the dominance of foreign content on Btv, The Secret Garden is, arguably, the exception. This drama series is popular among females, and both rurally and urban-based participants. The popularity of The Secret Garden could be credited to its entertainment value. When asked why they liked this program, the participants alluded to its “romantic nature”; yet, the participants complained about similar American series, such as The Bold and The Beautiful. One middle-aged, semi-urban-based female participant stated the following: “there is really no kissing on that program [The Secret Garden]; you feel comfortable watching it as a whole family.” The participants “comfort” levels could be due to the romantic relationship-based drama having limited graphic love and affection scenes. As television viewing remains a family affair, public display of affection on television could thus be an issue of concern among Batswana. In Setswana culture and African culture in general, adults are uncomfortable to such displays of public affection. Affectionate gestures such as deep kissing are considered private matters that are indecent when displayed in public. However, this does not suggest that there are no liberal views about this, as younger generations in Botswana are more accommodative of this behaviour than the more conservative older generations. In Botswana, as this country faces the challenge of HIV AIDS as discussed in Chapter 1, television has been used to educate the public about this epidemic. But portrayal of public display of affection as well as graphic display of sex related content is discouraged on the channel, mostly for cultural reasons. Indeed broadcasters in Botswana as elsewhere, have to consider cultural issues in their program production and scheduling.
5.5.4 Focus groups discussants perceptions of Btv

The audiences’ perceptions of Btv have been divided into three sub-themes: reasons for watching Btv, reasons for watching foreign programs, and expectations of Btv. These are explained further in the following sub-sections.

5.5.4.1 Reasons for watching Btv

Focus group participants cited various reasons for preferring Btv. The most common reasons were expressed in phrases such as “it is ours”; “it teaches”; and “it entertains.” A few participants used phrases such as “it motivates us,” “it reinforces peace and social harmony,” and it “represents our culture.” The reasons for preferring national television are similar to observations by other scholars that national television is preferred because of its educational, informational, and entertainment values (Bourault, 1995; Holtz-Batch & Norris, 2001; Eko, 2003), its role in motivating viewers (Schramm, 1964; Singhal and Rogers, 2001), and its ability to reflect local cultures (Banerjee, 2002; Straubhaar, 2006). These reasons are elaborated in the following paragraphs.

“It is ours”

Over half of the participants who mentioned Btv as their preferred channel indicated that they watched Btv because of a sense of “ownership” of the service. This concept was expressed in the local Setswana phrase, “ke ya rona,” meaning, “it is ours.” These are examples of some of the participants’ statements in this regard:

Really, as a Motswana, I am a Btv loyal. Btv is ours. (Female, urban group)

As for me, as a Motswana, I am a Btv loyal. It is our television, although I sometimes watch SABC, but the main channel I like is Btv. (Male, semi-urban group)

What can we do, madam? It is ours. (Female, urban group)

For me, really, when I watch Btv, it’s only because it is our local channel, so what can we do? (Laughs). (Male, semi-urban group)

The excerpts also reflect various levels of satisfaction with Btv. The first two comments reflect a high level of contentment with the service. Conversely, the last two comments reflect frustration and despair. Ultimately, this finding demonstrates that the participants who are satisfied and those who are frustrated with the Btv still prefer Btv over other channels because it is seen as their channel. Nonetheless, the use of a national
identifier, “Motswana,” in the comments that were expressed by some of the focus group participants is a partisan expression, suggesting that the participants might be driven by patriotic fervour to watch the television channel. For example, some stated the following:

As for me, I remain loyal to my home country. South Africa has long boasted about their television; now we have ours. (Female, semi-urban group)

As for me, madam, I am a Btv loyalist [singing the Btv logo song]; we have long watched South African television; we are tired. They should also now see we are a nation too. (Male, semi-urban group)

My view is that we should really improve our television, because we really would like to watch it, rather than SABC, so although we watch it [Btv] rather than SABC, we know SABC has better quality than Btv. (Female, rural group)

I really watch it (Btv), I know it can be annoying at times, but all the same, I still prefer to watch it rather than SABC; we have long watched foreign channels. (Male, semi-urban group)

Indeed, these focus group participants believe that television has a symbolic meaning. They perceive Btv as a symbol of national sovereignty. They also see television as a way of expressing media independence from the regional powerhouse, South Africa. Most of the participants who said that they watch Btv because “it is ours” were principally older participants. These participants, who might be described as belonging to the “independence generation” (i.e., those born before and around 1966—Botswana’s independence period), might express a strong sense of nationhood and anti-SABC sentiments that are consistent with their historical experiences of Botswana’s potential incorporation into South Africa during colonial times, as described in Chapter 1 (Section 1.5.3).

“It teaches us”

A reason that the focus group participants gave frequently for watching Btv was that its programs had educational and informational value. The following excerpts illustrate this:

We know so many things; we have seen them on television. Especially wild animals; if it was not for television, maybe, when we see a lion, we could be wondering how a dog could be that big? So, it teaches us. (Male, semi-urban group)

Yes, It (Btv) shows us many things. It also teaches us (Female, semi-urban group)

It (Btv) teaches us, we see what is happening in other parts of the world. (Male, semi-urban group)
The emphasis that television “teaches” and “shows” is also a reflection of the participants’ previous media exposure. Their emphasis on how visuals on television enhances their understanding of issues, corroborates views expressed by the interviewees about the need to establish a national television in Botswana to address limitations of existing communication channels such as the kgotla and radio. Despite being established over a decade ago, television is still considered a novelty in Botswana. Radio has been the dominant mass medium (Zaffiro, 2000); therefore, the focus group participants said they have largely been relying on radio, and had to visualise the objects described.

“It entertains us”

As anticipated, the entertainment value of television was mostly mentioned as one of the reasons why some participants watched television. Most of the participants who said they watched television for entertainment also mentioned specifically that they watched television for leisure, although most complained that entertainment programs on Btv were limited. A Setswana phrase, “go intsha bodutu” (recreation), was commonly used to explain why participants watched certain channels and programs. Some participants said that, sometimes, they watched television when they were idle and bored, or watched it for relaxation. The following statements of the focus group participants illustrate this finding:

Like, if you are not busy, you can watch and keep yourself busy [o itlosa bodutu ’], and it can help you not to spend your time worrying. (Female, rural group)

For us retired people, unlike you young people, we have plenty of time in our hands, and very little activities to engage in. So, television is our companion [‘e re ntsha bodutu]. (Female, semi-urban group)

Television really is for entertainment [go intsha bodutu]. And at times you can also get some skills. (Female, urban group)

I mainly watch for recreation [go intsha bodutu]. Just to keep myself busy. (Female, semi-urban group)

The comments above reveal the media use patterns of some focus group participants, particularly those of the elderly participants: television was used to pass time, especially in the absence of any productive activity. The first among the comments that were listed above demonstrates instances where television was used as a distraction; in this case, it was distraction from worrying. In a few instances, television was used as a replacement of some
of the Setswana practices that are also recreational, but that are disappearing, as the following statements illustrate:

I really like most of the local programs, and I watch some of the programs to relax [go intsha bodutu]. What can we do with our spare time? We now longer make clay houses, and they would be keeping us busy in summer. (Female, semi-urban group)

In towns, we do not visit each other easily like in the village, where, when I am bored, I cannot visit my neighbour, so we end up with television as our alternative friend, to entertain us and be our companion [e re ntsha bodutu]. (Female, semi-urban group)

The above excerpts illustrate the socio-cultural changes occurring in Botswana, and how television is situated in this transformation. The focus groups were conducted during summer in Botswana. Traditionally, the Batswana lifestyle involved a tripartite rotational and seasonal migration from three homesteads throughout the year. These homesteads are the cattle post (moraka), the lands (masimo) and the village (legae). Due to urbanisation, some people have dwellings in the cities as their third homestead, or a more common practice it so have an urban dwelling as a fourth homestead. During summer, traditionally, community members return to the village where they engage in activities such as home renovation that involve the use of clay or mud. However, with modernisation, the yearly renovation of mud houses is waning as more houses are constructed with conventional cement and bricks. Because traditional activities in the summer are limited, some villagers might have spare time, hence their view that they might be idle. Similarly, the traditional Setswana practice of spending spare time with neighbours is also waning. Remaining indoors in one’s homestead is considered a sign of affluence, as the preceding excerpts illustrated. As such, television viewing is used to fill the void that is created by the disappearance of traditional practices that either kept participants busy or enhanced social interaction.

In contrast, the urban young people who participated in this study contended that they did not watch Btv because its entertainment programs were unappealing. This, they said, drove them to watch programs on other channels. An older female viewer, who said the following, corroborated this: “[o]ur children really like SABC. So we sometimes find ourselves having to watch with them, when they are watching their programs.” Foreign channels offer alternative programming; however, this participant’s comment reveals that watching foreign channels is a challenge for some families because most of them still have one television set. A participant in a semi-urban area illustrated the dynamics of viewership at home:
I really like Btv, like others have just stated, I really like it... even my children know that when I come home and find them watching other channels, I complain about what they are watching. I know they like foreign channels, but I have set a rule that at 7 o’clock it is my time for television. (Male, semi-urban group)

The participant was referring to being given an opportunity to watch Dikgang (News) at 7 p.m. on Btv. The preceding statement offers an insight into the negotiations occurring at the family level to accommodate the various media consumption needs of various family members. Moreover, the finding also provides insight into the negotiations that go on in households’ regarding television watching in light of the patriarchal societal set-up of many African societies. Customarily in African societies, the man is the head of the household and amasses decision-making powers (Kiriti & Tisdell, 2003; Kiriti, Tisdell, & Roy, 2003). Moreover, the Setswana culture emphasises respect for elders. It is thus likely that within the negotiations on television viewing options, the male or the father as is the case in the above excerpt may overrule everybody in the family and decide on a program that the family can watch. Thus while programs may be targeting children, youth and women, the decision to watch television may also lie with the father or an elder male in the household.

A male farmer with a lower educational status, who was a participant in an urban focus group, expressed the opposite view. He was concerned about the excessive use of television for entertainment, arguing that “television should not be overly dominated by entertainment programing; rather, we need informational and educational programming as a developing country. We should be able to learn from other countries.” In view of contentions about the trajectories of television, entertainment, and national development, as highlighted in the literature review, this researcher discusses further the role of television in entrainment and in Botswana’s national development in the next chapter in relation to the implications of leveraging entertainment to transmit development-related messages.

Concerning the least frequently mentioned reasons for watching Btv, the focus group discussants mentioned reasons such as television’s motivational value, televisions’ ability to reinforce peace and social harmony, and the use of television to show national culture. These are elaborated below.

Motivational value
Some participants stated that television viewing helped them to become motivated. Often, the participants said, they watched because they could obtain encouragement from seeing successful people on television. In this regard, they stated the following:
These programs are important, for example My Star, and My African Dream, it motivates others; after seeing their colleagues on television, they also want to be on television, and, as such, they work hard and improve their skills. (Female, rural group)

It (Btv) helps because it can encourage you, too; when you watch, you can get encouraged that... yes... you can, and then you also get the courage to try your luck, and I will end up in a better state. (Female, rural group)

Yes, it (Tsa Temo-thuo) can really entice you, and you can spend sleepless nights thinking about how to achieve the same success and eventually improve your life. When you see these people on Sedibeng, it inspires you. That yes, you can also do it. (Female, semi-urban group)

The above excerpts suggest that television programs are seen as mirrors through which viewers perceive model behaviours and characteristics. The participants claimed that the successes of others inspired them to change their own behaviour and adopt different approaches to life. However, most focus group participants complained about limited number of Btv programs that presented successful people to emulate, other than the music programs that are used to promote local talent by showing successful artists who could inspire inexperienced musicians.

Peace and social harmony (kagisano)

The focus group participants, mostly the elderly in rural groups, the non-capital-based urban group, and the northern-based semi-urban group emphasised how television programs could reinforce peace and social harmony in Botswana. They singled out news and current affairs programs, particularly the section on international news, which provides reports on political conflicts and national security-related issues elsewhere in the world. Participants said that news stories covering instability in other parts of the world make them aware of the possible consequences of living in an unstable democratic society. For example:

I do not heavily watch television. But I like Btv because it shows us the challenges faced by other countries, which (events) can also befall our country. (Male, rural group)

It [Btv] can also show you what is happening in other parts of the world, for example, Somalia, and that really makes us think twice about peace and food, and we always pray and do not want to do anything that will make that situation come to Botswana. (Male, urban group)

---

41 A Btv magazine program which profiles successful personalities and places in Botswana
We see what is happening in other countries. Those happenings teach us about the need for social harmony, so that we remain living in peace. (Female, semi-urban group)

These comments might have been made in light of the core values of harmonious coexistence in Botswana; as social harmony, *kagisano* is one of the national guiding principles. In general, the perception among participants who mentioned this view is that the performance of Btv programming was reasonably favourable in enhancing social harmony.

“Ngwao” (Culture)

Less than a fifth of the participants from all the focus groups mentioned that they watched Btv because it gave them the opportunity to see their own culture or “ngwao” displayed. Participants were of the view that Btv programs, such as *Sedibeng* and traditional music programs (*dikhwaere*42) reflected national culture. Culture, in this context, was explained along the traditional practices of Botswana; for example, planting using cattle to pull the plough was a common cultural scene that the older audiences preferred to watch on television. Yet the younger focus group participants’ view of culture was the opposite: they preferred modern practices such as urban lifestyles. Extremely strong views were expressed during the focus group discussions about the insufficiency of the cultural content on Btv. However, the urban young people’s group expressed discontentment with Btv programming’s preponderance of culturally oriented themes, whereas the participants who preferred culturally oriented programming complained about paucity of cultural programs on Btv. The variance in the participants’ expressions of their interest in cultural programs reflected their contrasting expectations of the national broadcaster. Nonetheless, culturally related content is discussed in the next chapter because culture is central to the critiques of modernisation theory, specifically for the critical development communication scholars and the alternative paradigms of development.

5.5.4.2 Reasons for watching foreign programs

Nearly half of the focus group participants said that they preferred soap operas on foreign channels. The SABC’s soap operas, *Generations* on SABC 1 and *Muvhango* on SABC 2, were frequently mentioned as favourite programs. Most female participants across all focus

---

42 Traditional choir music
groups expressed a preference for soap operas. The dominant reason for this preference is that they are a relaxing, as well as entertaining. The other reason is that these soap operas use languages that are generally familiar to the Batswana. A few elderly participants said that they learned about South African cultures from these programs. The young people said that they watched these soap operas for their production quality and contended that the level of skills demonstrated in South African soap operas was enviable. For instance, they mentioned issues such as presentation styles, excellent studio sets, and captivating story lines as some of the aesthetic qualities of some foreign programs. The popularity of foreign programs is central to this thesis. As the review of the literature and the discussion of the theoretical framework revealed, the globalisation and media imperialism arguments that were based on the flows of media content have been used to challenge the modernisation approach to development. In the next chapter, the implication of foreign content in the context of television in Botswana is explored further, with a view to evaluate the validity of such arguments in specific national contexts such as Botswana.

5.5.4.3 Expectations for Btv

Whereas most focus group participants acknowledged that local content on Btv had increased, they also expressed frustration with a perceived absence of coverage of their community issues, which, they argued, limited the extent of their involvement with Btv’s television programs. Twenty-eight focus group participants expressed negative sentiments about Btv because the service ignored activities that were occurring in their localities or communities. Whereas they expressed contentment with the coverage of issues that were of national interest, such as national events, celebrations, and village tours by the President, they complained strongly about the coverage of issues that were specific to their villages. For example, Focus Group 1 mentioned the inauguration of their village chief as a newsworthy event that Btv ignored. Similarly, Focus Group 4 gave the example of the absence of coverage of a story concerning one of the biggest dams in their area. What follows is an example of the complaint that was expressed by semi-urban group participants;

Male 1: I complain that Btv does not cover out village, so that we can see ourselves. We only see same people from the South. It [Btv] should also visit our villages, so we can see our own children doing something in their village; we have artists like wood carvers. Television should come to Bokalaka,43 so we see our children and ourselves on television. We have our stadium; it is never shown on television.

---

43 Bokalaka is the region where the most of the ethnic minority, the Kalanga, mostly reside.
Researcher: Does that mean you absolutely never get coverage?

Male 1: They come, but very rarely.

Male 2: They come when there is a Minister.

Male 1: They never just come specifically to cover our own village activities. Sometimes they (Btv) tell us they are busy. Sometimes they are just not available.

In the same vein, an urban group in the south and a semi-urban group in the south complained that Btv largely ignores their activities such as kgotla meetings and political activities. This is despite their villages’ proximity to the service, which, they argue, should make travelling to their communities easier. The concern over the absence of coverage of community issues is a valid concern because villages or communities are a central social institution in Botswana. The Batswana express pride about the success of their villages; hence, the need to represent the villages on Btv, so that others can see the successes of their village. As indicated in the introductory chapter of this thesis, the elites in Botswana, who include chiefs, cattle barons, and bureaucrats, have connections with the villages. The village is where the cattle are located, and most social activities, such as wedding and funerals, take place. Whereas the need to cover all the villages is a reasonable one, it presents practical challenges in a vast country such as Botswana. Thus, the media policy should address the audiences’ needs of community-oriented content.

Having outlined the participants’ viewing patterns and their attitudes toward Btv, the next section presents the participants’ views on how Btv could be improved.

5.5.5 How Btv can be improved

Regarding the focus groups participants’ suggestions on how Btv could be improved, two broad sub-themes, the structure of Btv and the feedback mechanisms for the service, have been delineated. Regarding the structure of Btv, most rural and semi-urban participants said that they were content with the status quo of the ownership of Btv. For example, they stated the following:

I don’t have any problem with it [Btv] being government owned. (Female, rural group)
I can only say that I wish it can be run in a way that would be more beneficial to the public and it could be freer. (Male, rural group)

For me, if the government did not sideline other people from getting media coverage, I would say I am happy with a government owned channel. A commercial broadcaster is not good for us, if companies [private] own it, then it will be expensive for us. (Male, rural group)
I think our television, Btv, is ok where it is. If there is no state control, we might find ourselves in a situation similar to other countries where there is internal unrest. Also, the way television is structured now, allows it to inform us about various activities in our country. We sometimes see how the private media cover issues: we do not want to open the floodgates, there has to be some control. (Male, semi-urban group)

I feel it should remain under government ownership. The current government has done well for this country to date, understanding the needs of Motswana, so when they control it they know what they are doing. (Female, semi-urban group)

Indeed, although most endorsed state ownership, attitudes varied toward state control. Some participants displayed a carefree attitude (e.g., the first two comments above). The quoted statements of the participants who endorse state ownership are rooted in the national guiding principles of social harmony and unity, although indications exist that a diversity of views, is necessary as suggested in the first excerpt above. Contrariwise, urban-based groups articulated a different need: they wanted an SABC replica, or a “commercial” or “parastatal” national broadcaster. Parastatals in Botswana are corporations that are partly owned by the government, and are perceived to be independent of state control. As such, these are perceived as an ideal way of running a national channel. Participants said that they preferred the SABC model because they claimed that SABC could broadcast programs covering ordinary people and their struggles with life.

Urban-based residents with higher educational levels suggested that Btv could broadcast on two channels. They suggested that one channel could broadcast government programs and the other could broadcast programs that would appeal to the public. These participants held the view that Btv could cater for both government interests and those viewers who were less interested in government information programs. One participant gave the example of national radio, which has two channels: Radio Botswana 1 (RB1) and a commercial channel, Radio Botswana 2 (RB2), with the former mainly serving as a government and informational channel, while the latter serves commercial interests of the public as well as carrying limited government oriented programs. As the document analysis findings demonstrated, the option of Btv having two channels is currently being considered as a possible alternative manner for structuring Btv (Section 5.2.4). Indeed structures of media institutions are policy issues. In view of these suggestions and the data that emerged from other findings in this study, the structure of Btv is discussed further in the next chapter.

Next, all the focus group discussants expressed the need for Btv to provide them with an opportunity to give feedback to the media professionals as regard their views on the
performance of the channel. Participants said that they should be allowed access to Btv to provide input on the types of programs to be broadcasted and to give feedback on Btv’s current programs. For instance, they stated that programs such as talk shows could be used to increase Btv’s engagement with diverse audiences. Some participants expressed frustration that Btv did not listen to their complaints. A female participant with tertiary education in an urban-based, capital city group commented: “We need more entertainment programming. They [Btv] are not listening to our demands. There is a Facebook page called Btv Sucks;\(^\text{44}\) we comment there, but it is like they don’t see our comments.” Thus a suggested area for improving Btv is that the service should allow for audience feedback.

5.5.6 Summary of focus group discussions key findings

In summary, this section has explored the audiences’ understanding of the origins of Btv, their perceptions of Btv content and foreign content, as well as their suggestions on how Btv can be improved. Regarding the origins of Btv, the key findings show that the focus group discussants believed that Botswana needed national television because of its visual impact. Moreover, the visual power of television as a technology was to be mostly used to show other cultures in Botswana. Furthermore, this view has become extremely entrenched in the audiences’ perceptions of the performance of Btv, in that they expect the service to provide content reflecting Botswana culture and various communities, which, they suggest, Btv must substantially improve.

Regarding the audiences’ preferred television channels and programs, Btv and its public affairs programs, such as news and current affairs and government programming, are considered popular. Although sport programs occupy a considerable amount of time on Btv schedule as explained in the schedule analysis findings, sports programs were not very popular with Btv audiences who participated in this study. Possibly, the lack of popularity of sport on Btv could be due to the fact that compared to other sectors in Botswana; sport is one area where the country is under performing. This poor performance may be contributing to limited interest in sport and to some extent even in sport programming. The country has only managed to win in major sporting events since 2010. A four hundred meter athlete Amantle Moncho won gold at the Commonwealth games in Delhi and 2010. This continued through as another athlete, Nigel Amos won gold in major athletics competitions, including the 2014

\(^{44}\) https://www.facebook.com/#!/pages/Btv-Sucks-Big-Time/141465629252804?fref=ts
International Association of Athletics Federations (IAAF) competition. In view of the general poor performance in sport, there may be fewer sports heroes that could attract audiences to watch Btv sport programming. A remote but possible explanation also could be due to historical circumstances of Botswana and South Africa. South Africa continues to dominate Botswana across various sectors as explained in Chapter 1. Also, South Africa is a regional powerhouse in sport. Moreover, prior to the arrival of Btv, some Batswana watched South Africa television, and listened to soccer commentary on South African radio. In addition, successful soccer players in Botswana depart for South African teams where they play professional sport. Consequently, due to this exposure, Batswana audiences may prefer to watch South Africa sport content at the expense of their own as they seek to watch soccer teams and personalities they are already familiar with.

The lack of popularity of sport on Btv could also be linked to the lack of development of sport in Botswana. Chappell (2007) explains that Botswana’s sport development policy had to compete with other national pressing needs. As such, Botswana government investment in sport infrastructure and development was very minimal. For example the country could only afford to pay a national coach in 2001 (Chappell, 2007). In light of the pressing social needs as outlined in Chapter 1, it is inevitable that sport would be a least priority compared to other more pressing needs such as HIV AIDS. Thus the lack of popularity of sport on Btv could be a reflection of the overall national prioritisation of sport and limited government commitment until around 2000 when the government began to prioritise sports as a national development concern. Therefore, as an underdeveloped sector, it is probable that audiences may prefer sport from other more established channels such as SABC.

The prevalence of SABC and its entertainment programs mostly soap operas, is a noticeable preference among the participants in this study. The implication for these preferences is that Btv must balance traditional tastes through cultural programing and the South African and, to some extent, Anglo-American tastes that foreign programs have introduced. Moreover, the preference of those programs, such as foreign drama, could also reflect the audiences’ need for more entertainment programs, which, they stated, are in limited number on Btv. Regarding the audiences’ reasons for watching television, and their relationship to national development, the findings suggest that focus group participants related the national television to its nationalist agenda, meaning that they watched Btv because it is a national service. Moreover, they prefer educational, informational, and
entertainment programming, which are roles of the media that are consistent with the dominant paradigm of development, as is discussed in the next chapter. Moreover, the national principle of social harmony has been extremely influential in the audiences’ perceptions of Btv, in that action or decisions that are made about programming must be in the interest of social harmony. Finally, the other key finding of the focus group discussions relates to the need to retain a state-owned broadcasting model in Botswana. As this researcher discusses in the next chapter, this is a policy issue that needs to be considered in light of the contending views among the media professionals need for broadcast reforms, and audiences’ preference of state owned media with some level of editorial independence from government. The issue of a how media policy in Botswana should grapple with this complex situation is explored in the next chapter.

5.6 Summary of key findings
The key findings of this study have been thematically grouped according to the role of television in national development, the factors affecting national television, and the policy and regulatory factors shaping the performance of Btv, as Table 5-10 shows.

Table 5-10

Overview of the Key Findings of this Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Documents</th>
<th>Schedule analysis</th>
<th>Interviews</th>
<th>FGDS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Role of Btv in national development</td>
<td>Media professionals focusing on cultural role</td>
<td>Development messages such as health, education, crime, agriculture prevalent.</td>
<td>Inform, educate, and entertain most frequently mentioned.</td>
<td>More culturally oriented content needed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Botswana government emphasised mobilisation and publicity of government information role</td>
<td>National events and national anthem used</td>
<td>Emphasis on dissemination of government information, but against state control, propaganda, and censorship</td>
<td>Government programs appreciated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Market Botswana outside its</td>
<td>Foreign content domination</td>
<td>Least frequently mentioned the commercial role of Btv regarding adverting and</td>
<td>Television was needed for nationalist agenda, and for its visual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Minority languages not</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Media professional wanted to increase commercial output through more advertising. More advertising used.

Marketing Botswana outside its borders. Cultural and commercial output also frequently mentioned by media professionals.

Reasons for establishment of television relating to countering foreign content, unite Batswana, i.e., nation building, and to improve government communication with the citizens.

Information, education and nation building reasonably performed well.

More entertainment programs needed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors impacting on Btv</th>
<th>State broadcasting and public service broadcasting</th>
<th>Government programs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hughes Report endorsed state control and propaganda-based reporting</td>
<td>Limited commissioned local programs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exemption of state broadcasting from BOCRA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Positive perception about the service wearing out. Advertising revenue goes to government coffers-Economic factors.

Sponsorship of programs and commercialization. Insufficient budget for local content.

Sparse population. State control and censorship. Historical and geographic connection of Botswana with South Africa.

Communities expect coverage of their community issues. Perceptions of absence of credibility of Btv. Comparison of Btv with SABC by audiences.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy and regulatory vacuum</th>
<th>General formal policy vacuum- Draft Broadcasting policy rejected. Broadcasting Act no</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government and PSB models synonymous in Botswana? PSB preferred by consultants and media professionals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status quo must prevail (mostly rural and semi-urban) Btv must remain stated owned</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provisions for State Broadcasting</td>
<td>State Preferred Government Owned - BOCRA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hughes Policy document outdated, introduced before television</td>
<td>Lack of common understanding on Btv’s mandate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s field work notes.

The findings of this thesis reveal that the reasons that were advanced for the establishment of a national television service, which related to nation building, countering South Africa domination, and communicating government information, largely framed the role of television in Botswana. The document analysis findings show that it is stated and/or implied that Btv should support national development. The interview data extends this to explain that the launch of a national television in 2000 was a sign of development in Botswana. The findings reveal that a consensus exists on the role of Btv in educating, informing, and entertaining the public. Considerable agreement also exists on the role of television in disseminating government information. However, the most significant finding is that the use of television for disseminating information about government policies and projects is contested. Some interviewees, mostly from media interest groups, and some focus group participants stated that some government information is propaganda. Other interviews and focus groups state that such information is necessary for informing the public about the activities of their government. The other role of television is the need for Btv to reflect Botswana culture. The perception that Btv fails to meet the audiences’ demands for cultural programming dominated the critique of Btv’s performance. The findings of this study also reveal that an expectation is placed on Btv to play a role in nation building, and near consensus exists that the channel performs this role suitably. However, some focus groups participants and interviewees stated that nation building must reflect diversity, as well as unity. The other roles of Btv relate to its commercial contribution to national development, in
terms of marketing Botswana globally and providing an advertising outlet for the commercial sector in Botswana.

Regarding suggestions on how to improve the performance of Btv, the key findings of this study relate to the broadcasting model, the mandate and objectives of Btv, programming and funding. The findings reflect that over the years, an absence of clarity existed mostly among media professionals on the broadcasting model that was adopted when Btv was launched in 2000. The project team, which comprised expatriate and local personnel, believed that it was establishing a public service broadcaster, whereas the other local members of the project team and the government officials were aware that Btv was part of a government department and that, therefore, it was a state broadcaster. This tension prevailed, and two approaches emerged over various periods to address this issue. The proposal to transform Btv into a public service from 2006 to 2011 was one such approach that did not materialise, mostly due to the absence of political support. The enactment of a new regulatory framework (BOCRA Act, 2012), which, unlike previous frameworks, recognised state broadcasting as opposed to public service broadcasting, is the latest approach to address the stalemate of a broadcasting model for Btv.

The findings also show that the mandate of Btv was never clearly articulated, and in an instance where that was implied, the mandate was articulated in terms of the programming focus of the television channel. For example, the mandate would be news and current affairs. The other key finding is that the objectives of Btv are diverse. Whereas this is normal for broadcasting, the limitation is that, in Btv’s case, these objectives were not delineated accordingly to reflect key and peripheral goals of broadcasting. Taken together with the audiences’ expectation that Btv should focus on cultural representation, the findings of this study include the suggestion that the national television service’s objectives must be harmonised with public expectation specifically in relation to cultural oriented content.

The other key findings relate to programming on Btv. The efforts to improve local content on Btv were commended mostly by focus group discussants. The use of programs that were produced by government departments has emerged as one of the key findings relating to improving local content, despite such programming being mostly limited to covering the government’s agenda. The analysis of the schedule data also revealed that despite low levels of local content and the dominance of foreign content, local programs are given prominence on Btv schedules. Likewise, efforts were made to use the local language, Setswana, although the focus group discussants believed that a diversity of languages should
be used on the national television. The suggestions for improving programing thus related to the need for diversity in programming, and for improved public engagement in production. Moreover, funding of Btv was another key finding that related to improving Btv’s performance. The media professionals who were interviewed in this study were the most vocal in expressing the need for improved funding of the national service.
Chapter 6 Discussion and Conclusion

6.1 Introduction
Drawing from the review of the literature, the conceptual framework and the key findings that emerged from the study, this chapter discusses the status of Btv, the national television service in Botswana. The overarching aim of this study was to consider that Btv has had a role to play in national development in Botswana, as proven by the way it was introduced, its nationwide signal access and the relevance of its local content. However, although these factors indicate that to a certain extent, modernisation theory is applicable in the Botswana context, there is a need for the Government to introduce appropriate media policy with a view to strengthening and positioning Btv to realise its full potential in national development. This chapter is divided into four parts. The first part (6.2) elucidates the key findings that relate to the origins of a national television service in Botswana, demonstrating that indeed Btv was delayed, and that its delay was justifiable. In part two (6.3), this study considers the use of Btv as a national broadcaster, emphasising that generally, its roles reflect a modernisation approach to development. As a follow-up to this, in part three (6.4), this chapter also explores the political and economic issues that have shaped the performance of Btv and suggests that, to a certain extent, these have occurred because of a lack of appropriate policy framework. In consideration of this, part four (6.5) of this study explores the priority policy factors that could be considered to position Btv so that it can fully realise its potential in national development. The final section of this chapter presents the overall conclusions of this study, including its research contributions (section 6.6), limitations and suggestions for future research (section 6.7), and concluding statements in section 6.8.

6.2 The origins of a national television service in Botswana
This study has established that the origins of Btv were influenced by the Botswana Government’s plans to counter the public’s dependency on foreign broadcasters such as SABC and other channels which were available through Multichoice pay television. Similar to other media systems in developing countries where there is a pervasive presence of foreign media content (Rodrigues, 2006; Sakr, 1999; Storr, 2011), Botswana has had to contend with the invasion of foreign channels, most significantly from South Africa. Zaffiro (2000) also expressed the same view. Concerns were that these broadcasts influenced Botswana’s knowledge about other countries over their own. As described in Chapter 1, since colonial
times Botswana has always sought to limit its association with South Africa. In this regard, a positive outcome for Botswana is that in response to the possible invasion of the media market by foreign channels, the government acted to introduce a national television service. While it has been observed that in general foreign content has negative consequences, such that it creates dependency (Menon, 2004), and is a form of imperialism (Estwick, 2006; Schiller, 2001), in the case of Botswana the infiltration of foreign media has, among other factors, propelled the government to decide to introduce a national television service.

Previous research indicates that the origins of national television broadcasting in many African contexts date back to the 1960s when television stations were either inherited from colonial governments, or hastily introduced to coincide with some important national events (Alhassan, 2005; Bourgault, 1995; Katz & Wedell, 1977). However, in Botswana, unlike radio and print media that were introduced by the British Colonial Government as part of war propaganda tools (Zaffiro, 1991), national television was only introduced in 2000, thirty-four years after Botswana’s independence. Instead of conforming to the 1960s’ trend of introducing broadcast media as an indicator of national development, as advocated by UNESCO (Amienyi, 2004), Botswana delayed the introduction of a national television service. As reported in the preceding chapter, focus group discussants said that by 1999, the introduction of a national television service was long overdue. They said that at that time, the main reason Botswana needed its own national television service was to reduce its dependency on foreign channels. As noted in Chapter 5.3.2, media professionals who were interviewed as part of this study also shared similar sentiments. These viewpoints raise the question as to the appropriate time to introduce a national television service in a developing country context, considering that development is an ongoing process.

Nevertheless, a significant argument regarding the introduction of Btv as late as 2000, which emerged during interviews with the elite in the government and the media sector, is that it had to be delayed. Primarily, their concerns were that prior to 2000, there was inadequate infrastructure such as electricity and broadcasting transmitters, which would limit nationwide access to television. Conceivably, since independence the government of Botswana has been faced with the mammoth tasks of providing social services, infrastructure, and fighting acute poverty and drought, as these were the main pressing demands nationwide, as demonstrated in Chapter 1. In view of this, necessary priorities were made such that other services, including Btv, had to be postponed until much later. Actually, this relates to Botswana’s pragmatic approach to national development, which involves providing more
pressing national development services and delaying others until later (Harvey & Lewis, 1990; Khama, 1970a; Kijeski, 1995). Therefore the notion of waiting until there was appropriate technology and adequate infrastructure in Botswana is justifiable, as it suggests that there was careful planning, and as part of this, necessary preparations were made to address the issue of signal distribution and access to national television. This is because signal access remains a significant limitation to the success of television in national development (Katz & Wedell, 1977; Mytton, 2000). Furthermore, careful planning is consistent with a modernisation approach to national development (Leys, 1996; Okolie, 2003), and this shows that the origins of Btv have been adapted to the modernisation paradigm. Generally, the findings of this study indicate that in the context of a developing country such as Botswana, where the priorities lie in improving the socio-economic conditions of the people, the introduction of a national television service is considered secondary. However, this does not mean that a national television service is of less importance to national development, as will be discussed in the next section.

6.3 The Roles of Btv in national development in Botswana

This study clearly demonstrates that Btv plays a key role in national development in Botswana. Specifically, Btv is useful to educate, inform and disseminate information. Although most of the findings in this study are consistent with the espoused role of national television in the modernisation paradigm, this study also indicates more distinct findings specific to the Botswana context in the way national television contributes towards socio-economic development. Conceivably, this is because of two closely related dynamics that exist in the case of Btv. First, as Botswana continues its endeavours to better the lives of its people, Btv remains part of the mass media, particularly as the only visual broadcast medium, for use in this regard. Second the conception of the importance of a national television service for the people of Botswana is that in view of the changes brought about by modernisation, there is a need for the inclusion of more entertainment and culturally relevant content in Btv programming to address the emerging needs associated with disrupted social structures.

6.3.1 The use of Btv to inform and educate

As part of its introduction, the primary role of Btv was that it should be used to inform and educate the public on matters that relate mostly to their socio-economic lives. Although the dominant view of various scholars has been that mass media fail to inform and educate the
public in many developing countries (Bourgault, 1995; McLellan, 1986; Moyo & Chuma, 2010), the general viewpoints of the focus group participants and interviewees in this study was that Btv was very informative and educational, particularly on issues that related to agriculture, health, current affairs and crime prevention. Likewise, the data from both the document and schedule analysis illustrated that many of Btv’s programs were educational and informational. Perhaps the role of Btv in this regard attests to the Botswana Government’s dedication to the development goal of attaining an educated and informed nation, as planned for in Vision 2016 (Presidential Task Group on a Long Term Vision for Botswana, 1997). This indicates that the use of Btv for educating and informing Botswana is consistent with the modernisation paradigm in development, which states that the role of mass media is to inform the public and introduce them to new ways of doing things to better their livelihoods (Eko, 2003; Fürsich & Shrikhande, 2007; Schramm, 1964, 1967). This conceptualisation also extends Obijiofor’s (2011) observation that the mass media in Africa remain the conduit for public information, education and entertainment.

6.3.1.1 The contextual use of Btv by the Botswana government

One of the contextual findings that emerged from this study was that Btv has been predominantly used by the Botswana Government to disseminate information that has been contested as propaganda. Conceivably, the Government’s approach in this regard is influenced by the fact that national development in Botswana is state-led, such that the Government of Botswana is central to the process of national socio-economic development by providing infrastructure, policies and social services (Harvey & Lewis, 1990; Hillbom, 2012; Khama, 1970a). Associated with this, there has been an increase in Government publicity-oriented Btv programs, to almost a quarter of local programs, as reflected in the schedule analysis data. The popularity of some of these programs among focus group discussants, for example Ishireletse (see section 5.5.1.2), somehow suggests the acceptance of such content on Btv by the public. This could also be because of the public’s dependence on the Government, suggesting they look to the Government to be informed about Government activities that would benefit them. In addition, the findings from the analysis of the documents in this study showed that the ‘public relations role’ (section 5.2.1) of Btv, such as disseminating Government information, has been the primary focus of State media, including Btv. The significance of Btv in this regard is consistent with the viewpoints of
various scholars who have proposed that the mass media are ideal channels for transmitting information aimed at social change (Kraidy, 2013; Lerner, 1958; McQuail, 2005).

However, media professionals interviewed in this study were critical of the dominance of information about Government activities and policies on Btv. Similar views have been accentuated by various scholars who have contended that state owned media in Botswana, including Btv, serve as a mouthpiece for the Government (Balule, 2013b; Zaffiro, 1992). There are indications of an emerging trend regarding the definition of what constitutes government information. The example cited regarding this trend of blurring lines between the Government and the Botswana ruling party’s (BDP) information, was demonstrated during the split of the ruling party in 2010, when the ruling party news was editorially treated as government information. The use of the media by the Government and the BDP is part of a classic question embedded in the literature of political economy communication, which disparages the control and manipulation of the media by the dominant elite for their own goals (Davis & Baran, 2006; Mosco, 2009; Schiller, 1992). The need to delineate what is government information is a policy issue that needs clarification to demystify any misunderstandings about the role of television in disseminating Government information, hence, the need for a clearer policy direction which informs the mandate of Btv in national development.

Moreover, the engagement of the media in disseminating government information has attracted much criticism, particularly among scholars whose concerns are that this dissemination results in perceived restrictions on press freedom (Balule, 2013b; Fombad, 2002; Robie, 2008) and propaganda (Amienyi, 2004; Eko, 2003; Tettey, 2001; Willems, 2011). Interestingly, the unique finding of this study was that there was some level of tolerance for propaganda content. Perhaps, tolerance for Government propaganda stems from observations that in some cases the Government performs effectively in socio-economic development of the country. For instance, as Tsie (1996) proposes, the relative achievements of the Government of Botswana in implementing development projects and its accountability and transparency justify the Government’s actions. Correspondingly, other scholars have emphasised the need for governments and other stakeholders involved in the development process to follow up information dissemination with implementation (Amienyi, 2004; Lerner & Schramm, 1967; Lerner, 1967) since the media alone are not responsible for the development of a nation, but are only a part of the whole process.
6.3.2 The use of Btv for entertainment

Previous studies have conceptualised the role of television for entertainment as facilitating development through the provision of edutainment content (Singhal & Rogers, 1999; Tufte, 2008). This study, without assuming any causal relationship, extends the literature on edutainment by showing how the socio-cultural changes associated with modernisation in Botswana may increase the entertainment needs of the public, or media audiences. For instance, focus group participants in both rural and urban areas explained how changes in their lifestyles, whereby they have become more associated with modern lifestyles, have created the demand for entertainment programming (See section 5.5.1). These lifestyle changes have created more spare time for them and in some instances loneliness. In view of these factors, the participants in the study acquiesced that Btv remained a substitute media, as it offered them entertainment.

However, although the changes in social lifestyles associated with improved socio-economic conditions as part of the modernisation efforts in Botswana, as demonstrated in the findings above, rationalise the need for Btv to provide more entertainment programs, many focus group participants in this study complained that Btv did not offer enough entertainment. According to the participants, there were only a few entertainment programs on Btv, as further demonstrated by their preference for South African soap operas and drama. An arising question is: Should Btv provide for the audiences’ demands for entertainment? Entertainment programming is blamed for undermining social change by encouraging social ills (Gray, 2008). Moreover, such programs are discredited for their capability of diverting people’s attention from their problems and disengaging them form sensitive issues such as political debates (Katz and Wedell, 1977). Contrariwise, other scholars have demonstrated that when combined with education, to produce edutainment, entertainment programs can be useful in development communication mostly in the areas of agriculture and health communication (Kotler & Roberto, 1989; Singhal & Rogers, 1999; Singhal & Rogers, 2001, 2004; Tufte, 2008). In light of the existing literature that reflects that edutainment can support rather than undermine developmental purpose of the media, Btv has to consider providing programs that reflect a balance between education and entertainment in order to positively influence social change in Botswana. Such a decision would ensure programming that is aligned to the overall national development goals of Botswana, as edutainment programming will also be meeting the informational needs of audiences. Moreover, such edutainment programs would be consistent with the national development strategy of Botswana. As outlined in section 1.5.4
one of the seven pillars of Vision 2016- a development strategy for Botswana, focuses on “an educated and informed nation”. Thus while the document is silent about entertainment needs of the country, its focus on the education and information needs of citizens warrants the inclusion of educational and informational content on national television. Thus in view of the inevitable demands for entertainment as the country “modernises” and the demands of education and information as requested fro in the development strategy, Btv programs should ensure a balance between entertainment and education needs of Batswana.

6.3.3 The Role of Btv as a Mirror for Cultural Reflection

The other role of Btv for national development is its use as a mirror for cultural reflection. Culture has been one of the issues that have attracted criticism from orthodox development models. As demonstrated in the theoretical framework, classical sociologists such as Weber, Durkheim and Tonnies, whose viewpoints about transition of societies from traditional to modern postulated that culture changes as societies change from traditional to modern. Within the modernisation paradigm, traditional or cultural practices are considered an impediment to development (Kumar, 2002; Rogers, 1962; Schramm, 1964). In this study, the role of Btv as a platform for cultural reflection is characterised by a major gap between promise and performance. The analysis of the documents in this study has shown that during Btv’s early years (2000-2005), there was inconsistency between the Botswana Government and the media professionals’ documentations as regards television’s role in culture. The media professionals projected the role of Btv along cultural reflection lines, while Government documents focused more on the Government media’s role in raising awareness about government projects and policies. However, the schedule analysis findings suggested limited cultural programming on Btv. Moreover, there was a perception among the focus group participants that Btv has performed dismally with regard to its role in cultural reflection (ngwao). Put differently, the role of Btv in national development along cultural lines represents contradictions between the elites, who do not frame the role of Btv as that of a cultural institution, and the audiences, who see culture as fundamental to Btv. Perhaps this is because the elite do not prioritise cultural preservation as part of national development. Indications are that the public in Botswana is not satisfied by the amount of Btv programs that reflect culture.

Culture, despite its conceptual vagueness, can refer to societal preferences as regard certain forms of expression, meaning, and way of doing things (McQuail, 1992, p.276). Thus
culture involves conventions of customs, norms and values. Williams (1965, in Hebdige, 2012) also included the notion of ‘trends’ in ‘everyday life’ in his conceptualisation of culture. Thus reflection of culture on television, or rather cultural programming, should include content that has educational value in that the viewers of such content should learn the customs and norms of their society through television programs. In addition, cultural content should be locally produced and broadcast in the local language (Blumler, 1992). McQuail (1995) states that programs that relate to national culture include the arts, crafts, national customs and religion. Plausibly, the concerns by focus groups about lack of cultural content on Btv are consistent with the views of the media imperialism scholars about the need for media in developing countries to improve their local content as a way of averting Western cultural imperialism (Dutta, 2012; Melkote, 2012; Servaes & Malikhao, 2008; Willems, 2011). The need for cultural heritage preservation in developing countries is linked to UNESCO discussions about protection of Third World countries from Western cultural invasion (McQuail, 1992). However, in Botswana, like most African societies, the efforts to increase local cultural programming may be hampered by the diverse ethnic groups in the country. As such, media policy should focus on national distinctiveness, as well as promoting local diversity through television content.

6.3.4 Other roles of Btv in Botswana

Broadcasters have an obligation to pursue certain core goals, as well as others that may be either auxiliary or complementary goals (Franklin, 2001). In this study, the roles that were least frequently mentioned in the interviews, focus group discussions, analysis of documents and schedules were described as ‘other roles of Btv’. The three peripheral roles of Btv are (i) publicising Botswana outside its borders (ii) advertising and (iii) mimicking community media.

The document analysis and the interview data reflect that Btv is expected to ‘publicise Botswana outside its borders’. A review of the documents reflects that the role of government media to publicise Botswana outside its borders dates back to the 1960’s (See section 5.2.1), and continues to date. It can thus be suggested that Botswana’s global visibility remains one of the country’s concerns. Two possible explanations can clarify this finding. First, the need for global visibility in Botswana has historic precedents. Since the 1960’s to date, the phenomenon of global flows of information, which advanced global visibility of the West through the media, has been of concern to developing countries. The need to counter this
Western domination of media content has thus dominated media policy priorities for many developing countries. Through the debate over a New World Information and Communication Order (NWICO), developing countries have attempted to address domination by Western television content of their national media systems (Gerbner et al., 1993; Golding & Harris, 1997). Second, the emergence of globalisation in the 1990’s that increased inter-connectedness of the world may have intensified the desire of developing countries to address the Western domination (Boyd-Barrett, 2012; Thussu, 2010). Consequently, it is possible that developing countries such as Botswana may develop media policies that aim to increase their own global visibility with the ambition to reduce Western domination.

However, this study was not able to establish the extent of Btv’s ‘global’ reach. But the media professionals confided that the service had a footprint covering most of the Southern African region. Generally, the findings of this study based on the interview data and schedule analysis suggest the absence of Btv programs targeting the global audience. Perhaps, the role of Btv’s global reach is compromised by, among other factors, a lack of convergence of its services demonstrated by a lack of an online presence and missed opportunities in exchange program policies that could leverage Botswana content on the global scene (see Section 5.4.7). Convergence of media content, that is offering content through various technological platforms, has been considered to be another way of improving audience reach as this allows content to be more accessible to a diverse audience than traditional broadcast platforms (Thomas, 2003). Although the extent to which Btv can achieve a global reach is contested, it is possible to argue that national broadcasters in developing countries such as Botswana have to contend with often competing objectives of broadcasting relating to national objectives as listed above, and international objectives such as enhancing global visibility. Practically, the application of this role to television production becomes problematic in that content has to appeal to both local and international audiences if it is to achieve these goals. The need for local and global oriented content indicates that in developing country contexts, although there may be desires to target global audiences, programming mostly targets local audiences, suggesting that national objectives towards modernisation may ultimately prevail over global ones.

Nonetheless, the tendency to focus on national as opposed to global visibility of Btv suggests the persistence of structural challenges facing media industries in developing countries as observed by media imperialism scholars. The need for Btv to focus on national audiences may be applauded for its likelihood of increasing self-reliance in the form of
having a national service. Media imperialism scholars (Galtung, 1977; Golding & Harris, 1997; Smythe, 1981) advocate for such self-reliance. However, this finding on the limited achievements of Btv in attaining global visibility suggests that media imperialism arguments remain valid in that broadcasters from developing countries are still to penetrate the global television market. The point of departure though is that limited global visibility of media industries of some Third World countries such as Botswana may be based on best policy choices in view of the socio-economic contexts of such countries. For instance, in the case of Btv, the focus has to be first on reaching national audiences, while global audiences are of least priority.

The other role of Btv relates to using the service as an advertising outlet. A unique finding of this study relates to the two varying rationalisations of advertising on Btv. On one hand, the media professionals’ objective is to use the revenues generated to justify requests for the corporatisation of Btv as they seek the transformation of Btv from a state broadcaster to an independent public service broadcaster. On the other hand, the media policy makers interviewed in this study said that the role of advertising should be supportive of the national development objective of economic diversification from a mineral-based economy to a diverse economic base. Thus, advertising on Btv is consistent with Botswana’s efforts to diversify the economy (Clover, 2003; Hillbom, 2008; Matambo, 2014). Equally, in view of the dominant perception of the state control of Btv, efforts towards an independent broadcaster are also of paramount importance.

While advertising on Btv is regarded as important on the above grounds, there must be caution in regard to advertising on Btv. In other countries, the preponderance of state broadcasters to attract audiences and consequently advertisers has compromised the scheduling of development-oriented content (Alhassan, 2005; Rodrigues, 2006; Storr, 2011). Similarly, the drive for advertising has inevitably led to the dominance of commercial objectives over other goals, such as information and education (Duncan & Glenn, 2010; Horrocks, 2004; Thussu, 2000). Although this study has not established the extent to which advertising on Btv diverts the television channel from developmental to commercial imperatives, further research should be conducted to establish the extent of the domination of commercial roles on Btv, with the view to guiding media policy to maintain a reasonable balance between developmental and commercial imperatives, both of which are necessary in the case of Botswana as they relate to national development.
The other role of Btv relates to the expectation on the service to “mimic community media”. As stated in the findings chapter, there is no community media in Botswana, hence the expectation on the Btv to “mimic” community media. Thus in the absence of community media, there is more pressure for Btv to perform roles that would be practically impossible for a national broadcaster. Nonetheless, the desire for Btv to be providing services of a community media could suggest the need for media pluralism. Indeed scholars in Africa (Banda, 2003; Banda & Fourie, 2004; Kasoma, 2001; Manyozo, 2009; Olorunnisola, 2002) advocate for this type of broadcasting. Their view is that community media in Africa provides a platform for diversity of views as the national broadcasters tend to be urban based monopolies promoting elitist agenda (Kasoma, 2001). Community media is assumed to be a better alternative to state broadcasters as regard their role in communication relating to development issues ranging from agriculture to corruption (Banda & Fourie, 2004). In view of the new regulatory framework of Botswana (BOCRA, 2012) that has abolished licensing of community media, a participatory and community based development communication framework in Botswana is dead.

6.4 The political and economic factors influencing the performance of Btv

Media systems tend to be impacted by dynamics that make them different from society to society (Horrocks, 2004). Thus, the social, economic and political factors of the society influence the way media systems operate. Employing the political economy of communication framework, this section reviews the findings of this study with a view to exploring the key political and economic factors that influence the operations and performance of Btv. Particularly, this study considered that the state ownership of Btv and a lack of clear regulatory and policy frameworks have significantly impeded the performance of the station. Because of these political factors, there is a perception of state control of the station, especially by the governing elite in Botswana. Furthermore, economic factors such as globalisation, inadequate funding and a small market size have limited Btv’s revenues. These factors are discussed further in the next subsections.

6.4.1 Political factors that constrain the operation of Btv

As part of this study, the following two political factors were found to have constrained the operations of Btv: (i) state ownership of Btv and (ii) the lack of clear regulatory and policy frameworks. These political factors are central to the analysis of the media because of the
The centrality of national governments in determining national media systems (Hallin & Mancini, 2004; Horrocks, 2004) through legislation, funding, and the introduction of media technologies (Brown, 1996). As demonstrated in this thesis, the Botswana Government spearheaded the introduction of television infrastructure, enacted the legislation guiding broadcasting in Botswana, and funds Btv. Specifically, Btv was launched as a state-owned broadcaster which has remained unlicensed contrary to the requirements of the then Broadcasting Act (1998) about the need to license all broadcasters in Botswana. As previously stated in the findings of this study, the viewpoint of the elite in Botswana is that ownership of Btv by the state occurred because of two factors. First, the television stations that were already in existence, for example, closed circuit television services in the mining towns of Orapa and Jwaneng, were incapable of providing television with nationwide coverage, as that required a large amount of start-up capital, and at that time in Botswana, the state remained the most capable to provide such a service. As such, Btv was started as a state department. Second, a national television service as a capital-intensive project for Botswana was considered to be a national development project, demonstrated by its inclusion in the National Development Plan 9 (NDP9) (Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, 1997). Contrary to the NDP 9 statement about launching a national television service as a state enterprise, which Zaffiro (2000) referred to as a commercial service, the Botswana Government launched it as a Government department. If Btv was launched as a semi-government institution as stated in NDP 9, Btv would be inconsistent with the modernisation paradigm (Lerner, 1963), neo-liberalism (Freedman, 2008) and UNESCO’s ideals of media operating as commercial enterprises in a free, independent and pluralistic context (Banda, 2013). Thus, contrary to modernisation theory that focuses on a free market approach, the economic conditions in Botswana are more favourable to state ownership of a national television such as Btv.

In addition to state ownership of Btv, this study also found that there have been deliberate efforts by the state to avoid Btv licensing, thus allowing the broadcaster to flout regulatory frameworks. In addition, the decision by the Botswana Government to stall efforts to have a national broadcasting policy, as demonstrated in the findings of this study, further shows the Government’s efforts to ensure Btv operates within a broadcast policy vacuum. The recommendation shared by Steyn (1998), Franklin (2001), and Freedman (2008) is that broadcasting policy is useful to guide media systems towards the achievement of specific goals. Although television broadcasting can operate within a broadcasting policy vacuum and
even flourish, as in India (Rodrigues, 2006; Sonwalkar, 2008), this study found that in the case of Botswana, the lack of an official broadcasting policy has resulted in the station operating without a clear mandate under government control. This has also resulted in the state having a firm grip on the station and control of its content. As Okigbo (2004) observed, the absence of a formal media policy in some African contexts affords the political elite leeway to fashion media functions more favourable to them. Correspondingly, concerns from the media activists and media policy makers interviewed in this study were that due to the absence of a broadcasting policy that stipulated the structure and role of Btv, the service has remained susceptible to perceptions that the elite use Btv to pursue their own interests.

6.4.1.1 State ownership and control of Btv.
As noted in the two paragraphs above, state ownership of Btv, as well as a lack of clear regulatory framework to guide its operations has resulted in the state controlling the service. State control of the media involves varying factors such as government censorship of content (Kasoma, 1997; Phiri, 2010), and laws that limit press freedom (Tettey, 2001). In the context of this study, this involves censorship and enactment of laws, specifically the BOCRA Act (2012). Correspondingly, other scholars have also noted state control of the media in Botswana (Balule, 2013a; Tutwane, 2011; Zaffiro, 1992). Similarly, the developmental media theory also endorses some level of state control to direct the media towards supporting developing countries’ governments towards social change (McQuail, 1984). The findings of this study showed that some participants in this study endorsed state control of Btv while others disapproved of it.

On the one hand, participants endorsed state control of Btv on two fronts. First, the focus group discussants, mostly the elderly in rural areas, noted that state control was essential to preserve peace and harmony. In the first factor, the focus group discussants explained the need for the state to control the content and operations of Btv to ensure the channel avoided airing content that may provoke ethnic tensions, thus destabilising the peace and harmony (kagaisano) existing in Botswana. This view may be explained by Botswana’s socio-political structure. The mainstream Tswana tribes peacefully assimilated other non-Tswana ethnicities into their villages and tribes (Mompati & Prinsen, 2000). Despite the limitations of this social establishment, including the subordination of the minority groups, this arrangement, among other factors, explains Botswana’s ethnic unity, which has facilitated a peaceful society that has allowed modernisation to take place in Botswana.
Nonetheless, the suppression of ethnic minority views is one major argument that dominates the critique of Botswana’s democracy (Good, 1993, 2008; Taylor, 2003). Thus, the lack of empowerment of ethnic minorities is one of the weaknesses that Botswana has to address as it continues with the modernisation process. The first step has already been taken through constitutional amendments to recognise ethnic minority groups. There is a need to extend ethnic equality policies through other sectors (Good, 2008; Nthomang, 2004; Solway, 2002) such as the media. As reflected in the schedule analysis findings, there are no specific programs targeting the minorities in Botswana, nor are their languages used in the national television.

Notwithstanding the possible abuse of media for political reasons, this finding on the endorsement of state control in this study thus challenges the dominant view in the literature that perceives state control negatively (Fombad, 2002; Moyo & Chuma, 2010). These scholars fail to account for the fragility of most African states that may warrant their governments to guide broadcasters towards national development objectives such as national unity. This finding on the endorsement of state control on the grounds of maintaining peace and harmony (*kagisano*) has implications for developing national media policies that balance the two competing views in the Botswana context, and elsewhere in Africa: the need to maintain peace and harmony, while also allowing ethnic minority views access to the public sphere.

Second, the views of some of the focus group participants and interviewees endorsing the state control of Btv are based on political factors relating to the performance of the Botswana Government. The perception among some focus group participants was that, based on its performance in the delivery of infrastructure and social services, the Government understood the needs of Botswana. This finding is important because Lerner (1963) stated that development should occur through a balance between aspirations and achievements. That is, after developing ‘empathy’ through exposure to media messages; the national economic and political system should allow citizens opportunities to implement the new knowledge to bring about social change. The limited success of governments to provide for the aspirations of citizens has attracted criticism of modernisation (Contractor, Singhal & Rogers, 1988; Tomaselli & Dunn, 2001). For example, as stated in the literature review, Contractor et al. (1988) demonstrated frustrations brought by satellite television raised the aspirations of the population in India, while the government was limited to meeting the growing demands of the public. It must be noted that Botswana’s economic system also has limitations such as
unemployment and income inequalities (Good, 1999b; Merafe, 2012; Narayana et al., 2005) as alluded to Chapter 1. But, overall, there has been considerable achievement in improving the living standards of many citizens as reflected in the Introduction chapter by examples relating to access to health facilities, potable water and education. The implication of this finding about the endorsement of state control is that the performance of governments, which may legitimise some of the actions of the ruling elite, may also influence the perceptions of the audience regarding state and media relations in a developing country context where meeting the most pressing needs, such as social services, is largely a key factor determining the success of government.

On the other hand, some research participants in this study disapproved state control of Btv on the grounds that it influences the state to dominate much of the television content. For instance, evidence from this study to support this viewpoint came out during focus group discussions when participants cited an example where BDP (the ruling party in Botswana) makes Btv its publicity mouthpiece. As is the case with Btv programming, the views of the Government prevail over those of the citizens. The domination of the elite in the media thus affirms concerns of the political economy of communication scholars about the media’s elitism and perpetuation of the status quo (Herman & Chomsky, 1988; McChesney, 1999; McChesney, 2008). In relation to this, some of the media professionals interviewed in this study expressed concern about lack of political will by the governing political elite to allow more diverse views. In addition, there have been appeals from various non-governmental organisations, media officials and legislators from the opposition political parties in Botswana to change Btv from a state television service and transform it into a public broadcaster (Balule, 2013b; Kelebonye, 2010; Media Institute of Southern Africa (MISA), 2009). Notwithstanding, the Botswana Government has remained firm in its refusal to liberalise Btv into a public service broadcasting model.

6.4.2 The economic factors that constrain the operation of Btv

As noted above, the economic factors related to the current performance of Btv include the lack of adequate funding, the small size of the Btv market and globalisation. Thus, like other broadcasters, Btv faces financial challenges. Inherently, funding the media is one of the key issues framing media policy debates worldwide (Blumler & Nossiter, 1991; Padovani & Tracey, 2003; Rowland & Tracey, 1990).
Media professionals interviewed in this study stated that Btv is underfunded, as demonstrated through the meagre budget allocated to program procurement. In general, therefore it seems the limited funding of Btv reflects the overall national paradox of Botswana’s economic development. The development philosophy in Botswana has been based on free enterprise and a market economy (Narayana et al., 2005), but in practice the economy has been state-capitalist (Mothusi & Dipholo, 2008; Narayana et al., 2005; Samatar, 1999). The lack of economic diversification implies a limited private sector that may be able to invest in, among other things, broadcasting. Although Zaffiro (2000) had suggested that the Gaborone-based commercial television, GBC, was growing, the findings of the study reflect that commercial television in Botswana, GBC, has yet to make its mark.

A socio-economic factor influencing the performance of Btv is the sparse population of Botswana. The demographics of Botswana, as described in Chapter 1, reflect low population density, diverse ethnic languages, and social inequality. Therefore, as stated in the findings chapter, there is a need for variety in programming to reflect the diversity in Botswana society. Another challenge is that in Botswana, the poor and the most disadvantaged ethnic minorities are mostly located in very remote areas (Good, 1999b; Nthomang, 2004), with difficult terrain such as desert. The implication of these social, economic and geographic factors is that Btv may face challenges in reaching the poor and the disadvantaged ethnic minorities, who should be central to development communication. The limited reach to such fundamental audience groups accords with the critique of modernisation by participatory and empowerment approaches about the exclusion of the needy and the grassroots from mainstream development communication (Dutta, 2012; Melkote, 1991). While this limitation of giving voice to the minorities may be valid, in the case of Botswana, alternative traditional forms of communication involving the grassroots such as kgotla meetings, if leveraged, could augment mass media communication.

Furthermore, the small population of Botswana, which is characterised by socio-economic conditions such as high unemployment\(^\text{45}\) and high poverty levels\(^\text{46}\) (Central Statistics Office, 2011b), signals a society that may lack a substantial middle class to sustain commercial broadcasting. This suggests that in all, there is market failure in television

---

\(^{45}\)Unemployment is estimated at 17.8% (Statistics Botswana, 2011)

\(^{46}\)The Preliminary Results of the Botswana Core Welfare Indicators (Poverty) Survey 2009/10 estimated poverty at 20.7% in 2009/10 reduced from 30.6 percent in 2002/03 (Statistics Botswana, 2011, p. 1). Poverty is widely acknowledged as one of the persisting challenges facing Botswana since independence.
broadcasting in Botswana. Put differently, the operation of Btv as a state or public institution confirms media policy debates about state intervention based on market failure arguments (Collins, 1994; McQuail & Siune, 2003). With the preceding insights into the economic conditions in Botswana, it is contestable as to whether the national television system can operate along liberal ideals as implied by Western media policy scholars (Freedman, 2008; van Cuilenburg & McQuail, 2003). The paradox of economic growth in Botswana extends Waisbord’s (2000) argument, which this study also suggests, that in some non-Western contexts, the liberal pluralism notion of private property and the press may be inapplicable due to existing conditions that limit the extent of the autonomy of the media from the state. In Botswana, the statist approach in national development limits the autonomy of Btv from state control.

As mentioned in the theoretical framework chapter, globalisation also presents challenges to national media systems (Appadurai, 1996, 2006; Sreberny, 2006). For instance, in the case of Botswana, its related notion of ‘regionalisation’, which involves flows of media content within regional markets (Straubhaar, 2007), has implications for the performance of Btv on two grounds. As described by the media professionals in this study, Btv competes with South African broadcasters for advertising revenue, as multinational companies, which are mostly based in South Africa, prefer to advertise with South African media to Btv. The focus group discussants, specifically the urban youth, mostly compare Btv with SABC. It is possible, therefore, to suggest that regionalisation deprives Btv of advertising revenue, as well as raising expectations of audiences regarding content needs on Btv. Additionally; a more serious implication for Botswana in relation to globalisation is that development media messages broadcast on Btv also have to compete with foreign channels for audiences. Skinner (2008), addressing a similar situation in Canada, suggesting that the Canadian regulatory authority, Canadian Radio-Television and Telecommunications Commission (CRTC), counters America’s regional dominance in broadcasting by scheduling better Canadian content. Perhaps Botswana may have to consider broadcasting appropriate local content to reduce the adverse effects of globalisation.

6.5 Policy considerations in improving the performance of Btv
The preceding sections have demonstrated the factors impacting on Btv in its efforts to modernise Botswana, as well as Btv as a modernisation project itself and the roles the television channel plays in national development in Botswana. This section addresses the
third question of this study that relates to policy suggestions for consideration in the future to exploit the potential of a national television service in the development of Botswana. The findings of this study have demonstrated that Btv has operated in a policy vacuum and flouted the regulatory framework. Broadcasting policy can be useful in guiding media systems towards the achievement of specific goals (Freedman, 2008; Mosco, 1996; Steyn, 1998). In the absence of a broadcasting policy that stipulates the structure and role of Btv, the service remains susceptible to perceptions that certain sections of society use the station to pursue their own interests as reflected in this study. Granted, television broadcasting can operate within a broadcasting policy vacuum and even flourish, as in India (Rodrigues, 2006; Sonwalkar, 2008). However, to improve the performance of Btv as a modernisation agent, policy suggestions relating to four broad themes: the broadcasting model, mandate and objectives, programming and funding, are discussed below. It must be noted that policy suggestions are made under the premise of an eclectic approach to media policy that underscores the developmental role of the media as well as being considerate of the context of Botswana’s political economy.

6.5.1 Broadcasting model

This study shows that efforts to later reform Btv into a public service broadcaster from a state broadcaster never materialised due to, among other factors, lack of political will. The need for the reform of Btv accords with earlier observations about restructuring state broadcasting in Africa into public service broadcasting (Fourie, 2003; Heuva, 2010; Kaswoswe, 2005; Zaffiro, 2000). However, the possible opportunity to reform Btv into a public service broadcaster, as provided for in the Broadcasting Act (1998) and as suggested in the interview findings, was replaced with a more draconian legislation, the BOCRA Act (2012) (See section 5.2.1.4 and 5.2.4). The new law, BOCRA (2012), exempts Btv, as a Government broadcaster, from the regulatory authority of an independent institution. Balule (2013a) explains that the consultation process on the establishment of the new regulatory regime was characterised by deceit, as the selling point for reforms was regulatory convergence, with no mention of reforms in the broadcasting sector. Even more disturbing was the lack of consultation regarding public expectations of the role of Btv. This lack of consultation is reflective of the political economy of communications postulation about the elite dominance of the media (Herman & Chomsky, 1988; Jere, 2010; Schiller, 1992)
These findings in this study also show that two competing models of public broadcasting are preferred in Botswana: state broadcasting and public service broadcasting. Most of the media professionals and media activists interviewed in this study advocated for public service broadcasting, similar to the literature on broadcasting reform in Botswana (Balule, 2013a, 2013b; Fombad, 2002; Zaffiro, 1992). On the other hand, most focus group participants in this study preferred the status quo of state owned broadcaster. Both models have advantages and limitations. The major premise of public service broadcasting is that the state and the market are driven by political and commercial objectives respectively, limiting their ability to pursue public interest goals (Devereux, 2007; Freedman, 2008; Herman & Chomsky, 1988). Most importantly, Jacka’s (2003) position, based on developed media markets, dismisses the assumption made in defence of public service broadcasting that other non-public service broadcasters, specifically commercial broadcasters, do not carry public service broadcasting obligations. The state broadcasting model is also limited, mainly in terms of the diversity of views and dominant government censorship of content (Barker, 2001; Fourie, 2003), as is the case with Btv. While this study did not set out to establish why the state broadcasting model is resilient in Botswana, a conclusion that the dominance of the state in national development in Botswana puts the Government at the centre of the political and economic system in Botswana can be drawn. This dominance of the state as opposed to the market driving national development is consistent with developmental media policy that suggests that the relationship between the media, the public and the state should be characterised by mutual advantage as opposed to complete autonomy (McKenzie, 2006; Waisbord, 2000). Within this context, it can therefore be suggested that a hybrid model informed by both public service and state broadcasting needs to be developed for contexts such as Botswana. Thus, a desirable model for a developing country such as Botswana would be one that is developmental in nature, with accountability to both the public and the state. This suggestion will undoubtedly be highly scrutinized, but there are some immediate dependable conclusions forming the basis of suggesting a hybrid model of broadcasting in Botswana. The television broadcasting system is relatively new, and provides a fertile environment for experimenting with new models. There are favourable democratic, economic and social conditions, such as a culture of participation and national unity that provide the basis for a hybrid model of broadcasting. The findings of this study that relate to how Btv, soon after its launch, appeared to be an independent broadcaster, further demonstrate that consistent with Botswana’s pragmatic approach to development, the same philosophy could
be adopted to re-align the television system to meet its developmental goals as would be agreed to by the government, media professionals and the public. In addition, the literature reflects that generally there is hybridization in broadcasting systems, mostly in developed media markets (Heap, 2005; Hujanen, 2000; Søndergaard, 1999). This hybridisation is mostly projected through various funding mechanisms. Funding will be discussed later in this chapter (Section 6.5.4)

6.5.2 Mandate and objectives

The findings of this study, similar to Zaffiro’s (1992) findings, suggest that there is a continuation of the need to clearly capture the objectives of government media in Botswana. The findings in this study reflect that there is inconsistency in the conceptualisation of the goals of television, specifically between the governing elites and media professionals. This inconsistency could be addressed through the formulation of a broadcasting charter and a board of directors. A charter guides the operations of the broadcaster, and a broadcasting board of directors oversees the performance of the service as prescribed in the broadcasting charter (Franklin, 2001). The absence of a charter and a board of directors in broadcasting in Botswana is a familiar feature of most African broadcasting systems (Mbaine, 2003; Ojo & Kadiri, 2001; UNESCO, 2001). Despite their absence in Africa, a broadcasting charter and an independent board are considered desirable as they are used to promote the media’s accountability, and are also used to judge the performance of broadcasters against the stipulated objectives stated in the charter (Harrison & Wessels, 2005; Heap, 2005). It can be suggested that this is one of the policy considerations needed in Botswana to improve the performance of Btv.

In this study, it was found that the three most prominent roles of the national broadcaster have been Btv’s roles in firstly, informing, educating, and entertaining; secondly, in disseminating information about Government policies as a way of mobilising the public towards national development; and thirdly, in cultural reflection. Thus, for Btv to really meet the expectations of its audiences, these objectives should be central to public broadcasting, while the other objectives mentioned in the preceding section, nation building and commercially-related objectives, can be peripheral.
6.5.3 Programming

The low level of local content is another media policy issue that can compromise Btv’s endeavours in national development. Local content averaged about 36% in the two years (2010 and 2011) reviewed in this study. Foreign content dominates the schedules, as elsewhere in Africa and other parts of the world (Havens, 2007; Murdock & Golding, 1973; Padovani & Tracey, 2003; Straubhaar, 2007; Thussu, 1998). The data from the document analysis shows that the Botswana Government has had a more technological determinist approach to broadcasting consistent with the modernisation paradigm. The documents reviewed showed that the Botswana Government has mostly focused on technological issues such as transmission, and overlooked the local content needs of Btv. The data from this study suggests policy failure – failure by the government to set targets for programming on Btv. Therefore, three key programming areas must be addressed: reducing foreign content; increasing cultural programming; and improving citizen engagement.

In an effort to improve what Waisbord (2003) calls communication sovereignty, states have intervened in cultural industries for cultural protectionist reasons. State intervention in the regulation of media markets, as demonstrated in India, China (Pashupati et al., 2003), Russia (Boyd-Barrett 2012) and in the European Union (EU) (Ogan, 2007), is a common practice in broadcasting policy. Likewise, although it is impossible to completely stop the flow of foreign content to maintain communication sovereignty (Hamelink, 1993; Waisbord, 2003), state intervention to address the flow of foreign content is inevitable in the case of Botswana. In an explanation of attempts to address issues of local content through regional efforts in Europe, Ogan (2007) demonstrated how an EU loans and subsidy project, European MEDIA, has supported co-productions in the region. The European Union (EU) has set a target of half EU content on national broadcasters’ schedules among EU member states. In addition, the EU secured tariff exemptions for member states from the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) on the grounds of cultural programming (Organ, 2007). This is despite the opposition to the quota system by the United States, on the grounds that quotas are a trade barrier (Organ, 2007). This issue of state intervention to ensure local content through regional negotiations is rarely addressed in the literature on media and development in Africa, despite the continent having organisations aimed at regional development, such as SADC.

Therefore, to improve cultural programming, the suggestion is that content quotas could be introduced on Btv. Addressing the situation of public service broadcasting in
Europe, Heap (2005) and Organ (2007) observed that most countries have quotas for local content, with the intention of supporting national cultures. Such quotas must relate to, among other issues, minority programming, minority language, and government programming. Related to quotas is the inclusion of ‘must carry’ clauses in policy broadcast charters and regulatory documents to demonstrate the need to address deficiencies such as programming for minority audiences. Within these quotas, there is a likelihood of improved pluralism in television content. Quotas could ensure pluralism by reducing the tendency of programs to be dominated by a few sectors of society, which has been found in this study to be the concern of some focus group participants.

Next, to ensure engagement with the public, which according to the findings of this study is an issue that needs to be addressed, there is a need to explore ways of involving the citizens in program acquisition or production at Btv. An example from Malta sheds more light on this. The Maltese broadcasting policy provides for what are called Program Statements of Intent, outlining the programming needs, and evaluation criteria for content acquisition, which the public has input in (Borg, 2006). In the context of Botswana, consultation (therisano) is a very central issue. Existing consultative fora such as radio phone-in programs, kgotla meetings, and social media such as Facebook could be used to gain input from audiences in programming related issues. Public engagement in Botswana is an established tradition that involves civil servants addressing the public at kgotla meetings as a consultative forum. Likewise, the state radio and even commercial radio has phone-in programs that are normally used as consultative forums where Government officials, in this case media professionals, can take suggestions from the public about the citizens’ expectations from the national broadcaster. Bearing in mind that television is relatively new in Botswana, the media professionals may also need to explain some of their activities to the public for more buy-in of the services offered by Btv.

6.5.4 Funding
In view of the various funding models for the media, such as state appropriation (Hoskins & McFadyen, 1992; Mbaine, 2003), advertising, license fees (Franklin, 2001; Jennings & O'Hagan, 2003) and other hybrid models such as a combination of state appropriation and license fee (Teer-Tomaselli, 2006) and the existing socio-economic conditions of Botswana, a hybrid approach to funding Btv is suggested. Unlike other countries, for example South Africa, where there are attempts to collect license fees for television set owners, the
Government of Botswana seems reluctant to explore this alternative. It has been acknowledged in the literature that the collection of license fees is challenging in some contexts due to insufficient resources (Banerjee & Seneviratne, 2005; Ojo & Kadiri, 2001), and in this regard Botswana is no exception. The license fee was rejected as a funding model in the 1960’s (Hughes, 1968); soon after independence when there was abject poverty. Despite improved living conditions, the license fee is still considered inapplicable, probably because of the overall national development strategy of equal access to infrastructure (Harvey & Lewis, 1990). If a fee is set, it will have to be universal in Botswana, consistent with the national objective of social justice and equal access to national resources. But with the persisting challenges of poverty and unemployment, as stated in Chapter 1, the license fee model of funding is currently limited. However, further work is needed to understand how prepared Botswana is to introduce a license fee.

Btv, similar to other broadcasters, generates revenue through advertising. However, there is need for broader Government policy to consider allocation of revenue generated by Btv. The findings of this study show that advertising revenue generated by Btv goes into the general Government coffers. However, financial exemption legislation could provide for some of the funds to be used to improve local content production on Btv. One example of a funding model involves the Botswana Police Service (BPS). The BPS bargained for half of the share of traffic fines (Gaotlhobogwe, 2012). Another example, although a little remote, is the use of the funds from the alcohol levy fund. These funds have financed diverse initiatives, such as the Ministry of Sport, Youth and Culture, which received 45% of the available revenue; and the Ministry of Health, which received 10%. The remaining 45% went to the Government (Sebonego, n.d). In Thailand, alternative funding models include the ‘Sin tax’ that involves funds from alcohol and tobacco taxes (Im, 2011). Thus, funding for government institutions could be derived from various sources. In the case of Btv, the Government of Botswana could allow the broadcaster access to a certain percentage of advertising revenue from Btv as opposed to depositing all the money into the government account. Funds from this arrangement could augment local content production funding, especially for programs such as cultural reflection content that seems to attract less sponsorship from the commercial sector in Botswana.

The use of various funding techniques, such as sponsorships and advertising in addition to Government funds, to ensure content production, reflects a hybrid approach to funding a national television service in Botswana. However, as described in the preceding

233
sections, the socio-economic situation of Botswana which involves a mineral and state
-dominated economy, as well as poverty and unemployment, indicates the complexities of
factors to be considered in implementing policies aimed at improving the performance of Btv
as a service involved in the modernisation process of Botswana.

6.6 Contribution of the thesis to knowledge
This thesis has theoretical, methodological and policy contributions. One of the major
theoretical challenges of this study is that there is extensive evidence in the literature
suggesting the inapplicability of the modernisation paradigm in developing countries
(Manyozo, 2012; Sachs, 2010; Servaes, 1999, 2004). The findings of this thesis, in the case
of Botswana, suggest a contradictory conclusion to the dominant view about the failure of the
modernisation paradigm. Taken together, despite the limitations such as state control, foreign
content and limited cultural programming, the positive factors such as planning for the
introduction of the service, improved transmission signal access, diverse programs aimed at
developmental issues such as health, education and agriculture and use of the national
language, are some of the factors that validate the applicability of the modernisation
paradigm of development communication in the Botswana context.

Furthermore, the use of a political economy approach has allowed for a balanced
understanding of the contextual socio-economic and political factors of Botswana that impact
on the performance of Btv. While most studies have critiqued modernisation for failing in
developing countries (Curran & Park, 2000; Melkote, 2012), few studies have analysed the
economic, social and political contextual factors that impact on the performance of national
television through a political economy approach (Mosime, 2007; Moyo & Chuma, 2010;
Rodrigues, 2006). Most studies have analysed the media systems of developing countries
within the theoretical framework of media imperialism (Boyd-Barrett, 1977, Hamelink, 1993)
and globalisation (Appadurai, 2006; Chang, 2003; Sreberny, 2006). The findings of this study
propose that in contexts such as Botswana, where the state has to contend with the logic of
circumstances, such as first providing infrastructure and social services as part of
modernisation, the introduction of national television is secondary.

This thesis also contributes to the literature on broadcasting in Botswana, specifically
television broadcasting. The findings of this study extend the literature on media and society
in Botswana by exploring the role of television in national development in Botswana. This is
because few studies have been conducted on Btv from a modernisation and political economy perspective.

This study has methodological contributions too. With attempts at a holistic approach to studying media history, production, content and audiences, this study used four methods of data collection: document analysis; schedule analysis; focus group discussions; and interviews. Using interviews and document analysis was central to synthesising issues related to media production at Btv. The understanding of media production is essential in examining how the political and economic factors such as ownership and state control impact on Btv content. A broader view of media content was also achieved through using schedule analysis, which generated data relating to the extent to which Btv serves the developmental goals of Botswana through the channel’s programming. The study’s use of schedule analysis, instead of content analysis, is another unique point of departure in an attempt to explore programming, using a non-traditional approach to analyse media content. While content analysis is sufficient for the analysis of media text, it is mostly limited to the analysis of selected programs. Thus, the use of schedule analysis provided a bigger picture of the program output of the Btv. Also, the use of focus group discussions allowed for the exploration of issues relating to the reception of Btv’s media content. In this context, the focus groups generated data pertaining to the audience understanding of the role of television in national development in Botswana, as well as their perceptions of the type of broadcasting system they prefer. In all, the use of the four methods was especially important in that few studies reviewed by this researcher in this study have approached the analysis of media from the various possible angles attempted in this study. This methodological approach to studying media is also unique in that none of the previous studies on television broadcasting in Botswana have used this approach. Interviews and document analysis are the most widely used method (Balule, 2013b; Mosime, 2007), and audience studies focusing on viewing patterns has been the domain of commissioned research (Probe Market Intelligence, 2009; Thapisa & Megwa, 2002). Thus, the use of the four methods has provided robust data that contributes to the knowledge about media and development in Botswana through the integration of diverse areas of media studies that include production, content, and reception. With the all-encompassing view attempted in this study, there are sufficient grounds for further studies to explore the broadcasting philosophy of Botswana.

This study has policy contributions through suggestions of policy issues that should frame national television broadcasting in Botswana and other countries with almost similar
contexts. This study was conducted at a relatively early stage of national television broadcasting in Botswana. As such, it adds to the very scant literature on media and development, and media policy in Botswana. As outlined in Section 6.5 above, this study has enumerated a number of policy suggestions for consideration to align Btv with the broader national development strategies and objectives. The suggestions on media policy are informed by the understanding that the policy decisions made in the service’s early years are the foundation for future decisions about the goals of television broadcasting in Botswana, hence appropriate policies should be considered to align the role of television to the broader national social policy objectives relating to development and democracy. As there is evidence in the literature pointing to emerging disillusionment with the Government in Botswana due to perceptions of inequality relating to unemployment, poverty and marginalisation of ethnic minorities, the policy considerations suggested in this study contribute to some of the issues the Botswana Government may have to grapple with to enhance national social policy objectives of development and democracy.

6.7 Limitations of the study and suggestions for future research

This study had a number of methodological limitations. The limitations relate to the research approach and research sites. Firstly, the research approach in this study is qualitative. Although the qualitative methodology employed in this study was sufficient to generate data to answer the research questions, a combination of quantitative and qualitative data could have yielded triangulated data to generate generalizable findings. Future studies could incorporate quantitative data to investigate audience perceptions of the role of the media in national development through a survey as this allows for a much wider sample size than focus group discussions, again suggesting a more generalizable data (Wimmer & Dominick, 2006). Due to the small sample size, even though various demographics were considered in the recruitment of the focus group discussants, the sample size limited the extent to which the demographic variables impacted or did not impact on focus group discussants data. This limitation can be addressed by future studies combining focus group discussions and survey data to increase the sample size.

Secondly, a limitation of this study relates to research sites. While this study has attempted to cover diverse research sites, due to the sparse population and huge land mass of Botswana, the researcher faced practical limitations relating to accessing the remotest areas of Botswana. This was mainly due to financial and time constraints. In view of this, the
remote test areas in northern Botswana and western Botswana were challenging to access. The lack of access to these remote areas has implications on this study and its focus on national development, as the remotest areas of Botswana tend to have high prevalence of poverty and unemployment (Nthomang, 2004). Further studies can solicit wider audience views from these areas, where development communication could be most needed due to high levels of social inequality in these areas.

6.8 Conclusion

This study examined the dynamic interaction between media, national development and media policy in Botswana through an analysis of a national television service, Btv. The main research question was to explore the role of television in national development in Botswana. This section provides the conclusion of the study, which is presented based on the research questions of the study.

RQ1. What is the role of Btv in national development in Botswana?

Regarding this research question, a conclusion that can be reached is that the roles ascribed for a national television service are largely consistent with the roles of the media in the modernisation paradigm of development communication. In general, it seems that development (ditlhabololo), which is one of the national guiding principles in Botswana, is central to the role of the Btv in Botswana society. The Government officials, media policy activists, and the focus group discussants in this study shared a common understanding that Btv has to be a medium for diffusing development ideas initiated by the Botswana government, for possible adoption by the public. The role of Btv in disseminating Government information is compounded by the existing socio-economic structure where the government is at the centre of national development in Botswana. Thus, this thesis has contributed to existing literature on the ubiquitous role of the media in informing and educating the public in a developing country context. In addition, the thesis has demonstrated that the role of television in national development has nuances of more relational issues as opposed to contentions over the role of the media in national development. Put differently, there is more divergence on how Btv should play its role in national development, as opposed to what should be its role in national development. Future studies can address this relational issue about how Btv should play a role in national development in Botswana, in view of the
evidence in this study suggesting that the political elites are using their legitimacy and national development consensus as mechanisms for state control of the media.

RQ2. **What are the socio-economic and political factors that have shaped the overall performance of Btv?**

As regard the second question of this study, two conclusions can be reached and they relate to state control and lack of a formal policy framework. Due to the national development context that is controlled by the Government, it is inevitable, in the case of Btv, that the Government dominates and influences the operations of Btv. Invariably, Btv faces challenges of government control, self-censorship, foreign content, lack of broadcast policy, limited funding, and limited public participation in program production. However, as a television service that was launched in 2000 with improved infrastructure, poor technical quality of content and overly urban biased content have been minimised in Botswana. These issues plagued many broadcasters in Africa in the 1950s through to the 1980s when most studies on modernisation paradigm were done (Katz & Wedell, 1977; Mytton, 1983; Wilcox, 1975). The service has also made strides in using the Setswana language in its programming. The media professionals at Btv have also made strategic decisions to give prominence to local content. But Btv’s role in national development is limited by lack of formal policy framework that can direct and set parameters for the broadcaster to ensure it serves the interests of the state, and the public. Media policy is essential in that as reflected in Chapter 1, there are emerging challenges for Botswana that relate to social inequality. Moreover, the popularity of the ruling BDP has been declining over the years. With these emerging contexts, the media such as Btv may remain vulnerable to more state control in the event the ruling party and the government feel threatened.

RQ3. **What policy considerations could drive a national television broadcasting system in Botswana?**

Turning now to the last research question of this thesis that focuses on policy considerations to improve the performance of Btv, it can be concluded that policy deliberations should be informed by a development oriented approach to policy and regulation of Btv. This approach implies that prioritization of issues should be informed by their alignment with national development of Botswana as perceived by both the government and the public. The other conclusion related to media policy is that the emerging trend of exemption of Btv from
existing regulatory frameworks is a major drawback and the service is susceptible to being diverted to pursue the elitist interests of either media professionals or governing elites. To address this major limitation with television broadcasting in Botswana, it can be concluded that the issues of the mandate, objectives, programming requirements, and funding of the state owned service should be addressed in formal policy documents. Thus, the policy suggestions stated in this study are expected to provide advice in the formulation of media policy in Botswana.

In the final analysis, this study of television broadcasting in Botswana has provided critical reflections on broadcasting in small countries such as Botswana. Overall, the social, economic and political context of Botswana provides a case study to understanding media in a context where modernisation prerequisites, such as economic growth and democracy are prevalent. In such a context, this study has shown that Btv’s performance regarding its role in national development faces limitations, which relate to media policy.
References


Ahuvia, A. (2001). Traditional, interpretive, and reception based content analyses: Improving the ability of content analysis to address issues of pragmatic and theoretical concern. *Social Indicators Research, 54*(2), 139-172. doi: 10.1023/a:1011087813505


Broadcasting Regulations 2004. 72:04. (Botswana)


*Communications and Regulatory Authority Act 2012. 72:03* (Botswana).


Im, S. (2011). *A public service broadcasting model for developing countries: The case of Cambodia*. (Doctor of Philosophy), Scripps College of Communication of Ohio University.


Makgato-Malesu (2011, March ). [Keynote address by the Minister of Trade and Industry, Hon Dorcas Makgato Malesu, on the occasion of the national consultative and dissemination workshop on public service broadcasting in Botswana.]. Gaborone, Botswana.


Merafhe, M. (2012). [Keynote address by His Honour the vice president Lt. Gen Mompati Sebogodi Merafhe at the official opening of the launch of the poverty eradication programme and guidelines].


Office of the President. (n.d-a). *Revised communications strategy for information services falling under the office of the president*. Gaborone, Botswana.


development communication. Approaches to development communication. Paris:
UNESCO.

international perspective. In J. Servaes (Ed.), Communication for development and
social change (pp. 158-179). New Delhi, India: Sage.

passing of traditional society. Retrieved from
http://muse.jhu.edu.ezproxy.library.uq.edu.au/books/9781439906262/


Simmons, L. (2004). Television then. In R. Horrocks & N. Perry (Eds.), Television in New
Zealand: Programming the nation (pp. 44-73). South Melbourne, Victoria, Australia:
Oxford University Press.


campaigns. In R. E. Rice & C. Atkin (Eds.), Public communication campaigns. (pp.

A. Singhal, M.J. Cody, E.M. Rogers, and M. Sabido, M. (Eds) Entertainment
education and social change: History, research, and practice (pp. 3-20). Mahwah,
NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Singleton, R., & Straits, B. (2010). Approaches to social research (5th ed.). New York:
Oxford University Press.

and public policy: change and continuity in an era of global liberalization (pp. 3-26).


Smythe, D. W. (1981). Dependency road: Communications, capitalism, consciousness and

southern African studies, 28(4), 711-729. doi: 10.1080/0305707022000043485


Sparks, C. (2007). What's wrong with globalization? Global Media and Communication,
3(2), 133-155. doi: 10.1177/1742766507078413

265


Appendices

Appendix 1  Documents Reviewed in the Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Where collected</th>
<th>Document Synopsis</th>
<th>Data analysed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broadcasting Act (1998)</td>
<td>Legal document</td>
<td>Government Printer, (BTA website)</td>
<td>Legal provisions for broadcasting in Botswana</td>
<td>• Licensing, broadcast models • Local content regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Draft broadcasting policy (2006)</td>
<td>Legal document</td>
<td>BTA</td>
<td>Goals and objectives of broadcasting system</td>
<td>• Status of broadcasting. • Broadcasting reforms. • Local content issues • Citizen access to Btv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawrence Report (1978)</td>
<td>Consultancy Report</td>
<td>Botswana National Archives. Department of Information Services library</td>
<td>Assessment of government media, and policy alternatives to be considered</td>
<td>• Functions of government owned media. • Policy options for government media.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An African</td>
<td>Personal</td>
<td>Kevin Hunt (sent</td>
<td>Outlines the</td>
<td>• Beginning of</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

271
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Btv</th>
<th>Btv</th>
<th>Role of Btv</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tale-The Story of Botswana Television (2000)</td>
<td>article</td>
<td>by email</td>
<td>beginnings of Btv</td>
<td>Btv project. • Role of Btv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revised Communications Strategy for Information Services falling under the Office of the President (no date)</td>
<td>Report</td>
<td>Btv</td>
<td>Government communications (BGCIS and DIS)</td>
<td>Role of government broadcasters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Broadcasting Services (n.d.)</td>
<td>Brochure</td>
<td>Btv, Consumer Fair</td>
<td>Background information about DBS</td>
<td>• Vision, mission, structure, • Role of DBS.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Hughes Report</td>
<td>Consultancy Report</td>
<td>Botswana National Archives (Record number, DIS 7/1)</td>
<td>Assessment of government owned media and media policy alternatives</td>
<td>Government owned media functions and operations in the 1960s to 1970s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Development Plans (Transitional National Development Plan, NDP1, NDP9, NDP 10)</td>
<td>Government Document</td>
<td>(Government website. Government printer, Botswana National Archives)</td>
<td>Planned national development projects and initiatives, and associated expenditure</td>
<td>• Performance of the media. • Planned development projects relating to Btv. • Role of the media in national development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Role of Internet Botswana</td>
<td>Background</td>
<td>Vision, mission, and</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

47 The document collected was not dated. It was accessed in 2011. The latest date referred to in the text of the document is 2008. The researcher concluded that the document was produced between 2008 and 2011.

48 The brochure refers to the financial year 2006/07, and the information about the advertising rates is dated 2007, therefore, the researcher concluded that the document was published in 2007.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>state media information (Government)</th>
<th>Government website (<a href="http://www.gov.bw">www.gov.bw</a>)</th>
<th>information about DBS and Btv.</th>
<th>role of government owned media.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>From the Director Internet information (DBS)</td>
<td>Btv website (<a href="http://www.btv.gov.bw">www.btv.gov.bw</a>)</td>
<td>Overview of Btv</td>
<td>• The role of Btv, • Local content, • Citizen access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speech by Minister of Trade and Industry</td>
<td>Speech</td>
<td>MISA BGCIS</td>
<td>Government’s support of the workshop on transforming state broadcasters in Botswana.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ fieldwork notes

---

49 This link might be inaccessible, but at the time of data collection, it was accessible.
# Appendix 2  Composite Week Schedule, 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Monday</th>
<th>Tuesday</th>
<th>Wednesday</th>
<th>Thursday</th>
<th>Friday</th>
<th>Saturday</th>
<th>Sunday</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 February 2010</td>
<td>9 March 2010</td>
<td>28 April 2010</td>
<td>17 June 2010</td>
<td>20 August 2010</td>
<td>30 October</td>
<td>07 November</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06:00 06:30</td>
<td>Phatsima</td>
<td>Phatsima</td>
<td>Phatsima</td>
<td>Phatsima</td>
<td>Phatsima</td>
<td>Breakfast</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td></td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06:30 07:00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07:00 07:30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07:30 08:00</td>
<td>Dora rpt</td>
<td>Dragon tales rpt</td>
<td>Air academy rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td>Adv. Of Paddington rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08:00 08:30</td>
<td>Sesame street rpt</td>
<td>Sesame street rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td>Spain vs Switzerland rpt</td>
<td>Dog star rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08:30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Dora rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td>Penguins</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Run adventure rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00 09:30</td>
<td>History of Christianity</td>
<td>Brainwave rpt</td>
<td>Aqua kids rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:30</td>
<td>One on one rpt</td>
<td>Girl Friends rpt</td>
<td>My African dream rpt</td>
<td>South Africa vs Uruguay (rpt)</td>
<td>Black hole high rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00</td>
<td>Mantlwaneng rpt</td>
<td>Bare beauty rpt</td>
<td>My star rpt</td>
<td>The bold and the beautiful rpt</td>
<td>KONG</td>
<td>700 club</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00 10:30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30</td>
<td>History of Christianity rpt</td>
<td>11:00</td>
<td>Around the world in 80 days rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00</td>
<td>Touch net rpt</td>
<td>11:15</td>
<td>Mantlwaneng</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15</td>
<td>Agriculture rpt</td>
<td>11:15</td>
<td>Turning point</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30</td>
<td>Silent shout rpt</td>
<td>11:45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:45</td>
<td>Mokaragana rpt</td>
<td>11:30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00</td>
<td>Sports round up rpt</td>
<td>12:15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:15</td>
<td>Honduras vs Chile repeat</td>
<td>12:30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30</td>
<td>Talk back rpt</td>
<td>12:45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:45</td>
<td>Agriculture rpt</td>
<td>13:00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00</td>
<td>Silent shout rpt</td>
<td>13:30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30</td>
<td>Mokaragana rpt</td>
<td>14:00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00</td>
<td>Sports round up rpt</td>
<td>14:15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:15</td>
<td>Honduras vs Chile repeat</td>
<td>14:30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30</td>
<td>Talk back rpt</td>
<td>15:00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00</td>
<td>Agriculture rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Air academy</td>
<td>Macdonald's farm</td>
<td>World cup studio</td>
<td>Flippa and Lopaka</td>
<td>Go Diego</td>
<td>Boxing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00</td>
<td>Sesame</td>
<td>Play with me sesame</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:30</td>
<td>Macdonald's farm</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00</td>
<td>World cup studio</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:30</td>
<td>Air academy</td>
<td>Play with me sesame</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00</td>
<td>Macdonald's farm</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00</td>
<td>World cup studio</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:30</td>
<td>Winning women rpt</td>
<td>NBA action rpt</td>
<td>700 club rpt</td>
<td>Greece Vs Nigeria</td>
<td>Backyard science</td>
<td>Volley ball semi-finals</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:30</td>
<td>Jane see and so</td>
<td>Bigger things</td>
<td>The new tomorrow</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00</td>
<td>Aqua kids</td>
<td>Mantlwaneng</td>
<td>Worldwide sport</td>
<td>Steve and Chris rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00</td>
<td>Jobs for juniors</td>
<td>Get reel music</td>
<td>Real life 101</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:30</td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
<td>Miss World 2010</td>
<td>America got talent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:00</td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:10</td>
<td>Brainwave</td>
<td>Pulse</td>
<td>Sedibeng</td>
<td>Dark kink in my hair</td>
<td>The bold and the beautiful</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:30</td>
<td>Bare beauty</td>
<td>Silent shout</td>
<td>Lobebe</td>
<td>filler</td>
<td>Mr cooper</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:00</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:30</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>First Issues</td>
<td>Be mobile premier league mid</td>
<td>Initiative</td>
<td>Dikopane</td>
<td>Prime time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:30</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20:00</td>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>First Issues</td>
<td>Be mobile premier league mid</td>
<td>Initiative</td>
<td>Dikopane</td>
<td>Prime time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

276
## Appendix 3. Composite Week Schedule, 2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>05:55</td>
<td>phatsima</td>
<td>phatsima</td>
<td>phatsima</td>
<td>Phatsima</td>
<td>phatsima</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06:00</td>
<td>06:30</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06:30</td>
<td>07:00</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07:00</td>
<td>07:30</td>
<td>Spider rider</td>
<td>Banana in pjs</td>
<td>Adv. Of Paddington rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07:30</td>
<td>08:00</td>
<td>Flipper and lopaka</td>
<td>Ultimate book of spell</td>
<td>Bird squad rpt</td>
<td>Dog star rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08:00</td>
<td>08:30</td>
<td>Go Diego rpt</td>
<td>Magination</td>
<td>Dora the Explorer</td>
<td>Penguins rpt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08:30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Kong</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00</td>
<td>09:30</td>
<td>Rules of engagement rpt</td>
<td>The Bold and the Beautiful rpt</td>
<td>My star rpt</td>
<td>Number jacks</td>
<td>Skyland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00</td>
<td></td>
<td>Police itshereletse rpt</td>
<td>Primetime Life</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Phatsima</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Phatsima</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

278
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10:00</td>
<td>Molemo wa kgang rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30</td>
<td>Flavadome rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The bold and the beautiful (rpt)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The bold and the beautiful (rpt)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The bold and the beautiful (rpt)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mantlwaneng</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>700 club</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30</td>
<td>Mr cooper rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sports filler</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Silent shout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Turning point</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00</td>
<td>Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15</td>
<td>Are you afraid of the dark rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Silent shout</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Are you afraid of the dark rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The world game</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Talk back rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15</td>
<td>Discover Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30</td>
<td>Close up rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inside Hollywood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>700 club rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7th heaven rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30</td>
<td>Design and technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:45</td>
<td>Close up rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inside Hollywood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>700 club rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7th heaven rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:45</td>
<td>Maths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00</td>
<td>Maths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00</td>
<td>Talk back live (Talk show)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:15</td>
<td>Revision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30</td>
<td>Flava dome rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Turning point</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Quantum Magazine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prime time rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30</td>
<td>IT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:45</td>
<td>Beyond school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30</td>
<td>Race max</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30</td>
<td>Melodi ya dinnoto rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00</td>
<td>MAD rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rebina mmogo rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Boys over flowers rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00</td>
<td>Dignash rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ghost trackers rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 and ½ men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00</td>
<td>Darts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00</td>
<td>The world game</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00</td>
<td>Reina mmogo rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Small ville)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The world game</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Darts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30</td>
<td>7th heaven rpt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sesame</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00</td>
<td>Adventures of Paddington</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:00</td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>News Headlines (English)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:10</td>
<td>Everybody hates Chris</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The bold and the beautiful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Bold and the Beautiful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Bold and the Beautiful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Matlhodiala a 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:30 19:00</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:00 19:30</td>
<td>Dikgang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:30 20:00</td>
<td>Agriculture Tsa Temothuo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20:00 2030</td>
<td>NEWS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20:30 21:00</td>
<td>Friends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21:00 Shuga 1</td>
<td>Friends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21:30 Dinoga tsa Botswana 8</td>
<td>Unique whips</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22:00 Ally Mcbeal</td>
<td>The album show</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23:00 23:30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23:30 0555</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 4. An example of a Btv program brief

Program: TALK BACK

TalkBack is a 48 minute weekly live multimedia distance educational talk program.

TalkBack’s main objective is to contribute to breaking the silence associated with HIV and AIDS in the classroom setting, as a result creating an opportunity for relevant behavioural change.

The program (TalkBack)’s other objective is to empower teachers with relevant knowledge and skills on interactive methods in the teaching of HIV and AIDS through the use of television. TalkBack believes that this will help to break down the cultural barriers which prevent the young and the old to discuss sex and sexuality issues, reduce denial, secrecy and stigma surrounding HIV and AIDS.

TalkBack has teachers as its primary target, while students and the community are secondary beneficiaries. It allows interactivity with teachers through phone-ins, SMS messaging and letters. It an English program.
## Appendix 5. Generic schedule Btv (2011–2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Monday</th>
<th>Tuesday</th>
<th>Wednesday</th>
<th>Thursday</th>
<th>Friday</th>
<th>Saturday</th>
<th>Sunday</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>05:55–06:00</td>
<td>Inspirational / Religious</td>
<td>Inspiration al / Religious</td>
<td>Inspirational / Religious</td>
<td>Inspirational / Religious</td>
<td>Inspirational / Religious</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06:00 – 06:30</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast Show</td>
<td>Breakfast Show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06:30 – 07:00</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast Show</td>
<td>Breakfast Show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07:00 – 07:30</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast Show</td>
<td>Breakfast Show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07:30 – 08:00</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td>Breakfast Show</td>
<td>Breakfast Show</td>
<td>Breakfast show</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08:00 – 08:30</td>
<td>cartoon</td>
<td>cartoon</td>
<td>cartoon</td>
<td>cartoons</td>
<td>cartoons</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08:30 – 09:00</td>
<td>cartoon</td>
<td>cartoon</td>
<td>cartoon</td>
<td>Cartoon</td>
<td>cartoon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00 – 09:30</td>
<td>Soap (repeat)</td>
<td>Soap (repeat)</td>
<td>Soap (repeat)</td>
<td>Soap (repeat)</td>
<td>Soap (repeat)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:30 – 10:00</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Motivational / Inspirational / religious</td>
<td>Motivational / Inspirational / religious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00 – 10:30</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Children magazine</td>
<td>RELIGIOUS Magazine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30 – 11:00</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Channel repeats</td>
<td>Youth talk show</td>
<td>RELIGIOUS Magazine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Education al Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Religious /moral education/Worship</td>
<td>Choral music /folk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00 – 11:30</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Education al Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30 – 12:00</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Education al Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00 – 12:30</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Health talk show (Talk back)</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30 – 13:00</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td>Educational Broadcasts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00 – 13:30</td>
<td>News (Setswana)</td>
<td>News (Setswana)</td>
<td>News (Setswana)</td>
<td>News (Setswana)</td>
<td>News (Setswana)</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td>Musical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30 – 14:00</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00 – 14:30</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30 – 15:00</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00 – 15:30</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:30 – 16:00</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Children</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00 – 16:15</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:15 – 16:30</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:30 – 17:00</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00 – 17:30</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Youth programs</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:30 –</td>
<td>Talk Shows</td>
<td>Talk Shows</td>
<td>Talk Shows</td>
<td>Talk</td>
<td>Talk Shows</td>
<td>Sport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time</td>
<td>Silent Shout</td>
<td>Shows</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:00</td>
<td>Silent Shout</td>
<td>Shows</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:00 – 18:10</td>
<td>News Headlines [English]</td>
<td>News Headlines [English]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:10 – 18:30</td>
<td>Soap</td>
<td>Soap</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:30 – 19:00</td>
<td>Sitcom</td>
<td>Sitcom</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:00 – 19:30</td>
<td>News (Setswana)</td>
<td>News (Setswana)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:30 – 20:00</td>
<td>Agriculture and life Magazine show</td>
<td>Business Magazine show (First issues)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20:00 – 20:30</td>
<td>News (English)</td>
<td>News (English)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Announcements**

- News Headlines [English]
- News (Setswana)
- News (English)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Drama</th>
<th>Current Affairs</th>
<th>Drama</th>
<th>Family and lifestyle Talk shows</th>
<th>Entertainment shows</th>
<th>Entertainment shows</th>
<th>Politics Talk shows</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20:30 – 21:00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21:00 – 21:30</td>
<td>Sports magazine shows</td>
<td></td>
<td>Documentar y</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21:30 – 22:00</td>
<td>Talent development productions</td>
<td>Talent development productions</td>
<td>Talent development productions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Drama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22:00 – 23:00</td>
<td>Drama</td>
<td>Reality</td>
<td>Movie</td>
<td>Reality</td>
<td>Movie</td>
<td>Movie</td>
<td>Drama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23:00 – 00:00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>00:00 – 05:55</td>
<td>International Feed</td>
<td>Internatio nal Feed</td>
<td>International Feed</td>
<td>Internatio nal Feed</td>
<td>International Feed</td>
<td>International Feed</td>
<td>International Feed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Btv Schedules
Appendix 6. Information Sheet (Interview)

Television in Botswana; Development and Policy Perspectives

Dear Participant,

I am a student at the School of Journalism and Communication, University of Queensland, (Australia). I am conducting interviews as one of the methods for collecting data for my study on ‘Television in Botswana; Development and Policy Perspectives’ which is a PhD research project.

Purpose

This study aims to explore television broadcasting in Botswana, by analysing the role, structure and performance of Btv to determine the role of the media in a developing country like Botswana. As a result, there is need for information pertaining to local content on television, which I intend to source from your participation in this study.

Research Procedure

The interview will be face to face, at a mutually convenient location. It will take approximately 45 minutes to an hour. The interview will be in your preferred language, and will be audio-recorded to accurately capture the discussion.

Voluntary Participation

Although your participation in this study is very important and will be highly appreciated, your participation is voluntary. You are within your rights to withdraw from the study before or during the interview.

Anonymity and Confidentiality

The data collected from this study will be handled in a very strict, confidential manner, and will only be accessible to those involved in this study. The interview material will be kept in a safe and lockable cabinet. In addition, the researcher will not use your names, or any information that may lead to your identification.
Risks

The study poses no risk to you, in that you will remain anonymous, and the interview will be done at a place convenient to you.

Access to findings

The findings will be made available to you if you would like to access them.

If you have any question about the study, please feel free to contact me, or any of my supervisors. Our contact details are below.

Thank you

Seamogano Mosanako

School of Journalism and Communication
University of Queensland
Brisbane 4072
Australia
Mobile +61 0420721576 or 72152201 (Botswana)
Email: seamogano.mosanako@uqconnect.edu.au

Advisors

1. Dr Levi Obijiofor
   School of Journalism and Communication
   University of Queensland
   Brisbane 4072
   Australia
   Email: l.obijiofor@uq.edu.au

2. Ass. Prof Eric Louw
   School of Journalism and Communication
   University of Queensland
   Brisbane, 4072
   Australia
   Email: e.louw@uq.edu.au

This study adheres to the Guidelines of the ethical review process of The University of Queensland. Whilst you are free to discuss your participation in this study with the researcher and the advisors, if you would like to speak to an officer of the University not involved in the study, you may contact the Ethics Officer on 33653924, or School of Journalism and Communication Research Ethics Committee Chair, Associate Professor Eric Louw (e.louw@uq.edu.au).
Appendix 7. Participant’s Consent Form

Participant's Agreement:

- I understand the purpose of this study, which has been explained to me verbally, and in a written form.
- I am aware that my participation in this interview is voluntary.
- I am aware I can withdraw from this study before or during the interview.
- I understand the data gathered in this study are confidential with respect to my personal identity unless I specify otherwise. The data will also be kept in a safe place.
- I am aware the data will be used in a PhD thesis, which will be publicly available at the University of Queensland library.
- The researcher has reviewed the benefits and risks of this project with me.
- I consent to the interview being audio-recorded. Yes ☐ No ☐

I have been offered a copy of this consent form that I may keep for my own reference. I have read the above form and have discussed and cleared any issues with the researcher; and understand that I can contact the researcher if I have any questions about this study; and I consent to participate in today's interview.

_______________________  ____________________
Participant's signature      Date

__________________________
Interviewer's signature

Researcher: Seamogano Mosanako  seamogano.mosanako@uqconnect.edu.au

Advisors:  Dr Levi Obijiofor  l.obijiofor@uq.edu.au

As. Prof Eric Louw  e.louw@uq.edu.au
### Appendix 8. Interview Guide by Category of Interviewees

**Television production**

- In your view why was a national television established in Botswana?

- What is its role in national development in Botswana?

- Are you exactly aware of what Btv audiences like to watch on television and what they don’t like to watch?

- Why are there discrepancies/gaps in what you are offering and what the audiences like? What informs program selection and production choices?

- Have there been audience surveys to inform programming choices? If not, on what basis do you determine which programs Btv should broadcast?

- The audience discussions reflect varying perceptions of the role of Btv? How do you explain this?

- Why do you think there is disenchantment among various stakeholders about the contents of Btv?

- In your view what are the challenges facing Btv in relation to content production?

- In your view, what should be done to improve the performance of the national broadcaster?

- What are your thoughts on broadcast reform (s) in Botswana, most specifically relating to Btv or state media?

---

**Btv Project Team**
Please share your experiences about the establishment of a national television in Botswana, regarding why it was established, and your involvement in the introduction of the service?

- Why was a national television established in Botswana?
- In your view, what is the role of television in national development in Botswana?
- What are your perceptions of local content on national television?
- In your view what are the factors impacting on the performance of Btv?
- How has Btv changed over the years? Please explain these changes.
- How do you think broadcasting should be reformed in Botswana?

**Policy makers**

- What national objectives informed the establishment of Btv? Why was a national television established in Botswana?
- In a sentence or two, what is the role of television in Botswana?
- What are your perceptions of local content on national television?
- How has Btv changed over the years? Please explain these changes.
- In your view, what is the role of television in national development in Botswana?
- How do you think broadcasting should be reformed in Botswana?
- What are the challenges involved in regulating Btv?

**Media industry interest group**

- What are your views on Btv programs?
- What are your views on local content that are broadcast on Btv?
- In your view, what is the role of television in national development in Botswana?
- Btv meeting that role?
- What challenges do you see confronting Btv as the national broadcaster?
- Is there any policy consideration(s) you think should be made to improve the performance of the national broadcaster?
Appendix 9. Focus Group Discussion Guide

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 1: Introductions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Myself</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Study purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Focus groups discussants self-introductions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ethical issues (consent form)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ground rules</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 2: Factual information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What are their preferred television channels and why?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are their preferred programs and why?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 3: Perceptions and opinions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• What are their thoughts about the need for a television service in Botswana? Why was a national television service necessary concerning national development in Botswana?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are their perceptions about Btv?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are their perceptions about Btv?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are their perceptions about local content?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Does programming reflect their content needs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Does content reflect their lifestyle?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How useful do they find local content?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What are their expectations on the national television?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• To them, what is the role of Btv?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• What is the role of television in national development?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• How can Btv be improved?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Phase 4: Closing

- Brief summation of the discussions
- Seek discussants’ comments to the summary.
- Researcher takes biographic details of participants
- Refreshments and Gifts given as token of appreciation